

Historic Designation Criteria Guidelines

Adopted by the Coronado City Council on October 4, 2011
Amended December 5, 2018



City of Coronado

Fostering civic pride through historic preservation

TABLE OF CONTENTS



Introduction	3
Historic Designation Criteria	4
Historic Resource Evaluation	
Resource Types	5
Research and Documentation	6
Historic Context	7
Designation Criteria Guidelines	
Criterion A	8
Criterion B	10
Criterion C	13
Criterion D	16
Criterion E	19
Criterion F	20
Historic Integrity	21
Additional Considerations	24

INTRODUCTION

The purpose of the Historic Designation Criteria Guidelines is to assist in the understanding and application of Coronado's Historic Designation Criteria. These Guidelines shall be used when evaluating a property's eligibility as a Historic Resource in association with a Determination of Historic Significance application.

The information contained herein is rooted firmly in Federal guidance found in National Register Bulletins, particularly National Register Bulletin #15. National Register Bulletins are published by the National Park Service and provide recognized and accepted guidance principles for historic resource evaluation. National Register Bulletins may be consulted for additional information or background on historic resource evaluation.

City of Coronado Municipal Code Chapter 84.10 identifies the criteria by which a resource may be designated as a Historic Resource. It states that an object, building, structure, or site, may be designated as Historic Resource by the City of Coronado Historic Resource Commission if it meets two or more of the adopted designation criteria.

Age Requirement

In order to be nominated for designation as a Historic Resource, a resource must be 75 years old, or have gained historic significance within the last 75 years. In other words, a property of any age may be nominated as a Historic Resource.

However, there is an age threshold for historic review of a property in association with a project that involves demolition or partial demolition visible from the street right of way. In order to be subject to a Determination of Historic Significance review in association with this type of project a structure must be 75 or more years old.

Historic Designation Criteria

Historic Designation provides protection for buildings, structures, objects, and sites that meet the criteria to be designated as a Historic Resource in Coronado. Designated Historic Resources cannot be easily demolished, and must be maintained and preserved.

A building, structure, object, or site may be designated as a Historic Resource by the Historic Resource Commission if it is at least 75 years old (or has achieved historic significance within the past 75) years and meets two or more of the following designation criteria:

- A. It exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's military, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, or engineering, history;
- B. It is identified with a person(s) or an event(s) significant in local, State or national history;
- C. It possesses distinctive characteristics of an architectural style, and has not been substantially altered;
- D. It is representative of the notable work of a builder, designer, architect, artisan or landscape professional.



Historic Resource at 611 A Avenue
Designation Criteria: C, Tudor; and D, William Sterling Hebbard

HISTORIC RESOURCE EVALUATION

Evaluation of a property for historical significance involves several steps. The type of resource should be determined, historic research should be conducted, and a historic context should be developed. Once this is complete, the resource is evaluated using the City's adopted historic designation criteria.

Resource Types

The Coronado Municipal Code identifies four types of resource types that may be designated as Historic Resources, defined as follows:

Object – Objects are those constructions that are primarily artistic in nature, relatively small in scale, and simply constructed. Objects may be, by nature or design, movable; however, an object that is eligible for historic designation would typically be associated with a specific setting or environment. Examples: fountains, monuments, sculpture, statuary, signs, and boundary markers.

Building – A building is a construction created principally to shelter any form of human activity. Examples: dwellings, theaters, offices, schools, and social halls.

Structure – A structure is a construction created for a functional purpose that does not include human shelter. Examples: seawalls, ships, bridges, gazebos, lighthouses, tunnels and windmills.

Site – A site is the location of a historically significant event or activity where the location itself possesses historic, cultural, or archeological value. Examples: battlefields, ceremonial sites, trails, designed landscapes, and ruins.

