

CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

September 18, 2002

A regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:18 p.m., Wednesday, September 18, 2002, in the Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Casey Tanaka, Chairman of the Historic Resource Commission.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Tanaka, Draper, and Ryan

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioners Steiner and Keith

STAFF PRESENT: John Swanson, Assistant Planner
Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Linda Hascup, Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes for the Regular Meeting of July 17, 2002 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTORS REPORT

There was no separate Director's report.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Commissioner Ryan asked if there was any information regarding the protection of the Donal Hord murals at the High School. He noticed that there were plywood boards nailed over them, but wondered if that would be sufficient. Chairman Tanaka said that he had been keeping track of this. The plywood panels have Styrofoam underneath to protect against vibration, etc. He believes that the school district is taking care of the panels.

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

Chairman Tanaka indicated that he would like to postpone HR 4-02, which is listed first on the agenda due to the absence of a quorum. There were only three Commissioners present, a fourth is expected to arrive shortly, and Commissioner Ryan would have to recuse himself on the application for 1116 Loma Avenue, as he is a previous owner of that residence. The Commissioners agreed to hear HR 5-02 first.

HR 5-02 **MOORE, JOSEPH L. AND KAREN G.** - Request for Historic Designation of the single-family residence located at 520 B Avenue in the R-1A (E) Single Family Residential Zone

Mr. Swanson introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said that the home was issued a building permit on August 15, 1927 with a construction cost of \$4,000. Mr. Cosgrove was the architect who designed the home. The owner was Chris A. Cosgrove, who was also the architect, and who also built a house at 420 Ninth Street. His company, Cosgrove, Hathaway, Vestal, Dorman and Lain were building contractors in Coronado from the 1920's to the 1940's. The dwelling is an example of a mixture of Spanish Colonial Revival and Spanish Eclectic that was popular between 1915 and 1930. The applicant noted that the floor plan and elevations are remarkably similar to those published in an article by Richard Requa, one of the most notable architects in San Diego's history. The subsequent owners of the home were an investment broker and banker, Naval Officers, and a teacher.

Applicant, Karen Moore, 520 B Avenue provided photographs to show some of the features of the home. She advised that they have also submitted an application for historic alteration to be considered at a future hearing. She said that historic preservation is very important to her. Ms. Moore's last home was also a historically designated property. She made a thorough presentation regarding the home and its contribution to the City if it is preserved.

Chairman Tanaka asked if Mrs. Moore would like to speak a little about the remodel proposal. He said that he wanted to make sure that Mrs. Moore understood that if the home were designated historic, there was a possibility that the remodel could be denied. Ms. Moore said that she understood, but that she felt that this second story addition would be very sensitive to the historic nature of the home and would most likely be approved. There are also portions of the home's restoration included in the remodel application. She said that the second story addition is 80 feet back from the property line and wouldn't normally be seen from street level by a pedestrian. It is in keeping with the historic quality of the house and enhances its character. It will also be an improvement as far as the neighbors are concerned because of the removal of the existing shed and garage that are termite infested. She introduced her architect, Kevin Rugee, to explain the elements of the addition.

Kevin Rugee said that he and the Moores have been working on this project for the last two years. He said that from the first time he walked in the home he believed this property is a real gem. There are inlaid wood floors, very interesting arches, fireplace tiles, etc. From an architectural design standpoint, the goal was to maintain the original character of this house because it is so special. His goal is to create something that looks like it was part of the original portion of the home. The thought originally was to expand to the rear, but that would have

destroyed the back yard, so they decided that answer would be to add an upper story. The lot is 50x140, 7,000 sq.ft., the existing house is 2,300 including a separate guesthouse and a 376 sq.ft. garage. After tearing down the existing guesthouse and garage, about 600 sq.ft. in floor area will be added and rebuild the garage. There will be about 400 sq.ft. above the garage and an additional 200 sq.ft. onto the back of the house. The floor area proposed will be around 43%, well below the 54% allowable. The lot coverage will also be at 43%, with an allowable of 50%.

