

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

September 19, 2007

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m., Wednesday, September 19, 2007, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioner O'Brien

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner  
Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of September 5, 2007 were approved as amended.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director McCaull reported that the City had issued a stop work notice to the property owners of 1017 Encino Row because the property is older than 75 years old. Approximately two months ago, the City issued a permit for exploratory demolition and a site visit yesterday indicate a lot more had been done than that. The property owners will be coming in to apply for a Notice of Intent to Demolish permit application.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

**HRPA 8-07 RON AND BARBARA SOSNOWSKI** – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated residence addressed as 1013 Adella Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On August 18, 2004, the Historic Resource Commission designated 1013 Adella Avenue as a Coronado Historic Resource. The property was designated as an historic resource for representing the English Revival architectural style and for being representative of the notable work of builder Oscar W. Dorman.

One of the benefits of having the property designated as a Historic Resource is that the property owner is then eligible to apply to the City of Coronado for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement. The Mills Act Agreement is not an automatic entitlement rather it is a benefit the City is providing to historic properties with each agreement evaluated on its own

merits. On August 16, 2007, Ron and Barbara Sosnowski filed an application to enter into an Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement.

An Historic Resource Preservation Agreement is a contract between the property owner and the City, wherein the property owner agrees to preserve, and when necessary, restore and rehabilitate a designated historic resource throughout the term of the ten (10) year agreement. In exchange, the property owner receives a reduction in property taxes. If restoration or rehabilitation work is planned or needed for the property, it is identified on a "list of improvements" attached to the Historic Resource Agreement.

During the ten-year period of the agreement, the property owners propose to undertake the following improvements:

1. Window Restoration
2. Roof replacement
3. Paint façade and trim
4. Front yard landscape improvements.

Tom Galloway of the County Tax Assessor's office has not completed an estimate of the restricted value of 1013 Adella Avenue with the Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement in place.

The applicant, Ron Sosnowski, 1013 Adella Avenue, was present in the audience.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR WILSON MADE A MOTION TO FORWARD THE HISTORIC RESOURCE PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION TO THE CITY COUNCIL WITH THE APPROVED LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS FOR 1013 ADELLA AVENUE (HRPA 8-07) AS FOLLOWS:

1. WINDOW RESTORATION
2. ROOF REPLACEMENT
3. PAINT FAÇADE AND TRIM
4. FRONT YARD LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.

ABSENT: Commissioner O'Brien.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

**HRPA 9-07 JIM AND GAYLE WELTY** – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated residence addressed as 1112 Churchill Place and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On August 15, 2007, the Historic Resource Commission designated 1112 Churchill Place as a Coronado Historic Resource. This property was the 107th property to be designated historic. The dwelling was designated as a historic resource for its uniqueness and for representing the Queen Anne architectural style.

One of the benefits of having the property designated as an Historic Resource is that the property owner is then eligible to apply to the City of Coronado for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement. The Mills Act Agreement is not an automatic entitlement rather it is a benefit the City is providing to historic properties with each agreement evaluated on its own merits. On August 21, 2007, Jim and Gayle Welty filed an application to enter into an Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement.

An Historic Resource Preservation Agreement is a contract between the property owner and the City, wherein the property owner agrees to preserve, and when necessary, restore and rehabilitate a designated historic resource throughout the term of the ten (10) year agreement. In exchange, the property owner receives a reduction in property taxes. If restoration or rehabilitation work is planned or needed for the property, it is identified on a "list of improvements" attached to the Historic Resource Agreement.

During the ten-year period of the agreement, the property owners are not planning to undertake any major improvements. The owners are planning to rebuild a side porch due to termite damage.

Tom Galloway of the County Tax Assessor's office has not yet completed an estimate of the restricted value of 1112 Churchill Place with the Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement in place.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant, Gayle Welty, 1112 Churchill Place, provided additional information on the home, and made herself available to answer questions. Ms. Welty said she had some information from the Coronado Historical Association that the home was built in 1885. She also learned from records at the Water Rights Bureau that the property probably was purchased in 1885, and that the water and improvements to the lot occurred in 1886.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER HERRON MADE A MOTION TO FORWARD THE HISTORIC RESOURCE PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION TO THE CITY COUNCIL WITH THE APPROVED LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS FOR 1112 CHURCHILL PLACE (HRPA 9-07) AS FOLLOWS: NO MAJOR IMPROVEMENTS. THE OWNERS ARE PLANNING TO REBUILD A SIDE PORCH DUE TO TERMITE DAMAGE.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioner O'Brien.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

**HR 10-07**     **JEFFREY AND CANDACE TAYLOR** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 1427 Fifth Street and located in the R-1AE (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The home has been in the Taylor family for the past fourteen years. The site contains a single story residence with a detached garage and a courtyard in between. The residence totals approximately 1,280 square feet. The owners have applied for historic designation to preserve the structure for the future.

