

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

June 18, 2008

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3 p.m., Wednesday, June 18, 2008, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, St. Denis, and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner  
Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of June 4, 2008 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director McCaull reported that an Historic Alteration Permit application for 1043 Ocean Boulevard will be scheduled on the next agenda. The Commission had previously approved an alteration permit with a vote of 3-2, and the decision was subsequently appealed to the City Council. The applicant then withdrew their application in an effort to return with a revised project that may be more suitable to the entire Commission and community.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

None.

MISCELLANEOUS

**HR 7-08**     **CITY OF CORONADO** – Presentation and discussion regarding window materials for historically designated properties.

Director McCaull reported that the purpose of today's meeting is to allow the Commission to discuss their policy regarding window materials on historically designated buildings. There are manufacturers that are developing windows to more closely replicate real wood windows and they are utilizing slightly different materials that provide enhanced longevity of the window in

the coastal climate. Vice Chair O'Brien has contacted several window companies and asked them to make brief presentations to the Commission regarding their window materials and styles as an informational session for the Commission.

Chairperson MacCartee thanked the speakers today for attending.

Vice Chair O'Brien also thanked the speakers for providing information to the Commission and community. Mr. O'Brien said that a number of window manufacturers have made an effort to offer a clad product that meets the restriction requirements of cities nationwide. He said that homes over 75 years of age are now using dual glaze windows that meet energy conservation requirements. When a second pane is used, there is a vacant space between the panes and the exterior profile becomes compressed. Despite material changes, whether vinyl or aluminum, the windows begin to take on a new look. He understands there is glass that can be used that retains a single pane profile that meets the energy codes. The second constraint involves wood windows that face south. Many of these wood windows are beyond restoration and have been replaced because of the extent of damage caused by the sun. Mr. O'Brien introduced Mr. Gibbons of TM Cobb, and mentioned that his company restored the wood windows (single glazed) for the historic Hawaiian home located at 300 First Street and replicated windows to match the original windows for the addition.

Marty Gibbons, TM Cobb, gave a brief presentation, displayed product samples, and answered questions. He said his company has been in business since 1935 and manufactures wood windows and doors. They manufacture both single and dual glazed wood windows that meet the requirements for historic window replacement. Their company does not offer clad products. He added that his company provided wood windows for the Santa Fe Train Depot (after approval by the San Diego Historical Society) and the Pickwick Hotel in downtown San Diego. They are also the approved wood window vendor for the Quieter Home Project in Point Loma.

Director McCaull asked if the wood windows require painting every two years.

Mr. Gibbons said yes, especially if the wood windows are south or southwest facing.

Larry Albin, an independent window dealer, said he has had the privilege of selling windows in Coronado for almost 20 years. He said he represents several major, national, top quality wood window brands, and generally he recommends to customers that they replace their wood windows with clad windows because of high cost and maintenance issues associated with wood windows. However, if there is a requirement that replacement of wood windows be in kind, he has recommended Jeld-Wen because of a product they offer called Auralast, which comes with a 20-year warranty.

Andrew Caspers, Jeld-Wen, gave a brief presentation, displayed product samples, and answered questions. He confirmed that the product they offer, Auralast, comes with a 20-year warranty (out of the box) on the system, glass, and hardware against any type of wood rot and termite infestation. He noted that painting and staining of windows is very important to prevent water from damaging wood windows; however, their product is 100 percent through the wood so water is repelled which adds to the longevity of the windows.

Commissioner St. Denis asked how this product is applied.

Mr. Caspers said the product is applied prior to the window being constructed.

Chairperson MacCartee asked if special orders can be requested.

Mr. Caspers said custom orders are built on demand.

Director McCaull asked Mr. Caspers to clarify the difference between the true wood window and the aluminum clad wood window they offer with regard to the face of the window from the exterior.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked for clarification on clad windows.

Mr. Caspers said that clad is an aluminum or vinyl cladding material that is applied directly to the wood.

Director McCaull added that when the material is applied to the surface, detailing normally found in the wood window is usually lost.

Mr. Caspers said that Jeld-Wen produces their windows in such a way that the detailing is not lost.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the pressure treated wood and the clad windows both have the 20-year warranty.

Mr. Caspers said yes, because all of their wood is treated with Auralast.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if there is a significant cost difference between the two products.

Mr. Caspers replied there is a minimal difference; however, the true wood product must be maintained. He added that even if the coating on the wood product is not maintained, the warranty is not compromised.

Commissioner St. Denis mentioned that the Design Review Commission approved the use of double hung clad windows for the Del Village at the Hotel Del Coronado.

Marty Condon, Sierra Pacific Windows, gave a brief presentation, displayed product samples, and answered questions. He said that although their main business is lumber, they started a wood window company about 30 years ago. He discussed true and simulated divided light and insulated glass with regard to their window product.

