

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

April 2, 2008

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:05 p.m., Wednesday, April 2, 2008, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, St. Denis, and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of March 5, 2008 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director McCaull reported that at the April 15 City Council meeting, City Council will be considering two items that were previously heard by the Historic Resource Commission:

1. Request for approval of a Condominium Conversion Map for the Granada Complex, a historically designated property located at 936-954 C Avenue;
2. Request for approval of a Condominium Conversion Map for the property located at 909 D Avenue, 1006-1012 Ninth Street.
3. An Appeal of the Historic Resource Commission's decision to approve an historic alteration permit for the historically designated residence (Spreckels Mansion) located at 1043 Ocean Boulevard. Only those individuals who are identified on the List of Witnesses are eligible to speak at the Council meeting regarding the project. Anyone wishing to be placed on the list should contact City staff.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HRPA 1-08 MONICA AND DANIEL CEPIN – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated residence addressed as 940 Glorietta Boulevard and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull reported that the applicants and/or their representatives were not present.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ITEM DUE TO LACK OF REPRESENTATION AT THE COMMISSION MEETING.

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, St. Denis and Wilson.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

HAP 6-08 **CAROLYN ELLEDGE** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit to modify roof materials for the historically designated residence addressed as 1244 Alameda Boulevard and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The existing roofing material on the residence is cedar wood shingles and is in poor condition and needs replacement. Mrs. Elledge would like to replace the existing wood shingles with new wood shingles; however, she is having difficulty locating high quality and affordable roof shingles. As an alternative, she is considering a fiberglass shingle produced by Grand Manor Shangle that would be in a Brownstone color. This item was heard at the March 5 meeting and was continued to allow time for Ms. Elledge to obtain a sample of the roofing material. The applicant was also encouraged to view 605 10th Street because the home uses similar roofing material.

The applicant, Carolyn Elledge, 1244 Alameda Boulevard, brought samples of the roofing material and made herself available to answer questions.

Vice Chair O'Brien said the difference between the Grand Manor Shangle and some of the other composition roof tiles is that it has a black shadow line underneath each individual tile so when it is viewed from a distance, it appears thicker.

Commissioner St. Denis asked the applicant if she had an opportunity to look at treated wood cedar shingles and compare prices. Ms. St. Denis noted that these types of shingles must be fire treated and are pricey but is the same roofing material currently on Ms. Elledge's home.

Ms. Elledge said she was quoted a price of \$150,000 for replacing her existing roofing material with wood cedar shingles. This quote was given to her by the same person who fixed the roof leak.

Commissioner Wilson asked Ms. Elledge what she thought about the roofing material on the home located at 605 10th Street.

Ms. Elledge said the shingles looked nice on the home but they did not appear to look like real shingles. She would prefer to use real shingles on her home.

Vice Chair O'Brien commented on the combination of the prohibitive price and the additional cost of insurance to put in a wood roof. He commented that Coronado is one of the few municipalities in San Diego County that allows wood roofs which he feels suggests that we should be looking at alternatives. The Grand Manor Shingle is a good solution at a reasonable price that also addresses the issue of homes which are not structurally sound enough to support a heavy roof.

Commissioner St. Denis said the roof on Ms. Elledge's home is very prominent and asked if there is a way to save enough good shingles to place in the areas that are at eye-level such as the entry roof, and install Brownstone shingles on the remaining roof area.

Ms. Elledge said she asked the contractor who fixed the roof leak, and he said he would not be open to doing this.

Commissioner St. Denis suggested that Ms. Elledge may want to speak with other contractors.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 6-08, REQUEST FOR MODIFICATIONS TO THE ROOFING MATERIAL TO ALLOW FOR CEDAR OR FIBERGLASS SHINGLE PRODUCED BY GRAND MANOR SHINGLE ON THE HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 1244 ALAMEDA BOULEVARD, AS SUBMITTED.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.

