

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

March 3, 2010

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3 p.m., Wednesday, March 3, 2010, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Crenshaw.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, O'Brien, Ryan, and St. Denis

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Senior Planner
Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner
Ed Walton, Director, Engineering & Project Development
Martha L Alvarez, Recording Secretary, Minutes Preparer

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of February 17, 2010, were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

There was no separate Director's report.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Dan Soderberg, Co-Chair of the Neighborhood Historic Preservation Coalition in San Diego, and a member of Save Our Heritage Organization (SOHO), referenced a letter he submitted to the Commission, which communicates his support in saving the Village Theatre terrazzo. He considers it a beautiful design detail of historic movie theatres and feels it really speaks to a period of time in our history when we had neighborhood movie theatres. As a film projectionist working in various theatres in San Diego and Los Angeles, he had the opportunity see many great terrazzo designs, and believes that the Village Theatre terrazzo can be saved.

John Turpit, 740 J Avenue, Commercial Architect, said he was speaking as a Coronado resident and not as a formal member of the Design Review Commission. Mr. Turpit said that Design Review has discussed the terrazzo in terms of the theatre design. As a result, he and Commissioner Jane Reed met on site with City Engineer Ed Walton, and Associate Planner Peter Fait. It was agreed that the terrazzo was damaged but possible solutions for improvements were not readily available. Mr. Turpit suggested meeting with a subcontractor on site to assess the terrazzo, so a subsequent meeting was held. Mr. Turpit said that the subcontractor is a third generation terrazzo expert, and his company had previously repaired cracks on the terrazzo. It was his recommendation that the existing terrazzo should be removed, a new concrete sub-base

poured, and the terrazzo located behind the ticket booth, which is proposed to be covered by carpet, be brought out to the front sidewalk. Mr. Turpit suggested that photographs be taken of the existing pattern, both behind the ticket booth and out on the sidewalk. This pattern can be put into an autocad drawing to an absolute scale. A drawing would be created identical to what currently exists. The expansion joints could be placed, per the subcontractor, in the concrete sub-base so that any cracking occurs only on the brass strips. The result would be a fantastic surface that would look identical to what is currently there. He added that he has spoken to surrounding business owners who have confirmed that persons have slipped on the terrazzo during inclement weather. To address this issues, the subcontractor suggested acid-etching the terrazzo which creates a texture vs. the smooth glass-polish finish.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the Design Review Commission had asked Mr. Turpit to speak before the Commission as a private citizen, or as a representative of Design Review.

Mr. Turpit said he was asked to speak as a citizen.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if this item was on Design Review's agenda.

Mr. Turpit said that one of Design Review's tasks was to determine whether the developer should cover up the terrazzo located in the interior of the theatre.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if Design Review agreed to do this.

Mr. Turpit stated that the business owner decided to expand the snack counter, which in turn invaded part of the terrazzo.

Commissioner Ryan asked about the Design Review process.

Mr. Turpit said Design Review approved the building, the marquee, moving the front part of the theatre out to midpoint where the ticket booth is located, and duplicating the ticket booth.

Commissioner Ryan asked if the interior terrazzo could be saved.

Mr. Turpit said that tenant improvements in the lobby are built over portions of the terrazzo pattern. He feels it should be a complete and not a partial pattern.

Jeff Tyler, 1427 5th Street, said that he has similar sentiments in preserving a terrazzo look and a design that currently exists at the theatre. Mr. Tyler said he is on the staff of Lambs' Players Theatre, which has beautiful terrazzo in front of its theatre. With regard to safety issues, he has spoken to key persons and is not aware of anyone who has slipped or fallen on the terrazzo during inclement weather. He understands that the terrazzo has been treated with an anti-slip coating and dismissed stories he has heard about Lambs' Theatre taking actions during inclement weather (i.e., using sandbags, laying out carpet on the terrazzo).

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HR 2-10 **MATTHEW AND MELISSA PROVENCHER** – Request for historic designation of the single family residence addressed as 455 B Avenue and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicant, Matt Provencher, 455 B Avenue, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions of the Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Jones said the home is lovely. She understands why the house has been featured in magazines and the cover of the telephone book. The house was built in 1919 and faces west so she can understand why the windows and shutters need replacement if they cannot be restored.

Commissioner St. Denis said it is a beautiful, small home. She is pleased to know that the siding is original because she understands that the windows, front door and shutters had been replaced and the front porch extended. She feels the applicant has done a nice job considering the house was built in 1919.

Vice Chair O'Brien said he was fully in support of the request.

