

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

October 5, 2011

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3 p.m., Wednesday, October 5, 2011, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Ryan.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Crenshaw, McGowen, Ryan, St. Denis

MEMBERS ABSENT: Jones

STAFF PRESENT: Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner
Martha L Alvarez, Recording Secretary, Minutes Preparer

CITY ATTORNEY: Lisa Foster

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of September 7, 2011, were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

City Council

Ms. Olsen thanked the Commission members for attending the meeting of October 4. Ms. Olsen said there were two items heard by the City Council, the Mills Act Waiting List (including the 50% tax reduction), and the Historic Designation Criteria Guidelines. She said there was much discussion and, overall, it went well. The City Council adopted the alternative recommendation for the Designation Criteria Guidelines, which is to approve the Ordinance amendments minus the change in the age threshold and the change to the language of Criterion F. Both of these items were postponed. The Criterion F item will return before the City Council when the Historic District Ordinance is heard again, and the age threshold item was deferred pending public outreach/input. She said that Mayor Tanaka requested that the age threshold item return before City Council in one month.

Chairperson Ryan stated that the Commission was not permitted to discuss this item as it was not agendaized; however, questions could be asked of staff.

Vice Chair St. Denis said the age threshold item discussed the age and not the process; however, she asked if all of the homes would be reviewed by the Commission.

Ms. Olsen replied that the amendment to the Ordinance addressed only the age threshold. She said that this change would require that all homes would be subject to the process currently in place. When the City Council considers the age threshold and other options in one month, the process should be clarified. Ms. Olsen said that the postponement by City Council of the age threshold item is a good idea as it allows staff to prepare a very thorough analysis for City

Council to consider including different options in terms of how to deal with it procedurally.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if a survey would be conducted by the City Council, or if this task would be appointed to the Commission.

Ms. Olsen said a decision has not been made by the City Council at this point. She mentioned that a couple of City Council members appeared to be adamant about conducting a survey so it is definitely one of the options to be considered by City Council.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if City Council would be asking the Commission their opinion on whether a survey is a viable option.

Ms. Olsen further clarified that the City Council wanted public outreach to be undertaken and the item returned to City Council in one month. There was no direction asking the Commission to take any action regarding public outreach. At this time, staff is waiting for instruction from the City Manager's office in terms of what City Council wants to review in one month—whether it is public outreach results, or options on how to approach public outreach. No further information regarding public outreach is available at this time. Ms. Olsen said that the public may provide public comment regarding this matter at any of the City Council meetings.

Ms. Olsen said that the second item that was heard by City Council was the Mills Act applications and whether or not to reduce the property tax benefit for individuals to a maximum of 50 percent. The City Council chose to implement the 50 percent approach and accepted the Commission's recommendation in that the current waiting list will be processed using the current Mills Act calculation. That is, it will not be set at a maximum 50 percent; however, any new applications that are submitted once the City Council adopts a Resolution to implement the change will be limited to a 50 percent savings of their current property tax. Ms. Olsen said that the City Council appreciated all of the time and effort that the Commission invested in hearing and relaying public comment on this item.

Ms. Olsen stated that the City Council unanimously (5-0 vote) adopted the Historic Designation Criteria Guidelines item; however, the Mills Act Waiting List item was postponed with a vote of 4-1, with Councilmember Denny voting against the recommendation. Ms. Olsen encouraged the Commission to view the City Council recording for further explanation on the vote.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Wayne and Debbie Hunter, the new owners of 1010 Glorietta introduced themselves and said they are excited to work with the Commission on future modifications to their home.

Chairperson Ryan stated that a portion of the discussion at yesterday's City Council meeting involved the 75-year age requirement for homes that are designated historic. Mr. Ryan commented that City policy states that if a person's home is newer than 75 years of age and meets other criteria, it can possibly be designated historic. He suggested that if a person is planning to make renovations to their property, it is important to speak with City staff to obtain information about historic designation and Mills Act. Mr. Ryan said that other discussions at the City Council meeting involved the option of public outreach in the form of communicating with property owners whose homes are between the age of 50 and 75 years of age, and the possibility

of having the Commission review all demolition and alteration permits for homes that are 50 years of age.

Commissioner St. Denis said she was comfortable with the fact that the City Council postponed the age threshold item. She said there is much misunderstanding on why the Commission is requesting the age threshold changed from 75 to 50 years, and there appears to be some unnecessary disquietude among homeowners.