E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, St. Denis, and Wilson
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

HR 1-08 **DONALD HUBBARD** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 1022 Park Place and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The site is 40' wide and 140' deep totaling 5,600 square feet. The property contains a two and one-half story dwelling with a detached accessory building. The site does not have alley access. The owner has applied for historic designation to preserve the residence and also plans to apply for a Mills Act Agreement in the future.

City records do not reflect the original construction date of the residence. Permits indicate the lot had an assessed valuation of \$50 in 1892 and then no valuation in 1894 -1895 and then in 1896 an assessed valuation of \$1,200. Based upon material submitted with the application and the 1896 assessed valuation on the lot in 1896, it is presumed the dwelling was constructed in 1895. The dwelling is estimated to be 113 years old.

The application notes the dwelling was built for B.L. Muir who came to San Diego in 1886 during the time of the great sale of Coronado lots. Mr. Muir opened the first real estate office in 1887. Mr. Muir's marriage to Lizzie Barber was also the first wedding ceremony to be conducted in Coronado at the Hotel del Coronado. The application notes that Reverend E.S. Chase performed the ceremony and he was the pastor of the First Methodist Church of San Diego and helped organize the Coronado Beach Methodist Episcopal Church in 1887.

Some modifications have occurred to the dwelling over the years. A permit was issued in 1922 for alterations and an addition to the dwelling. In 1939, a breakfast nook and porch were added; in 1942, the building was altered; and in 1948, a concrete slab and shelter were erected. The home has a Queen Anne Victorian architectural style. The dwelling has a steep cross-gable roof with a prominent front facing gable with fish scale shingles and circular window. The dwelling has varying wall textures of clapboard siding, wood planking, plain and fish scale shingles.

The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave this residence a historical value rating of 2. A rating of 2 indicated the structure should be a candidate for inclusion on the Coronado Historical Register and was built before 1942; is in excellent physical condition; is almost entirely unmodified from its original exterior appearance; has substantial architectural significance; and would qualify as a contributing structure to a potential historic district.

The applicant, Donald Hubbard, 1022 Pak Place, made himself available to answer questions.

Commissioner Wilson said it was a treat to read the applicant's narrative about his home. She asked about the concrete slab and shelter erected in 1948 that was mentioned in his report.

Mr. Hubbard said he was referring to the pigmented red concrete slab and an unattached shed that was built on the property.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Carl Jennings, 1135 Loma Avenue, said he has been a longtime neighbor of the applicant and said he fully supported the request.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Wilson said she enjoyed reading about the home's history and thanked the applicant for the information.

Commissioner St. Denis said she loved reading Mr. Hubbard's written presentation as well.

Commissioner Crenshaw said it is a perfect demonstration of a home containing an eyebrow dormer.

Chairperson MacCartee said it is a wonderful home and thanked the applicant for preserving it.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER ST. DENIS MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 1022 PARK PLACE TO BE AN HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY AS THE DWELLING WAS BUILT FOR MR. B.L. MUIR WHO OPENED THE FIRST REAL ESTATE OFFICE IN 1887, AND HIS MARRIAGE TO LIZZIE BARBER WAS THE FIRST WEDDING CEREMONY TO BE CONDUCTED IN CORONADO AT THE HOTEL DEL CORONADO, AND FOR THE QUEEN ANNE ARCHITECTURAL STYLE;

- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY FOR MR. MUIR'S ROLE IN CORONADO'S EARLY HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE QUEEN ANNE ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION WITH ITS PROMINENT FRONT FACING GABLE WITH FISH SCALE SHINGLES AND CIRCULAR WINDOW AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED.
- E. IT DOES MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME).

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, O'Brien, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

Chairperson MacCartee announced that this is the 119th home to be designated historic.

Director McCaull said that Mr. Hubbard will be invited to attend a City Council meeting where he will be presented with an historic preservation plaque for his home.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

HR 2-08 **BRENT BOGH** – Preliminary Review and Comment regarding the Historic Designation of the village Inn addressed as 1017 Park Place and located in the Commercial zone of the Orange Avenue Corridor Specific Plan.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The Historic Resource Commission has established a policy to allow for preliminary review applications to be filed with

the City to allow property owners to submit potential projects to the Commission for early input and comment. The Commission typically provides initial feedback and direction to the applicant regarding the various aspects of the project proposal. These preliminary applications are handled in the same format as formal applications including a public hearing and notification to all property owners within 300' of the project.

