

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

September 1, 2010

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3 p.m., Wednesday, September 1, 2010, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Crenshaw.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Crenshaw, Jones, O'Brien, Ryan, St. Denis

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner  
Martha L Alvarez, Recording Secretary/Minutes Preparer

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of August 18, 2010, were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. Olsen reported that written correspondence had been received by the City and provided to the Commissioners regarding both Notices of Intent to Demolish permit requests. In addition, Ms. Olsen provided a copy of an excerpt about Lamb's Grocery from the book titled "The Coronado We Remember."

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARING

**NOI 2010-10 GERALD AND THELMA NATHANSON** – Notice of Intent to Demolish the commercial building addressed as 711 Fourth Avenue and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicant's representative, John Campisano, 334 G Avenue, provided a brief overview of the request and answered questions of the Commission.

Commissioner St. Denis asked about the length of time the business has been closed.

Mr. Campisano replied that it has been closed for several years.

## PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

## COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner St. Denis said she was not passionate about preserving the structure although she could certainly make a case about the property's historicity. She inquired about zoning requirements if the structure is demolished.

Ms. Olsen responded that current zoning is single family residential. Its existing use is grandfathered as legal non-conforming; however, the City cannot require that the property owner continue with this same use.

Vice Chair Jones noted that the structure served as a small, useful grocery store at one time; however, it seems these types of businesses have mostly disappeared. She said she visited the site and confirmed that the area is forlorn, not pedestrian friendly, and the structure appears to have no redeeming physical qualities. Ms. Jones said she would support the request for demolition.

Commissioner Ryan said the structure's use is historic but the building is not. He said the underlying zoning is residential and he would like it to return to same.

Commissioner O'Brien agreed that the structure would not meet the criteria to deem it historic.

Chairperson Crenshaw concurred that this is not an historic site.

## COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER ST. DENIS MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 711 FOURTH AVENUE (NOI 2010-10) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

- A. IT DOES NOT EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY, SPECIFICALLY JOHN R. LAMB, WHO OWNED AND OPERATED THE LAMB GROCERY FOR OVER 40 YEARS;
- C. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL

STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;

D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;

E. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 5024.1 OF THE CALIFORNIA PUBLIC RESOURCES CODE.

THE FOLLOWING CONDITION WAS ADDED:

1. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CITY AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO ALLOW CITY AND/OR THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION AN OPPORTUNITY TO PREPARE A PHOTOGRAPHIC, FILM, VIDEO, OR OTHER APPROPRIATE RECORD OF THE EXTERIOR/INTERIOR OF THE STRUCTURE.

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, Jones, O'Brien, Ryan, St. Denis.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

**NOI 2010-11 JON A. PALMIERI** – Notice of Intent to Demolish the single family residence and garage living quarters addressed as 1105 F Avenue and 808 Tolita Avenue located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicant's representative, Jon Palmieri, 1000 G Avenue, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions of the Commission.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the windows located on the enclosed front porch are original to the structure.

Cara Clancy, 1000 G Avenue, said the mullions, glass and dividers are a different size than the ones on the side of the house. The windows are also vertical sliders that have been painted shut. Ms. Clancy displayed pictures of the front façade and explained that there is an odd window located at the center of the front porch. A house built during this time (1912) likely would have had the front door at this location and its windows on the side of the house. When the front porch was enclosed, it appears that a patio type door was installed as the front entrance; a window placed where the original door was located; and the other two doors made to match the

door at the front. Ms. Clancy said that, based on the original building permit and fire map, there was definitely an open porch.

Ms. Olsen clarified that the intent of the staff report was to communicate that the porch was enclosed at some point; however, the permits were unclear as to when this was done and the Sanborn maps likely were not updated to reflect this change.

Vice Chair Jones said this was conjecture as she visited the site and can confirm that the glass is very old.

Ms. Clancy stated that the front porch was never part of the original house.

Chairperson Crenshaw replied that the addition is over 75 years old.

Ms. Clancy asked if any alterations made to an original structure which is over 75 years old are automatically considered historic.

