

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

February 3, 2010

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3 p.m., Wednesday, February 3, 2010, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson O'Brien.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, O'Brien, Ryan, St. Denis

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioner Jones

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Senior Planner
Tricia Olsen, Associate Planner
Martha L Alvarez, Recording Secretary, Minutes Preparer

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of December 2, 2009, were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull reported that the City recently issued a building permit for the exterior remodel of the Emerald City building which included changes to the front facade. The item was reviewed by the Design Review Commission but not the Historic Resource Commission because of prior significant alterations to the front facade. During the course of the remodel/partial demolition, the owner and architect/contractor discovered the original facade. The owners now plan on restoring the building to its original look. The item will be re-presented to the Design Review Commission for formal approval.

Ms. McCaull introduced newly hired Associate Planner, Tricia Olsen. Ms. Olsen will be assisting with the implementation of the Historic Preservation Program as well as other activities within the department.

Historic Resource Commission Annual Meeting for Election of Officers

Commissioner St. Denis made a motion to nominate Vice Chair Crenshaw as Chair, commencing February 17, 2010. Chairperson O'Brien seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0.

Commissioner St. Denis commented that Chairperson O'Brien has done an incredible job.

Commissioner St. Denis made a motion to nominate Commissioner Jones as Vice Chair, commencing February 17, 2010. Chairperson O'Brien seconded the motion. The motion was withdrawn. The Commission agreed to continue this item when Commissioner Jones is present at the meeting.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Sue Gillingham, 649 Pomona Avenue, spoke about the 1906 Lodge. She presented to the City a copy of an award which was presented to the Gillinghams for the restoration of a commercial property located at 1060 Adella Avenue. The award is an Orchid that was received from the San Diego Architectural Foundation for historic preservation. She thanked the City, Historic Resource and Planning Commissions, and staff for their support.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HR 1-10 **WILEY, RICHARD AND KIRSTEN** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 320 7th Street and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicants, Richard and Kirsten Wiley, 320 7th Street, gave a brief overview of the historic designation request, then displayed plans of a future planned addition to the residence, and answered questions by the Commission.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the applicants plan on saving the two original windows facing the J Avenue elevation.

Ms. Wiley said they will try to save and re-use the windows; however, the windows do not meet the Code requirements for egress.

Ms. McCaull said that with historic designation there is latitude in the Building Code for the egress requirement.

Ms. Wiley stated that she would like to extend the addition out about 18 inches toward 7th Street. Currently, this is not within the Code.

Chairperson O'Brien explained that the Commission can review the proposed preliminary alteration today and the applicant can then present an alteration permit request to the Commission at a future date. At that time, the applicant may request relief for the front yard setback at 7th Street.

Commissioner St. Denis said that it would be considered a side yard setback request. She asked if the applicant was in compliance with the 25-foot setback from J Avenue.

Ms. Wiley responded yes.

Ms. McCaull stated that the setback requirement along 7th Street is only five feet, and asked about the home's current setback.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the home would retain the steeped, pitched roof.

Ms. Wiley said it would.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the diamond shaped divided lite window pattern would be re-created.

Ms. Wiley answered yes.

Mr. Ryan asked about the square footage of the new addition, and the present square footage.

Ms. Wiley said it is about 800 and 900 square feet; the present square footage is about 1360. The livable area would be about 2200.

Mr. Ryan mentioned that should the applicant wish to apply for the Mills Act in the future, there may be issues with additions to the home.

Ms. Wiley said that the lot is unique in that the front façade is not being changed because, technically, the front of the house does not face the front. She understands that the Mills Act requires no changes to the front façade.

Commissioner St. Denis added that this requirement extends to what is visible from the public right-of-way.

Ms. Wiley said that from J Avenue, there is only a view of a grassy area.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Thomas Mustin, 710 J Avenue, a neighboring property owner, confirmed that Molly McGowan resided at the subject residence. He and his wife, Jean, support the historic designation request as they also plan on submitting a similar request in the future.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner St. Denis said she considers the home historic even though it is not yet 75 years old. The home has a unique architectural style and the windows are a character defining element of the home. The proposed addition is unusual because of the J Avenue legal frontage. She does not consider the J Avenue side attractive and suggested that if the applicants are considering bringing the structure out to the 25 foot frontage, they should consider it another front elevation of the house because the home is located on one of the most beautiful blocks of Coronado, which is also considered a potential historic district. She added that if the applicants do return with a Mills Act request, the request will not be a “slam dunk” because of the proposed addition. She added that “repair rather than replace” are the key words in historic preservation, and suggested that the applicants go through the expense and trouble of repairing the windows.