Brent D. Bogh is the owner of the Village Inn located at 1017 Park Place. The property contains a three-story hotel with 15 hotel rooms, a manager's apartment, and roof-top access. A prospective buyer is interested in preserving the Inn and restoring and rehabilitating the building. He is also interested in pursuing a condominium hotel map to allow for fractional ownership of the units in a similar fashion as was done of the new cottage units at the Hotel Del Coronado. This type of ownership would be the subject of a future subdivision application before the Planning Commission and City Council.

City records indicate a permit was issued in 1926 for a hotel so the existing Inn is 82 years old. The estimated construction cost was \$50,000. The architect for the original Inn is not known. A permit was issued in 1931 to alter the lower floor of the building. The owner was identified as Earl Robson and the contractor was identified as E.A. Peterson. Permit records indicate the Biltmore Hotel owned the hotel in the 1960's and completed re-roof and furnace upgrades. The Bogh family has owned the Inn for the last 30+ years.

The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave this building a historical value rating of 2. A rating of 2 indicated the structure should be a candidate for inclusion on the Coronado Historical Register and was built before 1942; is in excellent physical condition; is almost entirely unmodified from its original exterior appearance; has substantial architectural significance; and would qualify as a contributing structure to a potential historic district.

The applicant, Brent Bogh, 1106 Los Indios Court, Chula Vista, introduced his attorney, Carrie T. Morton.

Carrie T. Morton, Rose, Munns & Chin, 1020 Isabella Avenue, Coronado, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the prospective buyer planned to replace the original wrought iron at the front windows and remove the brick.

Ms. Morton said yes.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the prospective buyer planned to leave the original front façade windows.

Mr. Bogh said yes.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the prospective buyer plans to change out the planters.

Mr. Bogh said the planters are actually windows and they will be removed so that the window sills are more visible.

Commissioner St. Denis said she noticed on the historic photos that there was iron at the front windows.

Mr. Bogh said there is iron at the balconies and an iron rail at the top windows.

Commissioner St. Denis noted that the iron rails at the front door appear to be original.

Mr. Bogh said that was correct.

Commissioner St. Denis said it would be her preference to remove the awnings so that they do not cover what she considers the most beautiful architectural feature of the hotel. She said the hotel has many original elements including an incredible central window and iron above the windows.

Mr. Bogh said there is material in the upper part of the building that appears to be iron but is really wood.

Commissioner St. Denis agreed that the central window is made of wood and the window on the right has iron and both are covered up by the awnings.

Mr. Bogh said the awnings were installed so that the building would not look so “boxy.” He said the potential buyers would like to obtain preliminary comment from the Commission so that they can decide whether to proceed with the purchase and preservation of the Inn.

Chairperson MacCartee thanked the applicant. She said that the Commission, based on the information presented today, feels that the building would most likely meet the criteria to be considered an historic resource. The applicant is proposing very minimal changes to the structure and it appears that Commissioner St. Denis would like to see the wrought iron re-installed or unearthed from the brick in front.

Commissioner Wilson asked about the Village Inn sign because it appears to need improvement.

Director McCaull said the sign is grandfathered under the Specific Plan; however, there is discussion that the potential buyers would like to improve the sign.

Commissioner Wilson said the architectural elements that Commissioner St. Denis mentioned are very crucial to the historic feeling of the building. Ms. Wilson feels that the central window opening is the treasure in the front. She suggested that more detailed information be provided about the proposed enlargement of the side windows. She also suggested keeping as much of the original material and design elements as possible.

Chairperson MacCartee said the Commission enthusiastically endorses the concept and would love to work with the applicant on this project.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

COMMISSION ACTION

PRELIMINARY REVIEW – NO ACTION WAS TAKEN ON THIS ITEM.