HISTORIC RESOURCE EVALUATION

Research and Documentation

Historic resource evaluation under each designation criterion requires research and documentation. Examples of acceptable documentation that may be used to support historic significance include, but are not limited to:

- Newspaper and Journal articles
- Written histories (personal records, family histories, etc.)
- Oral histories and first person accounts (transcriptions, archival audio, etc.)
- Photographs
- Legal documents
- Census records
- Voting registers
- Construction Drawings, sketches, and renderings
- City Directories
- Records and Archives

The City contracts with local historic research consulting firms for the preparation of Historic Research Reports in association with applications for a Determination of Historic Significance. The consulting firm will conduct thorough research of the property and prepare a historic significance evaluation based upon the information that is discovered through research and analysis using the City's adopted historic designation criteria.

HISTORIC RESOURCE EVALUATION

Historic Context

In order to be eligible for historic designation, a resource must be historically significant, that is, it must represent a significant part of history, and it must possess the characteristics that make it a good representative of resources associated with that history. Whether or not a resource is a good representative can only be judged and explained when it is evaluated within its historic context. Historic contexts are those patterns or trends in history by which a resource is understood and its significance within history is made clear. The following questions should be considered when evaluating whether a resource is significant within its historic context:

1. *What facet of history does the resource represent?*
2. *Is that facet of history significant?*
3. *Is the type of resource under study relevant and important in illustrating that history?*
4. *How does the resource illustrate that history?*

Once historic research has been conducted and a historic context for the resource has been developed, the resource must be evaluated through the application of the historic designation criteria.

DESIGNATION CRITERIA GUIDELINES

Criterion A – It exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's military, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, or engineering history

Understanding Criterion A

Criterion A encompasses resources that are historically significant because they exemplify or reflect special elements of local history. It is important to note that Criterion A states that a resource must exemplify or reflect *special elements* of local history. It is not enough for a resource to simply exemplify or reflect local history in general, as all buildings, structures, and objects do. A *special element* of history refers to an element of history that is distinct among others of its kind or that surpasses the usual in significance.

Applying Criterion A

Eligibility under Criterion A as a special element of local history involves first, determination of what associations the resource exemplifies or reflects within the context of local history; specifically, in the areas of military, culture, society, economy, politics, aesthetics, and engineering. Second, research and documentation must confirm that the resource rises to the level of a “special element” within this association. A resource should clearly exemplify or reflect the special element of history, not simply have a general association.

It should be noted that Criterion A does not apply to singular persons or events, which are recognized under Criterion B; examples of architectural styles, which are recognized under Criterion C; or examples of the notable work of a builder, designer, architect, artisan or landscape professional, which are recognized under Criterion D.

Some examples of supporting documentation relevant to Criterion A include, but are not limited to:

- A brief historic context of the resource under study, including original building permits, a Notice of Completion, or other written documents that provide a date of construction.
- Documented oral or written history, newspaper accounts, or other primary documents establishing that the resource rises to the level of special element within this context.

Criterion A - 350 D Avenue (HR 2-06)



In 2006, 350 D Avenue was designated as a Historic Resource under Criterion A, as a special element of Coronado's military history. The designation notes that the home has the earliest known roof deck, which was used as a military lookout by the civilian air defense during World War II. The nomination includes a first person account from Hildegard Jaeger Stubbs, the daughter of the first owner of the property, and who lived in the house between 1936 and 1943, from age 9 to age 15. Ms. Stubbs recalled for the nomination that the dwelling had the first roof deck ever constructed in Coronado, and that the roof deck was used as a lookout by the civilian air defense corps after the bombing of Pearl Harbor in 1941. This information substantiates that the resource is eligible under Criterion A because it reflects a special element of Coronado's military history.

DESIGNATION CRITERIA GUIDELINES

Criterion B – it is identified with a person(s) or an event(s) significant in local, state or national history

Understanding Criterion B

Criterion B applies to resources that are significant for their association with significant Person(s) or Event(s).

Person - Resources associated with individuals whose significant contributions to history can be identified and documented may be eligible for designation under Criterion B. For local designation, contributions to history may be significant at the local, State or National level.

Event – Resources associated with events, which have significance that can be identified and documented, may be eligible under Criterion B. For local designation, the event may be significant within the context of local, State or National history.

