HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting March 21, 2012

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3 p.m., Wednesday, March 21, 2012, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Ryan.

| | |
|---|---|
| MEMBERS PRESENT: | Crenshaw, Ryan, DeNardi |
| MEMBERS ABSENT: | Jones, McGowen |
| STAFF PRESENT: | Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner<br>Laura Alvarez, Recording Secretary, Minutes Preparer |
| CITY ATTORNEY: | Lisa Foster |

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of March 7, 2012, were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. Olsen reported that Chair agendas have been provided to the Commissioners to clarify how and why the Chair runs the meeting as he does. She then reported that at the City Council meeting of March 20, the City Council approved two requests by Mayor Tanaka to consider items at a future meeting. One of those items relates to changing of the composition of the Historic Resource Commission from three at-large members and two representatives from other Commissions to five at-large members. The second item relates to limiting the number of Commissions that residents can serve to one Commission at a time.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Vice Chair Crenshaw announced that the flower show will be held on March 21 and 22, and a booth will be available on site.

Chairperson Ryan asked that an item be agendized for a future meeting to discuss who will volunteer their time at the flower show booth.

Ms. Olsen said that Commissioners Jones and McGowen volunteered to man the booth.

PUBLIC HEARING

**HR 2012-03** **HOFFMANN** – Request for historic designation of the single family residence addressed as 416 Ninth Street and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicant, Richard Hoffmann, provided a brief overview of the request and answered questions of the Commission.

Commissioner DeNardi asked for clarification on why the footprint has not changed since 1949.

Ms. Olsen said the reason the report states that the footprint has not changed since 1949 is because this was the first time that the footprint of the house appears on the Sanborn Map. The later Sanborn Map in 1988 does not indicate a change. The house is not present on the Map prior to 1949 because the next earlier Map would have been in 1921 and the house was not built at that time.

Commissioner DeNardi asked for clarification on the time line depicted for the map and photographs submitted.

Mr. Hoffmann said the map and photographs are current.

Commissioner DeNardi respectfully disagreed as the photographs show the bathroom is built out instead of recessed in, with a window visible from the street.

Mr. Hoffmann agreed and said the master bedroom projects out about 18 inches and the bathroom is flush with the bedroom.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if the three-panel patio window and the plain window next to it are original.

Mr. Hoffmann said only the three-panel patio window is original.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked when the wall was installed in the patio area.

Ms. Olsen confirmed it was in 1962.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair Crenshaw said she feels this home qualifies as historic as it is well documented; however, she stated that if the applicant applies for Mills Act in the future, she would like the patio window replaced with non-aluminum material.

Mr. Hoffman replied that he would like to replace the aluminum windows along the side of the kitchen with wood windows.

COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 416 NINTH STREET TO BE A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION, IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

A) IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;

B) IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S) OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;

C) IT DOES POSSESS DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SPANISH ECLECTIC ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;

D) IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, CHRIS COSGROVE;

E) IT HAS NOT BEEN LISTED OR FORMALLY DETERMINED ELIGIBLE FOR THE CALIFORNIA REGISTER AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 5024.1 OF THE CALIFORNIA PUBLIC RESOURCES CODE.

THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS WERE ADDED:

1. THAT THE EXTERIOR OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SHALL NOT BE ALTERED WITHOUT APPROVAL FROM THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION IN ACCORDANCE WITH CHAPTER 84.20 OF THE MUNICIPAL CODE;
2. THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SHALL NOT BE DEMOLISHED OR REMOVED FROM THE SITE WITHOUT APPROVAL BY THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION IN ACCORDANCE WITH CHAPTER 84.20 OF THE MUNICIPAL CODE;
3. THAT THE EXTERIOR OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SHALL BE ADEQUATELY MAINTAINED TO AVOID THE LOSS OF EXTERIOR BUILDING MATERIALS, ROOFING MATERIALS AND PAINT; AND
4. THAT THE SITE, LANDSCAPING, AND MISCELLANEOUS IMPROVEMENTS SURROUNDING THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SHALL BE ADEQUATELY MAINTAINED TO PROVIDE FOR THE VISIBILITY OF THE STRUCTURE FROM PUBLIC RIGHTS-OF-WAY.

COMMISSIONER DENARDI SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, DeNardi, Ryan.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Jones, McGowen.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

Total deliberation time: 17 minutes.

**HAP 2012-06** **ANGIOLETTI** – Request for Historic Resource Alteration Permit for the property addressed as 928 H Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from zoning standards.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicant, Barbara Angioletti, gave an overview of the request and answered questions of the Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner DeNardi said he was not opposed to the variance requests; however, he had an issue with three additional items that he feels the applicant is not complying with, as follows:
Carriage House Ordinance, Section 86.56.110:
Item I: No portion of the second story is permitted to project beyond the first story except adjoining the alley.
Item M: The stairway cannot be enclosed. He said that because it is enclosed with a walk-in doorway, it increases the first floor square footage above 600 ft.
Item E: No portion of the second story is permitted to extend beyond 26 ft. from the alley. He said that if the structural columns that support the second story are taken in, it flows into an area greater than 26 ft. from the property line.
Commissioner DeNardi said the application does not ask for a variance on the above Code items.

