

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

May 7, 2008

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m., Wednesday, May 7, 2008, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioners Crenshaw and St. Denis

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner  
Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of April 16, 2008 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director McCaull reported that at the City Council meeting of May 6, the City Council approved the proposed amendments to the Historic Preservation Ordinance. The amendments require that, per City Council's direction, certain types of alteration permits involving exceptions to the Code have final approval by the City Council.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

**HRPA 1-08**    **MONICA AND DANIEL CEPIN** – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated residence addressed as 940 Glorietta Boulevard and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. This item was continued from the April 16, 2008 meeting in order for the applicant to be present when the item was heard. On December 6, 2006, the Historic Resource Commission designated 940 Glorietta Boulevard as a Coronado Historic Resource.

One of the benefits of having the property designated as a Historic Resource is that the property owner is then eligible to apply to the City of Coronado for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement. The Mills Act Agreement is not an automatic entitlement rather it is a benefit the City is providing to historic properties with each agreement evaluated on its own

merits. On March 6, 2008, Monica and Daniel Cepin filed an application to enter into a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement. Mr. Dale Mummert is the owner's representative with the application.

An Historic Resource Preservation Agreement is a contract between the property owner and the City, wherein the property owner agrees to preserve, and when necessary, restore and rehabilitate a designated historic resource throughout the term of the ten (10) year agreement. In exchange, the property owner receives a reduction in property taxes.

During the ten-year period of the agreement, the property owners are planning to undertake the following improvements:

1. Paint house.
2. Anti-termite treatment
3. Fix roof leaks and wood chips
4. Replace basement support beams
5. Window repair
6. Replace Electric
7. Landscaping Improvements
8. New gate and Iron fence replacement
9. Cut tree because roots are too close to house
10. Replace driveway cement that is broken
11. Replace sewage drain system

Lee Potter of the County Tax Assessor's office has completed an estimate of the restricted value of 940 Glorietta with the Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement in place. With the current estimate, the owner will see an estimated \$5,071 savings in property tax. The City of Coronado and the Community Development Agency will see an estimated annual property tax revenue decrease of \$2,941. The Commission is aware that there is a back-log of Mills Act applications.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant's representative, Dale Mummert, 1532 Glorietta Boulevard, made himself available to answer questions.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL APPROVAL OF HRP 1-08, REQUEST FOR AN HISTORIC PRESERVATION MILLS ACT AGREEMENT, AS SUBMITTED.

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioners Crenshaw and St. Denis.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

**HR 4-08**      **ARNOUD AND MARGARET SWAGEMAKERS** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 756 J Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The site is 50' wide and 140' deep totaling 7,000 square feet. The property contains a single story residence and a detached accessory building and guest house. The owner has applied for historic designation to preserve the residence and also plans to apply for a Historic Alteration Permit for modifications to the rear building in the future. This item was continued from the April 16, 2008 meeting at the request of the owners.

City records indicate a permit was issued in 1926 for the construction of the dwelling so the residence is 87 years old. Mrs. J. G. Hall was identified as the owner and Oscar Dorman was identified as the contractor. In 1929, a permit was issued for an addition to the dwelling and was completed by Chris Cosgrove. While alterations and or additions occurred to the building in its early years, City records indicate no building alterations have occurred to the dwelling since 1941.

The single story residence has a Spanish Colonial Revival architectural style with stucco exterior, tile roof, prominent "hacienda" style front porch and deeply recessed wood windows. The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave this residence an historical value rating of 2. A rating of 2 indicated the structure should be a candidate for inclusion on the Coronado Historical Register and was built before 1942; is in excellent physical condition; is almost entirely unmodified from its original exterior appearance; has substantial architectural significance; and would qualify as a contributing structure to a potential historic district. The application mentions that the owners may want to pursue future alterations; however, no information has been submitted at this time.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

Arnoud "Dutch" Swagemakers, 756 J Avenue, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions. Mr. Swagemakers said that the property located at 756 ½ has been a non conforming rental property for the last 40 years and does not know if this may be an issue should he decide to apply for an historic designation in the future.

Chairperson MacCartee said that if Mr. Swagemakers is considering an historic designation and may be requesting relaxation from zoning requirements, she would suggest he bring plans before the Commission for a preliminary review.

