



City of Coronado
Street Tree Committee

**Minutes for Meeting of
October 4, 2012**

Meeting Location: Public Services Conference Room

Members Present: Caroleen Williams, Chair Nancy Cuddy, Resident
Marvin Heinze, Vice Chair Shannon Player, Resident
Jess Culpeper, Advisor

Members Absent: Don Hale, Resident

PRELIMINARIES

Meeting was called to order at 9:05 a.m.

Approval of Minutes

Minutes of the August 2, 2012 meeting were approved, as amended, with motion by _____, seconded by _____, and with four yeas.

Oral Communication

1. Caroleen Williams moved items #2 and #3 from “New Business” on the agenda to the first order of business (please see the minutes for these items under “New Business” below).

REPORTS

1. Laura said she mailed the Heritage Tree notices in preparation for the meeting and City staff received responses from residents to be reviewed.
2. Jess Culpeper said some trees were evaluated and determined to be hazards, therefore, they need to be removed. Matt Little let the Street Tree Committee members know the process for removing these trees.

OLD BUSINESS

1. Caroleen Williams mentioned that the following items addressed by Shannon Player in last meeting's Oral Communications should have been added to this meeting's agenda:
 - A. Oral Communication #3 – Shannon Player suggested that some trees be removed from the approved list, such as the *Bauhinia blakeana* Hong Kong Orchid and the *Rhus lancea* African Sumac. This item will be placed on the September agenda.

Shannon said we need pictures of the trees, the issue needs to be more thoroughly examined, and these trees need to be reconsidered. Marv Heinze said we will add this item to “Old Business” on November's agenda.
 - B. Oral Communication #4 – Shannon Player said it looks like the 5 Podocarpus trees at 1001 E Avenue have not been taken care of and suggested that the resident be sent a letter regarding taking care of the trees.
2. Marv Heinze referred to #8 on the minutes from August's meeting regarding the Yucca plants at 465 Palm Avenue. Matt Little said City staff would like to speak to the homeowners. Marv Heinze wants to add this item to “Old Business” on future agendas. Marv Heinze also reminded City staff to make sure pending items from previous agendas/minutes are placed on following agendas.

NEW BUSINESS

1. Caroleen Williams thinks the Tree Master Plan and what it states about tree removals needs to be discussed, specifically in regards to landscaping renovations. Reference was made to the last paragraph on page 22 of the Tree Master Plan. Marv Heinze talked about this section in relation to what authority the Street Tree Committee has. Shannon Player said it is the City's responsibility to maintain the canopies, using the Tree Master Plan as a guideline. Caroleen Williams said determinations can be handled on a case-by-case basis.
2. The Italian Stone Pine located at 1027 Adella Avenue was approved for nomination as a Heritage Tree. Greg Hebert, the property owner of 1027 Adella Avenue, was present at the meeting. Bob Lindsay reviewed and talked about the tree. Jess reviewed the letters that were received by Public Services. One of the neighbors who lives across the street from the proposed Heritage Tree was present at the meeting and voted in favor of the nomination. The nomination was approved with motion by Marv Heinze, seconded by Nancy Cuddy, and with four yeas.

3. The Italian Stone Pine located at 731 I Avenue was approved for nomination as a Heritage Tree. Gloria Curran, the property owner of 731 I Avenue, was present at the meeting and talked about the tree on her property. The Street Tree Committee members reviewed response letters and photos. Two neighbors attending the meeting had questions in regards to what a Heritage Tree is and why they are important. Bob Lindsay explained the process and benefits. Jess Culpeper explained the City's role in maintaining Heritage Trees. The nomination was approved, with motion by Marv Heinze, seconded by Caroleen Williams, and with four yeas.
4. A request to remove both trees at 631 Balboa Avenue was approved, contingent upon the replacement trees being of a large size determined by City staff and being planted either on site or at another location in the City, as coordinated with City staff. Jess Culpeper reviewed the evaluation for the Brisbane Box tree in front of 631 Balboa Avenue. The tree was determined to be healthy. The resident is moving the driveway, but did not coordinate with the Street Tree Committee prior to the removal request. They will plant another tree in a different spot. The requests were approved, with motion by Marv Heinze, seconded by Nancy Cuddy, and with four yeas.
5. A request to remove both trees at 631 Balboa Avenue was approved, contingent upon the replacement trees being of a large size determined by City staff and being planted either on site or at another location in the City, as coordinated with City staff. Jess Culpeper reviewed the evaluation for the Melaleuca tree in front of 631 Balboa Avenue. The tree is not unhealthy, but it is unstable. Shannon mentioned the tree is codominant, which makes it less structurally sound. Caroleen Williams asked Matt Little for a staff recommendation. The requests were approved, with motion by Marv Heinze, seconded by Nancy Cuddy, and with four yeas.

Matt Little said the Brisbane Box tree could be removed, preferably as long as they plant one tree in a different location, as well as one more tree, possibly near the water meter and driveway area, as suggested by Jess Culpeper, though that exact location is still in question. Marv Heinze expressed concerns about the Brisbane Box tree because it is a good tree and suggested that maybe the contractor can plant a large tree of similar size to replace it. Matt Little said City staff should send a letter regarding the number of trees to plant and the size they should be.

6. Jess Culpeper recommended, as did Marv Heinze, that the request to remove one Melaleuca tree at 701 Cabrillo Avenue be deferred one month while City staff determines which property it is in front of, exactly. Matt Little said City staff will contact both property owners. This recommendation was approved with motion by Marv Heinze, seconded by Caroleen Williams, and with four yeas.
7. A request to remove one Eucalyptus Ficifolia located at 968 G Avenue was denied. Jess Culpeper reviewed the evaluation. The tree was determined to be healthy, with no structural issues, and was rated a low-hazard. Marv Heinze said he doesn't understand the request letter because the rationale for removal is not supported by the Tree Master Plan. In addition, the photos show that a sidewalk has been poured into the median,

creating a hard surface around the tree. Matt Little said the hard surfaces around the tree are concerns, as well as the flowers and shrubs. The request was denied with motion by Shannon Player, seconded by Marv Heinze, and with four yeas.

8. A request to remove two Brazilian Pepper trees at 834 A Avenue was denied because the letter does not meet the criteria for removal in the Tree Master Plan. Jess Culpeper reviewed the evaluation. The trees were determined to be healthy with no issues. Shannon Player mentioned there is buttressing at the base of the tree and the Street Tree Committee has considered removing some Pepper trees. She also mentioned that residents should be educated about tree care. Marv Heinze agreed that the Street Tree Committee has considered removing Pepper trees, however, not these particular ones. Shannon Player suggested the Street Tree Committee review this request again, at a later date, and in the meantime, send a letter stating denial of the request because the trees are not in terrible shape compared to other Pepper trees. Marv Heinze and Matt Little both agreed that the resident could draft a new letter that might meet the requirements for removal in the Tree Master Plan. The request was denied with motion by Marv Heinze, seconded by Caroleen Williams, and with four yeas.

The next regular meeting is scheduled for Thursday, November 1, 2012 from 9:00 a.m. to 10:30 a.m. There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 10:28 a.m.

Caroleen Williams
City of Coronado
Street Tree Committee Chairman

Laura Gerszewski
Office Specialist
City of Coronado Public Services