

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

September 16, 2009

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3 p.m., Wednesday, September 16, 2009, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Vice Chair Crenshaw.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, Ryan and St. Denis

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioner O'Brien

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner  
Martha L Alvarez, Recording Secretary/Minutes Preparer

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Approval of the minutes of August 19, 2009, was continued to the next regular meeting, to allow review of the audio by Commissioners Jones and Ryan.

Ms. McCaull clarified that the "draft" minutes concerning 1127 F Avenue would be forwarded to City Council as part of the staff report.

Commissioner Jones and Ryan agreed that the draft minutes should be forwarded.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

There was no separate Director's report.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Vice Chair Crenshaw reported that Associate Planner Ann McCaull had been promoted to Senior Planner. The Commission congratulated Ms. McCaull on her achievement.

Commissioner St. Denis announced that Ms. McCaull, Commissioners Crenshaw and Jones and she attended a one day seminar, "Best Practices in Historic Preservation." Ms. St. Denis said it was a very informative seminar.

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

**HRPA 7-09** **FLAGSHIP HAWAII LP** – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated residence addressed as 300 First Street and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone. *(To be continued to the meeting of October 7, 2009)*

Ms. McCaull reported that the applicant requested the item be continued to the next regular meeting of October 7, 2009.

### COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING OF OCTOBER 7, AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT.

COMMISSIONER ST. DENIS SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, Ryan, and St. Denis.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT: Commissioner O'Brien.

ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

**HRPA 8-09** AMZ INVESTMENTS – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated residence addressed as 921 A Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. *(Continued from the meeting of August 19, 2009)*

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The applicant's representative, Susie Piper, 930 I Avenue, gave an overview of the request via a PowerPoint presentation, and answered questions.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if zoning exceptions are being requested.

Ms. Piper responded that no exceptions are being asked for by the owners.

Gary Zoft, general partner and part owner, gave a brief overview and answered questions.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

Nancye Splinter, 1027 G Avenue, said the remodel is superior and appreciates that the owners kept the original doors and windows. However, she stated that much of the home is no longer historic although the owner has invested a great deal of effort and expense to keep as much of the original home as possible. She reminded the Commission that Mills Act funds are very limited and should not be given to homes that are completely remodeled. She also expressed concern that the owner's signature is missing on the Mills Act application.

Ms. Piper commented that the request is about the house and not the owners. Consideration should also be given to future owners who must pay for costly maintenance of the home.

Mr. Zoft clarified that their representative signed the Mills Act application on their behalf.

Ms. McCaull stated that AMZ Investments, a limited partnership, is the owner. Mr. Zoft is the general partner and this information is recorded with the State of California. Ms. McCaull added that she has a letter from Mr. Zoft authorizing Ms. Piper to make the presentation today.

Commissioner Ryan asked how much square footage was added to the original structure.

Mr. Zoft said the square footage increased from about 1900 to 2800.

Commissioner St. Denis stated that two-thirds of the house was demolished so it appears that two-thirds of the existing square footage is new. She asked how much of the original historic structure has been preserved.

Mr. Zoft said there was demolition at the rear of the structure; however, it was rebuilt to the original specification.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner St. Denis thanked Ms. Piper for the presentation and the wonderful photographs taken of the home. She stated, however, that the structure is not close to being subservient to the original historic house because of the bulk and mass of the second story addition. Ms. St. Denis pointed out that there are many good things about the remodel and restoration. A very charming, historic house has been saved and converted to a contemporary family home that is livable by today's standards. The windows and shingles were repaired rather than replaced, and the dark redwood color was used. She noted that on the Alteration Permit submitted in December of 2007, the applicant stated he was adding 1000 square feet and demolishing two-thirds of the historic home. At the time the additions were approved, staff indicated that the Commission may not support a Mills Act Agreement given the amount of demolition. Former Chairperson MacCartee communicated to the applicant during the meeting that he may not be eligible for the Mills Act. Mr. Ehret said he understood. Former Commissioner Herron repeated her concern that the Mills Act would be tentative at best because of the remodel. Ms. St. Denis stated that although the second story addition is nicely set back from the front, it is too dominant and bulky. The Tent City character, which former Commissioner Wilson spoke of, has been lost. The unique original curved roof line which was so much a part of the character of the house (this made it "the tent") is somehow diminished by the 2009 version. She stated she is reluctant to support the request. She read from the Secretary of Interior's Standards: "Recommended: constructing a new addition so that there is the least possible loss of historic materials and so that character defining features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed. Locating the attached exterior addition at the rear or on an inconspicuous side of an historic building and limiting its size and scale in relationship to the historic building. Design a new addition so that its size and scale in relation to the historic building are not out of proportion thus diminishing the historic character. Design additional stories that are set back from the wall plan and are as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street." Commissioner St. Denis stated she is not able to support the request.