Director McCaull said it is up to the property owner if he wishes to proceed with the designation request. The City Council will ultimately make the final decision for alteration permit requests. More details are needed with regard to the number and type of Code exceptions before any clear direction can be given by the Commission and/or be considered by the City Council. Ms. McCaull suggested that a conception plan would be helpful before action could be taken on a designation request.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO ALLOW THE APPLICANT TO RETURN WITH PRELIMINARY PLANS.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioners Crenshaw and St. Denis.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

**HAP 8-08 LEONARD PERRY AND LINDSEY ANDERSON** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for modifications to historically designated residence addressed as 576 E Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On September 7, 2005, the Historic Resource Commission designated this residence as an historic resource. An Historic Alteration Permit has been filed with the City for proposed alterations planned for the historically designated property. The application proposes to re-roof the existing building and construct a basement below a portion of the existing residence along with a new foundation.

The existing composition roof shingles are a green color. The existing shingles and layers on the roof will be removed and replaced with a new composition shingle roof in a weathered wood color. No changes are proposed to the roofline of the residence.

An existing crawl space is located below the entire building. A new basement is proposed to replace the existing crawl space under a portion of the residence and provide new square footage for the dwelling. The new basement will also provide an opportunity to address structural issues with the existing foundation and improve stability of the residence.

The basement will not result in any change to the size, height, or elevations of the residence. The new floor area within the basement will trigger the need for an egress well window. The egress well window is proposed at the front of the residence. The building code requires a safety railing

if the well depth is 30" or greater. The building official will not waive this requirement for a Historic Resource and landscape hedges may not be used as an alternative. Hedges could be placed in front of the safety rail or grate. The architect should clarify whether some type of safety railing or grate will be installed around the well so an individual does not mistakenly fall in. Since fencing surrounds the perimeter of the site, the safety railing will likely not be as visible from the public right-of-way.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant's representative, Carol Anderson, 151 West Wing Street, Burlington Heights, IL, provided a brief overview and answered questions.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair O'Brien agreed that the house does need a new foundation, and said that he supports the request.

Chairperson MacCartee asked if the safety railing needed to be approved by the Commission, especially if it would not be visible from the street.

Director McCaull responded that it may or may not be visible.

The Commission agreed to include approval of the safety railing in their motion.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 8-08, REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR MODIFICATIONS TO HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 576 E AVENUE, TO INCLUDE MODIFICATIONS TO THE ROOF, FOUNDATION, AND THE SAFETY RAILING.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioners Crenshaw and St. Denis.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

**HAP 9-08** **CHARLES AND VIRGINIA NELSON** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for the historically designated residence addressed as 1807 Monterey Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from zoning standards.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On April 16, 2008, the Historic Resource Commission designated this residence as an historic resource. At the meeting, it was noted that the owners planned to restore the residence and make some alterations to the home. Conceptual plans were presented; however, no formal action was taken by the Commission. It was noted that these alterations would be the subject of a future public hearing.

An Historic Alteration Permit has been filed with the City for proposed restoration and alterations planned for the Historic Residence. Byrlan Cass-Shively is the architect for the project and the owner's authorized representative with the Historic Designation request.

The project plans and application detail the extent of improvements planned for the site. The Alteration Permit generally involves renovations and restoration to the residence with some additional changes to the rear of the building; new decorative wrought iron grill work along the front façade; and the addition of a pergola above the existing porte cochere.

Along the front façade, a new pair of French doors is proposed on the second floor behind the existing arched covered balcony. The existing wood railing at the balcony is proposed to be removed and replaced with a decorative wrought iron railing. A new decorative wrought iron "reja" is proposed on the second story central window per the original construction drawings. New wrought iron entry gates are also proposed for the front door as well as for the driveway entrance at the porte cochere. The existing chimney is proposed to be extended to 23'6" in height and a new decorative cap added to match the original drawings. The wood windows throughout the building are proposed to be restored or replaced in kind. The existing wood shutters will also be removed and replaced with new wood shutters that match existing shutter design and dimensions. The building is proposed to be refinished in a smooth off-white stucco finish with Cape Code Blue trim for the windows and shutters and black or dark bronze wrought iron.

The porte cochere has an existing roof deck. The applicant proposes to modify the structure to raise the existing stucco wall along the front and side perimeter to 30" in height and replace the

existing rear wood railing with a new 30" tall wrought iron balustrade. The applicant should clarify whether the proposed railing height complies with today's building codes. According to the Building Official, the railing height must be a minimum of 42" above the surface of the deck. Due to safety concerns, the Building Official is not willing to waive this requirement using the Historic Building Code. A decorative wood pergola is proposed above the existing porte cochere deck. The pergola would be fairly open with the exception of the three pergola support posts and two horizontal members. The design of the pergola posts are intended to match the porch column on the front of the building. The proposed pergola and raised stucco wall and replacement railing are located within the 5' side yard setback requirement and would require Commission approval. Additionally, the Building Official indicates the pergola would need to be made out of heavy timber if within 5' of the property line.

