

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

November 5, 2008

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3 p.m., Wednesday, November 5, 2008, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, MacCartee, O'Brien and St. Denis

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner  
Tony Pena, Director of Community Development  
Martha L Alvarez, Recording Secretary

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

There was no separate Director's report.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Commissioner Crenshaw thanked Commissioner St. Denis and the Coronado Historical Association for a lovely mayoral presentation.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

**HAP 10-06 JOE AND CAYLEE PINSONNEAULT** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for alterations and additions and exceptions to zoning standards for the historically designated property located in the R1-A (Single Family Residential) Zone, addressed as 941 J Avenue, including the construction of a replacement dwelling and garage located on the rear of the property addressed as 937 J Avenue.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On October 15, 2008, the Historic Resource Commission conducted a lengthy public hearing on this item. The vote to approve the project failed by a 2-3 vote. Because no motion was made to deny the application or to approve the application with conditions, no final decision was made by the Commission and the matter is being returned for further consideration and final action. A courtesy public notice of today's meeting was provided to all property owners within 300 feet of the affected property. Additional written correspondence was received after the agenda was distributed; this correspondence has been provided to the Commission and is available for public review. Most of the correspondence received communicated an objection to the permit.

## PUBLIC COMMENT

Chairperson MacCartee asked that all public testimony be limited to three minutes.

The applicant's representative, Kevin Rugee, Architect, 1024 Isabella Avenue, made himself available to answer questions. Mr. Rugee stated that he had an issue with some Commissioners voting today about a project that they were not involved in when it was originally heard by the Commission. He felt that the Commissioners were doing a disservice to the previous Commissioners by voting against their projects. He asked how the Commission was able to vote in the affirmative for another similar project located at 629 A Avenue.

Commissioner Crenshaw responded that the reason she voted in the affirmative for the project located at 629 A Avenue is because she considered the location of the home on Adella Avenue, which fronts an alley as do the neighboring homes. In addition, there was a mutual agreement between neighboring property owners and a lack of opposition from neighbors that were appropriately notified.

Commissioner St. Denis stated that the reason this item is being heard/voted on by the Commission today is because they have been directed to do so by a Court ruling. The Commission is meeting today because the Commission did not vote on a Resolution at the meeting of October 15.

Director McCaull clarified that the purpose of the hearing is for the Commission to consider the project as if it were a new application coming before the Commission today, and to receive public comment from property owners who were not previously notified.

Robert Vaughn, 937 Alameda, expressed concern about zoning changes to the property.

Director McCaull responded that the City did not change the zoning of the property. The property is zoned R-1A and there are two legal dwellings on the property. The zoning ordinance states that the rear dwelling cannot be sold off separately. Ms. McCaull added that it is not the City's intent to re-open the entire public hearing; the City has provided a courtesy notice to the neighbors advising that a Resolution will be reconsidered today.

Susan Hevelon, 1144 Isabella Avenue, asked the Commission to consider the precedent they would be setting if they approved this item.

Chairperson MacCartee responded that many things have changed since this item was originally heard, e.g. these types of items receive final approval by the City Council and there are new Carriage House rules.

Jim Scott, 958 I Avenue, provided information supporting his objection to the project.

Joe Pinsonneault, 709 First Street, referred to written correspondence he submitted to the Commission. He stated that he originally came before the Commission to request that the

dilapidated garage at the rear of the property be demolished. At that time, the Commission asked if the front home could be designated historic. He understands that some neighbors may not have been noticed but he does not feel that he should be here today.

George Bruce, read into the record written correspondence he submitted to the Commission, which communicates his opposition to construction of the rear dwelling.

Sarah Wells, 961 J Avenue, stated she did not receive notification of the project. She stated she was opposed to the construction of the rear rental apartment building as it would impact the alley and distort the concept of the R-1A zoning. She asked that the Commission require the owners to execute a covenant, running with the life of the property, agreeing not to promote or use the apartment as a rental. She said it was not feasible that the rear building be torn down but asked that the kitchen be removed as a show of good faith to honor the covenant.