Commissioner Ryan stated that he supports the request. The home is a treasure and is part of Coronado's history. He commented that the house was built in less than 90 days which he considers incredible. He hopes that the applicants will build the addition in such a way that they may qualify for the Mills Act in the future.

Vice Chair Crenshaw said she supports the request and thanked the applicants for saving such a lovely home. She agreed with Commissioner St. Denis that one of the home's distinctive features is the windows, and encouraged the applicants to restore them.

Chairperson O'Brien said he is not ready to support the alteration request. This leaves the applicant in "no man's land" inasmuch as if the Commission designates the home, the applicant may become "stuck" with the proposed alteration permit request if it is not approved by the Commission at a future date. He suggested that the applicants return with more detailed information including specifics on what the structure and addition will look like.

Commissioner Ryan said the drawings do not indicate that the applicants plan to make the front entrance face J Avenue.

Ms. Wiley said that they would prefer to keep their house as is; however, it does not accommodate a large family. She suggested that she could add a bay window on the J Avenue side; however, the front entrance will remain on 7th Street.

Mr. Wiley said they plan on staying in their home for a while and would like to retain the charm of the home.

Commissioner St. Denis also suggested landscaping to soften the J Avenue façade.

Chairperson O'Brien asked if the applicants would like to continue the item to allow them time to provide a more detailed elevation for J Avenue.

Ms. Wiley expressed concern about the time delay if they continued the item.

Chairperson O'Brien said they could schedule the item for the next meeting date.

Mr. and Mrs. Wiley agreed. Ms. Wiley asked if they would present their request for a variance at that time.

Chairperson O'Brien said that would be appropriate.

Commissioner St. Denis suggested they also provide a landscaping plan for the J Avenue side.

Vice Chair Crenshaw said her understanding is that the Commission is being asked to designate the home today. She does not understand why the Commission would not allow a future addition as it is being done within the requirements. She would like to designate the home because she feels it meets the requirements.

Commissioner Ryan agreed. He understands that the applicants would like to save the home and he would prefer to designate the home historic today. He does not feel that the proposed alteration request is significant enough to be an issue. The addition is the subject of a future hearing.

COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 320 7TH STREET TO BE AN HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

ALTHOUGH THE HOME IS NOT 75 YEARS OF AGE, IT HAS REACHED HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE WITHIN THE LAST 75 YEARS BECAUSE IT DOES MEET THE FOLLOWING CRITERIA:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S ARCHITECTURAL AND CULTURAL HISTORY; AND
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY SPECIFICALLY IT WAS THE HOME OF MOLLY MCGOWAN, THE CORONADO HIGH SCHOOL TEENAGER FOR WHOM THE MOLLY MCGOWAN AWARD FOR CITIZENSHIP, SCHOLARSHIP, FRIENDLINESS, AND LEADERSHIP WAS NAMED;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE FRENCH PROVINCIAL ARCHITECTURAL STYLE IN THE R-1A ZONE RETAINING CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF THE STYLE INCLUDING A STEEPLY PITCHED GABLED AND HIPPED ROOFLINE, STUCCO EXTERIOR FINISH, RECESSED ARCHED ENTRY, PROJECTING BAY WINDOW, AND DIAMOND PANED WOOD FRAMED WINDOWS; AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;

COMMISSIONER RYAN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Ryan, and St. Denis.
NAYS: Commissioner O'Brien.
ABSENT: Commissioner Jones.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-1.

DISCUSSION

HR 5-09 City of Coronado: Review of proposed amendments to Chapter 70.20 regarding the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance pertaining to Historic Preservation Benefits and Historic Districts and amendments to Chapter 70.22 regarding establishment of expiration dates for

Historic Alteration Permit approvals and City Council review of Historic Resource Commission recommendations for alterations permits involving zoning exceptions.

The Commission reviewed the draft amendments and suggested changes including a 51 percent contributing (rather than 75 percent), and a 75 percent consent rate (rather than 100 percent).

Chris Ackerman, 760 C Street, expressed concern with the 100 percent issue. He said he would support the 75 percent requirement.

Vice Chair Crenshaw made a motion to approve the changes as noted in the agenda and as amended in the discussion. Commission Ryan seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

HRPA 1-10 City of Coronado: Update regarding Historic Resource Commission review of Historic Preservation Mills Act applications submitted in 2009 for prioritization and placement on the Historic Preservation Mills Act Waiting List.

Ms. McCaull provided the Commission with an update of the prioritization process as outlined in the staff report. She stated she would like to schedule the hearings in March 2010. The Commissioners indicated their availability to participate at the March meetings.

Discussion regarding the Mills Act Program and City Council direction to hold a workshop (no report)

This item was not discussed.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:37 p.m.

Rachel A. Hurst, Director of Community Development,
Redevelopment & Housing Services