

CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

October 6, 2004

A regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:03 p.m., Wednesday, October 6, 2004, at the Coronado Police Department Emergency Operations Center, 700 Orange Avenue, Coronado, California by Chairperson Keith.

ROLL CALL

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

MEMBERS ABSENT:

STAFF: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Linda Hascup, Administrative Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Minutes of the Regular Meeting of September 15, 2004 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull said the Historic Resource Commission has been working really hard on getting out the word on the city's historic preservation program with their public outreach projects as evidenced by recent accomplishments such as: a listing and photographs (in a slideshow format) of all the designated homes will soon be added to the City's website; the first Historic Resource Commission newsletter will be distributed next month as an insert in the Coronado Historical Association's newsletter; and, a new slide show created by Gerry MacCartee and Nancy Cobb titled, "Coronado: Castles and Cottages" will be presented On Thursday, Dec 2 at 7 PM in the Coronado Library Winn Room.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

None.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Chairman Keith advised that she received a phone call from Bruce Coons of SOHO who alerted her that the Hotel Del has gotten a couple of estimates from window companies to replace some of the original wooden windows with vinyl. She said there doesn't appear to be any discretionary permit process to make this change even though the Hotel Del is a National Historic Resource; it is not designated as a City of Coronado Historic Resource. She hoped an alternate solution could be discovered.

PUBLIC HEARINGS: APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

HR 21-04 **Mulzet, Susan and Mark** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 1127 F Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Susan Keith stepped down since the residence is within 300 feet of her home.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said the home is in excellent condition and is one of the larger "estates" in the community. A building permit was issued in 1924 for a dwelling and a garage. The information discovered by the applicant is that the architect was Richard Requa and it is typical of his "Southern California Style". The architectural style would be considered Spanish with Moorish influences. Some minor exterior changes were made over the years, including a partial remodel of the both floors and the basement in 1988, the addition of a second story utility room in 1995, and the flat garage roof was replaced with a hipped roof using mission tiles in 1987. The Sourcepoint inventory rated this structure as a "2H", indicating it as having significant local historical and architectural importance, being in excellent physical condition, and almost entirely unmodified from its original exterior appearance.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Herron said there probably wasn't much to discuss because there is no argument about the significance of this property. Commissioner MacCartee said the owner coming forward to designate this property is a gift to the City.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 21-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1127 F AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING THE SPANISH WITH MOORISH INFLUENCES STYLE OF ARCHITECTURE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; AND
- D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF A NOTABLY ARCHITECT, RICHARD REQUA.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioner Keith

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 4-0 with one commissioner absent.

Ms. McCaull said this is the 41st historically designated property in Coronado.

Chairman Keith rejoined the Commission.

HR 23-04 **Kirschner, Anna** - Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 1015 Adella Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. A building permit was issued in 1927 for the construction of a dwelling. The owner and contractor of record was Chris A. Cosgrove. The architectural style would be considered "Spanish Eclectic". In 1939 the owner, Capt. Lewis Goye hired Chris Cosgrove to enlarge two rooms, and a maid's room was added previously in 1935. In 1988 a balcony was added above the front entry along with two "eyebrows" over the front windows. The structure was rated a "4", at the lower end of the Sourcepoint inventory scale, due to its only fair physical condition and exterior modifications. However it was noted it could be a contributory structure in a potential historic district and represents a unique or scarce style. In addition, it has been restored and is now in excellent physical condition.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner MacCartee said that even though the balcony that was added in the front in the 1980's affected the façade, and the architect was not notable, she supports designation of the house in the sense that it certainly represents Coronado and its architecture and meets the age requirement. She said she would lean towards allowing a home to be made livable if it is in keeping with the town; the Commission has approved modified homes before. Ms. MacCartee said that realistically there isn't enough pure architecture remaining and to be able to save the character of Coronado there are other criteria to consider. She suggested that the standards to approve the request to designate a house should not be applied as rigidly as for the approval of a Mills Act contract. For a Mills Act contract the rules should be more stringently followed.