Commissioner Ryan agreed, and was pleased that another home has been saved.

Chairperson Crenshaw asked if the applicant was requesting designation for the rear residence.

Mr. Provencher replied that he was requesting designation for the front home only.

Chairperson Crenshaw said the renovation in 2008 included the addition of a second story. She asked if the request was to designate only the front part of the home.

Mr. Provencher replied yes.

Chairperson Crenshaw stated that this is an absolutely exquisite, picturesque cottage, and thanked the applicant.

Ms. McCaull clarified that generally when a property is designated as an historic resource, the entire dwelling is designated. There are times when a property owner will apply for a Mills Act Agreement, and if there has been an addition to the residence, typically the addition is excluded.

Based on previous conversations with the applicant, she does not believe that the applicant is planning to pursue the Mills Act Agreement.

Mr. Provencher said he is interested only in designating his home as historic.

COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 455 B AVENUE TO BE AN HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A) IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S AESTHETIC AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B) IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;
- C) IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE COLONIAL REVIVAL ARCHITECTURAL STYLE;
- D) IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;
- E) IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2, (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 1.9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME).

COMMISSIONER RYAN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, Jones, O'Brien, Ryan, and St. Denis.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

HR 3-10 **TOM AND JEAN MUSTIN** – Request for historic designation of the single family residence addressed as 710 J Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Commissioner St. Denis recused herself from the meeting and stepped down from the dais.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicant, Tom Mustin, 710 J Avenue, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions of the Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Jones said the house is extremely handsome, has a great presence, and deserves historical designation. She said the colors of the home are vibrant, and the home is well deserving of preservation.

Vice Chair O'Brien said that he fully supports the request.

Commissioner Ryan concurred.

Chairperson Crenshaw commented that the house is exquisite and well preserved, and the yard is fabulous. The additions are very well done, and the chimney is original.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 710 J AVENUE TO BE AN HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A) IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S SOCIAL, AESTHETIC AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B) IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY, SPECIFICALLY, REAR ADMIRAL KEMP C. CHRISTIAN WHO BUILT AND LIVED IN THE HOUSE THROUGHOUT HIS LENGTHY NAVY CAREER AND UNTIL HIS DEATH IN 1983;
- C) IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SPANISH COLONIAL REVIVAL ARCHITECTURAL STYLE AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D) IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF ARCHITECT CHRIS COSGROVE;
- E) IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2, (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 1.9 (COMMENCING WITH

SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA
REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME)

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Crenshaw, Jones, O'Brien, and Ryan.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
DISQUALIFIED: St. Denis.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

Commissioner St. Denis returned to the dais at 3:43 p.m.

Ms. McCaull thanked the applicants for their participation in the Historic Preservation Program, and stated that the City will present an historic plaque for their residence at a future City Council meeting.

HAP 2-10 **SHAW WAGENER** – Request for Historic Resource Alteration Permit for installation of solar panels on a historically designated residence addressed as 1156 Isabella Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

Commissioner St. Denis mentioned that this is the second time that a request for installation of solar panels has been presented before the Commission. She asked staff for clarification on whether state law prohibits the Commission from disapproving such requests.

Ms. McCaull clarified that the Commission must make a determination on the location of the solar panels. It is within the Commission's purview to ensure that the panels are located in the most unobtrusive location possible in order to minimize impacts to historical resources. This has been the Commission's policy in the past.

Commissioner Ryan asked for further clarification.

Ms. McCaull responded that the City needs to facilitate the installation of solar panels on buildings. The statute specifically reads that the City cannot require design review for solar panel installation. The idea is to encourage the locations of solar panels throughout the state.

Commissioner Ryan said he is not opposed to such requests and asked for clarification on whether it is city, state, or federal law that requires the approval of solar panels by cities.

Ms. McCaull said that state legislation requires the City to approve these types of requests.

The applicant's representative, Kevin Mulvey, Sullivan Solar Power, 7964 Arjons Drive, San Diego, answered questions from the Commission.

Vice Chair O'Brien asked about his understanding on the legislation regarding solar panels.

Mr. Mulvey said California state law states that requests for solar panel installation cannot be denied for aesthetic purposes. For historic homes, it is required that the integrity of the residences are not jeopardized in any way, i.e. not visible from the street.

Commissioner Ryan asked if solar panels were proposed to be located on the top roof above the second story.

Mr. Mulvey said there will be two rows of tilted solar panels.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the panels will be raised about 12 inches.

