

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

July 2, 2008

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3 p.m., Wednesday, July 2, 2008, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, St. Denis, and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of June 18, 2008 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director McCaull reported that the third item on today's agenda, HAP 14-08 LaSalle Bank N.A., Trustee of Trust No. 00-2361, has been continued to the August 6 meeting, per a written request from the applicant. Properties within 300 feet of the affected property will be re-noticed.

Director McCaull also reported that Commissioner Wilson has been the Design Review Commission representative to the Historic Resource Commission for the last five years. Ms. Wilson's term will expire at the end of July. Ms. McCaull recognized Commissioner Wilson's dedication and service on the Historic Resource Commission.

Commissioner Wilson thanked the Commission and said it has been a pleasure serving.

Chairperson MacCartee thanked Commissioner Wilson for her service and commented that it has been a pleasure working with Ms. Wilson.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Chris Ackerman, Architect, 765 C Avenue, commented that he has worked with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Restoration and Rehabilitation since the inception of the Standards in 1978, and subsequent modifications and additions to the Standards. He stated that although the City has leeway to interpret them in different ways unique to their own town, they cannot be ignored, especially if it involves a Mills Act property.

Nancye Splinter, 1027 G Avenue, thanked the Commission and staff for their hard work on this project. She hopes that the project will be able to meet the applicant's needs as well as be preserved for the community's future enjoyment and expressed tremendous respect for all of the work that the Commission and staff have done on behalf of historic preservation in Coronado.

Susan Hevelin, 1144 Isabella Avenue, said she also lives in an historical home and understands that these types of homes are different. She communicated to the applicant the importance of living in an historical home and said that, after living in the home, the applicant may wish to leave it as was originally built.

Commissioner Crenshaw thanked Commissioner St. Denis for the beautiful handout provided to the Commissioners regarding windows.

Public Oral Communications was re-opened at the end of the meeting to allow public communication by the following speaker:

Pat Decicco, 1022 Adella Avenue, said she has served on the Historic Resource Board in Palo Alto for the past five years. She commented that the Spreckels Mansion is a very significant historical resource in the Coronado community, second only to the Hotel Del. She expressed concern on how the item was handled at the March 5 public hearing. She feels that the process was definitely not in compliance with the Secretary of Interior's Standards as approval was made by merely stating that the request met the Secretary of Interior's Standards. She said that the Commission, whose mission it is to defend and explain and present evidence, language and findings as to why the structure should be preserved and why it would not be in compliance, was at no time mentioned. She requested that the Commission review the guidelines on how to apply the Standards. Ms. Decicco added that the request is not in compliance with the Standards as it would significantly change the façade of the structure which needs to be observed.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HR 6-08 **RANDAL AND MELISSA WITTRY** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 450 A Avenue and located in the R1-B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The Wittrys acquired the property in 2002. The property contains a two story residence with an attic and a detached garage. City records indicate a permit was issued in 1929 so the residence is 79 years old. The estimated cost to build the dwelling was \$7,700. Mrs. E. Rifenerick was identified as the original owner from 1929-1942 and J.W. Eastin was identified as the contractor. In 1945, a permit was issued for minor alterations to the dwelling. No other permits were issued for alterations to the residence and the building appears to be largely intact since its original construction. The dwelling has a Tudor architectural style with steeply pitched roof lines; stucco exterior with decorative half-timbering; prominent vertical bay window at the second level and tall wood casement windows with diamond lite panes at the first level.

The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave this residence a historical value rating of 2. A rating of 2 indicated the structure should be a candidate for inclusion on the

Coronado Historical Register and was built before 1942; is in excellent physical condition; is almost entirely unmodified from its original exterior appearance; has substantial architectural significance; and would qualify as a contributing structure to a potential historic district. The dwelling was also identified in the 2008 Coronado Property Review list completed by the Historic Resource Commission. In addition to its architectural significance, research conducted by the owners reveals the residence is important for representing the community's social, political and military history.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant, Melissa Wittry, provided background information and answered questions. She added that during her research, she discovered that several of the past residents were in the U.S. Navy and four of the past residents of the property had distinguished military careers. The first owner, Mrs. E. Rifenberick, was the wife and widow of Army officer Colonel Rifenberick. Arthur C. Miles lived in the residence in 1932-1933 and had a Naval career for 34 years. He graduated from the Naval academy in 1916 and achieved the rank of Vice Admiral. Guy Clark lived in the residence in 1934 and had a Naval career for 32 years. He also graduated from the Naval academy and achieved a rank of Rear Admiral during his career. James Richardson lived in the home in 1937 and achieved the ranking of four star Admiral during his 40 distinguished years in the Navy. As a four star, Admiral Richardson served as Commander in Chief, U.S. Pacific Fleet in 1940-41. Prior to Commander in Chief, Admiral Richardson was Commander Destroyers, Scouting Force; Assistant to the Chief of Naval Operations; and Chief of the Bureau of Navigation. Arthur and Grace Chytrus purchased the residence in 1946 and lived in the dwelling for 28 years. Mr. Chytrus served as a councilmember from 1948-1952 and owned Coronado's auto dealership called "Arthur Motors" from 1953-1960.