Ms. Olsen said that Item I refers to the 12-inch offset to projecting beyond the first story on the alley side is permissible because it requests that this be done in order to not have a two-story blank wall. Item I states that it cannot project beyond the first story on any other side of the carriage house. She noted that Commissioner DeNardi concern stems from the area where the covered patio is essentially the carriage house above. She said that staff did not see an issue with this area because the carriage house above does not project beyond the wall closest to the house. She said staff's interpretation of the Code is that if the second story carriage house had projected beyond the wall which is closest to the house, there would be a code exception request required.

Ms. Olsen then explained that Item M states that "Access to the second story shall only be external to the Carriage House building with an open and unenclosed stair with a foot of said access stairs only entered from the main dwelling side of the structure." She asked if the concern was that the entrance to the carriage house is on the side of the building.

Commissioner DeNardi said his concern was that the stairway is enclosed and Item M states that it cannot be enclosed.

Ms. Olsen stated the plan does not depict an enclosed stairway.

Commissioner DeNardi said he was referring to the door for storage.

Ms. Olsen clarified that Commissioner DeNardi was referring to the area below the stairway. She stated that the Code section does not reference this area. The Code states that the stairway cannot have a roof and should be open to the air as one ascends the staircase and enters into the second story. Also, there should not be a stairway from the interior of the garage that accesses into the second story carriage house; it should be an exterior stair.

Commissioner DeNardi noted that having the area enclosed and having a walk-in storage area increases the floor area to greater than 26 sq. ft.

Ms. Olsen asked if Commissioner DeNardi was adding in the area beneath the stairs as sq. footage.

Commissioner DeNardi said yes.

Ms. Olsen said the applicant did not indicate this on the site plan. She suggested that the applicant may want to return with additional information if the Commission felt this was pertinent information to base their decision.

Commissioner DeNardi stated he cannot approve the application as submitted.

Ms. Olsen addressed the third item, Section E, which reads "No portion of the second story of the Carriage House building is permitted to extend beyond 26 ft. from the rear property line excluding one open unenclosed stairway." She said Commissioner DeNardi's concern is that when the columns that support the shed roof in front of the carriage house are counted, they do extend three feet beyond the 26 ft. requirement. Ms. Olsen said that in the past, staff has considered an architectural element that projects beyond the footprint of the carriage house to be a needed exception request.

Ms. Olsen asked the applicant if she wished to continue the item to the next regular meeting.

Ms. Angioletti said she would request that the item be continued to allow a full quorum of Commissioners.

Vice Chair Crenshaw said she agreed with Commissioner DeNardi. She said she is very firm on the Carriage House regulations and if the ground floor will go over 26 sq. ft., this is not acceptable.

COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING, AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT, TO ALLOW A FULL QUORUM OF COMMISSIONERS TO BE PRESENT.

COMMISSIONER DENARDI SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, DeNardi, Ryan.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Jones, McGowen.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

Total deliberation time: 22 minutes.

**NOI 2012-02** **SMOKY BAYLESS** – Notice of Intent to Demolish the Single Family Residence addressed as 856 B Avenue and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicant, Raymond Herrera, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions of the Commission.

Commissioner DeNardi asked about Balboa, LLC.

Mr. Herrera said it is the trust for his children and he is the manager/owner of the trust.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair Crenshaw stated that although this is a beautifully maintained home, it is not possible to declare a home historic when it is documentarily not.

Mr. Herrera said he has no intention of demolishing the house. Instead, he plans on refurbishing the entire house and adding a second story.

COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 856 B AVENUE (NOI 2012-02) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED

AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

A) IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;

B) IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S) OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;

C) IT DOES POSSESS DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SPANISH BUNGALOW ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;

D) IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;

E) IT HAS NOT BEEN LISTED OR FORMALLY DETERMINED ELIGIBLE FOR THE CALIFORNIA REGISTER AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 5024.1 OF THE CALIFORNIA PUBLIC RESOURCES CODE.

THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS WERE ADDED:

1. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CITY AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO ALLOW CITY AND/OR THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION AN OPPORTUNITY TO PREPARE A PHOTOGRAPHIC, FILM, VIDEO, OR OTHER APPROPRIATE RECORD OF THE EXTERIOR/INTERIOR OF THE STRUCTURE.

COMMISSIONER DENARDI SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, DeNardi, Ryan
NAYS: Jones, McGowen.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

Total deliberation time: 9 minutes.

DISCUSSION

**HP 2012-03** **CITY OF CORONADO -** Review of the City of Coronado Mills Act Alteration Guidelines.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commission discussion ensued.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DENARDI MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE RECOMMENDED CHANGES TO THE MILLS ACT GUIDELINES, WHICH WILL THEN BE INCORPORATED INTO AN UPDATED HISTORIC RESOURCE GUIDEBOOK.

VICE CHAIR CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, DeNardi, Ryan
NAYS: Jones, McGowen.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

Total deliberation time: 15 minutes.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:16 p.m.

_____

Rachel A. Hurst, Director of Community Development,
Redevelopment & Housing Services