

CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

November 5, 2003

A regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:01 p.m., Wednesday, November 5, 2003, at the Coronado Police Department Emergency Operations Center, 700 Orange Avenue, Coronado, by Florence Draper, Chair of the Historic Resource Commission.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Draper, MacCartee, and Keith

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioners Walsh and Ryan

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Linda Hascup, Administrative Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Minutes of the Regular Meeting of September 17, 2003 were approved as amended.

The Minutes of the Regular Meeting of October 4, 2003 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

There was no separate report.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

None.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS:
APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

HR 9-03 **Marno and Louise McDermott** - Request for Historic Designation of the single family dwelling located at 1313 10th Street, in the R-1A(E) (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Mr. Swanson, Assistant Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said that the home was designed in the "Southern California Style" by the well-known architect Richard Requa of the architectural firm of Requa and Jackson. The building permit was issued to Walter B. Neill in September of 1926 and it was built by contractor Gengie and Son for \$22,000. W.A. Gunn, a furniture manufacturer from Grand Rapids, Michigan gave the house to his daughter and her husband, the Neill's, as a wedding gift. Mr. Gunn also owned a showcase home built designed by Richard Requa at 1127 F Avenue.

Applicant, Marno McDermott, 1313 10th Street, informed the Commission that his family had purchased the home about a year and a half ago. It was a mess at that time, but they have refurbished it from the roof down. He said his wife found original photographs to work from in the renovation. He said the house was well used by the family of ten that lived in it over the last ten years, so there was a lot of work to do. All of the windows and doors are original. There is a new roof, but the old tiles were taken off carefully and reused. He brought the old photograph to show how the house looks now just like it did when it was built. Mr. Marno said they even kept the interior of the house like the original, including the beams.

Chairman Draper said she had found a nice write-up in Bunnie MacKenzie's book on this home. It said that in 1950, Mr. Miller, the owner at the time was a professional photographer. At the time he built a photo lab and studio on the back of the house. She wondered if it was still there. Mr. Marno said there was a building permit taken out in the 1950's to enclose a patio and put in a bathroom in an area on the back of the house that might have been the studio. He remodeled the area as a room, bathroom, and closet. Commissioner Keith said that was where her family had their filmed developed as long as she could remember. Ms. Draper said she brought it up because someone might mistake that portion of the home as Requa's work. She thought this fact might be noted in the designation similarly to what the Commission did with the property on Alameda that had some added features.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Keith said she appreciates the time, money and love that the Marno's put into their home. She said she thinks the property should be designated as it is.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER KEITH MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 9-03 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1313 10TH STREET, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY MEETS THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY;
- D. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, WOULD BE VALUABLE FOR STUDY, AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; AND,
- E. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF AN ARCHITECT (RICHARD REQUA), BUILDER OR DESIGNER.

COMMISSIONER MacCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, MacCartee, and Keith

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioners Walsh and Ryan

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 3-0 with two Commissioners absent.

HR 13-02 **City of Coronado** - Preliminary Review of Application for Historic Designation of City Parks

Chairman Draper introduced the agenda item. Commissioner Keith asked for some clarification on the parks described in the package. She thought the Commission had agreed to leave out the Park in the Coronado Cays and include Centennial Park. Ms. McCaull explained that the City Council had requested the Commission to include information on the Coronado Cays and Glorietta Bay parkland. She said Commissioner Draper carried out the research and added the information to the package, but that doesn't necessarily mean that the Commission's recommendation to the City Council will be to have those parks included in the historic designation. Ms. Draper said since

the City Council had asked for the information the Commission was obligated to provide it, even though the Commission's feeling was that these parks did not meet the criteria for designation. Ms. Draper mentioned that Commissioner Ryan had previously voiced some thoughts on protecting park land through historic designation, and the north Cays park area was a good example. Part of the park area was lost to provide land for the entrance to Loews' Coronado Bay Resort. His thought was to include all of the parks in the designation to protect them. Commissioner Keith didn't agree with that approach; her thought was that the Historic Resource Commission's purpose should be to save the historic parks of Coronado as historic resources. She thinks it is a little far-fetched to come up with any criteria that could include the Cays in the designation. She said that 75 years ago there may not have been any land there at all, or at the most, a dump. She felt it would be easy to explain to the City Council why the Cays was not included in the application.