Mr. Mulvey said yes. The panels will be angled to face the sun.

Commissioner Jones asked if there will be eight panels.

Ms. Olsen clarified that there will be two rows, with eight panels per each row, with 16 panels in that location.

Commissioner Ryan asked what portion of the panels will be on the upper roof as opposed to the area behind the parapet, which is not visible.

Mr. Mulvey said there are two sections of the roof that have parapets. There will be three rows of panels in the garage area, and another two in areas that are surrounded by parapet walls.

Commissioner Ryan asked if one-third of the panels will be on the large roof and if they will be visible.

Mr. Mulvey said the panels will not be visible from the street.

Commissioner Ryan asked if the panels will be facing north.

Mr. Mulvey said the panels will not be placed on the tilted roof. They will be placed on a flat dormer roof.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the Baby Del would look down on the solar panels as would all of the building's second story windows.

Mr. Mulvey said the applicant is aware that the panels will be visible from the front windows.

Chairperson Crenshaw asked if the panels are photo-electric.

Mr. Mulvey confirmed they were.

Commissioner Jones asked how much the energy corrector would be affected if the 18 panels on the dormer roof were eliminated.

Mr. Mulvey said the panels are 210 watts, which is the typical system that is installed, especially in Coronado. It is a substantial amount of energy, enough to power a small cottage.

Commissioner Jones asked if one-third of the energy provided to the home would be affected if the panels were removed.

Mr. Mulvey replied yes.

Commissioner St. Denis asked about the appearance of the solar panels.

Mr. Mulvey said the solar panels and frames will be a black color so there will not be any type of glare.

Commissioner Jones asked if the panels are a matte finish.

Mr. Mulvey replied yes.

Commissioner Ryan asked if this is a Mills Act home.

Ms. McCaull said the applicant has submitted a Mills Act application, with a request to be treated as a special exception due to the amount of restoration and because it exceeds the established \$15,000 cap. This request has not yet been scheduled.

Commissioner Ryan said he feels that the installation of solar panels may affect the applicant's Mills Act application.

Commissioner Jones said the solar panels at the third level dormer would be more of an issue with Mills Act than the panels on the two flat parapet roofs.

Commissioner Ryan clarified that he is referring to the installation of panels on the F Street side. He suggested placing the panels on the roof that runs parallel to F Street.

Commissioner St. Denis asked when the panels would be installed, if the request is approved.

Mr. Mulvey said the work would be completed within the next three weeks.

Commissioner Ryan said he is concerned about the visibility of the panel "flap" trying to capture the sun. He asked if the panel could be placed flat on the west facing roof that faces the sun.

Mr. Mulvey said the options available when facing the modules depends on the CSI (state rebate) which require that the panels be at a certain orientation in order to receive the state rebate. If the panels are not within that range, the applicant will not be reimbursed which is a significant impact when financing the project. It also has a major impact when it comes to production and

the amount of power it produces. He added that modules cannot face different direction on one inverter; they must all be the same orientation because there cannot be different voltages coming into an inverter at different times of the day—two separate inverters are needed if there are two separate orientations.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if there is new technology where solar panels are part of the roof tiles.

Mr. Mulvey said he has read about solar shingles. He understands they are extremely expensive because it is new technology. Also, the efficiency is nowhere near the same level as photovoltaic modules.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair O'Brien said that, should this structure be considered for Mills Act and the solar panels installed, there are options for the owner and the Commission inasmuch as the solar panels are not permanent—they are removable. To the extent that it creates an issue in the future, there are options. He feels that the applicant has made the best effort and stated that he will support the request.

Ms. McCaull clarified that the Mills Act application has already been approved by the Historic Resource Commission for recommendation to the City Council, and is pending approval by the City Council. It is currently on the waiting list.

Commissioner Ryan asked for clarification.

Ms. McCaull said this is a modification request to an historically designated residence with a pending Mills Act application that is awaiting approval by the City Council.

Commissioner Ryan asked if the request under consideration today would be presented to City Council under the original application should it be approved.

Ms. McCaull replied that anyone may provide comments to the City Council at the time the public hearing is held.

Commissioner Ryan suggested that the applicant may want to consider less power generation and have more panels installed in a less visible location in order to capture the Mills tax reduction which is very valuable to the owner.

Mr. Mulvey said that the California Code states that solar installation cannot be broken down by municipalities and subject to design review for aesthetic purposes. The intent of presenting the information before the Historic Resource Commission today is to ensure that the installation of

the solar panels will not alter the integrity of the home.

COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE REQUEST AS SUBMITTED, AND NOTED THAT THE ALTERATIONS MAY NOT BE CONSISTENT WITH MILLS ACT REQUIREMENTS.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

Commissioner Jones said that the alterations, especially in the dormer area, do not comply with the Secretary of Interior's Standards, with relation to Mills Act.

Commissioner St. Denis agreed. She said she was not aware that it had already been approved for Mills Act.

Commissioner Ryan said that he is uncomfortable approving this request.

Commissioner St. Denis said that the roof is such an important part of the Secretary of Interior's Standards.

Vice Chair O'Brien clarified his motion to read: ...to approve the alteration as submitted, advising the applicant that the alteration may affect his Mills Act application, and that the request cannot be denied due to state law.

Ms. McCaull said that the following information will be conveyed to the City Council when they consider the Mills Act for this property: That the Commission went on record noting that the solar panels that the applicant installed on the top portion of the roof were a concern to the Commission, and that the Commission will not support the Mills Act request. Ms. McCaull added that the property owner would need to be placed on notice as well. She suggested that the Commission consider supporting the installation on the two lower roofs and request a continuance on the placement of the other panels. She also suggested that the applicant do a mock-up so that the Commission could visit the site and make a decision on whether the panels are visible.

AYES: Commissioners O'Brien.
NAYS: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, Ryan, and St. Denis.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion failed with a vote of 1-4.

VICE CHAIR O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE REQUEST AS SUBMITTED.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

THE FOLLOWING CONDITION WAS ADDED:

1. THE SOLAR PANELS ARE APPROVED FOR THE TWO FLAT ROOF AREAS ONLY; THE APPLICANT SHOULD ADDRESS THE VISIBILITY OF THE PANELS

ON THE REAR DORMER ROOF AT A SUBSEQUENT HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION HEARING.

COMMISSIONER ST. DENIS SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, O'Brien, Ryan, and St. Denis.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

HAP 3-10 **RICHARD AND KIRSTEN WILEY** – Request for Historic Resource Alteration Permit for alterations to the historically designated residence addressed as 320 7th Street and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from zoning standards related to setback requirements.

Ms. Olsen introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

Commissioner St. Denis recused herself from the meeting and stepped down from the dais.

The applicants, Richard and Kirsten Wiley, 320 7th Street, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions from the Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Ryan said the applicants have done a terrific job in keeping the historic integrity of the home, and commended the applicants for saving the structure. Mr. Ryan said he has no issues with the installation of the solar panels or the request for wall and pool setbacks.

Vice Chair O'Brien asked if the Commission had purview in granting a reduced pool setback, or if it was a safety issue.

Ms. McCaull said the Commission has the ability to provide a reduced side yard setback.

Vice Chair O'Brien said he supports the request as presented today. He noted that, at a previous meeting, he voted against the request because he was concerned about future alterations. He said he is pleasantly surprised that the addition has been as well done as it is.

Commissioner Jones concurred, and stated that she had an opportunity to visit this charming home when it was on the market. She recognizes that the backyard area is very limited and understands the need for a three-foot pool setback. She asked if the Commission would like to discuss whether the addition reads as a secondary element. She concluded that she is very pleased with every aspect of the addition.

Chairperson Crenshaw thanked the applicants for returning before the Commission, and commended them for a job well done. She stated for the record that the significant amount of alterations may affect the applicants' ability to meet the requirements for Mills Act, should they choose to apply for it in the future.

Ms. Wiley said they are aware of this fact; however, she commented that this is most likely the only home in Coronado that has been affected in this way. She said she and her husband understand that there will be an opportunity to discuss their unique situation and the great lengths they have taken to minimize any type of alteration to the original structure. They hope that this information will be taken into consideration at that time.

Chairperson Crenshaw noted that the alteration request presented today includes the installation of solar panels which will not be visible from the street.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER RYAN MADE A MOTION TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL OF THE REQUEST, AS SUBMITTED.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT COMPLY BUT IS IN THE SPIRIT OF THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

VICE CHAIR O'BRIEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, O'Brien, and Ryan.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
DISQUALIFIED: Commissioner St. Denis.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

Commissioner St. Denis returned to the dais at 4:48 p.m.