THE COMMISSION INDICATED THAT THEY GENERALLY SUPPORTED THE CONCEPT OF DESIGNATION OF THE VILLAGE INN.

HAP 7-08 **TIMOTHY ROHAN** –Request for Historic Alteration Permit for the construction of an accessory building located behind the historically designated residence addressed as 108 D Avenue and located in the R-1AE (Single Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from zoning standards.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On October 4, 2006, the Historic Resource Commission designated the residence at 108 D Avenue as an historic resource. The structure was noted as historically significant due to its early construction date of 1892 and for remaining largely intact. The original owners, the Quinlan's, were also noted as historically significant as being the early Pioneers of Coronado. Mary Quinlan was a driving force behind the construction of the first Coronado Library and Michael Quinlan was one of the City's first employees and known for building the City's sewer system and operating the water truck when the City had dirt roads.

At a preliminary hearing conducted in September 2006 and subsequent designation hearing in October 2006, it was noted that Mr. Rohan planned to construct an accessory building on the property between the main dwelling and the existing guest house located at the rear of the site. It was noted that the building may need relief from zoning standards including setbacks and building height. No formal action was taken on the planned alterations to the site; however, the Commission generally supported the concept of keeping the original historic building in tact and creating additional living space in a separate structure.

The site contains the historic dwelling totaling 565 square feet and a detached guest cottage totaling 240 square feet. A new detached accessory building is proposed in the middle of the lot between the two structures. The application indicates the new structure would contain a total of 684 square feet. The proposed structure would not be a separate dwelling unit and a covenant would be required to be recorded to that effect. It would not be allowed to contain a separate kitchen with a stove.

When the project is completed the site would have a lot coverage of 38% and a floor area ratio of 45% which complies with code requirements. The proposed accessory building would not comply with the building height and number of stories allowed for accessory buildings. The proposed building is 26'4" in height and contains two stories. The building height and number of stories proposed does not comply with zoning regulations for accessory structures and would require the Commission's approval for exceptions to zoning standards. Lastly, the rear shed dormer does not appear to be consistent with sections 86.08.080 c and d which limits the width of a dormer to 8' and no more than 25% of the length of the roof abutting the dormer.

The applicant, Timothy Rohan, 108 D Avenue, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions.

Chairperson MacCartee asked how much of the proposed addition will be viewable from the front.

Mr. Rohan responded that no part of the addition will be viewable from the front.

Commissioner St. Denis said she understood that the shed dormer located in the rear elevation will be greater than eight feet. She asked about the width of the proposed shed dormer in the front.

Mr. Rohan said both dormers are the same size.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the dormers are within the second story rear yard setback.

Mr. Rohan responded yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair O'Brien said that given the constraints of the site and a single wall construction house, the proposed solution is probably the better one. He cautioned that even though it is not viewable from the street, there should be a consistent line with the vinyl windows. Mr. O'Brien commented that the roof color of the new building is proposed to be Harbor Blue and the front building has a tan roof color and asked if the applicant planned to match the two roofs.

Mr. Rohan said that the roof colors on both of the buildings will match.

Commissioner St. Denis said that although she is opposed to using vinyl windows, she understands their use. She feels that the proposed request is a good solution and prefers it to adding on to the front house. Ms. St. Denis asked if there is a kitchen in the guest house.

Mr. Rohan said there was a kitchen in the guest house at one time but it was removed.

Commissioner Wilson said it is an elegant solution and she likes the idea that the roof line is not viewable from the front; however, she said she would prefer that both of the building's roofs have the same color and type of shingles.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if the applicant was agreeable to match the roof colors and materials.

Mr. Rohan said yes.

Commissioner Crenshaw said the home is glorious and it is a wonderful solution.

Chairperson MacCartee agreed.

Director McCaull asked the Commission if they agreed that the proposed project material is adequate because of the location of the building on the lot.

