

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

January 21, 2009

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3 p.m., Wednesday, January 21, 2009, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, MacCartee, O'Brien and St. Denis

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Martha L Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of January 7, 2009, were approved as amended.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull reported that the Historic Alteration Permit request for 1043 Ocean Boulevard will be heard at the City Council meeting of February 3. The item will be placed on the Consent Calendar and may be taken off the Consent Calendar for discussion by any Council member or any member of the public. There is no separate public notice required to be published or provided to surrounding property owners.

Ms. McCaull announced that Chairperson MacCartee's term on the Commission will expire at the end of the month and this will be her last meeting. Ms. McCaull presented Ms. MacCartee with a Certification of Appreciation and thanked her for her six years of service on the Historic Resource Commission.

Chairperson MacCartee thanked everyone and expressed her gratitude in having the opportunity to serve on the Commission. She thanked Ms. McCaull for her assistance during the many years of service, and also thanked Ms. Alvarez for her diligence in processing the meeting minutes.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HR 9-08 **ROBERT AND RUTH GILLILAND** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 904 Fifth Street and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The site is very small and is only 37' wide and 25' deep totaling 925 square feet. The property contains a single story residence with an attached garage. City records indicate the construction of this residence was completed in 1915 so the residence is 94 years old. The estimated cost to build the six-room dwelling was \$2,000. Alma V. Johnson was identified as the owner and Sparks & Hale were identified as the contractor. A permit was issued in 1929 to pour a foundation to the residence. In 1947, a permit was issued to "make permastone alterations" on the exterior. It is believed this alteration is the decorative stone work that exists on the front façade and porch of the dwelling and chimney today.

The application notes that the home has a Craftsman style architectural style with original front door, knob and decorative plan, original wood floors, original woodwork and built-in cabinets. The exterior of the residence is a combination of stucco and decorative stone. The residence was not identified in the Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's. The home was also not identified in the 2008 Coronado Property Review list completed by the Historic Resource Commission. No written correspondence was received by the City.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant, Robert Gilliland, 904 Fifth Street, made himself available to answer questions. He stated that the correct lot size is 49' X 52', totaling 2,548 square feet.

Commissioner St. Denis asked about the location of the six "inch" wall referred to in some of the documents.

Mr. Gilliland said the documents refer to a six "foot" wall around the perimeter of the property.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Jones said she visited the home and was very impressed with both the interior and exterior. She stated that she would support historic designation.

Commissioner St. Denis said the façade of the home has been changed in such a way that she is unable to visualize what the original house looked like. She felt that the addition of the decorative stone work most likely took place in the 1970's. The Romanesque arches with the keystone, garage door with tiled roof, and two different sizes of fascia on the gabled grooves are a concern to her. She appreciates the original windows but is having difficulty in gathering findings to consider this home an historic resource.

Vice Chair O'Brien acknowledged that the additions detract from the original structure; however, those additions are easily removable. He added that the fiberglass garage door can also be replaced with original materials. He stated for the record that the arches appear to have been a later addition that can be easily removed at a future date if necessary.

Mr. Gilliland said there were some Craftsman homes that contained arches; however, he and his wife have not been able to locate any historic photographs of their home which would give an indication as to its original appearance. He stated that the side of the home (facing the garage)

appears to have been the front of the home at one time.

Commissioner Jones added that the detached garage at the front of the home was originally attached to the house next door.

Commissioner St. Denis asked about the square footage of the house.

Mr. Gilliland said the exterior foundation dimension is 1,250 square feet. The real estate records indicate the interior measures 1,185 square feet.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the applicant has spoken with any former property owners.

Mr. Gilliland said he has not been able to locate any former owners.

Vice Chair O'Brien advised the applicant that if his home was designated historic and the applicant desired to apply for Mills Act, it may be very difficult given the uncertainty of the porch.

Commissioner St. Denis said that if this home were to come before the Commission for Mills Act, she would request the porch be re-done in an historically accurate manner. She feels that the Mills Act funds are intended for this purpose. She added that it would be very helpful if there were old photographs of the house. She asked if the applicant knew if any former property owners were still living.

Mr. Gilliland said he understands the two previous owners are still living.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if he has searched through the records and photographs at the Coronado Historical Association or the San Diego Historical Association.

Mr. Gilliland said he has done his research at the Coronado Historical Association only. He added that he is not familiar with the Mills Act Program.

Ms. McCaull agreed that this home is an ideal candidate for the Mills Act Program. The Commission could require, in accordance with the 10-year agreement, that the applicant make certain improvements in exchange for obtaining the property tax reductions, e.g. returning the garage door to a more carriage house style, making changes to the front porch to make it more in keeping with the original style, and so on.