HRPA 1-10 **CITY OF CORONADO:** Historic Resource Commission review of Historic Preservation Mills Act applications submitted in 2009 for prioritization and placement on the Historic Preservation Mills Act Waiting List including the following properties: 803 Adella Avenue, 1025 E Avenue, 927 D Avenue, 465 G Avenue, 160 G Avenue, 300 First Street, 921 A Avenue, 731 C Avenue, 1807 Monterey Avenue, 1427 5th Street and 941 J Avenue.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. She stated that the purpose of today's meeting is for the Commission to discuss the material and for owners to present new information to the Commission regarding the historical significance of their residence. Each Commissioner will independently rank each property using a rating sheet, and will turn in the ranking sheets at the next regularly scheduled Historic Resource meeting for staff to determine the prioritization results.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The 2009 applications to be prioritized based upon the application submittal date were as follows:

1. 803 Adella Avenue

David Udell, 1327 8th Street, said the exterior facade as well as the interior of the home has been restored, including all of the woodwork, windows, baseboards, banister, and hardwood floors. The front entry, which is solid oak, was stripped down and restored. Mr. Udell mentioned that the Historical Association held their new membership meeting at his home, and stated that this house is truly a Coronado treasure.

Commissioner St. Denis said that one of the criteria is that a prominent builder or architect is identified.

Mr. Udell said he believes that the architect was from Chicago.

Chris Ackerman, 765 C Avenue, said the applicant did a spectacular job.

2. 1025 E Avenue

There were no comments from the public at this time.

3. 927 D Avenue

There were no comments from the public at this time.

4. 465 G Avenue

There were no comments from the public at this time.

5. 160 G Avenue

Molly Coumes, owner, stated that Cliff May was the architect for the home, and the contractor was Walter Vestal. The original owner, Fred Hyde, had the home built in 1938; he also built the 400 block section of homes on G Avenue, as well as the Village Theatre. Ms. Coumes noted that every original architectural feature in the residence is intact, including the fixtures, hardware, tiles, and wall fountain. She said the house has been restored, not remodeled, including the plaster walls, redwood doors, mahogany floors, and Saltillo tiles that were at one time covered by linoleum. She added that when they purchased their home, they learned that it had been featured in Sunset's Western Ranch Houses, published in 1946. Ms. Coumes asked if the applications being reviewed today will be integrated with the existing list. She also asked if the home's interior is a consideration under Mills Act.

Ms. McCaull responded that the homes that are prioritized this year will not be integrated with the existing list. She added that Mills Act properties in Coronado are not restricted or regulated in terms of changes to the interior features.

Commissioner St. Denis stated that this home may qualify for the National Trust for Historic Preservation, which would take into consideration the interior features of the home.

Commissioner Ryan added that in the event of a "tie breaker," the interior preservation/restoration of a home may raise the points earned.

6. 300 First Street

There were no comments from the public at this time.

7. 921 A Avenue (Commission did not support request)

There were no comments from the public at this time.

8. 731 C Avenue

Chris Harmer, owner, said only the original structure is evaluated. He highlighted the most important features of his home: the restoration of the windows; the original front entrance doors; the front porch, which is not original, but has been made to blend in with the home; and the rear addition, which was set back and is not visible from the street.

9. 1807 Monterey Avenue

Ms. Byrlan Cass-Shively, Designer, Bel Air, Texas, said her clients, Charles and Ginger Nelson, submitted letters of clarification, as did Mr. Gillem, the builder, with reference to the tile roof replacement and the second floor wrought iron balcony balustrade. It was clarified that the tile roof materials were restored and replaced, and the deteriorating wood balcony balustrade was replaced because of its southern exposure. It was noted that the original design drawing called for an iron rail to the balusters and the posts.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the original railings were made of wood or iron.

Ms. Cass-Shively said it was not possible to determine the original material of the railings; however, believes the railings had been previously replaced. She feels fortunate that the original plans for the home were available as they were used as a guide for restoration. No detailed photographs of the building were available.

Commissioner St. Denis commented that the original drawing shows that the only tile on the roof is at the ridge.

Ms. Cass-Shively said that the roof was built with the tile. The house had been poorly maintained for many years and there was an extensive amount of work that was necessary, i.e. mold in the interior and exterior, water damage in the basement. The roof tiles had to be restored and where necessary a small amount of tiles were replaced.

Commissioner Jones asked if a second arch was added during the remodel at the second story level.

Ms. Cass-Shively responded that an arch was added on the side elevation; however, it is not visible from the street. The two arches located in the front façade are original.

10. 1427 5th Street

Jeff Tyler, owner, said the house has been maintained and not restored or renovated since it was built in 1936. He added that the original owner, Lt. Thomas Donald Tyra, was also the designer and the builder of the residence. Mr. Tyler is in the process of obtaining the original plans from Lt. Tyra's daughter.

