

CORONADO DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

May 12, 2010

The regular meeting of the Coronado Design Review Commission was called to order at 3:04 p.m., Wednesday, May 12, 2010, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Reed.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Hammett, Jones, Reed, and Shallan

MEMBERS ABSENT: Turpit

STAFF PRESENT: Peter Fait, Associate Planner
Martha L Alvarez, Recording Secretary, Minutes Preparer

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Minutes of April 14, 2010, were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Commission's Summer Schedule.

The Commission discussed their schedules and agreed that no meetings would be cancelled.

Urgency Item

Request to add DR 16-09 Emerald City, 1118 Orange Avenue, to the agenda of May 12, 2010

Mr. Fait reported that an item requiring immediate action by the Commission had been received by staff after the agenda had been posted. The applicant requests approval of a change in light fixtures/type of lighting before their store opens on Friday, May 14. Mr. Fait stated in order for the item to be heard as an urgency item, the Commission must make a determination that a need for immediate action exists. The determination must be made by a two-thirds affirmative vote. If less than two-thirds of the members are present, the vote must be unanimous.

Vice Chair Shallan asked that staff provide clarification on the definition of "urgency" as he had a concern about the public not being noticed.

Mr. Fait said the request was reviewed by the City Attorney, and based on the information provided, Mr. Fait feels that this request meets the definition of an urgency item.

Chairperson Reed asked if this item could be placed on the next agenda and if this action would prevent the applicant from opening their store.

Mr. Fait responded that it would not prevent the applicant from opening their store; however, he would like to get the project finalized before the store opens, otherwise a temporary certificate of occupancy or temporary final will need to be processed. It would be much easier if staff resolved the design issues before the grand opening.

Vice Chair Shallan asked if the City Attorney was comfortable with the Commission acting on this item.

Mr. Fait responded yes.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER SHALLAN MADE A MOTION TO ADD ITEM DR 16-09, EMERALD CITY, 1118 ORANGE AVENUE, AS THE THIRD ITEM ON THE AGENDA.

COMMISSIONER HAMMETT SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Hammett, Jones, Reed, Shallan.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Turpit.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

None

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

DR 15-09 CORONADO FIREHOUSE RESTAURANT – Request for design approval for a revision to the previously approved exterior remodel to the existing commercial building located at 124-128 Orange Avenue within the Orange Avenue Corridor Specific Plan/C (commercial) Zone.

Commissioner Hammett recused himself and stepped down from the dais.

Mr. Fait presented the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicant's representative, Jim Biafore, 924 F Avenue, provided a brief overview and answered questions of the Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Jules Wilson, 677 7th Avenue #128, San Diego, said she liked the project and was pleased with the concept.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Reed said she liked the project, was pleased with the proposed colors, and had no issues with the roll-up doors.

Commissioner Jones said the project is great and unique.

Vice Chair Shallan said he liked it.

COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR SHALLAN MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE REQUEST TO REPLACE THE TWO LARGE FRONT DOORS WITH ROLL-UP GLASS DOORS AND TO CHANGE THE WINDOW AND DOOR TRIM COLOR TO "HARVEST CRANBERRY."

COMMISSIONER JONES SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Jones, Reed, and Shallan.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT: Hammett, Turpit.

ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

There is a 15-day appeal period.

Commissioner Hammett returned to the dais at 3:15 p.m.

DR 2010-09 CITY OF CORONADO – Recommendation from the Public Art Subcommittee that "Californiascope" Urban Tree by Harmon Nelson, Vicki Leon and Steve Riggs be located on the Glorietta Bay Promenade behind the Community Center at 1845 Strand Way.

Mr. Fait presented the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

Artist Harmon Nelson gave a brief description of the art piece, and answered questions from the Commission.

Chairperson Reed asked if the material used on the art piece contained any sharp edges that may be a safety issue for children playing near the piece.

Mr. Harmon responded that the chain used on the art piece had been sanded and there were no rough edges. In addition, the art piece was on display at the Embarcadero for one year without incident.

Chairperson Reed asked if the platform base is separate from the art piece. She understands that the base was brought in to provide wheelchair access.

Mr. Harmon said part of the base may need to be kept in order to meet ADA requirements.

Chairperson Reed asked if the base can be re-painted to match the concrete sidewalk

Mr. Harmon indicated this could be done.

Commissioner Jones asked if the art material is impervious to salt air.

Mr. Harmon said it has held up very well.

Commission Jones asked about required maintenance for the art piece.

Mr. Harmon said he would provide monthly maintenance for the art piece.

Mr. Fait reminded the Commission that the art piece is on loan to the City.

Chairperson Reed said the Public Art Subcommittee discussed the art piece being on a temporary loan to the City; however, the long term goal is for the City have a revolving art display program in the future. For example, different art pieces such as “The Trees” exhibits could be displayed and changed out periodically.

Mr. Fait added that if Council accepts the base from the Coronado Historical Association, the base will accommodate “The Trees” exhibits as it was designed specifically for the “Urban Trees” art pieces.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Susan Enowitz, Public Art Subcommittee member and Director of the Coronado Historical Association, 1100 Orange Avenue, commented that the art piece is beautiful, joyful, unique, and interactive. She feels that the art piece is well suited for the proposed location. In addition, the Historical Association Board feels the platform base is a wonderful donation to the City of Coronado.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Jones said the art piece is a wonderful and exciting addition to public art, and she will support the request.