Vice Chair O'Brien stated that, according to City records, 961 J Avenue was properly noticed at the original hearings.

Scott McMillan, attorney for Jim Scott, gave an overview of his points objecting to the project.

Chairperson MacCartee corrected Mr. McMillan on one point. She stated that the applicant asked the Commission to help them retain the historic front house. She said she would not allow Mr. McMillan to make misleading statements with reference to the applicant and/or his representative trying to "get away with something." She added that she has worked with Mr. Rugee for six years and he has always tried to help preserve the historic integrity of this community.

Mr. McMillan offered an apology and stated that his review of the record did not reflect such action.

Deni Herron, 1718 Visalia Row, said she served on the previous Commission that originally heard this item. She stated that she was offended by the accusations being made against the Commission, the City and staff by Mr. Scott and his attorney, Mr. McMillan. She stated, for the record, that they are the persons who are misrepresenting the facts.

Chairperson MacCartee stated she appreciated Ms. Herron's comments and added that this is a volunteer Commission who serve because they love their community.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair O'Brien said he would like to add to the motion the clarification that would suggest the following: 1) the Commission does have precedence for granting zoning relief in the past; 2) the Commission does have the ability to make findings for the request before them today; and 3) the Commission does have the authority to act on this property. He stated that he takes offense to the comments that they do not have rights or authority as a Commission and added that he would continue to support the project as currently submitted.

Commissioner Jones said this is a difficult decision. She stated that the rear structure is non conforming and once demolished cannot be built as a rental. Therefore, she will maintain her former vote.

Commissioner St. Denis said that the previous Commission was within their rights. The reason the Historic Resource Commission was formed was to preserve historic homes. Part of this project did that so beautifully with regard to the front house. She commented that had she served on the previous Commission, she would not have approved the rear dwelling at that size. She would have, however, approved the zoning exception to rebuild a rental property because she feels that the Municipal Code allows it, subject to interpretation. She suggested a motion approving the front house and approving the rear house with the following conditions: 1) that it does not set a precedent for future Commission decisions; 2) a covenant be required stating that it may not be rented; and 3) that the applicants discontinue listing it as a rental.

Commissioner Crenshaw stated that her vote has nothing to do with her respect for or how she views the decisions made by the previous Commission. She stated that the Code was very specific in that non conforming prohibits enlarging, extending or expanding structures and feels that the Commission's action will set a precedent. She stated that 937 J Avenue is not a Carriage House under the RSIP because of its square footage, and if it is a dwelling, it cannot be on an R-1 lot. She stated that she will not support the project.

Chairperson MacCartee asked the Commission if the kitchen should be kept.

Commissioner Jones said she would agree that the kitchen should be kept for use by family members.

Commissioner St. Denis suggested that it be made clear in the motion that this is a very unique, one-of-a-kind circumstance that in no way will set precedence for future decisions.

Community Development Director Pena made himself available to answer questions.

James Ravin, 936 I Avenue, said he did not receive notification of the project and asked if the project conforms to today's Codes.

Chairperson MacCartee said the Historic Resource Commission can grant leniency to persons applying for historic designation.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER ST. DENIS MADE A MOTION TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL OF HAP 10-06, REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR ALTERATIONS AND ADDITIONS AND EXCEPTIONS TO ZONING STANDARDS FOR THE HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTY LOCATED IN THE R1-A (SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL) ZONE, ADDRESSED AS 941 J AVENUE, INCLUDING THE

CONSTRUCTION OF A REPLACEMENT DWELLING AND GARAGE LOCATED ON THE REAR OF THE PROPERTY ADDRESSED AS 937 J AVENUE, SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