City records indicate this dwelling was constructed in 1936 so the residence is 71 years old. In order for a structure to be designated historic, the structure must be at least 75 years old or have achieved historic significance within the past 75 years and meet two additional criteria. Since the home is not 75 years of age, the Commission should determine first, if the structure has achieved historic significance within the past 75 years.

The application notes the residence is historically significant for its Spanish Revival architectural style and associated courtyard that was a popular design feature in Coronado in the early 20<sup>th</sup> Century due to Coronado's mild climate. The application further notes that the small home contributes to the architectural history of Coronado in that its architectural character and scale represent what Coronado once was and what is fast disappearing. Lastly, the application notes the residence represents Coronado's military history for the original owner was Lt. T.D Tyra, who also designed the home, and his involvement with the U.S. Navy.

City records do not indicate any exterior modifications have occurred to the residence since its original construction.

The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave this residence a historical value rating of 2. A rating of 2 indicated the structure was built before 1942; was in excellent physical condition; was almost entirely unmodified from original exterior appearance; had substantial

architectural significance; and would qualify as a contributing structure to a potential historic district.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant, Jeffrey Tyler, 1427 Fifth Street, gave a brief overview of the request, displayed photographs, and made himself available to answer questions.

Doug St. Denis, 1504 Parkview Place, said she was working with the applicants to add a separate guestroom to the home. Ms. St. Denis said the house is a treasure.

Chairperson MacCartee asked if the guest cottage would be completely separate.

Ms. St. Denis said they originally wanted to add the guestroom to the house but then decided to possibly place it in a small corner of the courtyard and not touch the original structure.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair Wilson said it is a great house and does not feel that it being 71 years of age will affect its designation.

Commissioner Herron said she was fascinated by the naval background and that someone so young would build a home. Ms. Herron said it is a beautiful house.

Commissioner Crenshaw said it is a gorgeous home.

Chairperson MacCartee said designating the home as an historic resource is a gift to the community.

### COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 1000 GLORIETTA BOULEVARD TO BE AN HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS: ALTHOUGH IT IS NOT OVER 75 YEARS OF AGE, IT HAS REACHED HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE WITHIN THE LAST 75 YEARS AS IT REPRESENTS AN ARCHITECTURAL CHARACTER AND SCALE THAT IS FAST DISAPPEARING WITHIN THE COMMUNITY AND BECAUSE IT DOES MEET THE FOLLOWING CRITERIA:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, AESTHETIC AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY IN THAT LT. T.D. TYRA WHO DESIGNED THE RESIDENCE WAS A NAVAL ACADEMY GRADUATE AND ONE OF THE EARLY SEA PLANE TEST PILOTS IN CORONADO AND NAVAL AVIATION IS WHAT PUT CORONADO ON THE MAP

IN ITS EARLY HISTORY; AND  
C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLE IN THE CITY POSSESSING  
DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SPANISH REVIVAL  
ARCHITECTURAL STYLE; PARTICULARLY WITH THE COURTYARD, AND IS  
VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF  
CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;

VICE CHAIR WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioner O'Brien.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

#### DISCUSSION ITEM

**HR 14-04** **CITY OF CORONADO** – Discussion regarding Coronado Property Review (CPR) List to replace the existing Ordinance that uses a 75-year criteria as a trigger mechanism for the Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit process. This List includes single family, multiple family, and non-residential properties.

The Commission proceeded to review the list of potential properties and made a determination as to which properties should be kept, reviewed further, or eliminated from the list.

#### Public Comment

Bruce Coons, Executive Director, SOHO, 51 Aruba Bend, suggested that the Commission visit properties located at 1021-1025 Park Place, 320, 1010, 1300, 1411, 1433 Seventh Avenue, 303, 901-915, 1211, 1414, 1424, 1601, 1611 Sixth Street, and 718 Tenth Street.