Mr. Rugee explained that the upper area of the elevation would never be seen from the pedestrian level because of the angle of view from the sidewalk. The addition height will only be 20'2" above the average grade. In the average home you can go up to 25' to 27'6". He said that some features they have tried to replicate with the addition are the stucco finish, window treatments, buttress wall, rounded entry with domed tower, roof tiles, and the rafter tail details. The upstairs is really a guest quarters with a deck off the back. There are a lot of details in the existing home that have been altered over the years, such as vinyl windows, that just don't match. They plan to return the house to its original state and do the addition to look like it has always been there.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper commended the Moore's for the care they have taken with this home to preserve it and provide modifications that are so in keeping with the home that they will appear to have always been a part of the property.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 5-02 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 520 B AVENUE FOR THE FOLLOWING REASONS: 1) THE PROPERTY MEETS THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT; 2) IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE SPANISH ECLECTIC ARCHITECTURAL STYLE AND HAS BEEN WELL PRESERVED; AND, 3) IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS AND EVENTS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY.

COMMISSIONER RYAN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Tanaka, Draper, and Ryan

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioners Keith and Steiner

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0, with 2 Commissioners absent.

HR 4-02 **ADAMS, DR. THOMAS J. AND LESLIE ADAMS TRUST**- Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence located at 1116 Loma Avenue in the R-1A Single Family Residential Zone

Commissioner Ryan recused himself because his family owned the house for 14 years and were involved in dedicating it to SOHO and Coronado Historical and have been passionately been involved with the process. There is no quorum at this time.

Chairman made the motion that the item be continued to the next meeting due to lack of a quorum. The item was continued by consensus.

Commissioner Ryan rejoined the Commission.

HRPA 1-02 **WILLIAM A. SPEER & MARSJ A. STEIRER** - Request for Historic Preservation Agreement for the single family residence located at 600 Glorietta Boulevard in the R-1A (CC-1) Single Family Residential Zone

Chairman Tanaka explained that this application was continued at the request of the applicant and would be continue to the next meeting.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Commission Discussion Regarding Application for Historic Designation of Public Structures, Properties and Miscellaneous Improvements

Chairman Draper said that she has done another seven hours of research in the library since submitting her last report. She believes that she has found the definitive answer to the rest of the story regarding the park system in Coronado. The information is regarding a trade made by Mr. Speckles' company. Spreckles' Company received the shoreline area where the Shores high-rise condominiums are now located. In return the City received the area around Glorietta Bay and several little parks. Sunset Park (Parcel 2) was one of them. It was deeded to the City of Coronado in October 30th of 1941, is less than 75 years old. She found information on the rest of the parks, but needs to write it out in a final form. She asked if this item could be discussed further at the next meeting to prepare the report. She said that it is very clear from the materials she has read, that from the very beginning, 1886, the history is long-standing, the precedent is there for dedicated parks and recreation areas. It has always been the City's idea and the Spreckles Company as well. She thinks the Commission will be able to make a great case to the City Council, but she would prefer to give them a complete, totally researched package.

Chairman Tanaka thanked Ms. Draper for doing all of the invaluable work she has done. He said that it makes good sense to continue the item; the information could be some of the most important discovered to date. Mr. Ryan said it would be embarrassing if they had gone forward earlier. It is clear that Sunset Park was not there until World War II because aerial photos at North Island show there was only water there.

MISCELLANEOUS

Commissioners discussed the upcoming schedule of meetings. Mr. Swanson said that Judge Moore would be available for the hearing on the HRP application for his property if the Commission met on October 30th or November 13th. Chairman Tanaka said that he would prefer to hold the October 2 meeting and not postpone it to later in the month because he didn't want to keep the Adams's waiting again. He felt very badly that they were kept waiting only to have no quorum for their application. He said that they could discuss the calendar again at that time.

FUTURE ITEMS

- Review of Applications Regarding the Designation of Public Historic Resources
- Outreach Program

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:59 p.m.

Tony A. Peña
Director Of Community Development