Commissioner Draper said she appreciates Ms. MacCartee's comments. She said she would also view designation favorably. She said it is a plus that two neighboring homes are designated. Although this is not a historic district, adding this home would result in having three homes in a row that are designated, which benefits the character of the neighborhood.

Commissioner Herron said she would also agree with Commissioner MacCartee. A balcony isn't going to make or break the case for designation. She said keeping the integrity of the neighborhood in tact is an important factor and the home has enough points in its favor. It really is the history of that area.

Chairman Keith commented that the balcony doesn't bother her as much because there is no noted architect, which made a difference to her. The eyebrows may have been added for protection from the sun since the house faces west. She said she also supports the comments that more leniency be given in the designation of historic structures and stricter when considering Mills Act contracts. She said the thought has been brought up before and it might be a good topic for discussion on a future agenda.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER HERRON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 23-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1015 ADELLA AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S AESTHETIC AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING THE SPANISH ECLECTIC ARCHITECTURAL STYLE; AND
- D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, CHRIS COSGROVE, WHO BUILT OVER 40 HOMES WITHIN THE CCOMMUNITY DURING THE 1920'S AND 1930'S.

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

Ms. McCaull said this is the 42nd historically designated property in Coronado.

HR 24-04 **Jordan, Martha Bentley** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 1125 G Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. A building permit was issued in 1928 for the construction of a dwelling and garage, and it was connected to the City's sewer system in 1928. The contractor of record was A.M. Southard, who was also the contractor for 1015 Loma Avenue. The dwelling's architectural style is Spanish Revival. In 1942 a balcony was enclosed and there were some repairs in 1943. The property was rated highly on the Sourcepoint inventory scale as a "2", indicating its significant local historical importance, excellent physical condition and almost entirely unmodified original exterior appearance, and substantial architectural significance. The home was awarded a plaque by the Coronado Historical Association for its historic significance.

Applicant, Martha Brantley Jordan, said she has the wrought iron bars that were taken from the second story and moved to the ground floor because of a burglary attempt. She said she could probably move them back if necessary. They are in near-original condition. She said she realized this home isn't in the same league with the grandest houses in Coronado and it isn't the cutest cottage, but it does reflect the fabric of Coronado. She said some of her other neighbors are interested in historic district designation.

Commissioner Draper said she couldn't imagine that the builder was so clever in 1928 to build a two car garage. Ms. Bentley said it was original; the doors are very heavy

and difficult to move. She said she is a die-hard 'restorationist' and plans to do some restoration of original kitchen, the garage doors, and the roof. The roof tiles, which are very heavy hand-made Tecate tiles with thumb prints on them, are quite hard to find. She plans to keep everything as original.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Kathleen Suros, 1105 G Avenue, said she lives on the same block in the cottage complex. She said she is delighted all three owners in the complex are applying for designation. She commented that the back yard of this home is organized in a very Spanish revival style with two section patios with an original fountain in the middle. She feels the home is very significant and is very accurate for the architectural style.

Nancye Splinter, 1027 G Avenue, said she lives a block away from Ms. Jordan's house and feels it is a treasure and in pristine condition. She said she supports the designation; if it was not designated it could very well be in danger in future years. If it doesn't have designation it could be in danger in later years.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Herron thanked the applicant for bringing this home forward. She said this is one of the blocks that needs to be saved. Commissioner MacCartee seconded the sentiment and added that the landscaping is important as well.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 24-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1125 G AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY; AND,
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING THE SPANISH REVIVAL ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, PARTICULARLY COMBINED WITH ITS SURROUNDING LANDSCAPING WHICH IS IN KEEPING WITH CORONADO, AND THE STRUCTURE IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron
NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

Ms. McCaull said this is the 43rd historically designated property in Coronado.

HR 25-04 **Peltier, James and Margie** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 1015 Loma Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. A building permit was issued in 1926 for the construction of a dwelling. City records show only one minor modification to the main structure, the installation of an elevator in 1949. A garage was added in 1939, a pool in 1960, and a kitchen remodel in 1964. The contractor of record was A.M. Southard, who was also the contractor for 1125 G Avenue, which was just designated. The Mediterranean style dwelling was designed by noted architect Edgar Vaughn Ullrich, who has designed several prominent buildings in the San Diego area, including Immaculate Heart Seminary at the University of San Diego, and the Casa de Manana Hotel, the Muir House and the Baille House in La Jolla.