Applying Criterion B

Eligibility under Criterion B for association with a significant person or event involves, first, determination of the historic significance of the person. The person or event must be individually significant within the history of the City of Coronado, the State of California, or the United States. It is not sufficient for the individual to be a member of a profession, class, social, or ethnic group; it should be shown that the individual gained historic significance within his or her profession or group.

Second, the length and nature of the association of the individual, or the event, with the property under study must be ascertained and documented. Properties eligible under Criterion B are generally associated with the individual's productive life, reflecting the time period when he or she achieved significance, rather than the individual's

formative years or retirement. Some examples of properties that may be associated with an individual may be a home, office, laboratory, or studio, depending on the nature of the historic significance. Properties that are associated with a significant individual's formative years or retirement are generally not eligible under Criterion B, unless no properties from the person's productive years remain intact. When establishing historic significance for association with a person, it should be noted that only one property may be historically designated for that association; therefore, it is important to conduct sufficient research to determine which property is most closely associated with the person's contributions to history. In order to be considered significant for association with a historic event, it must be documented through accepted methods of historic research that the resource under study existed at the time of the historic event and has clear association with the event.

It should be noted that resources associated with an architect, builder, landscape architect, etc., are not appropriately considered under Criterion B, as this association should be evaluated under Criterion D. The exception to this would be if the resource under study was associated with the productive life and accomplishments of the architect, builder, etc., as a historically significant individual, such as his/her own office, home, or studio.

Some examples of supporting documentation relevant to Criterion B include, but are not limited to:

- A brief biographical history of the individual, or summary of the event.
- Documentation establishing the historically significant contribution (s) to local, state, or national history of the person or event.
- Documented association of the individual or event with the resource, including the length and nature of the association. Speculative association is not acceptable.

Criterion B - 1101 Star Park Circle (HR 18-04)



In 2004, 1101 Star Park Circle was designated as a Historic Resource under Criterion B, for its association with L. Frank Baum, author of the *Oz* books. The designation notes that Baum rented the house at 1101 Star Park Circle during the winters and wrote several plays there during his stay. The application includes newspaper articles and publications that serve as documentation to support this claim. An article published in *The Baum Bugle* in 1976 provides documentation that many of Baum's *Oz* books and plays were written, at least in part, in Coronado during his stays at the Hotel del Coronado. The article also mentions by address the property at 1101 Star Park Circle as Baum's winter home, and indicates that it is the only intact house in which an *Oz* book was written.

A much earlier article in the *San Diego Union* dating to 1912 consists of an interview with Baum, in which he noted that he was currently working on the fifth of the *Oz* books, three new operas, and had just completed a lecture tour. The article also contains a picture of the subject property with the caption "Winter home of L. Frank Baum, Coronado Beach, Southern California." The articles, particularly the *San Diego Union* article dating to 1912, document that L. Frank Baum, who is considered to be a historically significant person due to his literary work, can be associated with the subject property, and resided and worked there during his productive life.

DESIGNATION CRITERIA GUIDELINES

Criterion C – It possesses distinctive characteristics of an architectural style, and has not been substantially altered

Understanding Criterion C

Criterion C applies to resources that are significant as an example of an architectural style. Resources significant under Criterion C must possess “distinctive characteristics” of an architectural style and must not be substantially altered from their original appearance. “Distinctive characteristics” are physical features or traits that are frequently present in recognized architectural styles and vernacular styles.

Applying Criterion C

Establishing historic significance under Criterion C involves, first, determining if the resource clearly exhibits enough distinctive characteristics to be truly representative of an architectural style. Recognized architectural styles should be determined using scholarly works and architectural style guides, and vernacular architectural styles should be defined using local research and historic context. Distinctive characteristics such as form, proportion, plan, composition, massing, scale, materials, and details of a particular architectural style should be fully integrated into the historic design, not simply tacked on as an afterthought or as part of a later remodel or addition.

Second, a resource should be unaltered or minimally altered from its historic condition in order to be considered historically significant under Criterion C. Evaluating the extent of alterations to a resource can be achieved by examining the level to which the resource retains its integrity of design, workmanship, and materials, and whether modifications made to a resource are visible from the street right-of-way and are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

for Treatment of Historic Properties.