Commissioner Ryan said that this is a 60x100 lot located in a very nice neighborhood. The applicant could have easily demolished the structure and built a new four or five bedroom home.

In this case, the owners and developers did a great job and saved an historic house. Mr. Ryan said he visited the property and acknowledges that the restoration was faithful and that much effort was invested in same. Mr. Ryan said there is recent precedent of the Commission approving additions to Mills Act homes. The homes are located at 1116 Loma Avenue and 611 A Avenue.

Commissioner Jones agreed that this home is very special and it has been beautifully restored. However, she prefers the appearance of the home prior to its restoration as much of its charm has been lost. She said the addition overwhelms the original structure although it has been set back. She stated that although the home is lovely, she does not consider it a Mills Act home.

Vice Chair Crenshaw thanked Ms. Piper for a lovely presentation. She agreed that the addition is overwhelming although she acknowledges that this is a unique and lovely home and appreciates that the home was saved. Based on the new criteria for Mills Act homes, she does not consider this home to meet same. She quoted from the Secretary of Interior's Standards which reads, "Additions: Additions should be subordinate in scale, bulk and mass to the historic building." She stated that this addition is much larger than the historic facade. She continued, "Additions should be located at the rear or in an inconspicuous side of the historic building." She said that the large mass is visible from the side of the home." She also read, "Additions should be designed to be reversible. Additions should be designed in such a manner that the addition is discernible from the original." Ms. Crenshaw said she does not consider this to be a Mills Act home.

Commissioner Ryan commented that the Commission has approved Mills Act homes that have been previously altered, as well as approved Mills Act homes that are currently being altered. One of the remedies was, via the County Tax Assessor's Office, to apply the Mills Act benefit to only part of the structure. He asked staff for clarification on the calculations used by the Tax Assessor's office to determine new square footage.

Ms. McCaull clarified that this Mills Act application has been filed based upon our current Standards and stated that the Commission should review this application based on current Ordinances. She reiterated that the purpose of today's public hearing is to consider the list of improvements associated with the Mills Act Agreement. The Commission's recommendations will then be forwarded to City Council for their consideration. She clarified that the Commission does not have the authority at this time to deny Mills Act applications. She added that the Tax Assessor's Office can only provide an estimate since he does not have detailed plans yet.

Commissioner St. Denis said she is basing her decision on her interpretation of the Secretary of Interior's Standards.

Commissioner Ryan stated that the owners made the decision to restore this historic structure and not demolish it. He stated that if the Commission becomes so strict that they are not willing to compromise on square footage and arrive at some flexibility and compromise, future developers and investors may not want to preserve other historic homes.

Commissioner St. Denis reminded the Commission that the applicants were advised in December of 2007 that if they were to make alterations to the home, it could make the structure ineligible for Mills Act. The owners acknowledged their understanding.

Commissioner Jones agreed with Commissioner Crenshaw about the Mills Act criteria which determines a home's eligibility, especially the criteria which states that the scale of additions should not overwhelm the original structure.

Mr. Zoft clarified that the rear addition is built on the original footings.

Ms. Piper noted that when the home was moved in 1912, only the front building was moved. Two rooms were added at the rear of the property in 1913. In 1920, another addition was made to the dwelling. She believes that the Standards may consider these additions historic.

Ms. McCaull explained that the Mills Act applications are prioritized on an annual basis. At the end of this year, all new Mills Act applications received in 2009 will be prioritized by the Commission based upon their historical significance.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER RYAN MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE REQUEST AS SUBMITTED, WITH THE CONDITION THAT IT BE APPROVED ON A PROPORTIONATE BASIS BASED ON THE COUNTY ASSESSORS DIRECTION, AND NOT RENDER MILLS ACT FOR THE ADDITION TO THE PROPERTY.