Commissioner St. Denis replied that the alterations can become part of the structure's history.

Ms. Clancy said clarification was needed on the meaning of "original." She added that with the limited amount of existing records, they are restricted to relying on what can be proved with the available documentation.

Mr. Palmieri noted that a major permit was issued in 1937. It is unlikely that, if there was an enclosure, it happened any time before 1937.

Ms. Clancy said there are two permits that represent significant changes and they are very non-specific so it is unclear as to what the changes were and when they occurred. She noted that if the changes occurred in 1937, it would make them 73 years old.

Commissioner Ryan noted for the record that a letter that was received by the Commission from Wayne Hunter, AIA. He asked Mr. Hunter to address the Commission.

Wayne Hunter, 1520 Tenth Street, made himself available to answer questions from the Commission.

Commissioner Ryan asked if Mr. Hunter had done these types of evaluations before and requested that he explain a comment in his letter which reads, "This organization unwittingly catches property in their net."

Mr. Hunter said he is not an historic preservation architect and explained that his comment was meant to share the community's perspective via his opinion as both an architect and a resident of the community.

Commissioner Ryan commented that Mr. Palmieri addressed in his presentation all of the specific elements in the City's charter which included arbitrary events and people, and not just information about the building itself.

## PUBLIC COMMENT

Ellen Lindsen, 975 B Avenue, said she is an attorney from Arizona and recently moved to Coronado. With regard to the Historic Resource Commission and demolition permits, she expressed concern that the criteria are vague which creates problems for the Commission because it requires the member's input when making a decision. She stated that decisions need to be balanced and reasoned and commended the applicants for their presentation. She said that the Commission's focus on whether the windows are original to the structure is irrelevant because the criteria are whether the home has historic value. She stated that if a determination about the windows were necessary, it should be made by professionals and not by residents of the community who lack the knowledge or expertise to make that determination. She stated that the evaluation made by Dr. Brandes and "Bunny" MacKenzie about the home's historicity should be carefully considered, especially since Dr. Brandes is the expert.

Susan Keith, 801 Tolita Avenue, said she served on the Historic Resource Commission and was instrumental in persuading the City Council to allow the Commission to use SourcePoint as a basis for some of their later work. Ms. Keith confirmed that many errors were found on SourcePoint and, therefore, it was absurd to imply that Dr. Brandes and Ms. MacKenzie purposely omitted this property from the list because it was not historic. Ms. Keith said this home should be identified not only with Ms. MacKenzie but also with Bill Weber, Ret. U.S. Navy Captain who fought at the battle of Midway and who was honored for his service by the Navy. In addition, Ms. Keith said the architecture style reflects the beach cottage Craftsman home that was so well noted in Coronado.

Gerry MacCartee, 836 D Avenue, said that one criterion which a home must meet to be considered historic is that it is one of the few remaining examples in the City possessing a type of architectural style. She said this cottage is one of the few remaining that forms an anchor to two blocks that are virtually unchanged and whose beauty and charm has beckoned to those that love it and those who wish to tear it down. Ms. MacCartee said that the house is surrounded on one side by original homes which include the Requa mansion, and on the other side by small cottages that define what Coronado once was. She said this house significantly contributes to the character of the entire neighborhood.

Tina Davis, daughter of Ret. U.S. Navy Captain Bill Weber, said she lived in this residence for one-year-and-a-half when her parents purchased the home in 1960. She stated her father recently passed away. Her father retired from the Navy after 30 years of service. He purchased the home as a retirement investment and it was used as a rental from 1962 through 1976. He lived in the smaller property for the first few years and in 1991, he moved into the main house. She commented that her father was always known as "Bill" and preferred not to be addressed as "Captain" because he was no longer serving in the Navy and felt it was no longer appropriate. Ms. Davis said she has worked as an interior designer and has studied architecture. She has visited the house over the years as she has been living in Coronado since 1976, and would currently describe the home as "charming" but does not consider it an example of any type of special cottage style. She does not feel that the house has any significant features such as a unique roofline, but would say that the windows are the home's best feature; however, it is unclear whether the windows are original to the structure because of the enclosure of the porch. She opined that it would be difficult for a modern-day family to live in this house because of the home's small size and unusual interior orientation.

## COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair Jones said the house was built in 1912, has a good presence, and displays some physical charm that could be enhanced. She said the house's age and whether it is livable are the key factors in her decision to support the request—not the age of the windows or whether the porch was enclosed. Ms. Jones agreed that changes have occurred to the home over the years, but acknowledged that the house is old and changes are necessary. In addition, she is taking into account the notable persons who resided at the home.

Commissioner St. Denis agreed. In response to the public comment made by Ms. Lindsen, Ms. St. Denis said she is one of several professionals serving on the Commission; is a partner in an architectural firm, St. Denis & Associates; and holds a degree in architecture. She and her husband, who is a licensed California architect (since 1972), have both worked on many historic homes in this community and consider themselves very knowledgeable in this area. Ms. St. Denis said the home meets the criteria to be deemed an historic resource. One of the criterion the Commission reviews is the home's historic context. She considers this home to be pure in its neighborhood context as the cottage is located on a very prominent corner one block from the beach. The persons associated with this house are important to the cultural and military history of Coronado, e.g. Ms. MacKenzie was born at this residence and visited the community often to tell stories about the home and the neighborhood.

Commissioner Ryan commended the applicant's presentation. He said this area is one of the last potential historic districts that exist in the community that has maintained its historic context. He agreed that Ms. MacKenzie and William Weber should be considered special persons in local history.

Commissioner O'Brien said the Commission's mission is to assist, aid and help applicants by providing benefits in order to obtain a similar goal. In this particular instance, the applicant is a professional in the business and is familiar with the rules; however, they have not asked the Commission for assistance. Mr. O'Brien said he has difficulty supporting 1) Criteria A because of the number of owners and modifications to the structure; 2) Criteria B because Ms. MacKenzie was identified with another residence for most of her career, and Mr. Weber has been lauded and honored for his military service in other ways; and 3) Criteria C because it is not an unusual or unique structure. He would prefer that the house be restored; however, if the applicant is not interested in doing so, he will support the request.

Chairperson Crenshaw disagreed. She said that the house has a very unique Craftsman bungalow architectural style and although the house is not listed in the SourcePoint, it was listed by the City in the Coronado Preservation Resource (CPR) list as a potential historic structure that should be saved and preserved. In addition, Ms. Crenshaw said the home is located in a potential historic district and the front façade, with the exception of the porch enclosure, has not changed in dimension or structure since 1912. Ms. Crenshaw added that while it does not contribute to the historic significance of the house, it is interesting to note that in 1950, her mother purchased this home. She stated that she will not support the request.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER ST. DENIS MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURES ADDRESSED AS 1105 F AVENUE AND 808 TOLITA AVENUE (NOI 2010-11) DO MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY, AS AN INTACT EXAMPLE OF THE CRAFTSMAN BUNGALOW, AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE WHICH IS A SPECIAL ELEMENT OF CORONADO'S CULTURAL, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY, SPECIFICALLY ALMA "BUNNY" MACKENZIE, WHO CONTRIBUTED TO HISTORIC PRESERVATION IN CORONADO THROUGH DECADES OF PRESERVATION ADVOCACY AND CO-FOUNDED THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION; AND WILLIAM WEBER, WHO FOUGHT AT THE BATTLE OF MIDWAY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE CRAFTSMAN BUNGALOW ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;
- E. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 5024.1 OF THE CALIFORNIA PUBLIC RESOURCES CODE.

CHAIRPERSON CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, Jones, Ryan, St. Denis.  
NAYS: O'Brien.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-1.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

## DISCUSSIONS

### **HR 2010-05** **CITY OF CORONADO** – Discussion regarding historic options for historic districts. *(continued from the meeting of August 18, 2010)*

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

Commissioner Ryan suggested that the Commission not make the requirements too restrictive so as not to affect individual property rights. He said this suggestion should be given to City Council rather than have them use an arbitrary number.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if City Council suggested using the 75% property owner consent.