Some examples of supporting documentation relevant to Criterion C include, but are not limited to:

- Original building plans, permits, and construction documents.
- Historic and transitional photographs.

Criterion C - 1000 Glorietta Boulevard (HR 11-07)



In 2007, 1000 Glorietta Boulevard was designated as a Historic Resource under Criterion C as an example of the Pueblo Revival style. Built in 1916, as documented by the original building permit, the house exhibits character defining features of the Pueblo Revival style, such as: a courtyard plan, a flat roof, front porch arcade, decorative beams, vigas, stucco exterior finish, and multi-light wood French doors and casement windows.

Historic photographs dating from 1919 and 1921 were submitted with the application, which showed the property in its original condition. The dwelling was examined at the time of designation and determined to be virtually unaltered from the original condition. The only modifications to the site were the addition of a garage and site walls in 1924. The resource possesses character defining features of the Pueblo Revival style, has not been substantially altered, and is therefore historically significant under Criterion C.

DESIGNATION CRITERIA GUIDELINES

Criterion D – It is representative of the notable work of a builder, designer, architect, artisan or landscape professional

Understanding Criterion D

Criterion D applies to those resources that are significant for their representation of the notable work of a builder, designer, architect, artisan, or landscape professional. It is important to note that this criterion does not require that the professional be notable, or a master in their field; rather, the resource should represent the *notable work* of a builder, designer, architect, artisan, or landscape professional, when viewed within in the context of their body of work.

Applying Criterion D

In order to be eligible for designation under Criterion D, a resource must first, be identified with an architect, builder, designer, artisan, or landscape professional, and this identification should be supported with documentation. Once a resource is associated with the professional, it must be demonstrated in the nomination that the resource is representative of the professional's notable work.

The City's Municipal Code provides a specific definition of notable work: *"Notable work" means an important or remarkable example from the body of work of a professional trained as a builder, designer, architect, artisan or landscape professional.* In order to determine if a resource is a notable work, enough must be known about the body of work of the builder, designer, architect, artisan, or landscape professional to provide a context for the resource under study. For example, a notable work may be a resource that expresses a particular phase in a professional's career, or a particular idea or theme in the craft. It should be noted that all works by the professional are not presumed to

be notable works, rather, notable works are subset of a professional's body of work.

Some examples of supporting documentation relevant to Criterion D include, but are not limited to:

- A brief biographical summary of the professional, including a context of his/her body of professional work.
- A list of the professional's known works.
- Original building plans, building permits, a Notice of Completion, newspaper articles, or other written documentation that supports an association between the resource and the professional.
- Original drawings, sketches, or architectural renderings of the resource, if available.

Criterion D - 1212 Sixth Street (HR 11-07)



In 2011, the dwelling located at 1212 Sixth Street was designated as a historic resource under Criterion D as a notable work of Herbert Louis Jackson. The building permit for the property lists H.L. Jackson as the property owner at the time of construction. Herbert Louis Jackson was a civil engineer who relocated to Coronado from Ohio in 1909. Jackson worked as a sole proprietor architect until 1915, at which time he joined the architectural firm of Richard Requa and Frank Mead. After Mead left the firm, Requa and Jackson maintained

their partnership for 20 years and contributed significantly to the architectural landscape of the San Diego region through the design of many homes and buildings, usually built in the Spanish Colonial Revival style.

Well known regional landmarks built out of the partnership of Requa and Jackson include the town center and many homes in the community of Rancho Santa Fe (with Lillian Rice), and the Torrey Pines Lodge.

In 1935, Samuel Hamill joined Requa and Jackson as a partner, and shortly thereafter Jackson and Hamill began their own firm. Jackson and Hamill designed such well known buildings as the San Diego County Administration Center (with William Templeton Johnson, Louis Gill, and Richard Requa), and the Del Mar Race Track. The partnership of Jackson and Hamill lasted until Jackson's retirement in 1940.

