HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting April 21, 2010

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:03 p.m., Wednesday, April 21, 2010, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Crenshaw.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Crenshaw, Jones, O'Brien, and Ryan

MEMBERS ABSENT: St. Denis

STAFF PRESENT: Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner
Martha L Alvarez, Recording Secretary, Minutes Preparer

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of April 7, 2010, were continued to the next regular meeting due to a lack of quorum.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. Olsen thanked Ms. Alvarez on Administrative Professionals' Day for a job well done.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Martha Jay, 700 B Avenue, said she and property owners in her neighborhood have an interest in designating their district as historic. She expressed concern, however, because one of the non historic houses on her block has undergone significant changes.

Chairperson Crenshaw responded that the Commission is currently working on proposed changes to the Municipal Code Ordinance regarding Historic Preservation.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

NOI 3-10 **ROHAN FAMILY TRUST** – Notice of Intent to Demolish the duplex addressed as 1014 and 1016 Flora Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. *(continued from the meeting of April 7, 2010)*

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicant, Tracy Rohan, 9257 Cadenza Court, Sacramento, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions of the Commission.

The applicant, Tim Rohan, 108 D Avenue, provided an overview supporting the request and answered questions of the Commission.

The applicant, Margaret Rohan, 8100 Lincoln Street, Lemon Grove, read into the record a list of changes made to the original structure since it was built, and answered questions of the Commission.

Commissioner Ryan asked if applicants are aware that if they demolish the structure, they will be giving up the garage located at the rear of the property.

The applicants acknowledged their understanding.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair O'Brien stated he was absent at the previous meeting but reviewed the minutes. He stated that given the information and photographs as presented, he would support the request.

Commissioner Ryan agreed. He said the original structure was very pleasant looking; however, the building today does not resemble the original structure. He acknowledged that the structure is non conforming to the neighborhood. Mr. Ryan disclosed that he had spoken to surrounding neighbors and they opined that there would be no loss if the structure was demolished.

Chairperson Crenshaw read into the record that Commissioner St. Denis had communicated via an email that she would urge the Commission to save the home.

Chairperson Crenshaw then added that she was contacted by surrounding neighbors who expressed support of the request. Ms. Crenshaw said she does not feel that the structure meets the criteria to be designated historic and will therefore not support the request.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 1014 AND 1016 FLORA AVENUE (NOI 3-10) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

A. IT DOES NOT EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;

B. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S), OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;

C. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;

D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;

E. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME).

THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS WERE ADDED:

1. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CITY AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO ALLOW CITY AND/OR THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION AN OPPORTUNITY TO PREPARE A PHOTOGRAPHIC, FILM, VIDEO, OR OTHER APPROPRIATE RECORD OF THE EXTERIOR/INTERIOR OF THE STRUCTURES.

2. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION (CHA) AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO PROVIDE CHA WITH AN OPPORTUNITY TO SALVAGE HISTORIC BUILDING MATERIALS FOR THEIR "KEEP IT IN CORONADO" RE-USE PROGRAM.

COMMISSIONER RYAN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, Jones, O'Brien, and Ryan.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: St. Denis.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0

There is a 10-day appeal period.

DISCUSSIONS

HRPA 1-10 **CITY OF CORONADO** – Commission discussion regarding the results of the Mills Act Agreement prioritization process for applications submitted in 2009. *(continued from the meeting of April 7, 2010)*

Vice Chair O'Brien recused himself and stepped down from the dais.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda and displayed the results of the Mills Act Agreement prioritization process for applications submitted in 2009. At the request of the Commission, she confirmed that she would provide supporting documentation at the next regular meeting for the project located at 1112 Churchill Avenue.

Discussion regarding City Council action at their meeting of April 20, 2010, regarding direction to staff regarding the terrazzo sidewalk adjacent to the Village Theater in the 800 block of Orange Avenue.

Ms. Olsen reported that at its April 20 meeting, the City Council approved the Historic Resource Commission's recommendation to preserve the existing terrazzo, using Option 3, which is repair of the unsafe and some of the unsightly cracks, the use of the existing tree wells, and repair of the parking meter bases.

Discussion regarding City Council action at their meeting of April 20, 2010, concerning Introduction of an Ordinance Amending Chapter 70.20 of the Municipal Code to Amend Subsection (A) of Section 70.20.090 and Subsection (B) of Section 70.20.100 regarding Historic Preservation Benefits and Process; Amending Chapter 70.22 to amend Subsection (G) of Section 70.22.190 regarding City Council Review of Historic Alteration Permits with Code Exceptions; and adding Section 70.22.280 regarding Expiration Dates for Historic Alteration Permit Approvals (HR 5-09 City Of Coronado).

Ms. Olsen reported that at their April 20 meeting, the City Council approved unanimously the Historic Resource Commission's recommendation to amend the Municipal Code Ordinance regarding Historic Preservation. Ms. Olsen stated that the Historic District portion of the Ordinance was removed for further discussion and examination by staff. City Council is aware that this section will return before Council for approval.

Discussion regarding update of Historic Preservation Program Applications and Documents.

Ms. Olsen reported that staff has undertaken the task of updating the City's Historic Preservation Program applications and documents. She provided the revised forms to the Commission for their review, and stated that staff will begin using these documents after today's hearing.

Commission direction regarding a request by Commissioner Ryan to docket partial demolition as a discussion item on a future agenda.

Ms. Olsen reported that Commission protocol for docketing an item on a future agenda at the request of a Commissioner requires a majority vote by the Commission.

<u>Commission Action</u>

Chairperson Crenshaw made a motion to approve a request by Commissioner Ryan to docket on a future agenda a discussion regarding partial demolition as it relates to the Notice of Intent process.

Commissioner Jones seconded the motion.

Ayes: Crenshaw, Jones, O'Brien, and Ryan.
Nays: None.
Absent: St. Denis.
Abstain: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

MISCELLANEOUS

May is National Historic Preservation Month

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:38 p.m.

Rachel A. Hurst, Director of Community Development,
Redevelopment & Housing Services