Along the rear elevation, the existing covered porch (or loggia) is proposed to be enclosed. The loggia would be enclosed with metal doors with multi-paned glass. The flat roof would be modified to a pitched roof with tile. The door that used to utilize the flat roof for access to the porte cochere roof deck will be changed to a window. A window closer to the porte cochere will be changed to a door to allow access to the deck. A small 6' x 8' one-story addition is proposed at the rear of the residence. The addition would have a 24' rear yard setback which complies with the required setback of 15'.

Miscellaneous outdoor patio improvements are proposed for the residence and generally include a new fountain, a wood pergola, brick pavers, and detached exterior stucco fireplace. There is no longer concern that the location of the new fire place may impact ingress to and egress from the garage since the new fireplace is in line with the existing wall. The doors on the existing garage are proposed to be replaced with new wood period carriage style over head doors. When the project is completed it will have a 30% lot coverage and a 48% floor area ratio which well below code requirements.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

Byrlan Cass-Shievely, 4 Town Oaks Place, Bellaire, Texas, gave a lengthy overview of the request and answered questions. Ms. Cass-Shievely provided the Commissioners with a perspective rendering of the porte cochere and second floor railing and pergola. She also provided a handout depicting a drawing of what the front façade would look like if the front railing was raised to 42".

Chairperson MacCartee asked if Ms. Cass-Shievely wanted relief from the height limitation of the wrought iron railing.

Ms. Cass-Shievely said yes.

Vice Chair O'Brien said that the Code, up until January 1, 2007, was at 36".

Ms. Cass-Shievely said the existing railings are 30" high. She mentioned that a number of homes in Coronado have the same railing height. She says that part of the reason for the lower railing height is because ceilings, during the time that the homes were built, were not very high. She added that the existing windows and French doors would be re-used as they are trying to re-

adapt as many of the existing materials back into the renovation to keep the original design of the architecture.

Vice Chair O'Brien asked staff to confirm the Code requirement for the railing height.

Director McCaull responded that the Code requirement is 42". This would definitely apply to the back railing above the porte cochere. However, the City is willing to work with the owner with the front railing height so that the building looks architecturally appropriate.

Chairperson MacCartee said that the Commission was willing to accept the front railing height of 30" but the owner would have to work with staff on the back railing height.

Ms. Cass-Shievely said that they would like to add Master bedroom French doors that go out into the balcony. They would also like the option to either restore or replace the windows with custom made windows to match the existing profiles.

Vice Chair O'Brien said the request to add French doors seemed a potentially appropriate solution in this case, though not always.

Chairperson MacCartee said it appeared that there are already existing French doors.

Ms. Cass-Shievely said there is only one French door and she is proposing adding another.

Director McCaull said that with regard to the wood pergola proposed above the existing porte cochere deck, she had not received any notification from the adjoining property owner.

Ms. Cass-Shievely said the pergola would provide a sense of privacy for both property owners.

Commissioner Wilson said that because no communication had been received by the adjoining property owners, she did not see an issue with the request.

Vice Chair O'Brien agreed and said that vines on the trellis would be appropriate. He said he would be prepared to support the application by requiring that the front railing of the porte cochere be at 36" which, up until December 2007, was the required height for safety issues. He said he would also support a 30" railing height over the Master bedroom, new French doors in the Master bedroom, proposed grill work in the front, and the pergola with the trellis in the far west side. However, he did request that the plants on the trellis be automatically sprinkled to keep the area aesthetically pleasing.

Chairperson MacCartee said she is fine with all requests but suggested that the owner contact the adjoining property owner to advise them of the proposed trellis.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 9-08, REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR THE HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 1807 MONTEREY AVENUE INCLUDING EXCEPTIONS TO THE ZONING STANDARDS, SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

1. THE LANDSCAPE MATERIAL PROPOSED FOR THE TRELIS SHALL HAVE AUTOMATIC IRRIGATION SYSTEM.
2. PERGOLA AND TRELIS SHALL RESPECT THE ONE HOUR FIRE CONSTRUCTION REQUIREMENTS.
3. FRONT BALCONY RAILING PROPOSED TO BE CHANGED FROM WOOD TO WROUGHT IRON IS SUPPORTED AT ITS EXISTING HEIGHT OF 30".