Commissioner St. Denis commented that Lt. Tyra was a Lieutenant in the Navy and built 12 courtyard homes in the United States.

11. 941 J Avenue

John Powell, owner, stated that one of the previous owners of the residence, Lloyd Harmon, was a significant member in the community. The residence has remained in the same family for 65 years, and the structure is very well preserved. There is much iron work at the façade, and the tiled entryway and curved wood front door with its window and iron grate over it is unique. The residence also has beautiful interior features.

Vice Chair O'Brien said that he was once told by a prior Chairperson that, "When we get to this point, everybody goes back to their respective corners and he or she values the houses as they see it should be valued. The conflicts that arise with neighborhoods, houses and ownership are taken care of by staff, but this is where each Commissioner does it on their own." Mr. O'Brien said this is how the previous Chairperson set the precedent and he chooses to continue this practice. He added that the Commissioners may not necessarily agree but rather they do the best they can with the information that has been presented.

The Commission recessed at 5:28 p.m.

The Commission reconvened at 5:33 p.m. All members were present.

DISCUSSION

HR 4-10 **CITY OF CORONADO:** Discussion regarding proposed improvements to the terrazzo tile adjacent to the Village Theatre in the 800 block of Orange Avenue.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. She stated for the record that written communication in support of replacing the terrazzo was received in a letter signed by Victor Todaro, Coronado Floor and Window; Sam Ramineni, The UPS Store; Kavous Sarkhani, Island Cleaners. Written communication in support of preserving the terrazzo was received from Milford Wayne Donaldson, Architect and State Historic Preservation Officer; Allen A. Hazard, San Diego resident; Susan Enowitz, Executive Director of the Coronado Historical Association; Florence Draper, Coronado resident; Dan Soderberg, San Diego resident; Kelly Purvis, Coronado resident; Rita Sarich, Executive Director, Coronado MainStreet.

Ed Walton, Director of Engineering & Project Development, repeated the PowerPoint presentation given to City Council at their meeting of March 2, and the Historic Resource Commission at their meeting of March 3, regarding the Downtown Enhancement Project which includes the Village Theater. Mr. Walton stated possible options for the repair, restoration, and/or replacement in kind of the terrazzo which extends from the theater to the UPS Store, and answered questions by the Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Gerry MacCartee, 836 D Avenue, read into the record the following statement: "The history of a community and its people is not found in a house or a park or a sidewalk, it is found in the stories

that lie within these things—the stories of who we are, where we came from, how we shaped our town and what made our particular place unique and special. It is the reason I have always in my efforts at historic preservation tried to find compromise. Yes, put a French door in, add another bedroom, repair the damage done by years, but leave us the house, leave us the story that lies within those walls, because once it is demolished, that story and our history is gone forever. We may not be able to repair all the terrazzo back to its original splendor. Parts of it even may have to be replaced but enough of it is there to bring us back to the day when it first graced Orange Avenue, when a town gazed on it in admiration and pride. To replace or replicate it would be to give us a new and lovely terrazzo sidewalk. To restore it would give us our history and our story, and I urge you to do that. Thank you very much.”

Susan Keith, 801 Tolita Avenue, stated that the Commission must first determine if the terrazzo sidewalks are historic before considering possible options for improvements. Ms. Keith said she believes they are historic even if they have not reached 75 years of age because the City Ordinance allows this if it is considered to have “achieved historical significance” She also does not feel that it is the Commission’s obligation to work out the financial aspects of this project. Ms. Keith suggested that the Commission’s recommendation to City Council should be that the terrazzo sidewalk is an historic part of our community and the City Council should do what they can to make sure that it stays as Coronado’s historic fabric.

Bruce Coons, Executive Director, Save our Heritage Organization (SOHO), 51 Aruba Bend, agreed that the Commission must first determine if the site is historic. If it is determined to be historic, the City’s ordinance, which adopted the Secretary of Interiors Standards, makes clear the process for treatment of historic property, which is to “preserve” or, if not possible, “repair rather than replace.” He referenced the letter from Wayne Donaldson, State Historic Preservation Officer, and stated that he has seen many of Mr. Wayne’s projects that have included the repair of terrazzo. Mr. Coons agreed that the street tree plan should be adjusted and that a couple of trees should probably be removed. He stated that he does not see this type of terrazzo anymore and believes that it can be repaired.