Herbert Louis Jackson and his wife Emma lived in Coronado throughout his productive career as an architect, residing at 901 Adella Avenue until 1920 and at 839 Adella Avenue thereafter. The subject property is significant under Criterion D as an example of a notable work of Jackson, as it represents his work as a sole proprietor architect, prior to his recognized partnerships with Richard Requa and Samuel Hamill; and because it is an example of his work prior to the proliferation of the Spanish Revival style, for which he is more widely known.

DESIGNATION CRITERIA GUIDELINES

Criterion E – It has been listed or formally determined eligible for the California Register as set forth in Section 5024.1 of the California Public Resources Code (as amended from time to time)

Understanding Criterion E

Criterion E provides local register eligibility for those resources identified as significant by the State Historic Preservation Commission through listing, or formal determination of eligibility for listing, on the California Register. In addition to properties nominated directly to the California Register, the California Register includes properties located in California that have been formally determined eligible for, or listed in, the National Register of Historic Places; as well as resources formally determined eligible for the California State Landmarks program or the California State Points of Historical Interest program.

Applying Criterion E

Eligibility for designation under Criterion E may be established by providing documentation that a resource has been listed, or formally determined eligible for, the California Register. A resource is not automatically listed if it meets this Criterion, rather an applicant must formally nominate the property to the local register and provide documentation that supports the California or National Register listing or determination of eligibility.

Additional documentation that should be provided with the Determination of Historic Significance includes:

- Copy of the National Register of Historic Places or California Register nomination and official documentation confirming that the resource has been listed, or formally determined eligible for, the National Register of Historic Places or California Register.

HISTORIC INTEGRITY

If it is determined that a resource is eligible for designation because it meets two or more of the adopted designation criteria, the integrity of the resource must be evaluated. Integrity is the ability of a resource to convey its significance. Only after the historic significance of a resource is fully established can the issue of integrity be addressed.

Evaluation of integrity must always be grounded in an understanding of a resource's physical features and how they relate to historic significance. To retain historic integrity, a resource will possess several, and usually most, of the following seven aspects of integrity:

1. **Location** – Location is the place where the historic property was constructed or the place where the historic event occurred. In rare cases, a moved resource can be eligible for designation. For example, a resource that is eligible under Criterion C as one of the few remaining examples of an architectural style and retains most other applicable aspects of integrity may not be negatively affected by the loss of integrity of location.
2. **Design** – Design is the combination of elements that create the form, plan, space, structure, and style of a resource, and results from the conscious decisions made during the original design or planning process. It also applies to the way in which buildings, sites, or structures are related with respect to special relationships, visual rhythms, and layout.
3. **Setting** – Setting is the physical environment of a historic property and refers to the character of a place, such as topography, landscape, and relationship between buildings. In this way, setting differs from location, which places importance on the specific place that a resource was constructed.

4. **Materials** – Materials are the physical elements that were used and combined, during a particular period of time and in a particular pattern or configuration, to form a historic resource. The use of particular materials reveals the preferences of those who created the resource and indicates the availability of particular types of materials and technologies.
5. **Workmanship** – Workmanship is the physical evidence of an artisan’s labor and skill in the construction of a building, structure, object or site. Workmanship practices such as carving, joinery, and other details or construction methods provide evidence regarding the technology of a craft and illustrate the aesthetic principles of a historic period.
6. **Feeling** – Feeling is a property’s expression of the aesthetic or historic sense of a particular period of time. It results from the presence of physical features that, when taken together, convey the property’s historic character. For example, a local historic district that retains original design, materials, workmanship, and setting will relate the feeling of small town neighborhood life in the early 20th century.
7. **Association** – Association is the direct link between an important historic event or person and a historic resource. A resource retains association only if it is the place where the event or activity actually occurred and is sufficiently intact to convey that relationship. Unlike the other six aspects of integrity, which are important to all historic resources, association is only applicable to resources that are historically significant under Coronado’s Criterion B, historic person or event; and possibly Criterion A, special element of local history.

ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS

The following additional considerations should be reviewed when evaluating a resource for historic significance, as special circumstances may apply that affect the eligibility of a resource.