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioners Crenshaw and St. Denis.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

**HAP 10-08 TODD AND TERRI ANSON** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for restoration work and modifications to the historically designated residence addressed as 611 A Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from zoning standards.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda, and added that no written communication had been received on this item with the exception of one telephone call from the adjoining neighbor to the north of the property and one visitor to the Planning Department from someone who owns the property south.

On March 7, 2001, the Historic Resource Commission designated this residence as an historic resource. The structure was noted as historically significant for its Tudor architectural style and for being designed by noted architect William Hebbard. Mr. and Mrs. Anson received a Mills Act Agreement for this property in 2002.

An Historic Alteration Permit has been filed with the City for proposed restoration and alterations planned for the historic residence. The Alteration Permit generally involves an addition to the residence; modifications to the roofline of the third floor of the residence; new garage doors; new roof materials and color scheme; and minor landscape improvements.

The addition is proposed along the side of residence along the north elevation. The addition will be setback from the front facade by approximately 12'. The addition will project out from the line of the existing residence by approximately 7'. Based upon today's standards, the zoning requires a 12'6" setback.

Adjacent to the kitchen addition, a new fireplace and covered porch are proposed. The proposed porch would have a 3' side yard setback instead of the 12'6" required by the zoning ordinance. Since this lot slopes down from the street, the porch may not be visible from the public right-of-way; however the proximity of the porch to the required side yard should be addressed by the Commission.

The existing flat roofline on the third floor of the residence is proposed to be replaced with a side gable roof. The existing building is 29' in height. The ridge line of the new roof will be approximately 31'. The maximum building height for roofs with a 6:12 pitch is 30' (with limitations). Although the roof modification is proposed to enhance the architectural look of the building, the proposed alteration exceeds the allowable building height regulations and requires Commission approval.

The existing roof is a composition shingle. The owners are proposing to replace this roof with a multi-colored slate roof. The slate roof has a faded green gray color and a sample material will be available at the meeting. The building color is proposed to be changed slightly to a "Putnam Ivory" which is slightly darker than the present stucco color. The Timbers, fascias, and trim would be painted "Hasbrouck brown" which closely resembles the colors today. The window sashes are proposed to be painted a "Caldwell Green".

The existing garage doors are proposed to be changed to wood carriage with glass transom windows. These garage doors are proposed to be painted "Caldwell Green." Additionally, the application notes new French doors and balcony are proposed; however, it is not clear where this alteration is occurring.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant, Todd Anson, 611 A Avenue, provided a brief overview and answered questions.

Donna Ball, 1414 6<sup>th</sup> Street, said she is supportive of all of the requests but expressed concern about light (shadow) issues on her home as well as privacy issues.

Chairperson MacCartee said she did not think that the roof line would make a difference with regard to light issues.

Mr. Anson said the porch roof should not cause any light issues for his neighbors.

Director McCaull said that the 14' high structure will be three feet from the property line although there are hedges which measure about 8' or 10'. Therefore, the top of the structure may be visible; however, whether it will create light issues is unknown.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Wilson said she had no issues with the requests.

Vice Chair O'Brien said he will support all of the requests as they are an improvement to the house. He added that although there are significant proposed changes, the house will still be an historically significant Mills Act home.

Chairperson MacCartee said that she is in favor of making historical houses into homes that will support modern living.

Director McCaull commented that the property owner's request to add a balcony and French doors along the northern elevation is not on the agenda for approval today and will need to return before the Commission at a future date.

### COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 10-08, REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR RESTORATION WORK AND MODIFICATIONS TO THE HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 611 A AVENUE INCLUDING EXCEPTIONS TO THE ZONING STANDARDS.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.

- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioners Crenshaw and St. Denis.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

The Commission recessed at 4:51 p.m.

The Commission reconvened at 4:56 p.m. All members were present.

**HAP 11-08 ADELLA PROPERTY VENTURE** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit to modify building colors and for the construction of a new garage with pool room above for the historically designated residence addressed as 803 Adella Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from zoning standards for the garage building.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda and stated that no written correspondence was received on this item. On December 19, 2007, the Historic Resource Commission designated this residence as an historic resource. On January 2, 2008, the Commission approved alterations to the residence with the condition that the applicant return with revised plans for the proposed two car garage and details of the proposed color scheme.

The owners have submitted a new application to address the conditions of approval. The proposed building scheme includes a stucco color that is a 50/50 blend of "Lotus Pod and Casa Blanca" by Sherman Williams. The trim color is a "Knoxville Grey" by Benjamin Moore. The windows will also be painted this color.