A previous owner of the home was Arthur Scully who managed real estate for the Hotel del Coronado and then worked with John Spreckels. The Pickford Family, other previous owners of the property, was well known in the Coronado business and civic community and for building the El Cordova Hotel. Mr. and Mrs. Peltier, the current owners are also well-known in Coronado. Mr. Peltier had a distinguished Naval career, then was prominent in the automobile business, and was a former member of the Coronado Planning Commission. Mrs. Peltier was highly educated and taught at various schools, and she co-authored a Spanish book for use in language training in local schools. Mrs. Peltier also served on the Coronado Library Board of Trustees

The property was rated highly on the Sourcepoint inventory scale as a "2H", indicating its significant local historical importance, excellent physical condition and almost entirely unmodified original exterior appearance, and substantial architectural significance. The home was awarded a plaque by the Coronado Historical Association for its historic significance.

Applicant's representative, Dr. Ray Brandes, 230 W. Laurel Street, Ste. 406, San Diego, introduced the owners, Midge and Jim Peltier. He reiterated the high rating of significance given to the home in the Sourcepoint inventory and spoke highly of the homes current and past owners. He pointed out that the home qualifies very easily, and meets all the distinctive characteristics. Dr. Brandes said the home has some of the very earliest Mediterranean architectural features such as its Moorish details.

He said the architect was one of the very best architects that didn't design any other structures in Coronado, and mentioned that several of Mr. Ullrich's homes are on the national historic register.

Mr. Jim Peltier, 1015 Loma Avenue, thanked the Historic Resource Commission for the time they spend on the historic program. He said in the 60's the Planning Commission struggled with keeping the special qualities within Coronado. He said he and his wife have kept the home up to date without destroying its qualities. In the 40 years they have lived in their beautiful home they have seen the destruction and tear-downs on their block and all around town. And to see the larger lots being broken into smaller lots is disappointing. He said it is a shame Coronado has lost the homes where Frank Ward, Dr. Gray, and Dr Steeds used to live.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Herron said the historic background on this house would make an excellent book. The Commission members agreed this designation was a foregone conclusion and they thanked the applicants for bringing it forward.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 25-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1015 LOMA AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY AND REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY IN THAT THE THREE FAMILIES WHO OWNED THE PROPERTY, THE SCULLY'S, THE PICKFORD'S AND THE PELTIER'S CONTRIBUTED TO THE COMMUNITY. MR. SCULLY WAS THE MANAGER OF REAL ESTATE FOR THE HOTEL DEL CORONADO AND LATER HAD A CAREER WITH JOHN SPRECKELS; THE PICKFORDS WERE WELL KNOWN FOR THEIR ROLE IN THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY PARTICULARLY FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF THE EL CORDOVA HOTEL; AND MR. PELTIER HAD A DISTINGUISHED NAVAL CAREER AND PROMINENT ROLE IN THE AUTOMOBILE BUSINESS AND ALSO SERVED ON THE CORONADO PLANNING COMMISSION AND MRS. PELTIER WAS A HIGHLY EDUCATION WOMAN WHO TAUGHT AT VARIOUS SCHOOLS INCLUDING CORONADO AND CO-AUTHORED A BOOK IN SPANISH USED

WITH LANGUAGE LABORATORIES IN CHULA VISTA AND CORONADO SCHOOLS; AND,

- D. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE MEDITERRANEAN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED.

COMMISSIONER HERRON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

Ms. McCaull said this is the 44th historically designated property in Coronado.

NOI 9-04 Economou, Joseph and Lisa - Consideration of Notice of Intent to demolish the single family residence addressed as 692 Margarita Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She explained that the property contains two structures, a residence, and a storage barn. The owner would like to demolish the structures and build something more in keeping with their family's needs. She said the issue for the Commission the determination of whether or not the home meets the criteria to be considered a historic resource. If it does meet the criteria it would become designated as historic and the owner would have to pursue a formal request for demolition, or consider alternatives such as an alteration permit. The staff recommendation is to adopt a resolution that the home does not meet the criteria because it has been substantially altered; and the owners, builder, and architect are not of historic significance.