1. THE REAR STRUCTURE IS APPROVED UNDERSTANDING THIS IS A ONCE-IN-A-LIFE-TIME, NON PRECEDENT SETTING SITUATION DUE TO EXTENUATING CIRCUMSTANCES AND THE INPUT FROM THE NEIGHBORS;
2. A COVENANT SHALL BE RECORDED ON THE PROPERTY THAT WILL RUN WITH THE LAND INDICATING THE REAR STRUCTURE SHALL NOT BE RENTED OUT AND WILL BE A GUEST HOUSE BELONGING TO THE FRONT HOUSE;
3. THAT THE KITCHEN MAY ACTUALLY STAY AND BE USED BY THE FAMILY MEMBER OR GUEST.
4. THAT THE REAR DWELLING IS NO LONGER LISTED AS A LEGAL RENTAL BECAUSE AFTER THIS, IT WILL NO LONGER BE A LEGAL RENTAL.
5. THE SECOND METER TO THE REAR STRUCTURE SHALL BE REMOVED IF FEASIBLE TO SAFEGUARD THE REAR STRUCTURE IS NOT SEPARATELY RENTED.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE;
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT;
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES;
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER JONES SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Jones, MacCartee, O'Brien, and St. Denis.  
NAYS: Commissioner Crenshaw.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-1.

**NOI 13-08**    **ARTHUR M. OSBORNE** – Notice of Intent to demolish the single family residence addressed as 345 Alameda Boulevard and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. Arthur M. Osborne is the owner of the property located at 345 Alameda Boulevard. The site contains a two-story dwelling with attached garage on a 50' x 140' parcel containing 7,000 square feet. City records indicate the dwelling was constructed in 1923 so the residence is 85 years old. The owner plans to place the property up for sale in the future but before doing so he wanted a determination made regarding the structure's historical significance and whether the residence could be demolished. Since the dwelling is over 75 years of age, a Notice of Intent (NOI) to Demolish Permit Application has been filed with the City. All property owners residing within 300 feet of the affected property have been notified of the public hearing. No written objections from neighbors have been received by the City.

Very few alterations have occurred to the residence since its original construction. The building has a very interesting building design and is fairly unique. The structure could best be described as having a Pueblo architectural style with some contemporary design elements. It is interesting to note the residence was built before the Spanish Bight was filled so when this residence was originally constructed, the property had a bay view. Today, the home sits in the 300 block of Alameda Boulevard which has been negatively impacted by Naval Air Station North Island traffic. If the home is demolished, two residences could be built on the property.

The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave this structure a historical value rating of 2. A two indicated the structure was almost entirely unmodified from its original exterior appearance and had substantial architectural significance. This property was also identified in the Coronado Property Review (CPR) List completed by the Historic Resource Commission in 2008.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant, Arthur Osborne, 345 Alameda Blvd., gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions.

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ABOVE-MENTIONED ITEM TO THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE

COMMISSION, AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT.

NOTE: BASED UPON CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED FROM THE APPLICANT'S REPRESENTATIVE, CHARLIE AHERN, ON NOVEMBER 17, 2008, THE MATTER HAS BEEN CONTINUED INDEFINITELY UNTIL FURTHER NOTICE.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Jones, MacCartee, O'Brien, and St. Denis.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

**HRPA 3-08** **MONTEREY CONDOMINIUM COMPLEX** – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated condominium complex addressed as 848 D Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On January 5, 2005, the Historic Resource Commission designated the Monterey Complex addressed as 848 D Avenue as a Coronado Historic Resource.

One of the benefits of having an apartment complex designated as a Historic Resource is that the property owner is then eligible to apply for a Condominium Map, which was done. A significant restoration occurred following the designation and all property owners have applied for the Mills Act Agreement. During the 10-year period of the agreement, the property owners are proposing to undertake improvements to the property. The estimate completed by the County Assessor based upon current rules and regulations, the City would see a property tax revenue decrease of about \$60,000 and the owners would see a reduction in property tax of about \$104,216. The Commission is aware that there is a back-log of Mills Act applications.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if there were other zoning exceptions granted to the property owners based on historic designation.

Director McCaull said there were parking exceptions and density and building height that were granted.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if the individual property owners would receive compensation based on their purchase price.