Ms. Olsen replied that the current Ordinance reads, "...75% of the property owners of contributing resources must agree or support the district in order for it to become a district." The issue with how the Ordinance is written is that 75% of the "contributing resources" could equal to a very small number of property owners deciding for an entire district. During Council discussion, the Mayor said he interpreted the Ordinance to read that support is required by 75% of the entire district, contributors and non-contributors, and indicated he would support an Ordinance that used this percentage. Ms. Olsen said that Councilmember Ovrom also agreed with the Mayor's interpretation of the current Ordinance and stated he would support the 75% property owner consent as well. Ms. Olsen said one of the reasons that an historic district has not been achieved is because the Ordinance defines a contributing resource as a designated resource. This means that 75% of the properties in a proposed district must already be designated resources before a district can be brought forward.

Commissioner Ryan commented that the City's requirements are so difficult that it will be difficult to establish a district. He understands that other cities are using 51% property owner consent to form a district. He suggested a hold harmless clause for properties that are non-historic.

Ms. Olsen said that 51% consent appears to be the most common number.

Chairperson Crenshaw asked about the comment made by Marie Nelson of the Office of Historic Preservation which reads, "We do not support the idea of requiring owner consent..."

Ms. Olsen said it is an extreme view and reflects the onus of the Historic Resource Commission to protect the historic resources of a city. She said there are cities whose Historic Resource Commission designates the district regardless of owner consent.

Commissioner Ryan said this idea would work nicely in the presentation to City Council as it would show an extreme solution versus a more practical one.

Chairperson Crenshaw said that incentives should be considered for forming an historic district.

Commissioner St. Denis noted that staff had provided website information which listed benefits of local historic districts ([www.nps.gov/hps/workingonthepast/definehd.htm](http://www.nps.gov/hps/workingonthepast/definehd.htm)).

Ms. Olsen said she would put together a draft Ordinance for Commission review based on information received at today's meeting.

The Commission agreed to the following:

1. Percentage of owner consent required to form a district: 51%.
2. Percentage of properties required to be contributing resources: 51%.
3. Regulation of Contributing Resources: All modifications to Contributing resources require an Historic Alteration Permit, with regulation under the Secretary of Interior's Standards; and District Design Guidelines, where applicable.
4. Regulations of Non-Contributing Resources: Additions and new construction require an Historic Alteration Permit, with regulation under the Secretary of the Interior's Standards; and District Design Guidelines, where applicable. Projects are reviewed for their impact on the Historic District as a whole only. Modifications other than additions and new construction do not require a Historic Alteration Permit or Historic Resource Commission (HRC) review.

**Commission direction regarding requests by Commissioners Crenshaw and Ryan to docket discussion items on a future agenda.**

Chairperson Crenshaw made a motion to docket the following item, as requested by Chairperson Crenshaw: Options for Preservation of Modern Resources in Coronado.

Commissioner St. Denis seconded the motion.

Ayes: Crenshaw, Jones, O'Brien, Ryan, St. Denis.  
Nays: None.  
Absent: None.  
Abstain: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

Chairperson Crenshaw made a motion to docket the following item, as requested by Commissioner Ryan: Visibility of mechanical equipment on Historic Resources as part of an Historic Alteration Permit application.

Commissioner Ryan seconded the motion.

Ayes: Crenshaw, Jones, O'Brien, Ryan, St. Denis.  
Nays: None.  
Absent: None.  
Abstain: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

Commissioner Ryan made a motion to docket the following item, as requested by Commissioner Ryan: The Mills Act as it relates to modifications to Historic Resources, specifically the idea of a scaled tax benefit based on the level of modifications.

Commissioner O'Brien seconded the motion.

Ayes: Crenshaw, Jones, O'Brien, Ryan.  
Nays: St. Denis.  
Absent: None.  
Abstain: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-1.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:15 p.m.

---

Rachel A. Hurst, Director of Community Development,  
Redevelopment & Housing Services