The applicant, Randal Wittry, made himself available to answer questions.

Chairperson MacCartee complimented the applicants for their extensive research on the home and asked that they provide this information to the Coronado Historic Association.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the garage is part of the original structure.

Mr. Wittry responded that it is not part of the original structure.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner St. Denis thanked the applicants for a wonderful presentation.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 450 A AVENUE TO BE AN HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY DUE TO THE STRUCTURE'S TUDOR ARCHITECTURAL STYLE AND DUE TO THE NUMBER OF PREVIOUS OWNERS OR RESIDENTS OF THE BUILDING WHO HAD DISTINGUISHED ARMY AND NAVAL CAREERS WHICH REFLECTS CORONADO'S EARLY HISTORY AS A NAVAL TOWN ASSOCIATED WITH NAVAL AIR STATION NORTH ISLAND. IN ADDITION, ONE OF THE OWNERS, ART CHYTRUS, SERVED ON THE CITY COUNCIL, WAS PRESIDENT OF ROTARY CLUB AND A BUSINESS OWNER OF ARTHUR MOTORS, CORONADO'S AUTO DEALERSHIP;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY AS ONE OF THE OWNERS, ART CHYTRUS, SERVED ON THE CITY COUNCIL, WAS PRESIDENT OF ROTARY CLUB AND A BUSINESS OWNER OF ARTHUR MOTORS, CORONADO'S AUTO DEALERSHIP; AND IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN NATIONAL HISTORY FOR COLONEL RIFENBERICK WHO PARTICIPATED IN THE PAN CAL EXPO OF 1915 AND WAS AWARDED THE FRENCH CROIX DE GUERRE WITH PALM; FOR ARTHUR C. MILES WHO WAS A VICE ADMIRAL, GUY CLARK WHO WAS A REAR ADMIRAL AND FOR JAMES RICHARDSON, WHO WAS A FOUR STAR ADMIRAL AND COMMANDER IN CHIEF OF THE U.S. PACIFIC FLEET IN 1940-1941;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE TUDOR ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED.

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, O'Brien, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

HAP 15-08 GRETCHEN MCCOY – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for proposed second story addition to the historically designated residence addressed as 763 C Avenue and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On October 3, 2007, the Historic Resource Commission designated this residence as a Historic Resource. On November 7, 2007, the Historic Resource Commission approved an Historic Resource Alteration Permit for restoration and alterations to the historically designated residence. The Commission also denied a request for a new carriage house that was proposed at the rear of the property. The Commission denied the request because it exceeded the allowable size regulations for carriage houses.

On February 6, 2008, the Historic Resource Commission considered a revised carriage house design that complied with zoning regulations and approved a new carriage house above a two car

garage. On June 4, 2008, the Historic Resource Commission considered a new historic alteration permit application for a second story addition to the residence. This application also involved a request for an exception to the rear yard setback requirement for the second story. The Commission denied the alteration permit request.

On June 12, 2008 a revised Historic Alteration Permit application was filed with the City for a proposed second story addition to the historically designated residence. While the revised proposal does not require an exception from zoning regulations since the residence is a designated historic resource, any exterior change to the building is reviewed by the Historic Resource Commission. Craig Bretthauer is the architect for the project and the owner's authorized representative with the application.

With the second story addition, the project will have a 41 percent lot coverage which complies with the allowable 50 percent. The floor area (including garage and carriage house) will total 3,264 square feet resulting in a floor area ratio of 58 percent. The six design features incorporated into the project allow for the proposed floor area ratio. The maximum allowable floor area ratio for the site is 63%.

The applicant's representative, Craig Bretthauer, 3813 Ray Street, San Diego, gave a brief overview of the request, presented display drawings, and answered questions. He noted that the applicant is not requesting any exemptions to the zoning as it meets all setback requirements.

Commissioner St. Denis said she was not serving on the Commission when the house was designated historic. She asked for clarification on which part of the home was historic and what was subsequently added to the structure. She also inquired if the porch and its roof were original. She commented that everything looked new and that the siding had been removed.

Mr. Bretthauer stated that the porch was a new element and the shingles (not the siding), for safety reasons, was removed because of possible asbestos issues.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the windows were being restored.

Mr. Bretthauer said the windows along the front as well as some side windows are being restored.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if the front bay window at the center of the façade with the projecting shed roof was removed.

Mr. Bretthauer said it had not been removed.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Brad Willis, 757 C Avenue, asked if the 70 foot setback was requested on the second story of the structure.