Reconstructed Resources – A reconstructed resource is eligible when it is accurately executed in a suitable environment and presented in a dignified manner as part of a restoration master plan, and when no other building, structure, site, or object with the same associations has survived.

Commemorative Resources – Resources such as statues, markers, or other objects with commemorative intent can be eligible if design, age, tradition, or symbolic value has invested the resource with historic significance in its own right.

Moved Resources – A resource removed from its original location can be eligible if it is significant primarily for architectural value or it is the surviving resource most importantly associated with a historic person or event.

Birthplaces– A birthplace of a historical figure is eligible if the person is of outstanding importance and if there is no other appropriate site or building directly associated with his or her productive life.

Resources that are less than 75 years old – Nominated resources that are less than 75 years old are eligible for designation if sufficient historical perspective exists to determine that the resource is significant within its historic context. This perspective can be provided by scholarly research and evaluation, and must consider both the historic context, and the resource's role within that context.

RESEARCH RESOURCES

It is important to provide additional documentation to support your application for Determination of Historic Significance. This section is meant to be a helpful tool in locating relevant resources; however it is not a comprehensive guide.

Local Government Resources

City of Coronado Community Development Department
1825 Strand Way, Coronado Phone (619) 522-7326

San Diego County Assessors/Recorders Office
1600 Pacific Highway, San Diego Phone (619) 236-3771

Local Archives

The Coronado Historical Association
1100 Orange Avenue, Coronado Phone (619) 435-7242
archivist@coronadohistory.org
www.coronadohistory.org

The San Diego History Center
Casa de Balboa, Lower Level
1649 El Prado, Balboa Park, San Diego Phone (619) 232-6203
<http://www.sandiegohistory.org/researcharchives/>

Internet Resources

Ancestry
www.ancestry.com

California Digital Newspaper Collection
<https://cdnc.ucr.edu/cgi-bin/cdnc>

Library of Congress Digital Collection
<https://www.loc.gov/collections/>

RESEARCH RESOURCES

Local Libraries

Coronado Public Library
640 Orange Avenue, Coronado Phone (619) 522-7390
www.coronado.lib.ca.us

The Coronado Library houses many books on local history as well as offers databases for research, including the Coronado Newspaper Index, Ancestry.com, and the Historical L.A. Times. The Coronado Newspaper index can guide you to specific articles about people, places, and events in the newspaper microfilm collection, and is available online.

San Diego Public Library
Special Collections, Central Library
330 Park Boulevard, San Diego, Phone (619) 236-5834
<https://www.sandiego.gov/public-library/central-library>

In the Special Collections sections of the San Diego Central Library, you can research local history at the California Room, family history in the Genealogy Room, and search newspaper indices in the Newspaper room. Among the many helpful resources in the California Room are copies of historic Sanborn Fire Insurance maps; historical newspapers and clippings; and Southwest Builder & Contractor. The library catalog can be searched at the website address listed above.

San Diego State Love Library
5500 Campanile Drive, San Diego Phone (619) 594-6728
University of California at San Diego Geisel Library
9500 Gilman Drive, San Diego Phone (858) 534-3336

Both the UCSD and SDSU Libraries have various research opportunities, including the San Diego Union newspaper indexed from 1871 and available on microfilm for in library research.

City of Coronado

Historic Preservation Program

The following documents are available in print at the Community Development Department or digitally on the City's website.

At www.coronado.ca.us/preservation you can find:

- Designation Criteria Guidelines
- Determination of Historic Significance Application
- Historic Alteration Permit Application
- Historic Preservation Program Guidebook
- Historic Resource Code
- Historic Resource Register
- Mills Act Application

At www.coronado.ca.us/planning you can find:

- Planning Fee Schedule
- California Environmental Quality Act Information

City of Coronado Historic Preservation

City of Coronado
Community Development Department
1825 Strand Way
Coronado CA, 92118

Phone: 619-522-7326
www.coronado.ca.us/preservation

Staff Contact: Tricia Olsen
Email: tolsen@coronado.ca.us