HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting December 7, 2011

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:03 p.m., Wednesday, December 7, 2011, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Ryan.

MEMBERS PRESENT:	Crenshaw, Jones, McGowen, Ryan, St. Denis
MEMBERS ABSENT:	None
STAFF PRESENT:	Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner Martha L Alvarez, Recording Secretary, Minutes Preparer
CITY ATTORNEY:	Lisa Foster

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of November 16, 2011, were approved as amended.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

City Council

Ms. Olsen reported that at the meeting of December 6, City Council approved the Historic Alteration Permit, with the exception of the carriage house, for the property located at 541 Ocean Boulevard, as recommended by the Commission.

Ms. Olsen mentioned that on December 20, the City Council agenda will have two Historic Preservation-related items: The Resolution for implementing a 50 percent savings for the Mills Act and a Historic Alteration Permit for the property located at 825 Adella Avenue, which is being heard by the Commission today.

Ms. Olsen made a correction to a previous statement. She noted that Commissioner Crenshaw's term ends on December 31, 2012, and not January 2012, as mentioned earlier.

Ms. Olsen noted there will be no Commission meetings held on December 21 or January 4. The next meeting will be held on January 18, 2012.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

Chairperson St. Denis reported that she was appointed to the Cultural Arts Commission and will step down as the Planning Commission's representative on the Historic Resource Commission. She said she has enjoyed serving on the Historic Resource Commission.

Commissioner members and staff thanked Vice Chair St. Denis her for her service on the Commission.

PUBLIC HEARING

HAP 2011-08 **MARK AND JULIE FRAHM** – Request for a Historic Alteration Permit including zoning exceptions related to setbacks for the property addressed as 824 Adella Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicant's representative, Christian Rice, project architect, gave an overview of the revised request and answered questions of the Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Dave Cranmer said he does not oppose the construction and remodel of the project; however, he expressed concern that the project is not consistent with other neighboring homes. He suggested that the proposed garage be moved further back toward the rear property line so that the front doorway be kept in its original location so that it does not create privacy issues for his home.

Brian Trotier expressed concern on how the Commission has interpreted the granting of historic status as the ability to grant alteration permits and variances without regard for the property rights of the existing neighbors. He said he was not opposed to the remodeling or the variance request for the north side of the subject property; however, he is concerned with the proposed changes to the south side of the property.

The applicant and owner, Julie Frahm, gave a brief overview of the project and requested that the Commission approve the project request.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Ryan asked the City Attorney to provide information regarding the Historic Preservation Code and property rights.

City Attorney Lisa Foster said that the fact that the home has been historically designated does give the owners the ability to come forward to the Commission within the provisions of the Municipal Code to ask for exceptions to the zoning rules. The purpose of the Code as an incentive for owners to designate their properties is that the owners have the potential to have more leeway for exceptions to zoning requirements such as setbacks based on the fact that they have a historically designated home. The Commission has the discretion in recommending the exception to City Council, and consideration can be given to impact on neighboring properties as this is one of the findings that needs to be made by the Commission, i.e. the requested alteration has an adverse impact on the neighborhood. She said there is an incentive built into the Code for historically designated properties to have more consideration for those types of exceptions.

Vice Chair St. Denis said she was under the impression there were no zoning code exception

requests for the south side of the property.

Ms. Olsen confirmed there were no requests.

Vice Chair St. Denis then said that the garage, whether historic or not, would be permissible under the City's Ordinance. She stated that there are no changes to the façade which faces Adella Avenue and said it is architecturally significant as it resembles the Italianate architect. She said it is a very significant house by Charles Herreshoff. Ms. St. Denis said that the existing placement of the front door is a result of a very lengthy discussion about retaining the integrity of the Hereshoff design and making it symmetrical. This design was in response by the architecture to the Commission's previous request.

Commissioner Jones agreed with the aforementioned comments.

Commissioner Crenshaw thanked the applicant for preserving the house and making it symmetrical. She asked how far the neighbor wanted the garage moved back.

Mr. Rice said he was unsure exactly how far back the neighbor wanted the garage moved. He did add that to stay within zoning, it would be moved only a few feet; however, this change, although it appears minor, would disrupt the architectural design plans he is currently working on. In addition, he said that the entire front door façade would become skewed because it would change the dynamic of that façade as well.

Chairperson Ryan reminded the Commission that it should make a determination on the request as presented today.

Commissioner McGowen said she understood that the location of the garage component and the bedroom above it is related to interior access to the second story, which would be significantly changed if the structure was moved back.

Mr. Rice agreed.

<u>COMMISSION ACTION</u>

VICE CHAIR ST. DENIS MADE A MOTION TO RECOMMEND TO CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL OF THE ISSUANCE OF A HISTORIC RESOURCE ALTERATION PERMIT INCLUDING ZONING EXCEPTIONS RELATED TO THE SETBACKS FOR THE PROPERTY ADDRESSED AS 824 ADELLA AVENUE AND LOCATED IN THE R-1A (SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL ZONE).

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

A. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.

C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS WERE ADDED:

1. ANY CHANGE TO THE APPROVED PLANS WILL REQUIRE THE REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION.
2. ANY MECHANICAL EQUIPMENT INSTALLED IN ASSOCIATION WITH THE PROJECT WILL BE SCREENED FROM VIEW FROM THE PUBLIC RIGHT OF WAY.

COMMISSIONER JONES SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, Jones, McGowen, Ryan, St. Denis
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0

Total deliberation time: 25 minutes.