The motion failed for a lack of second.

COMMISSIONER ST. DENIS MADE A MOTION TO DENY THE REQUEST AS SUBMITTED BECAUSE OF EXCESSIVE CONSTRUCTION, LOSS OF HISTORIC MATERIAL, THE ADDITION IS TOO PRIMARY AND CONSPICUOUS TO THE SIDE OF THE BUILDING AND VISIBLE FROM THE PUBLIC RIGHT-OF-WAY AND IS TOO LARGE IN SCALE AND ITS RELATIONSHIP TO THE HISTORIC STRUCTURE, AND THE ADDITIONAL STORIES, PER THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS RECOMMENDATION, IS NOT SET BACK FROM THE WALL PLANE, SO THAT IT IS CONSPICUOUS WHEN VIEWED FROM THE PUBLIC RIGHT-OF-WAY.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, and St. Denis.  
NAYS: Commissioner Ryan.  
ABSENT: Commissioner O'Brien.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-1.

Ms. McCaull clarified that the Commission's recommendations will be forwarded to City Council.

**HRPA 9-09 CHRISTOPHER AND BARBARA HARMER** – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated residence addressed as 731 C Avenue and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone. *(Continued from the meeting of August 19, 2009)*

Ms. McCaull reported that the applicant requested the item be continued to the regular meeting of October 21, 2009.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO THE REGULAR MEETING OF OCTOBER 21, 2009.

COMMISSIONER ST. DENIS SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, Ryan, and St. Denis.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioner O'Brien.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

DISCUSSION

**HRPA 8-08 CITY OF CORONADO** – Discussion regarding Joint City Council/Historic Resource meeting held on August 27, 2009, regarding proposed changes to the Historic Preservation Program pertaining to the Mills Act and other Program improvements.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The Commission discussed possible changes to the Historic Preservation Program.

Chris Ackerman, 765 C Avenue, suggested the Commission provide clearer figures to the City Council.

**Discussion regarding the City Council's action on adoption of a Resolution approving a Historic Resource Alteration Permit with Conditions for Alterations, Additions, and Exceptions to Zoning Standards for the historically designated residence addressed as 611 A Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.**

Ms. McCaull updated the Commission on action taken by the City Council.

**Discussion regarding the Appeal of the Historic Resource Commission decision to deny a Historic Resource Alteration Permit for 1127 F Avenue.**

Ms. McCaull reported that the appeal is scheduled to be heard by the City Council on October 6,

2009. She stated that all persons interested in speaking should be identified on the “list of witnesses” provided by either the applicant or the appellant. She encouraged one or two Commissioners to be present at the meeting.

Nancye Splinter, 1027 G Avenue, strongly urged that at least two Commissioners be present at the meeting. She asked if the public will be notified of the appeal date/time and have an opportunity to place their name on the witness list.

Ms. McCaull said that property owners within 300 feet will not be notified of the appeal.

**HR 5-09 City of Coronado: Preliminary discussion regarding proposed amendments to Chapter 70.20 regarding the City’s Historic Preservation Ordinance pertaining to Historic Districts and Chapter 70.22. regarding City Council review of Historic Resource Commission recommendations for alteration permits involving zoning exceptions.**

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

The Commission discussed possible changes to the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Chris Ackerman, 765 C Avenue, said he believes that the 75 percent requirement for historic structures is excessive. The Secretary of Interior’s Standards speaks about a majority which could be 51 percent. He suggested that the Ordinance provide incentives to encourage the formation of historic districts.

**COMMISSION ACTION**

VICE CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO THE REGULAR MEETING WHEN A FULL QUORUM IS PRESENT.

COMMISSIONER RYAN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, Ryan, and St. Denis.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioner O’Brien.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

**IS 2-09 City of Coronado: Preliminary discussion regarding proposed amendments to the City’s California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines pertaining to the Historic Resource Commission’s review authority in the City’s CEQA review process.**

**COMMISSION ACTION**

VICE CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO THE REGULAR MEETING WHEN A FULL QUORUM IS PRESENT.

COMMISSIONER RYAN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, Ryan, and St. Denis.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT: Commissioner O'Brien.

ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:40 p.m.

---

Rachel A. Hurst, Director of Community Development,  
Redevelopment & Housing Services