Applicant's representative, Fay Lorraine Sueltz, 8536 Via Majorca La Jolla, said the front façade of the house is not original; in fact nothing is original except the walls on the sides. It appears the cottage was either built on top of or beyond southern side property line. A significant split-level addition was made which destroyed the original "cottage" look. The structure is in very poor condition as well, and it would be impossible to retain at least 50% of the existing walls in order to renovate the home.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairman Keith said it appears doubtful that two of the other criteria besides the age of the structure could be found for it to be considered historic. Commissioner Draper agreed. The home is 75 years of age, however there was no one of any significance person associated with it and there were substantial modifications. Commissioner MacCartee said it's not worth going to the mat for, even though it is adorable. She said this is a perfect example of the simple cottage style without any outstanding features.

Chairman Keith noted the two conditions regarding photographing and salvaging any historic building materials prior to demolition.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER KEITH MADE A MOTION TO ADOPT A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WITH FINDINGS MAKING THE DETERMINATION THAT THE PROPERTY ADDRESSED AS 692 MARGARITA AVENUE (NOI 9-04) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO QUALIFY AS A HISTORIC RESOURCE, THEREFORE ALLOWING FOR THE FUTURE DEMOLITION OF THE PROPERTY.

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

NOI 10-04 Dunham, Linda - Consideration of Notice of Intent to demolish the single family residence addressed as 918 D Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She explained that the property contains two structures, a residence, and a storage barn. The owner would like to demolish the structures and build something more in keeping with their family's needs. She said the issue for the Commission the determination of whether or not the home meets the criteria to be considered a historic resource. If it does meet the criteria it would become designated as historic and the owner would have to pursue a formal request for demolition, or consider alternatives such as an alteration permit. The staff recommendation is to adopt a resolution that the home does not meet the criteria. Even

though the original owner and probably builder, Oscar Dorman, was well known in Coronado's past, the home is in poor condition and the several alterations have impacted its appearance significantly. The application states that it is also a poor example of Spanish architecture.

Applicant's representative, Jeff Farrell, 419 D Avenue, testified that the home is unrecognizable from the original structure, the windows are aluminum, there were multiple add-ons, and the condition is too poor to try to save or try to restore. He said the family has decided to build multi-family on the lot instead of trying to save the original home.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner MacCartee said this is a sad example of what can happen to a house. The other Commissioners were in agreement.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION ADOPTING A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WITH FINDINGS MAKING THE DETERMINATION THAT THE PROPERTY ADDRESSED AS 918 D AVENUE (NOI 10-04) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO QUALIFY AS A HISTORIC RESOURCE, THEREFORE ALLOWING FOR THE FUTURE DEMOLITION OF THE PROPERTY.

COMMISSIONER KEITH SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Discussion regarding the Public Outreach Program

Newsletter: The Commissioners reviewed a draft copy of the newsletter. They decided to use a photograph of a historic house plaque as the logo and to get quotes for black

and white versus color copies from the printer that CHA is using. They chose a green colored, medium weight, parchment paper to print it on.

Slide Show: Chairman Keith said the Winn Room is not available for the date previously planned, but would check on another date early December.

Parks Video: Chairman Keith put together a PowerPoint presentation to show the City Council instead of the beleaguered video which has been put on hold until someone with the necessary technical skills can complete it. The Commission previewed the draft presentation.

Discussion regarding the Historic Designation Application for City Parks

Ms. McCaull announced that this item was noticed for a public hearing at the next regular Historic Resource Commission meeting.

Discussion regarding the Historic Property Data List to identify those properties that would be subject to the new Demolition Permit Process

The Commission continued its review of the properties and their permit histories for the list.

Discussion regarding Historic Districts

Continued.

Discussion regarding Historic Resource applications for Designation versus Demolition

Continued.

MISCELLANEOUS

None.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

Tony A. Peña
Director of Community Development