The Commission agreed.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 7-08, REQUEST FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF AN ACCESSORY BUILDING BEHIND THE HISTORIC RESOURCE INCLUDING EXCEPTIONS TO THE ZONING STANDARDS FOR 108 D AVENUE, AS SUBMITTED, SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

1. ROOFING MATERIALS AND COLORS FOR THE NEW BUILDING SHALL MATCH THE HISTORIC DWELLING;
2. A COVENANT WILL BE RECORDED INDICATING THE ACCESSORY BUILDING WILL NOT BE RENTED OUT OR CONTAIN KITCHEN FACILITIES.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.

E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, St. Denis, and Wilson
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

The Commission recessed at 4:20 p.m.

The Commission reconvened at 4:22 p.m. All members were present.

NOI 2-08 **DR. RICARDO JOHNSON OKHUYSEN** – Preliminary review and discussion regarding proposed alternatives to demolition of the single family residence addressed as 822 First Street located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Commissioners Crenshaw and O'Brien recused themselves from the meeting.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On March 14, 2008, the City received the attached correspondence from Dr. Johnson requesting that his property located at 822 First Street, commonly known as the Jessop residence, be removed from the Coronado Property Review (CPR) List. This correspondence was included in the Coronado Property Review List staff report considered by the City Council at their April 1, 2008 meeting.

While the owner objects to the property being placed on the list, it is generally acknowledged that the residence at 822 First Street is both architecturally and historically significant to the community. Dr. Johnson would prefer to preserve the residence while allowing for some improvements to the structure or property that provide options for his family and the site.

The purpose of today's meeting is for the Commission to begin preliminary discussions with the property owner regarding the building. The owner is interested in discussing possible options for the structure and site including alterations, improvements to the building, alternative uses, and relocation rather than demolition.

The applicant, Dr. Ricardo Johnson Okhuysen, gave a brief overview of his request and answered questions. Mr. Johnson said he and his family have moved to La Jolla and the home has been vacant since January 2008. He feels that he is left with the following options: 1) demolish the

home and subdivide the property; 2) relocate the home to the alley side and make major interior remodeling to minimize noise; or 3) relocate the home to another location within Coronado.

Commissioner Wilson stated that the applicant should have been advised of the noise issue by his realtor before he purchased the home.

Mr. Johnson stated he was not advised.

Commissioner Wilson said that relocation of the home to the alley side would not minimize the noise level as she feels it is noisier on the alley side. She also commented that windows can be triple-paned to reduce the noise level. She asked if the applicant was using the home as a business office.

Mr. Johnson said he has been using it as his personal office.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Daffney Brown, 326 First Street, said she does not support the request to demolish the home. She mentioned that since the Navy installed its new main gate, the noise on her street has not been an issue. She also mentioned that the windows on her home are not soundproofed.

Langdon Smith, 800 First Street, said he loves living in his home and does not mind the noise which has been lessened by the opening of the gate on Third Street. He has not soundproofed the windows on his home.

Richard Sanders, 816 First Street, has lived next door to the applicant on the alley side for about 40 years. He remodeled and added sound barriers to his home which significantly minimized the noise level. He agreed that there has been less traffic since the gate on Third Avenue was opened.

Genevieve Rohan, 108 D Avenue, said the home is stunning and suggested that the applicant may want to re-zone the property for business purposes, such as a bed-and-breakfast or a law firm.

Commissioner Wilson said that the home cannot be torn down because it certainly meets the 75-year criteria so the applicant would not be able to obtain a demolition permit at this time.

Director McCaull stated that if this property were designated as an historic resource, the owner could apply for a special use permit that could be considered by the Planning Commission and City Council to allow alternative land uses like an office building. The process would not require re-zoning.

Dorothy Stanley, 1229 Alameda Boulevard, said she has the same traffic issues on her street, with the added problem of speeding automobiles.

Tim Rohan, 108 D Avenue, said he understands the traffic issues and feels that the suggestions made today are good. He also mentioned that the noise at his home are minimized when the sprinklers are on.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Wilson agreed that sprinklers or water features do mitigate noise.

Commissioner St. Denis asked if front windows contain the original panes.