Director McCaull said it would be based on their individual current property value.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

One of the applicants, Susan E. Vetter, President of the HOA, 848 D Avenue #102, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if all of the windows and doors were replaced.

Ms. Vetter said she did not know.

Director McCaull stated that all of the windows were replaced and believed that all of the doors may have also been replaced.

One of the applicants, Toby Hawkins Tomich, Secretary of the HOA and Head of the Architectural Committee, 2404 Via Sobrante, Palos Verdes, Estates, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions. She said the wood windows are replicas of the re-additions of the old windows; however, the doors are new.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the Historic Building Code have allowed the applicants to leave the railings as-is without raising them.

Director McCaull said that was the original intent; however, there were safety concerns expressed by the HOA.

Commissioner St. Denis asked about the sign.

Ms. Tomich said the sign is original and is not framed.

Peter Jensen, 1039 Olive Avenue, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions. He clarified that he is not the owner of the property—his wife's trust is the owner of the property. He stated that they intend to expend a significant amount of money to restore the structure to its original condition as it is one of the only historical properties of its type remaining in Coronado.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner St. Denis said this is a significant type of agreement for the City to enter into and is not what she would normally consider an interpretation of the Mills Act. She feels it would have been more appropriate for the original owner, who invested a considerable amount of money to restore the structure, to have requested the Mills Act. She said that the Mills Act money should have been applied to restoring some of the original windows and doors. She added that the benefit of designating the property historic was the owner's ability to divide it into condominiums in order to make it a more feasible financial investment. She added that one of the responsibilities of having Mills Act is keeping the property in good repair. With regard to the proposed improvements listed, she stated that she would never approve building an enclosure around the required U.S. mail boxes. She suggested instead building a new mail box using black iron.

Commissioner Crenshaw stated that the Mills Act requires that the front façade be kept as close to possible as the original. With regard to the garden, the Commission has previously designated courtyards and walls as historic. She stated that she supports the request.

Ms. Vetter commented that the builder reaped many benefits; however, they, as the new owners, have assumed the liability and expense of maintaining the property.

Ms. Tomich expressed her dissatisfaction of the previous owner's building "improvements" and said she looks forward to the proposed improvements which will return the Monterey back to its "original glory" and re-establish the integrity of the original architecture.

Vice Chair O'Brien said the Monterey has the ability, through its HOA, to arrange for the (saved) taxes to be applied towards the maintenance of the project for historical standards.

Commissioner St. Denis added that part of the Mills Act benefit is to return a resource to its original condition and it appears the applicants are on that road.

Commissioner Jones said that it appears to be a win-win situation for the homeowners to insure that the improvements are made.

Chairperson MacCartee advised the applicants that they may be on a very long list of Mills Act applications.

Director McCaull reported that the City is looking at modifications to the Mills Act Program where the amount of property tax reduction to owners may be reduced so it is possible the impact on the City and the homeowners may change in the future.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO FORWARD THE APPLICATIONS TO THE CITY COUNCIL FOR THEIR CONSIDERATION WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITION:

THE HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION (HOA) WILL ESTABLISH A PRESERVATION FUND THAT IS GENERATED WITH THE MILLS ACT SAVINGS THAT WILL BE ADMINISTERED BY THE HOMEOWNERS ASSOCIATION.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, St. Denis and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

This item will be heard at the City Council meeting of November 18, 2008.

Chairperson MacCartee left the Council Chambers at 4:53 p.m. Vice Chair O'Brien chaired the meeting.

**HRPA 4-08**    **RANDAL AND MELISSA WITTRY** – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated residence addressed as 450 A Avenue and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On July 2, 2008, the Historic Resource Commission designated 450 A Avenue as a Coronado Historic Resource. The dwelling was designated as an historic resource for representing the Tudor architectural style and for representing the City's early history as a Naval town due to the number of previous owners or residents of the building who had distinguished Army and Naval careers.