Commissioner Crenshaw said this is a small, lovely home located in the R-3 zone. The property owner has come before the Commission today to request that his home be designated historic. She feels that it behooves the Commission to find a way to designate it historic.

Mr. Gilliland asked about the significance of the home being located on the R-3 zone.

Commissioner Crenshaw replied that homes in the R-3 zone can potentially be demolished and two homes can be built on one lot.

Chairperson MacCartee stated that R-3 is very important to the Commission because it is where most of the single family homes are being demolished.

Mr. Gilliland asked if the San Diego Historical Association would also have photographs of Coronado homes.

Chairperson MacCartee replied yes.

Commissioner St. Denis asked the applicant if the windows which were replaced were the ones facing the alley.

Mr. Gilliland indicated yes.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the windows next to the fireplace were also replaced.

Mr. Gilliland replied that he did not think those windows were original.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 904 FIFTH STREET TO BE AN HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S SOCIAL, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY; AND
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE CRAFTSMAN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED.

COMMISSIONER ST. DENIS SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, MacCartee, O'Brien, and St. Denis.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

MISCELLANEOUS

HAP 13-08 **JIM AND MELINDA MARLAR** – Adoption of Resolution to approve or deny the Historic Resource Alteration Permit for the proposed demolition of 465 Palm Avenue located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone. (CONTINUED UNTIL ENVIRONMENTAL PROCESSING COMPLETE) (no report)

Ms. McCaull provided a brief update.

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

There was no action taken on this item.

Discussion regarding City Council action of January 20 regarding proposed changes to the Mills Act Program (no report)

Ms. McCaull provided an update on City Council action taken at the meeting of January 20, 2009. City Council considered the following: 1) City staff response to Council direction to formulate a method of allowing more persons to participate while maintaining the same fiscal implications; 2) Series of recommendations from the HRC regarding public workshops.

Ms. McCaull reported that the Council generally supported the Commission having up to three public workshops. Mayor Tanaka asked that at the conclusion of the workshops, a joint meeting be held by the Commission and the City Council in August.

Ms. McCaull stated that, with regard to the Mills Act, the Council did not agree with staff's initial recommendation and requested further research be done via the workshops to include incentives to properties that have been designated historic and are located in an R-3 zone. There was some discussion about allowing properties that are smaller in size to obtain a larger tax reduction. Ms. McCaull commented that some of these solutions are not possible because of legislation and the formula used by the County Assessor. The City, however, can determine who is eligible to participate.

Commissioner St. Denis asked for additional information regarding the workshops.

Ms. McCaull reported that Mayor Tanaka had suggested the workshops be held and that the recommendations from those workshops be discussed at a joint meeting between the Commission and Council once a full Council is present.

Ms. McCaull stated that Councilmembers Ovrom and Woiwode made the comment that possibly 50 percent is a good change but may not be a sufficient enough incentive for property owners to apply for Mills Act.

Commissioner Crenshaw said that Mayor Tanaka and Councilmember Downey were willing to support the change; however, they requested the word "maximum" [50 percent] be deleted.

The Commission agreed that the workshops should be held during the week in the early evening. Once the topics for discussion are determined, the following persons could be invited to make a brief presentation: consultants, architectural firms, the County Assessor's Office, and/or the State Assessor's Office.

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

There was no action taken on this item.

Discussion regarding City Council action of January 20 regarding CEQA direction for proposed demolition of the historic residence addressed as 465 Palm Avenue (no report)

Ms. McCaull provided an update on City Council action taken at the meeting of January 20, 2009. Councilmember Downey made a motion that the item be continued to the second meeting in July so that all Councilmembers can be present to consider the matter. The applicant agreed to the continuation.

Ms. McCaull reported that there is some anticipation that the Mills Act Exception request, discussed at the Commission's previous meeting, will be heard as a public hearing item so that the public is aware of what is being considered.

Commissioner St. Denis quoted the City Attorney as saying that CEQA law states that once the process begins, it cannot be continued. She asked if the item will be heard in July if the Mills Act Exception is approved.

Ms. McCaull replied that if the Mills Act is approved, the request to demolish would be withdrawn by the applicant and subsequently there would no longer be a CEQA requirement. The City attorney determined it would be appropriate to have the administrative record completed on the environmental documentation required for demolition of a home. In addition, it is acceptable to continue the item if the City and the applicant agree to do so.

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

There was no action taken on this item.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:54 p.m.

Rachel A. Hurst
Director of Community Development, Redevelopment
& Housing Services