Mr. Johnson said that all of the windows at the second level were replaced with double pane; however, the downstairs windows are original.

Commissioner St. Denis suggested replacing the original windows with a like kind and having them double or triple paned. She also suggested that if the home is designated, the Commission would be able to work with him to make the home more livable.

Mr. Johnson said he has not sold the house because his children have taken an interest in inheriting the home. He also said he does not want to demolish the home. On the contrary, he loves the home and wants to preserve it.

Chairperson MacCartee clarified, with regard to the options presented, that the Commission would never approve a demolition of the home. Ms. MacCartee added that she feels the option of relocating the home would not be acceptable because part of the reason the home is considered a jewel is because of its location. The other Commissioner may be open to this option. Ms. MacCartee said that an alternative use would definitely be a unique idea that would assist with the mortgage payments. Ms. MacCartee said there are many options to consider if the applicant desires to work with the Commission.

Commissioner St. Denis agreed and asked if the applicant has tried to rent it to a family that does not have issues with noise.

Mr. Johnson said he has rented the home during the summers and his tenants have followed up with letters which communicate their displeasure with the traffic noise. He asked if there is a fast-track process to apply for and qualify for the Mills Act Program.

Director McCaull said the City adopted the Mills Act Program and established a fiscal cap on the program. Although there is a long waiting list, part of the Resolution identified the ability to have an exception to the cap for extraordinarily important and significant buildings to the community that may be in danger or threat of demolition. She suggested that the applicant may want to pursue this process with the City Council after obtaining designation of his home.

COMMISSION ACTION

PRELIMINARY REVIEW – NO ACTION WAS TAKEN ON THIS ITEM.

THE COMMISSION INDICATED THEIR CONCERN WITH ANY PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF THE RESIDENCE AND ENCOURAGED THE APPLICANT TO EXPLORE ALTERNATIVES FOR THE BUILDING RATHER THAN DEMOLITION. THE COMMISSION SUGGESTED THAT THE APPLICANT EXPLORE INTERIOR BUILDING MODIFICATIONS AND WATER FEATURES THAT COULD ADDRESS THE NOISE ISSUES THE APPLICANT IDENTIFIED AT THE HEARING AND THE PURSUIT OF HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF THE SITE WHICH MIGHT PROVIDE ADDITIONAL OPPORTUNITIES AND ALTERNATIVES FOR THE SITE.

MISCELLANEOUS

Discussion regarding City Council Action on the Draft Coronado Property Review List

Director McCaull provided an update on City Council action at the meeting of April 1, 2008. The City Council voted 3-2 to (1) leave the current demolition review process as is; (2) request staff to amend the Ordinance to include commercial properties that would be subject to the review process; (3) take a look at how the Commission would address the properties that are not 75 years of age and yet were included on the draft CPR list; and (4) explore the idea of some type of tolling agreement that the City could enter into with the City.

Commission members asked for clarification on the tolling agreement.

Director McCaull explained that some of the property owners want to have an agreement with the City wherein they will preserve the building for a certain period of time but would have the option of not doing so after that period of time has elapsed. There would not be an absolute guarantee that the home would indefinitely be historic.

Commissioner Wilson said she understood that tolling was something that didn't apply to an individual property but is a SANDAG favorite. The list would be reviewed every five years.

Chairperson MacCartee suggested staff provide clarification on the tolling agreement when more information is available.

Discussion regarding Public Outreach Program

Director McCaull reported that in the past they have usually set up a booth at the Flower Show to bring out public awareness of the Preservation Program. She suggested the Commission may want to take part in the event next year.

Director McCaull also reported that the Coronado Currents is published on a quarterly basis. Usually the Commission submits a newsletter two or three times a year. The next due date for submission is April 21. The Commission agreed there would not be a newsletter submission at this time.

Discussion regarding Administrative Appeal Hearing scheduled for April 15, 2008, regarding 1043 Ocean Boulevard

This item was discussed under the Director's Report.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

Tony A Peña
Director of Community Development