#### Commission Discussion

Commission discussion ensued.

#### Commission Action

The Commission agreed to visit the properties located at 1021-1025 Park Place, 320, 1010, 1300, 1411, 1433 Seventh Avenue, 303, 901-915, 1211, 1414, 1424, 1601, 1611 Sixth Street, and 718 Tenth Street, to determine if these properties should be added to the list.

#### DISCUSSION ITEM

**Commission discussion regarding window removals and replacements as it relates to the Demolition Permit Review Process.**

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. A “notice of intent to

demolish” (NOI) permit application shall be filed with the Community Development Department for the proposed demolition of any residential structure that is 75 years or older.

“Demolition” means any act that destroys, in whole or in part, the exterior of an historic resource. “Total demolition” means the pulling down, razing or destruction of the entire portion of a building or structure which is above ground. “Partial demolition” means the pulling down, destruction or removal of a substantial portion of the exterior of a building or structure or the removal of architectural elements which define or contribute to the historic character of the structure.

Ms. McCaull reported that there have been recent inquiries to the Community Development Department regarding the removal and replacement of windows on the facades of residential structures 75 years of age or older and whether it triggers a NOI permit. If the building is remaining intact, staff has indicated that a permit is not required. This determination is made based on the fact that the intent of the ordinance was to address preservation of “buildings.” Since windows that are replaced with perhaps not historically accurate windows could at a future date be re-installed with historically accurate windows, staff has allowed the modifications without Commission involvement.

Director McCaull said she is able to provide more of an administrative report, if the Commission desires, to identify when an applicant is proposing these types of alterations.

Bruce Coons, Executive Director, SOHO, 51 Aruba Bend, said that many jurisdictions consider windows a character defining feature, including the National Register and the Secretary of Interior Standards and Rehabilitation, although some jurisdictions exempt non publicly viewable walls. Mr. Coons said the Commission should review whether it would be considered a major alteration.

Vice Chair Wilson said she feels it is very difficult to tell someone that every window must be replaced. She feels that the size of the window must be taken into consideration.

Mary Borvich, 1006, 1008, 1012 Ninth and 909 D Avenue, said she had to change the windows on two of her buildings that were built in 1912 because water was coming through the windows. She has not changed any windows on the public right-of-way. She is interested in finding out what action the Commission will take today. She agrees that it is very difficult to tell someone that the windows must be exact because a lifestyle in 1912 is so different from one in 2007.

Chairperson MacCartee said she tends to agree that what is important is the façade of the structures.

Vice Chair Wilson said that the size of the window is important because ultimately the window can be changed back.

Mr. Coons said there are many issues with regard to replacing windows with something other than what was there. By replacing windows, it changes the profile and the way the façade looks. If a person presents a structure with changed windows, the Commission may not be likely to designate which is significant.

Commissioner Herron says that wood windows are very important. A perfect example is the Monterey Apartments. It was heartbreaking.

Chairperson MacCartee suggested having persons go before the Commission only if façade windows are requesting to be replaced.

Vice Chair Wilson agreed.

Director McCaull suggested that if a person wanted to change out the windows on the front façade from a wood window to an aluminum clad, she would advise the person that the change represents modification to a key architectural element and they would need to go before the Commission unless the window is changed out in kind. If changes are requested to side or rear windows that are not visible to the public rights-of-way, the person would be advised that they do not need to go before the Commission but that the City encourages retention of historic windows because if they were to apply for historic designation in the future, that may come up as an issue.

Commissioner Crenshaw inquired about requests to change out windows to larger size windows.

Director McCaull said the same rule would probably apply.

Chairperson MacCartee agreed and said it was a good compromise.

Vice Chair Wilson agreed.

Director McCaull said she would add this permit process to the Commission's policies.

#### Commission Action

With regard to the Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit process and trigger mechanism for review regarding removal of key architectural defining elements, the Commission made a decision to consider modifications to windows that are visible from the public right-of-way to be a "partial" demolition triggering review by the Commission. If the windows to be modified will be the same size and material, no Historic Resource Commission review is required.

#### ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:02 p.m.

---

Tony A Peña  
Director of Community Development