Chairman Draper said there are four or five other parks on the list that are also not 75 years old, such as Sunset Park. Commissioner MacCartee said that perhaps the Commission could explain that they are only looking at park land in the historic village center and not areas that were developed later. This would allow space that was set aside very early in the village, possibly not developed as a park yet, in the designation. She said it would be nice to save the Cays park land from future development, but it does diminish the Commission to begin to include things that don't belong. There is an argument to include Glorietta Bay Park because it was part of Tent City. Commissioner MacCartee said it doesn't make sense to include Prospect Park on the list because it no longer exists. No one even knows where it was. Ms. Draper suggested that perhaps the list could contain all of the parks the Council requested information on, but then make a recommendation for designation of only those that meet historic criteria. She questioned how they should handle the un-named parks. Commissioner MacCartee said they couldn't include SDG&E Park because the City doesn't own it. She also would not include Tidelands Park or Rotary Park. Commissioner Draper agreed with those exceptions. She asked for confirmation that the Commission would keep the list from April 2003 with the exclusion of Prospect Park, SDG&E Park, and Rotary Park. Commissioners Keith and MacCartee suggested the addition of Glorietta Bay Park and Centennial Park to the list and the exclusion of the Cays Park. Commissioner Keith said the easy answer to why information on the Cays park land isn't included is because there is no information prior to 1975 and it doesn't meet any of the historic criteria. Commissioner MacCartee said that all of the information should be presented because Centennial Park has a similar difficulty with age; it wasn't designated as a park until the 1980's. However, the land was there and Centennial Park is part of the historic village. The only problem with Centennial Park has been the lack of printed information on it; most of the information so far is memories of the dedication ceremony. Ms. McCaull said she could do some research in City records for more solid information on Centennial Park. She felt that the information presented in the report was adequate, but perhaps there was some supplemental information she could find.

Ms. McCaull suggested that the Commission should respond to the City Council's request for information with due diligence. The Commission can then state in the application that the information presented either supports or does not support designation of certain parks. The Commissioners agreed with the suggestion. Ms. McCaull said the changes would be made as discussed and the next meeting would be a public hearing on the application as the last step before submitting it to the City Council.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Commission Discussion Regarding the Public Outreach Program

Historic Plaques - Commissioner MacCartee said that information was provided in the agenda packet on the two ways the plaques can be mounted, either with screws going through from the front, or on steel studs and adhesive from the back. The Commission members agreed that the "front attaching" method seemed to be the easiest method.

Commission Action: Commissioner Draper made motion to use the "front mount" option for the plaques. Commissioner Keith seconded the motion. The motion passed 3-0 with two Commissioners absent.

Coronado Parks Video - Commissioner Keith reported that she had spoken with Bill Putnam of Coronado Cablevision who said the video is not ready yet. He hopes to have it finished in the next couple of weeks. The Commission member were hopeful the video would be ready for the next HRC meeting on December 3 so they would be able to review it before the second City Council meeting in December on 18th.

Newspaper Articles - Chairman Draper asked for comments on her suggestion to include information regarding criteria for historic designation as a preface to the articles that are to appear in the Eagle & Journal. Commissioner Keith was only concerned about the amount of space the Eagle would give to the articles, but it is a good idea if they provide the space. Commissioner MacCartee said that if there is a space consideration perhaps a criterion could be emphasized in each article rather than listing them all. Ms. McCaull said that staff could take the photograph to submit with the article.

Commission Action: Commissioner Keith made motion that the letter concerning the residence at 520 B Avenue be submitted to the Eagle and Journal for publication. Commissioner Draper seconded the motion. The motion passed 3-0 with two Commissioners absent.

Commission Discussion Regarding the Referral of the City's Historic Pictures, Scrapbooks and Maps to the Historic Resource Commission for a Preservation Project

Paige Harrington, Executive Director of Coronado Historical Association, 1100 Orange Avenue, said she did have a chance to take a look at the materials yesterday. She said it's not in as bad a shape as she thought. The front and back covers of the scrapbooks have worn and come a little loose, and some of the pages have come out, but it appears that everything has been put back in generally the right order. Ms. Harrington said she would look over the catalogs of archival materials that to see what is available to aid in preserving the scrapbooks and come up with a suggestion for the budget. She said she would also advise on the type of environment and space required to keep the materials in good condition for the future.

Commission Discussion Regarding the Historic Preservation "Mills Act" Program and Fiscal Restrictions

Ms. McCaull said this item was on the agenda for the Commission to review input to the City Council provided by Commission Ryan. Ms. McCaull said that in Commissioner Ryan's absence she would report that she did postpone the item going to the City Council from November 4th to November 18th. She said she would need the information by Monday, the 10th in order to include it in her staff report to the Council. Ms. McCaull suggested that one or two Commissioners attend the Council meeting to represent the Commission.

MISCELLANEOUS

None.

FUTURE ITEMS

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:50 p.m.

Tony A. Peña