Commissioner Crenshaw said this was the best reception the Commission has experienced during their many presentations to City Council. She feels that although City Council acknowledged there are issues with preservation in Coronado that have not been addressed, she is uncertain if the City Council is accurately hearing what the Commission is attempting to communicate. Ms. Crenshaw said City Council may be concerned with the Commission not including the larger homes, when in fact the Commission is busy attempting to preserve the homes which have requested to be demolished. Ms. Crenshaw feels that City Council may be missing the entire purpose of the Commission selecting certain homes to be preserved. She said that while some homes may be eligible for designation if there is no age criteria, it does not mean that the home will be eligible to be designated historic, only that it may be eligible to be reviewed in association with a demolition request. She said the Commission is looking for unique homes to be preserved.

Commissioner McGowen said that based on the statements made at the City Council meeting yesterday, it appears that the Commission has much work to do to educate the public on precisely what the Commission does and the tools with which the Commission bases their decisions. She feels that the legal implications of the Mills Act formulation was clearly discussed and that it will take time to review the first portion and by that time there should be a better understanding of the legal ramifications. She said that overall, it was a very interesting meeting.

PUBLIC HEARING

HAP 2011-08 MARK AND JULIE FRAHM – Request for a Historic Alteration Permit including zoning exceptions related to setbacks for the property addressed as 824 Adella Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

Vice Chair St. Denis asked if there was an ownership change for the property located at the south side of the aforementioned property. She asked if additional information from the adjoining property owners had been received.

Ms. Olsen said that no communication had been received from the adjoining property owner and that a public notice had been sent.

Commissioner Crenshaw said she had spoken with the adjoining property owner last Thursday, and the new property owner indicated she had not spoken with the Frahms yet.

The applicant's representative, Christian Rice, gave a brief overview of the project and answered questions of the Commission. He said that minor changes had been incorporated based on input from the Commission at their last meeting.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if the exterior stucco was being changed.

Mr. Rice said no, the materials are consistent with the existing material.

The applicant, Mr. Frahm, stated that he had spoken with the new neighbors whose property adjoins on the south side. He said they offered no comments regarding the proposed alterations.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair St. Denis said she was thrilled with the design involving the south elevation symmetry as it keeps with the intent of the original architecture. She said she loved the change in the roof heights and the differentiation. She commented that Mr. Rice had previously mentioned that the property owners may subsequently apply for the Mills Act. She stated that one of the Secretary of the Interiors standards that has not been significant thus far in Coronado involves "...the attachment of an exterior addition designed for the new work may be contemporary or may reference design motifs from the historic building. In either case, it should always be clearly differentiated and be compatible in terms of mass, materials, relationships of solids to voids and colors." In other words, compatible but not a copy of. Ms. St. Denis suggested compliance with this standard for the windows above the garage door and asked if the windows are an accordion style.

Mr. Rice said that the current plans show an accordion style window and accordion style door facing the rear yard on the rear elevation.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if this type of accordion style window could be installed at the front of the house.

Mr. Rice said this option could be considered. He noted, however, that the window above the garage is comprised of three windows milled together so although it has the same dimension, it is still a very different design. He felt this window was different enough to comply with the aforementioned standard.

Commissioner Crenshaw stated that on the staff report, it reads "The project does not exceed allowable lot coverage of 50% or maximum allowable Floor Area Ratio (FAR) of 69%..." She asked about the nine bonus features.

Ms. Olsen said the nine bonus features are listed on the site plans. She added that while the features are required to achieve the FAR, using bonus features does not require an exception by the Commission for exceeding FARs.

COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR ST. DENIS MADE A MOTION TO RECOMMEND TO CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL OF THE ISSUANCE OF A HISTORIC RESOURCE ALTERATION PERMIT INCLUDING ZONING EXCEPTIONS RELATED TO THE SETBACKS FOR THE PROPERTY ADDRESSED AS 824 ADELLA AVENUE AND LOCATED IN THE R-1A (SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL ZONE).

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER McGOWEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, McGowen, Ryan, St. Denis
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Jones.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0

Total deliberation time: 36 minutes.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:50 p.m.

Rachel A. Hurst, Director of Community Development,
Redevelopment & Housing Services