Ms. Coons, 51 Aruba Bend, pointed out the sustainability issues. If the terrazzo is demolished, a significant amount of material will be discarded in landfills and a considerable amount of material will be created, which is wasteful and unnecessary.

Phil Monroe, 28 Bahama Bend, thanked the Commissioners for their service. He said he first felt in love with this area when he and Commissioner St. Denis met at the site with a pail of soapy water and a mop—they wanted to take photographs for the public art brochure. He stated that the choice to repair or replace is a false choice—one is either going to “repair or destroy.” He suggested that if the terrazzo is destroyed, a new artist should be brought in to create a new and modern piece for Coronado.

Rita Sarich, Executive Director, Coronado MainStreet, asked staff for clarification on written correspondence received by the City from surrounding business owners as it was her understanding that they were in favor of replacing the terrazzo with a regular sidewalk. Ms. Sarich stated that the MainStreet Board of Directors voted to preserve the terrazzo which reflects MainStreet’s commitment to preservation. She then requested clarification on Design Review’s

position on this issue as she understood that they voted for preservation of the terrazzo. Ms. Sarich thanked the Commission for all of their work.

Chris Ackerman, 761 C Avenue, said that over the years, a major portion of his architectural practice has involved working with historic buildings. He has worked with new terrazzo but has not worked with historic terrazzo. He had the opportunity to meet with Architect Wayne Donaldson, former Chair of the State Historical Building Safety Board, who has worked in both the public and private sectors on restoring historic terrazzo. After visiting the site, Mr. Donaldson concluded that: 1) the terrazzo in front of Village Theatre is highly restorable, 2) restoration is considerably less expensive than demolishing/replicating the terrazzo, 3) most likely the soil has stabilized to a great extent and will not be a major issue once the entire terrazzo is restored, 4) there is a limited but readily available palette of color choices for terrazzo so it should be fairly easy to match to the original color, 5) the color of the terrazzo today is not the same as when it was first placed; therefore, the terrazzo should be grinded down in order to remove the stains, and the original color should then be reintroduced. Mr. Ackerman agreed that damaged sections to the keylines should be removed where required, and the amount of material that needs replacement should be limited. New keylines could be sympathetically introduced which would address existing cracking issues. He suggested that the City make an exception for a couple of tree grates that do not match the other grates, or just simply not place trees in that area.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Ryan stated that it was wonderful to hear from former Historic Resource Commissioners. He said that he did not have an issue with the terrazzo meeting the criteria for age and feels that the terrazzo, façade and sign are the historic fabric. In response to a letter from three business owners regarding the terrazzo being slippery, he says that thousands of people have walked on the sidewalk and there have been no major issues. He pointed out that the City is liable for the sidewalk—not the business owners. Mr. Ryan said he favors retaining, preserving, protecting, restoring, and maintaining the terrazzo, and hopes that it will pass on to the fourth generation.

Vice Chair O'Brien said he followed the renovation and repair of Tent City. Despite everyone's best efforts, the sidewalk and building's façade ended up being, for the most part, new. He believes this may also be the case. Mr. O'Brien stated that he is in favor of the complete removal and replacement of the terrazzo tile.

Chairperson Crenshaw stated that she is in favor of restoration. She stated that her home has terrazzo in many areas including much of the floor space, and she can confirm that she has never experienced any safety issues. She added that the terrazzo has maintained its character and is the most beautiful piece of flooring that one could possibly imagine for any type of living circumstances because it wears so well.

Commissioner St. Denis said discussion regarding the terrazzo in front of the Village Theatre has been going on for a number of years. The terrazzo was scheduled to be demolished in March of 2007. However, the City received many comments from the public and City Council agreed to

postpone demolition of the terrazzo. Ms. St. Denis stated that she served as the Chair of Design Review and also as the Vice Chair of the Public Art Subcommittee at that time. The Design Review Commission, at their meeting of March 28, 2007, unanimously agreed to preserve rather than replace the terrazzo. The Public Art Subcommittee also unanimously voted to preserve the terrazzo. Ms. St. Denis stated that although Design Review Commissioner John Turpit was asked by Design Review to speak before the Commission today, the item was not part of their agenda and public comment was not received; therefore, Mr. Turpit spoke today as a private citizen. She understands Mr. Turpit's position that the terrazzo should be replaced; however, she stated that walking on a perfectly restored terrazzo sidewalk is not the same as walking on the original terrazzo sidewalk, which brings back many of her childhood memories and is very meaningful to her and to the community. This is what makes our history rich. Ms. St. Denis read into the record a letter she wrote to City Council in 2007: "Speaking as a private citizen, I have appreciated this unique piece of public art, the terrazzo, since the 1940s, when I attended Saturday matinees at the Village. My own grown children have similar fond memories of this special block, now desperately in need of some good news. The historical and sentimental reasons mentioned in your staff report is prompting the Design Review Commission's decision and are, in my opinion, two primary defining ingredients in the Village atmosphere and the strong sense of place we treasure in Coronado. The terrazzo in front of both village and Lambs' Players Theatre brings vitality and distinction to our main commercial sidewalks. I remember all the years now that the stage of our beloved Lambs' Players on the 1100 block of Orange was nothing but a boarded up cavity with a storefront men's shop at the sidewalk. And yet, that colorful terrazzo sidewalk in front remained there, faded and in need of repair, marking the site of Coronado's first theatre, constructed in 1917, at the direction of John D. Speckles. What great good fortune that Lambs' Players came along and gave it a new life."