Mr. Bretthauer responded that the rear of the second story is located 70 feet from the alley.

Mr. Willis asked for clarification on the process for approval of the request.

Director McCaull said the request involves a discretionary permit and it is a requirement that the Commission take action on the permit. The Commission may approve or deny the request or approve it with conditions. The Commission must make certain findings e.g. the addition is consistent with the Historic Preservation Ordinance for alterations.

Mr. Willis expressed concern with the historic designation of the house and the added benefits it would receive from a Mills Act. He commented that the original plans involved a one-story Craftsman style home with a second story carriage house at the rear of the property. He stated that he is not supportive of the additions. He also mentioned that he had prior issues with the same property owner on a porch that had been built too close to his property line. The porch was subsequently demolished and built to comply with the Code.

Director McCaull clarified that the porch project was approved with an eight foot deep porch. The contractor did not build it to the eight foot projection. Normally, the City will perform a framing inspection to make sure the project complies with the project approval. After Mr. Wilson's inquiry, the contractor was required to remove the porch and it now complies with zoning requirements.

Mr. Willis also questioned why the applicant has removed part of the roof in what appears to be the beginning of the second floor construction before it is approved by the Commission.

Chairperson MacCartee clarified that the Mills Act is given with great care and thought by the Commission and is not automatic. The Commission's goal is to save the historicity of this Winchester cottage by making it more habitable for modern living.

Commissioner St. Denis added that the proposal for the second story addition and the carriage house complies with the zoning codes in Coronado and the applicants are not being granted any special dispensation. The City has encouraged carriage houses to prevent homes from becoming too grandiose.

The applicant, Gretchen McCoy, 763 C Avenue, said that she desires to preserve the home but regrets the historical designation because of the difficult process, associated costly expense, and lack of relief granted in the process.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner O'Brien stated that the applicant and the architect have made great efforts to respond in a very timely manner to community input without special exceptions from the Commission. He added that it would be difficult to obtain a demolition permit for a Winchester house on that particular block. There are trade-offs involved in preserving the front of the home while meeting zoning requirements and fulfilling the current needs of the property owner. Mr. O'Brien said the applicant has done her best to preserve the historical home and he supports today's request.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if the original plan involved a one-story structure.

Ms. McCoy clarified that her previous statement was that if she could not obtain approval for a 700 square foot carriage house, she would definitely return with a request for a second story addition to her home. She also stated that the second story addition and her request for a carriage house was within code and did not warrant any zoning relief.

Commissioner St. Denis communicated her disappointment in having so much of the historic Winchester cottage removed, but also said she was pleased that the home was not demolished and replaced with a brand new house. She said it was unfortunate that the original shingles could not have been saved and restored as it would add more value to the home. She noted that the size of the second story addition, although considerably set back, does diminish the original existing cottage, and she would have preferred if the addition had stepped in on the side yard setback.

Chairperson MacCartee agreed and said that the timing of the original application coincided with the sudden changes of the carriage house rules. Ms. MacCartee understands that the applicant made the decision to save the house and agrees that there must be a compromise. She also thanked the applicant for her patience and understanding in the process.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 15-08, REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR PROPOSED SECOND STORY ADDITION TO THE HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 763 C AVENUE AND LOCATED IN THE R-1B (SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL) ZONE, AS SUBMITTED.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN, PARTICULARLY BECAUSE NO SPECIAL CODE EXCEPTIONS HAVE BEEN PROVIDED WITH THE PROJECT;
- B. THE PROPOSED SECOND STORY ADDITION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE;
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE WINCHESTER HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT, PARTICULARLY ALONG THE FRONT ELEVATION;
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES AS THE DESIGN HAS BEEN MODIFIED TO SPECIFICALLY ADDRESS CONCERNS PREVIOUSLY EXPRESSED BY NEIGHBORS IN THAT THE ADDITION COMPLIES WITH ZONING STANDARDS; AND;
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: Commissioner St. Denis.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-1.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

HAP 14-08 LASALLE BANK N.A., TRUSTEE OF TRUST NO. 00-2361 – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for a proposed second story and additional alterations proposed to the historically designated residence addressed as 1043 Ocean Boulevard and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. The alteration Permit also requests relief from zoning standards.

Director McCaull reported earlier in the meeting that this item was continued to the meeting of August 6, per a written request from the applicant.

MISCELLANEOUS

Discussion regarding Historic Preservation newsletter.

Director McCaull stated that the deadline for submission of news articles is August 1, 2008.

Commission discussion ensued regarding possible topics for publication in the newsletter.

The Commission agreed that staff would compile a list and photographs of homes that have been designated historic as well as a list of alteration permits that have been issued. In addition, the Commission agreed to write an article about the Fulton (Templeton Johnson) home on Glorietta Boulevard, which has been designated historic and which also boasts a cactus garden designed by Kate Sessions.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

Tony A Peña
Director of Community Development