

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

June 4, 2008

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:02 p.m., Wednesday, June 4, 2008, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, St. Denis, and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of May 7, 2008 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Commissioner's Summer Schedule. Director McCaull reported that, based on information she has received, there will be quorums for all upcoming meetings. She did remind the Commission that the July 16 meeting had been previously cancelled. The Commission agreed to not cancel any upcoming meetings, including the meeting on June 18 (discussion items only—no applications for review).

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HAP 12-08 **GRETCHEN MCCOY** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for alterations to the historically designated residence addressed as 763 C Avenue and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from zoning standards.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On October 3, 2007, the Historic Resource Commission designated this residence as an Historic Resource. On November 7, 2007, the Historic Resource Commission approved an Historic Resource Alteration Permit for restoration and alterations to the historically designated residence. The Commission also denied a request for a new carriage house that was proposed at the rear of the property. The Commission denied the request because it exceeded the allowable size regulations for carriage houses.

On February 6, 2008, the Historic Resource Commission considered a revised carriage house design that complied with zoning regulations, and approved a new carriage house above a two car garage. On May 15, 2008, a new Historic Alteration Permit application was filed with the City for a proposed second story addition to the historically designated residence. Craig Bretthauer is the architect for the project and the owner's authorized representative with the application.

The second story rear yard setback requirement for an addition to this residence would normally be 36' and the proposal calls for a 52' rear yard setback. Since this property previously received approval for a carriage house, the proposed second story addition is now subject to the Carriage House standards and setbacks. When a carriage house is located on a property, the second story rear yard setback requirement for the dwelling shall be "setback a minimum of 50 percent of the lot depth from the rear property line...." For this property, the second story rear yard setback is required to be 70' (50% of 140'). As mentioned previously, the proposed setback is 52' which is less than the 70' requirement.

Further, the architect has confirmed that the windows on the addition are proposed to be wood and the floor plan does not propose additional floor area where a small projection occurs on the street facing façade.

It is also important to note that Chapters 70.20 and 70.22 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance were recently amended to require City Council final approval for Historic Alteration Permit requests involving exceptions to zoning standards (excluding parking). Therefore, the Commission's action on today's permit request will be a recommendation to the City Council for final approval.

For the record, Director McCaull stated that a letter had been received from Chris Ackerman, the neighbor who lives at 765 C Avenue, supporting the alteration permit request.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant's representative, Craig Bretthauer, the project designer, 3813 Ray Street, San Diego, provided a brief overview and answered questions.

Harold Myers, 749 C Avenue, read into the record his letter requesting that the request be denied for the following reasons: (1) The project would result in a large structure incompatible with neighboring backyards and patios, (2) The project would set a precedent for future variances in the neighborhood, and (3) The Notice of Public Hearing for relief from zoning is inadequate.

Brad Willis, 757 C Avenue, agreed with Mr. Myers and asked that the request be denied because of quality of life issues the project would create for neighboring properties.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if the structure will be coming out to the lot line at the front of the property and if it involves a variance.

Director McCaull said that the previous alteration permit approved by the Commission allowed for an 8' foot porch to encroach into the 25' front yard setback. The porch encroachment was previously 6' and was changed four years ago to 8'. It does not involve a variance.

Commissioner St. Denis said she worked on the Carriage House Ordinance and believes it is a wonderful albeit controversial instrument which has been taken advantage of in Coronado. She said she approves of zoning relief for second story structures at the rear of properties while preserving the historic resource at the front. However, she feels that this request for both the carriage house and the second story addition falls under an "either/or" situation, and expressed concern with today's request because of privacy issues it will create if the property owner builds both a carriage house and second story addition. She added that because the property owner separately submitted the requests to add a carriage house and second story addition, it appears the property owner has attempted to "work the system."

Vice Chair O'Brien said he shared similar concerns and did not foresee this type of situation when the Carriage House Ordinance was approved.

Director McCaull commented that the Commission denied the original request by the property to add a new carriage house proposed at the rear of the property because it exceeded the allowable size regulations for carriage houses. The request was subsequently revised (and approved by the Commission) to comply with the codes in effect at that time.

Chairperson MacCartee re-opened the public hearing.

Peter Andreason, 753 C Avenue, stated he objects to the request including the request for relief from zoning standards, and said he feels that the property owner is attempting to circumvent the rules and regulations.

Ms. MacCartee said this is a very sensitive, historic neighborhood and feels that once variances are granted, it will impact the neighborhood and its residents' quality of life.

Vice Chair O'Brien asked about the requirement for the rear yard setback.

Director McCaull said the proposed setback is 52' which is less than the 70' requirement.

Commissioner St. Denis suggested a first floor addition that could possibly be joined to the garage if the property owner needed additional square footage.

Vice Chair O'Brien asked about the carriage house.

Mr. Bretthauer said the carriage house is presently under construction. He said that when he was designing the second story addition, he overlooked the rear yard setback rules for carriage houses.

Chairperson MacCartee asked one of the neighboring property owners, Mr. Myers, if he was willing to work with the property owner.

Mr. Myers said he was concerned with privacy issues if a second story addition and a carriage house were constructed; however, he said he was open to working with the property owner. He suggested that the second story addition would look better if it was moved forward and set back from the front of the house. If this were done, he understands this would be within the zoning requirements. He added that it appeared the eve of the front porch is not just extending into the side yard setback but actually going right up to the lot line. He requested that staff look into this matter.