Commissioner St. Denis mentioned that she is now on the Board of Directors of Lambs' Players Theatre, and the subject of the terrazzo has been discussed in great length. When Lambs' Players Theatre moved here almost 20 years ago, the sidewalk was restored with a painted on finish to prevent anyone from slipping. She confirmed that during inclement weather, Lambs' Players has never placed any type of sandbags, signs, or yellow tape in the area of the terrazzo. Further, she has spoken with the Los Angeles Building and Planning Department, as well as the Los Angeles Chamber of Commerce, and understands that the City of Los Angeles appreciates the value of their historic terrazzo sidewalks. They have designated the Clifton Cafeteria on Olive Street as an historic landmark, along with the colorful terrazzo sidewalks in front, which depicts scenes from the 1930s Los Angeles. Clifton Cafeteria was visited by attendees of a National Trust for Historic Preservation Conference recently, just to view the sidewalks. Twelve historic movie theatres on Broadway in Los Angeles have original terrazzo sidewalks, some in better shape than others. One of the best known sidewalks in the worlds, the Hollywood Walk of Fame, covers many city blocks, seven acres, with pink terrazzo stars set in large charcoal terrazzo squares. The entire sidewalk is a designated historic landmark, treasured by the City. No one she spoke with at the City, Chamber of Commerce, or business owners had ever heard of anyone falling or suing. Ms. St. Denis said she is truly grateful that City Council returned this item to the Historic Resource Commission instead of to Design Review because she considers the terrazzo historic.

Commissioner Jones stated that she serves on the Design Review Commission. She communicated that Design Review's concern was whether the repair or restoration would be "worthy of the new theatre facility" and whether the repair would detract from the new façade. There was never any discussion whether the terrazzo was considered historic. The issue before Design Review was whether they would approve the new theatre facility, the marquee, and the lighting. The issue of the terrazzo was discussed and it was Design Review's desire that the repair and restoration be pristine and seamless. If this could not be accomplished, Design Review recommended replicating the terrazzo. Ms. Jones said she is present at today's meeting representing Design Review, to a degree; however, it does not mean that she does not recognize the authenticity and the value of the terrazzo. Ms. Jones said that, at this point, she is much more of a preservationist and is less concerned about the pristine aspect of the sidewalk.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER RYAN MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL THAT THE TERRAZZO IN FRONT OF THE VILLAGE THEATRE BUILDING AND IN FRONT OF THE MERCHANTS OF THE ADJOINING BUILDING IS HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT TO THE COMMUNITY AND WORTHY OF PRESERVATION. THE COMMISSION ALSO RECOMMENDS THAT ALL OF THE TERRAZZO BE RESTORED, PRESERVED AND MAINTAINED. ENGINEERING SHOULD TAKE GREAT CARE IN PRESERVING AND PROTECTING THE TERRAZZO EVEN IF IT MEANS MOVING OR ELIMINATING SOME OF THE TREES AND LIGHTS THAT ARE PART OF THE STREETSCAPE ENHANCEMENT PLAN; OR ALTERNATIVELY, USE EXISTING "FILLED IN" HOLES. EVERY EFFORT SHOULD BE MADE TO BRING THE WATER AND POWER FROM THE CENTER OF ROUTE 75 AS OPPOSED TO FROM THE ALLEY TO PRESERVE AND NOT DAMAGE THE TERRAZZO.

COMMISSIONER ST. DENIS SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, Ryan, and St. Denis.
NAYS: Commissioner O'Brien.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-1.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:30 p.m.

Rachel A. Hurst, Director of Community Development,
Redevelopment & Housing Services