Commissioner Hammett commented that he serves as a member on the Public Art Subcommittee and was involved in the process. He said that the Subcommittee is trying to expose the community to public art by placing the art pieces in locations where the public frequents. He said that he appreciates the artist loaning the art piece to the City, and is thankful to the Historical Association for donating the base. He commented that the Public Art Subcommittee continues to receive generous donations from contributors and artists.

Chairperson Reed said she also serves on the Public Art Subcommittee. She said this particular piece of artwork will appeal to children, and feels that the proposed site is perfect for this type of artwork as the Community Center is about bringing families together. She also commented that

because the base is movable, future pieces may be located elsewhere. Ms. Reed thanked the artist for sharing his artwork with the City.

Vice Chair Shallan said he is appreciative to the artist for the loan, but commented that he does not feel that the Community Center is the best location for this type of whimsical art. He clarified he is not opposed to the piece itself, but would prefer to see an art piece that is more in line and in favor with the design of the City Hall and Community Center buildings.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER JONES MADE A MOTION TO RECOMMEND TO CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL OF THE REQUEST, AS SUBMITTED.

COMMISSIONER HAMMETT SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Hammett, Jones, Reed.
NAYS: Shallan.
ABSENT: Turpit.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-1.

There is a 15-day appeal period.

DR 16-09 EMERALD CITY –Amendment to request for design approval for an exterior remodel to the existing commercial building located at 1118 Orange Avenue within the Orange Avenue Specific Plan/C (Commercial) Zone.

Mr. Fait presented the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicant's representative, Jules Wilson, 677 7th Avenue #128, San Diego, provided a brief overview of the amended request and answered questions of the Commission.

Vice Chair Shallan asked if the original approval included light fixtures over an awning.

Ms. Wilson said approval had been given for the light fixtures both with and without the extension. The light fixtures with the extensions were to be placed over the awnings, and the light fixtures without the extensions were to graze the columns in between the awning in a linear fashion.

Ms. Wilson said that sometimes design evolves, and she apologized for not placing proper importance in submitting in advance the proposed change to the Commission for their review.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ilene Hoya, 1023 B Avenue, commented that designer Jules Wilson has added sophistication to the design.

Susan Enowitz, 1100 Orange, stated she was very impressed with the design, and would support the request. She hoped that the Commission would approve the request as presented as the light fixtures add light to a normally dark block.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Reed said that she visited the site twice. Her first visit occurred at about 7:30 p.m. and she noticed that the lights had not been adjusted so there were “hot spots” of bright light. This, as well as the light emanating from the sconces, was of concern because of the brightness. Adjusting the lights would be an improvement; however, when she returned for a second visit, the lights continued to be a concern. Ms. Reed commented that the applicant has done a wonderful job with the building; however, the interior and exterior light fixtures create excessive illumination. Ms. Reed asked if the wattage could be decreased. She also asked if the interior lights were temporary.

Ms. Wilson agreed that the interior lights are excessively bright; however, this is temporary while staff is preparing for its grand opening.

Chairperson Reed said she was pleased to hear this, but requested that the wattage on the exterior sconces be brought down to a 25-watt level. She also requested that the remaining exterior lights be lessened slightly. She complimented Ms. Wilson on a well done project.

Commissioner Jones said she visited the site during the evening hours. She also expressed concern about the overly bright lights emanating from the exterior sconces, and requested that the wattage be decreased. She stated she was pleased with the building’s exceptional appearance.

Vice Chair Shallan said he liked the project, although he agreed the exterior sconce lighting could be toned down slightly. He added that in a retail environment, bright lights are essential.

Commissioner Hammett said he was not in favor of legislating light wattage and pointed out that the Commission approved the Village Theatre with a spotlight which will be very bright. He said he preferred not to require specific wattage as a condition to the approval.

Vice Chair Shallan suggested that the applicant adjust the character of the sconces.

Chairperson Reed asked if the interior lighting will decrease once the store opens.

Ms. Jules confirmed that once the store opens, all of the interior lights will be on. She said she would be pleased to lower the light wattage to appease the Commission’s concerns.

Chairperson Reed clarified that the Commission does have the right to legislate the exterior light wattage as it affects the exterior appearance of buildings on the Orange Avenue Corridor. She felt that it is important for the Commission to address issues that appear out of place, and added that since the applicant is willing to do that, she will support the request.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER JONES MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE REQUEST AS SUBMITTED, WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

1. THE EXTERIOR LIGHT FIXTURES ARE APPROVED AS INSTALLED.
2. THE WATTAGE ON THE EXTERIOR LIGHT FIXTURES (SCONCES) BE REDUCED.

COMMISSIONER HAMMETT SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Hammett, Jones, Reed, and Shalan.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT: Turpit.

ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

There is a 15-day appeal period.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:52 p.m.

Rachel A. Hurst
Director of Community Development, Redevelopment
& Housing Services