On September 30, 2008, the applicants filed an application to enter into an Historic Resource Preservation Mills Act Agreement. During the ten-year period of the agreement, the property owners are proposing to undertake a number of improvements (22 items) to the site including landscape and hardscape enhancements, termite repairs, repairs to windows and timbers, painting of residence, and interior improvements.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant, Randal Wittry, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the front windows were being proposed to be repaired rather than replaced.

Mr. Wittry said the front windows were installed prior to their purchase of the home. The front windows are not original—they are new. Only the windows at the rear of the home are original.

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Crenshaw said she has no issues with the request.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION TO FORWARD THE APPLICATION TO THE CITY COUNCIL FOR THEIR CONSIDERATION.

COMMISSIONER ST. DENIS SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, O'Brien, St. Denis and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

**HRPA 5-08** **CITY OF CORONADO** – Historic Resource Commission Review and Recommendation to the City Council for 2008 Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreements.

Commissioner O'Brien recused himself from the meeting and stepped down from the dais because he was the previous broker for this property. Commissioner Crenshaw chaired the meeting.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On an annual basis, the Commission forwards to the City Council recommendations for Mills Act Agreements for the upcoming year. The recommendations are based upon complying with the fiscal cap established for the program. Staff recommends approval of 605 Tenth Street and 930 I Avenue for the 2008 Mills Act Agreements.

Previously, one or two property owners with early submittal applications voiced concern that their applications were not being processed as quickly as anticipated due to the Commission's policy change in prioritizing applications based upon "historical significance" rather than chronological order. Last year, the Commission made a decision to allow the older applications filed with the City to remain in the top prioritized spots with all newer applications to follow behind based upon prioritization.

605 Tenth Street is being recommended for approval by staff due to the length of time it has been on the waiting list and prior commitments from the from Commission. 930 I Avenue is being recommended by staff because it is well within the established cumulative cap for the Mills Act Program.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked for clarification on 605 Tenth Street with regard to the expected property tax loss to the City.

Director McCaull clarified that the estimated impact in 2005 was \$7,553. The property was sold this year and because of the valuation of the property, the property tax increased. With the Mills Act value, the property tax loss to the City increased to \$13,466.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

One of the applicants, Duncan Smith, 836 San Luis Rey, former owner of 605 Tenth Street, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions.

One of the applicants, Karen Smith, 836 San Luis Rey, former owner of 605 Tenth Street, read a letter into the record, giving a brief overview of the request and expressing her disagreement with how the prioritization system was handled for the Mills Act applications.

One of the applicants, Linda Perlich, said she and her husband, Russ Perlich, are the new owners of 605 Tenth Street. She gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions.

One of the applicants, John Duncan, 536 A Avenue, said he recently purchased his home and is also on the waiting list for the Mills Act Program. He stated that he is very supportive of the prioritization process currently in place.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner St. Denis said she would support the recommendation for approval to City Council.

One of the applicants, Susan Piper, 930 I Avenue, said she was thrilled and honored to have their home recommended for approval for the Mills Act Program.

### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER ST. DENIS MADE A MOTION TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL OF 605 TENTH STREET AND 930 I AVENUE FOR THE 2008 MILLS ACT AGREEMENTS.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, St. Denis and Wilson.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee, O'Brien.

ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

This item will be heard at the City Council meeting of November 18, 2008.

MISCELLANEOUS

**Discussion regarding the November 18, 2008, City Council meeting and historic resource items to be considered (no report)**

Director McCaull reported that at the City Council meeting of November 18, 2008, the Council will have several Historic Resource Commission related items as follows: 2008 Mills Act Recommendations, Historic Alteration Permit approved by the Commission for the property at 1043 Ocean Boulevard (under Consent Calendar but most likely will be pulled for full discussion by the City Council), and the Commission's Action on 937 and 941 J Avenue (under Consent Calendar but may be pulled for full discussion by the City Council).

Director McCaull recommended forming a subcommittee, possibly the Commission's Chair and Vice Chair, to be present at the City Council meeting.

The Commission agreed that at least two members of the Commission would be present.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

---

Rachel A. Hurst  
Director of Community Development,  
Redevelopment & Housing Services