Mr. Willis said he agreed with Mr. Myers that approval should be given to the property owner to construct either the carriage house or the second story addition, but not both. He asked if the property owner had obtained a permit for construction of the carriage house.

Director McCaull confirmed that the property owner has a valid permit to construct the carriage house.

Chairperson MacCartee closed the public hearing.

Vice Chair O'Brien summarized that the Commission could continue the hearing until the second story addition is brought in compliance with current zoning requirements, or deny the request presented today and have the applicant re-submit their request with appropriate changes. He supported that the item be continued.

Commissioner Wilson said such action would pre-suppose a certain amount of acceptance. She would be more comfortable denying today's request.

Commissioner O'Brien said that denial of today's application may be the appropriate action by the Commission; however, he suggested providing the applicant comments and direction. He suggested that the applicant move the second story addition forward so that a variance is not required.

Commissioner St. Denis agreed with Commissioner O'Brien, and said that this type of addition is being done in the community.

Commissioner Crenshaw said she preferred that the property owner not construct a second story because she feels this is a beautiful historic home.

COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION TO DENY HAP 12-08, REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR ALTERATIONS TO THE HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 763 C AVENUE AND LOCATED IN THE R-1B (SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL) ZONE, INCLUDING EXCEPTIONS TO THE ZONING STANDARDS.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS NOT CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION AND SECOND STORY ADDITION ABOVE THE REAR OF THE RESIDENCE THAT DOES NOT CONFORM TO ZONING REQUIREMENTS WILL NOT RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION AND REQUEST FOR RELIEF FROM THE SECOND STORY SETBACK REQUIREMENTS WILL ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER ST. DENIS SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, St. Denis, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

NOI 4-08 **SERNA, STEPHEN P. AND VIRGINIA D.** – Consideration of Notice of Intent to Demolish the single family residence addressed as 718 Tenth Street and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The site contains a single story dwelling on a 40' x 80' (3,200 square foot) parcel. City records indicate the dwelling was constructed in 1909 so the residence is 99 years old. Stephen and Virginia Serna would like to demolish the home to build a new residence. Since the dwelling to be demolished is over 75 years of age, a Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit Application has been filed with the City by the current owners.

The home was originally owned by William and Sarah Millen. The contractor and architect/designer were not identified. The current residence contains 1,039 square feet. City records indicate there have been a few alterations to the exterior of the residence since its original construction. Eduardo and Elizabeth Otero owned the residence from at least 1964 and deeded the dwelling onto their daughter a few years ago.

The building has a Craftsman Bungalow architectural style that is representative of Coronado's early developmental history. This house is one of five structures in the 700 block facing 10th

Street with Craftsman Bungalow architectural styles. It is interesting to note that 710, 714, and 718 were all built in 1909; however, there were no common owners or builders. The other two structures at 700 and 708 were built in 1911.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant, Stephen Serna, 749 H Avenue, made himself available to answer questions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Wilson said she regrets that this house (one of three) was not included on the Coronado Property Review (CPR) list.

Director McCaull commented that the house was on the original CPR list but was removed when the number of homes on the list was reduced.

Commissioner St. Denis said that the homes (three), as individual units, do not appear to be significant, but together they are contributory structures in a potentially historic district. In addition, they are representative of a unique and scarce style because of their roofs and windows.

Vice Chair O'Brien said he supports the request.

Commissioner Crenshaw agreed that the home is beautiful but supports the request for demolition.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 718 TENTH STREET (NOI 4-08) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

B. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S), OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;

C. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;

D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;

- E. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME).

THE FOLLOWING CONDITION WAS ADDED:

1. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION (CHA) AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO PROVIDE CHA WITH AN OPPORTUNITY TO SALVAGE HISTORIC BUILDING MATERIALS FOR THEIR "KEEP IT IN CORONADO" RE-USE PROGRAM.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, St. Denis, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

MISCELLANEOUS

HR 5-08 CITY OF CORONADO – Proposed modifications to Chapter 70.22 of the Municipal Code regarding the Historic Preservation Ordinance. The proposed amendments would modify the Notice of Intent to Demolish permit process to include non-residential structures 75 years or older that are subject to the Demolition permit review process.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. She said the issue before the Commission today is whether they desire to make changes to the draft Ordinance amendments before forwarding it to City Council for their consideration. She added that, per City Council direction, the draft Ordinance has been prepared to include all non-residential structures into the permit process; therefore, as drafted, any residential or non-residential structures 75 years of age or older would be subject to the Notice of Intent to Demolish permit process. In addition, discussion today should address those properties that are not 75 years of age or older. Ms. McCaull added that there was also some discussion by the City Council that they were interested in a tolling agreement with the property owners. After discussion with the City Manager's office, staff has determined that the tolling agreement would not be an appropriate contract for the City to enter into with a homeowner.

Commissioner St. Denis asked about the demolition process with regard to requests for demolition of Cliff May homes.

Director McCaull responded that all but two Cliff May homes in Coronado have been designated. She said she is in communication with one property owner, and the other property owner is in the process of historic designation.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if the Commission may review and remove properties on the list.

Director McCaull said the Commission would be creating a separate list, which is a concern because it may, once again, cause a controversy among the residents on why their homes are/are not listed.

Vice Chair O'Brien commented that some homes that were built between 1935 and 1939 are very attractive and it would be unlikely that the property owner would wish to demolish them.

Commissioner Wilson agreed and said she would prefer not to create a new list.

Chairperson MacCartee agreed.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:20 p.m.

Tony A Peña
Director of Community Development