The two car garage proposed at the rear of the property will be 26' wide and 23' deep totaling 598 square feet. The garage will have a 5' rear yard setback and 6' side yard setback along the driveway. The proposed garage complies with code requirements. Above the garage a new pool room is proposed. This pool room is considered a second story. This room cannot contain a kitchen or be used as a separate dwelling unit. Exterior stairs along the north and south elevation lead to the pool room via an open deck. The proposed accessory building has a very steep gable

roof and one dormer. The building height is 21' versus the 24' that was proposed with the previous submittal.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant's representatives, David Udell, 1327 8<sup>th</sup> Street, and Tom Lancaster, 936 J Avenue, gave a brief presentation/overview of the request, displayed a color palette, and answered questions. Mr. Udell said they were able to find a company in South Carolina to reproduce the existing roof tile and it is almost a perfect match. The roof material will be a ceramic tile with a greenish tint and a combing effect, similar to a shake roof. The shed part of the roof will be a copper roof. He has spoken with the surrounding neighbors and they have given him their verbal approval on this.

Nancy Hardigan, 731 Adella Avenue, said she originally had concerns with the garage and privacy issues but the owners have already addressed these issues. She added that the owners have been very sensitive with the details of the house and hopes that they will use carriage type doors for the garage.

Mr. Udell responded that they are planning to use carriage type garage doors.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 11-08, REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT TO MODIFY BUILDING COLORS AND FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW GARAGE WITH POOL ROOM ABOVE FOR THE HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 803 ADELLA AVENUE INCLUDING EXCEPTIONS TO THE ZONING STANDARDS, SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

1. THE GARAGE DOOR WILL BE A CARRIAGE HOUSE DESIGN RATHER THAN THE GARAGE DOOR DESIGN DEPICTED ON THE ELEVATION WITH THE PROJECT PLAN.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.

- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioners Crenshaw and St. Denis.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

**NOI 3-08**      **ELAINE H. ALLEN** – Notice of Intent to Demolish the single family residence addressed as 543 A Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The site contains a two story dwelling on a 59' x 190' parcel containing approximately 11,210 square feet. City records do not indicate when the dwelling was constructed; however, a permit was issued in 1913 to connect a structure to the sewer system. It is estimated that the dwelling is 95 years old. The property is in escrow and the new owner plans to demolish the structure and build a new residence. Since the dwelling to be demolished is over 75 years of age, a Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit Application has been filed with the City. D. L. Walker is the owner's authorized representative with the application.

City records indicate there have been several alterations to the residence over the years. In 1978, the appearance of the front of the home changed with the construction of a partial second floor addition, new roof line and stucco that was added to the exterior of the building. Permits were issued in 1995, for additional changes to the lower rear of the home; however the permits expired. Exterior photos provided by the applicant show the rear lower half of the residence in a state of disrepair and or construction. Since no current building permits exist for the property, it is not clear whether either the 1977 or 1995 permit work were ever completed.

City records do not indicate the original builder or designer/architect for the residence. Previous owners are not known to have played a significant role on Coronado's history. The building does not represent a particular architectural style since the roof line and exterior façade have been altered from their original appearance. The only architectural features remaining from the original building appear to be the wood diamond paned windows.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant's representative, Dan Walker, 543 A Avenue, made himself available to answer questions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 543 A AVENUE (NOI 3-08) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

- A. IT DOES NOT EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S), OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;
- E. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME).

THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS WERE ADDED:

- 1. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CITY AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO ALLOW CITY AND/OR THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION AN OPPORTUNITY TO PREPARE A PHOTOGRAPHIC, FILM,

VIDEO, OR OTHER APPROPRIATE RECORD OF THE EXTERIOR/INTERIOR OF THE STRUCTURE.

2. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION (CHA) AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO PROVIDE CHA WITH AN OPPORTUNITY TO SALVAGE HISTORIC BUILDING MATERIALS FOR THEIR "KEEP IT IN CORONADO" RE-USE PROGRAM.

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioners Crenshaw and St. Denis.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

#### MISCELLANEOUS

Commissioner O'Brien suggested that a public workshop be held with regard to historically accurate window replacements. He said that it may be interesting to hear from manufacturers who offer clad windows that meet historic designation criteria. Mr. O'Brien said that staff and he could put together a list of manufacturers who would be available to speak on this subject.

#### ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

---

Tony A Peña  
Director of Community Development