HAP 2011-11 **MOORE RESIDENCE** – Request for a Historic Alteration Permit for the property addressed as 927 D Avenue and located in the R-3/P (Multiple Family Residential) Zone. The Alteration Permit also requests relief from zoning standards.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. She emphasized that approval of the request should be based on the plans as submitted at today's meeting.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if the applicant has complied with conditions as stated in the Resolution.

Ms. Olsen said yes.

Vice Chair St. Denis asked if the dwellings can be converted to condominiums and sold as two separate dwellings.

Ms. Olsen said the second dwelling is allowed in the R-3 zone and is not violating any zoning requirements; however, she clarified that this information is not relevant to the request being reviewed at today's meeting. She emphasized that the Commission is reviewing the project's

consistency with the Secretary of the Interiors Standards related to its impact on the historic dwelling in addition to the zoning exception related to parking.

The applicant's representative, Kevin Rugee, project architect, gave an overview of the request and answered questions of the Commission.

The property owner, Robert Moore, thanked the Commission for their consideration.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if the applicant had drawn up a visual from the D Street side.

Mr. Rugee replied that he had submitted a drawing depicting the D Street side. He noted that the roof line of the second floor where the dormer is located has been reconfigured.

Vice Chair St. Denis asked if the dormer rather than the gable would be visible.

Mr. Rugee said the cross gable would not be visible from the public right-of-way.

Commissioner McGowen asked about the difference in height of the front versus the rear house.

Mr. Rugee said the height is basically the same.

Ms. Olsen confirmed that the height of the front home is 21'-9".

Commissioner Crenshaw confirmed that the height of the rear home is 29'-6".

Mr. Rugee said the original design for the rear building as submitted was 29'-8" and added that the effective massing has been reduced with the elimination of the cross gable and large gable ends on the side yards.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair St. Denis thanked the Moores for preserving their home in its entirety and commended Mr. Rugee for his architectural design.

Commissioner Crenshaw said the project was very impressive. She said she hoped the applicants would reconsider applying for the Mills Act for the front home.

Ms. Olsen clarified that while there is a zoning exception request associated with the project, should the Commission approve the project, review and approval is not needed by City Council because City Council does not need to approve parking exceptions.

COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR ST. DENIS MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE REQUEST (AND PLANS

AS SUBMITTED TODAY) FOR A HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR THE PROPERTY ADDRESSED AS 927 D AVENUE AND LOCATED IN THE R-3/P (MULTIPLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL) ZONE, INCLUDING RELIEF FROM ZONING STANDARDS.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

A. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

THE PROJECT WAS APPROVED WITH THE CONDITIONS AS STATED ON THE RESOLUTION.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, Jones, McGowen, Ryan, St. Denis
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0

There is a 10-day appeal period.

Total deliberation time: 26 minutes.

HRPA 2011-03 **BRENDA BEVERLY** – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated residence addressed as 200 H Avenue and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicants, Brenda and David Beverly, provided a brief overview of the request and answered questions of the Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Dutch Swagemaker asked for clarification on the Mills Act process.

Chairperson Ryan explained the application process and referred Mr. Swagemaker's specific questions about his property to staff.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER JONES MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE REQUEST FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION MILLS ACT AGREEMENT FOR THE HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 200 H AVENUE AND LOCATED IN THE R-1B (SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL) ZONE, TO INCLUDE THE LIST OF PROPOSED IMPROVEMENTS AND TO EXCLUDE THE NEW GARAGE FROM THE MILLS ACT.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, Jones, McGowen, Ryan, St. Denis
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0

There is a 10-day appeal period.

Total deliberation time: 14 minutes.

DISCUSSION ITEM

Commission Discussion on Public Outreach.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

Chairperson Ryan asked about pending items to date.

Ms. Olsen said the Historic District Ordinance and the Mills Act Alteration Guidelines are still pending from the list of tasks from 2011. She said she hopes to complete the items at the beginning of 2012, and hopes to work on official Historic Preservation Program public outreach items in February 2012.

Chairperson Ryan discussed the 28 or 30 CHA homes that have plaques but have not volunteered to be designated, as well as special interest homes that are not 75 years of age. He suggested appointing two Commission members to conduct public outreach to these homeowners in addition to holding public outreach meetings.

Commissioner Jones suggested holding these meetings in conjunction with providing exhibits in the main library.

Commissioner Crenshaw suggested public outreach via online.

Chairperson Ryan discussed marketing campaign presentations to realtors to help them understand the City's ordinances.

Vice Chair St. Denis said she serves on the CHA Preservation Committee as does Commissioner Crenshaw. She said that at yesterday's meeting, the number one most important agenda item was public outreach to the community and to those homeowners that have designated their home but have not officially done so with the City. She said the CHA Board would like to partner with the Historic Resource Commission to educate the public on the designation process.

Commissioner McGowen reminded the Commission that City Council appointed a committee to review the preservation list.

Chairperson Ryan asked if it was possible to agendize this item for mid-February.

Ms. Olsen replied that she will be able to agendize some items when the pending items have been completed.

Commissioner Crenshaw said that CHA homes should be addressed by CHA. She said the CHA will encourage CHA homeowners to speak with the City at which point the Commission would speak with them. She suggested that the timing should be more sensitive to the CHA homes. She expressed interest in working with the 350 homeowners on the preservation list.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:37 p.m.

_____

Rachel A. Hurst, Director of Community Development,
Redevelopment & Housing Services