HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting July 20, 2011

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3 p.m., Wednesday, July 20, 2011, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Vice Chair St. Denis.

MEMBERS PRESENT:	Crenshaw, Jones, St. Denis
MEMBERS ABSENT:	McGowen (arrived at 3:07 p.m.), Ryan
STAFF PRESENT:	Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner Victor Ravelo, Recording Secretary Martha L Alvarez, Minutes Preparer
CITY ATTORNEY:	Lisa Foster

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of July 6, 2011, were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

There was no separate report.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Holly Nappen, Chairman of the Coronado Historic Association's Preservation Committee, said it is her understanding that the Commission has been tasked by City Council to make recommendations to the current Historic Designation Ordinance. Ms. Nappen said the Preservation Committee would like to voice their support for adapting the City's current directives to be in concert with both the national ordinance as well as those of most other California cities. She said the committee specifically recommends that the 75-year age criteria should be changed to 45 years as it is in the City of San Diego, or at the very maximum, 50 years. Ms. Nappen said the committee also discussed the exploration of possible incentives that would encourage preservation in the commercial sector. The Committee recommends the addition of this topic as a future agenda item for the Historic Resource Commission, in order to encourage fostering of the preservation of the historic commercial properties through both education and possibly some creative incentives.

Vice Chair St. Denis disclosed that she serves on the Coronado Historic Association's Preservation Committee.

Ms. Olsen thanked Ms. Nappen for communicating the Preservation Committee's support for changes to the Historic Designation Ordinance. Ms. Olsen recommended that the Preservation Committee express their support via written correspondence and/or testimony directly to City Council as it would be very helpful. She said that the changes to the Historic Designation Guidelines will be heard by City Council within the next four to six weeks.

Commissioner Crenshaw commended Ms. Olsen on her presentation to City Council given at yesterday's meeting regarding HAP 2011-06 Susannah Farago.

Ms. Olsen said she was pleased to hear comments from members of the City Council praising the Commission's work.

PUBLIC HEARING

NOI 2011-05 **SHERYL AND SCOTT MATNEY** – Notice of Intent to Demolish the Single Family Residence addressed as 435 C Avenue and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Vice Chair St. Denis disclosed that she previously lived at the aforementioned residence.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

Vice Chair St. Denis confirmed that the date of the home's construction is 1920.

The applicant, Sheryl Matney, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions of from the Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Crenshaw said she noticed the house is located between a church and an apartment building, and asked if the house is the only structure zoned R-1B.

Ms. Olsen replied that the entire block is zoned R-1B, and suggested that the apartment building may pre-date current zoning.

Commissioner Jones said the house is cute but she understands the need to make the house larger and bring it up to today's living standards. She said she did not have true cause to deny the request.

Commissioner Crenshaw said the house is unique and wonderful; however, she said the structure does not meet the criteria to designate it historic.

Commissioner McGowen agreed that the structure did not meet the criteria to designate it historic.

Vice Chair St. Denis shared a story about actor Errol Flynn visiting this residence upon accepting an invitation from her uncle. Ms. St. Denis said that Mr. Flynn was filming a movie, "Dive Bomber," while staying at the Hotel del Coronado. Ms. St. Denis said she would support the request.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 435 C AVENUE (NOI 2011-05) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

A. IT DOES NOT EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;

B. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S), OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;

C. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;

D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;

E. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 5042.1 OF THE CALIFORNIA PUBLIC RESOURCES CODE.

THE FOLLOWING CONDITION WAS ADDED:

1. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CITY AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO ALLOW CITY AND/OR THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION AN OPPORTUNITY TO PREPARE A PHOTOGRAPHIC, FILM, VIDEO, OR OTHER APPROPRIATE RECORD OF THE EXTERIOR/INTERIOR OF THE STRUCTURES.

COMMISSION MCGOWEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, Jones, McGowen, St. Denis
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Ryan.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0

There is a 10-day appeal period.

Total deliberation time: 24 minutes.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:24 p.m.

_____

Rachel A. Hurst, Director of Community Development,
Redevelopment & Housing Services