Jay Stroman, BEDE Windows, gave a brief presentation, displayed product samples, and answered questions. He said they are a German engineered and designed company that specializes in vinyl windows. Their product places wood laminate over vinyl, giving their windows a very authentic look. He mentioned that this type of product has been in used in Europe for the past 20 years. The advantage to using a wood laminate on the exterior and a white

vinyl in the interior is the lack of wood material which tends to rot in a coastal environment. Their company has recently been approved to work on an historical home in Mission Hills and one home in Rancho Santa Fe. He invited the Commission to view their showroom located in Oceanside, California.

Vice Chair O'Brien asked how the vinyl product holds up on a south-facing window.

Mr. Stroman said they offer a 10-year warranty for the exterior face, 20-year warranty for the interior against abnormal fading, chipping, and peeling. Given a coastal environment, they feel that their product will do well as long as there is minimal amount of maintenance which requires cleaning of the surface.

#### Public Comment

Chris Ackerman, Architect, 765 C Avenue, said it was his experience that vinyl windows are not approved for historic use.

Mr. Stroman said the historical home was approved to use their product for windows located on the side of the structure and not the front façade.

Bruce Coons, Executive Director, Save Our Heritage Organization (SOHO), 2476 San Diego Avenue, said that the Secretary of Interior Standards states that windows should be repaired rather than replaced, and, in the event of replacement, it should be in kind. In addition, they state that windows are a character defining feature of a building which should not be modified. Mr. Coons discussed the limitations on replacement windows and expressed concern about vendors duplicating the exact profiles on replacement windows. He added that, based on a 20-year study, a properly maintained wood window should last over 100 years. Most of the newer vinyl and aluminum clad windows will not last as long due to different types of corrosion problems, especially in the coastal environment.

Director McCaull asked if the 20-year study required that the windows be painted every two years.

Mr. Coons said it would depend on the type of paint used on the window. A good oil-based paint would require repainting every five to ten years, whereas latex paints attract water and cause problems.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if it was environmentally legal to use oil-based paint.

Mr. Coons said it was not environmentally illegal and added that they are currently re-doing the Verna House and the front porches of the Whaley House as well as the entire Derby house. It is important to use good oil that will last; he prefers one called "Prolife."

Chairperson MacCartee said she would consider using these types of windows on new additions.

Mr. Coons said that most jurisdictions allow new window systems on new additions.

Alana Coons, 51 Aruba Bend, said that the types of windows presented today focus more on the historic resource and not so much on new additions. She also added that the maintenance of windows is the responsibility of the property owner. With regard to the earlier comment about restoration of the Santa Fe Depot, she stated that the San Diego Historical Society does not approve restoration or preservation projects in San Diego—it is the responsibility of the Historic Resource Board of San Diego. She applauded the Commission's effort in inviting the speakers present today and suggested that the Commission may want to, in the future, invite persons in the field of restoration and preservation.

Mr. Condon responded that the reason the industry favors aluminum or vinyl clad is because of the quality of the paint used today. It does not last as long which requires that the property owner paint every two years.

Vice Chair O'Brien thanked the speakers for their presentations.

### **Discussion regarding Secretary of Interior's Standards for the treatment of historic properties**

Chairperson MacCartee asked that this item be placed on today's agenda to allow discussion on how the Standards relate to historically designated properties. The Commission's philosophy is to encourage the community's participation in the preservation program and in turn, provide benefits to property owners while finding a "middle ground" between the applicant and the Commission.

#### Public Comment

Mr. Coons said that Coronado's Preservation Ordinance requires that the Secretary of Interior's Standards be used as a guideline by the Commission when reviewing and making decisions on items brought before the Commission. He also understands that the Standards are subjective and can be interpreted differently by each agency.

Vice Chair O'Brien asked if it is a requirement that each and every item brought before the Commission adhere to the Secretary of Interior's Standards.

Director McCaull confirmed that it is one of the required findings for every item.

Commissioner Wilson said that her concern was keeping the exterior of the historic property available to the public and if there is an addition, it can be easily removed with out affecting the historic structure.

Commissioner St. Denis stated that she holds the Mills Act structures to a higher standard than the buildings that have been designated historic because the City helps to pay for it.

Director McCaull said she will be attending a Mills Act workshop which will include topics such as how communities treat their Mills Act properties versus the historically designated properties. She said this may be a good subject for discussion for the Commission.

Commissioner Crenshaw said she feels that it is significant to delineate between the Mills Act and historic designation because it appears to be a crux of almost all that the Commission has done this year. She perceived the public comments regarding prioritization of the Mills Act applications as very negative, but feels that the Commission did the best they could do.

Mr. Ackerman said he is strongly in favor of the concept of granting zoning relief as it provides much flexibility and encourages protection of existing historic buildings. However, it is important that careful consideration be given to the request so that the historic structure is not harmed or view of the structure is not blocked.

### **Discussion regarding newsletter**

Director McCaull reported that the next newsletter will go out in early September. She said that staff would organize a list and provide photographs of all alterations and designations that have occurred in the past year.

The Commission discussed possible items of interest for inclusion in the newsletter.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:53 p.m.

---

Tony A Peña  
Director of Community Development