HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting April 16, 2008

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:04 p.m., Wednesday, April 16, 2008, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

| | |
|---|---|
| MEMBERS PRESENT: | Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson |
| MEMBERS ABSENT: | Commissioners St. Denis |
| STAFF PRESENT: | Ann McCaull, Associate Planner<br>Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary |

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of April 2, 2008 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director McCaull reported that at the City Council meeting of May 6, the City Council will be considering proposed amendments to the Historic Preservation Ordinance. The amendments require that, per City Council's direction, certain types of alteration permits involving exceptions to the Code have final approval by the City Council.

Director McCaull also reported that historic alteration plaques have been received. She has tentatively scheduled this item for the May 20 City Council meeting.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

**HRPA 1-08** **MONICA AND DANIEL CEPIN** – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated residence addressed as 940 Glorietta Boulevard and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. *(continued from the meeting of April 2, 2008)*

Director McCaull reported that the applicants and/or their representatives were not able to attend today's meeting, and have requested that the item be continued to the meeting of May 7, 2008.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ITEM DUE TO LACK OF REPRESENTATION AT THE COMMISSION MEETING.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Commissioner St. Denis.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

**HR 3-08** **CHARLES AND VIRGINIA NELSON** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 1807 Monterey Avenue and located in the R-1A(CC-1) (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. Charles and Virginia Nelson recently acquired this property, which totals approximately 7,200 square feet. City records indicate a permit was issued in 1935 for the construction of the dwelling so the residence is 73 years old. In order for a structure to be designated Historic, the structure must be at least 75 years old or have achieved historic significance within the past 75 years and meet two additional criteria. Since the home is not 75 years of age, the Commission should determine first, if the structure has achieved historic significance within the past 75 years. One justification for its historical significance would be that it was one of the first homes built in the "flats" as depicted by an early photograph provided with the application. As the Commission may recall, in Coronado's early days, "the flats" were not viewed as desirable locations for dwellings and remained sparsely developed in Coronado's early history.

City records indicate the original owner was S. L. Johnson and the contractor was R.E. Erwin Building Co. The application indicates the dwelling was designed by Louis Preibisius who was an architect and son of San Diego architect and builder, Henry Harms Preibisius. Henry Preibisius was noted for designing the St. James Hotel. No information was available regarding Louis Preibisius. The application notes the homes are similar in architectural style to the historically designated residences at 1015 Loma and 1010 Olive Avenue; however, none of these homes have common builders or architects.

The architectural style of the residence could best be described as Spanish Colonial Revival. Since the home was originally constructed, very few alterations have occurred to the residence. In 1941, a permit was issued to Walter Vestal to add a sun porch and in 1971, a permit was issued to remodel the kitchen. The home remains architecturally intact since its original construction

The applicant's representative, Byrlan Cass-Shievely, Designer, 4 Town Oaks Place, Bellaire, Texas, gave a brief overview of the request, reviewed potential future alterations to the home, and answered questions.

Chairperson MacCartee responded that the Commission's response to the potential alterations is very positive.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Crenshaw said the home is exquisite and she looks forward to seeing the proposed additions.

Commissioner O'Brien suggested that the outside water heater located on the east side of the property could be replaced with a flash water heater, which does not necessitate a separate room.

The applicant, Charles Nelson, 711 J Avenue, said the home had a mold problem due to poor piping quality. He hired a company to perform mold abatement. He has since installed a tankless heater which will be enclosed with proper venting.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 1807 MONTEREY AVENUE TO BE AN HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, SOCIAL, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY; AND
C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING HOMES THAT WAS FIRST BUILT IN THE "FLAT" AND POSSESSES AND POSSESSES DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SPANISH COLONIAL REVIVAL ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Commissioner St. Denis.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

**HR 4-08** **ARNOUD AND MARGARET SWAGEMAKERS** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 756 J Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull reported that the applicants and/or their representatives were not able to attend today's meeting, and have requested that the item be continued to the meeting of May 7, 2008.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ITEM DUE TO LACK OF REPRESENTATION AT THE COMMISSION MEETING.

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Commissioner St. Denis.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

MISCELLANEOUS

**Discussion regarding City Council Action Administrative Appeal for 1043 Ocean Boulevard. (no report)**

Director McCaull reported that that this item was continued to the City Council meeting of May 20, 2008. There were a few individuals who provided testimony and who will not be able to provide testimony at the May 20 City Council meeting.

Director McCaull stated that prior to the meeting she spoke with the owner and architect. They are willing to discuss ways to reach a compromise as they do not wish this to become a controversial issue for the City Council and community. Staff has made suggestions to the owner/architect regarding elements they may want to consider eliminating from their project proposal. The owners will take this information into consideration as well as advice from their attorney.

Chairperson MacCartee asked if the Historic Resource Commissioners should be involved in this process.

Director McCaull said that she would like to first obtain advice from the City Attorney with regard to procedures and processes. She is open to having two Historic Resource Commissioners involved in the process.

Commissioner O'Brien volunteered his services and suggested that Commissioner St. Denis may also be interested.

Commissioner Wilson agreed that Commissioner St. Denis would be a good candidate because she has an architectural background.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:39 p.m.

_____
Tony A Peña
Director of Community Development