

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

November 16, 2005

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:01 p.m., Wednesday, November 16, 2005, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chamber, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Keith.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Leticia Martinez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of November 2, 2005, were approved as amended.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

There was no separate report.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Commissioner Draper reported that residents had commented on how grateful they were for the HRC's latest newsletter; it was well received. They liked the update on the movie theater and asked if there could be something done about the Vons CoroMart deal.

Vice Chair MacCartee reported that they are out of CD's for the parks. She asked if more CD's could be ordered.

Ms. McCaull said there are more CD's at the City and she would provide at least 25 more. She stated that the HRC should be receiving a record from the museum which shows how many CD's are provided to the museum and a record of how many they have sold and the funds to match.

Commissioner MacCartee said that the museum places the funds into an envelope. She will pick up the envelope and give it to Ms. McCaull.

Commissioner Herron stated that Bay Books has the same process – they receive the funds and place it in an envelope.

Chairperson Keith said she would like to place an item for the next meeting. She is trying to come up with a simple one or two page flyer on how to form a district, giving some information on the SOHO site where residents can obtain information.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HR 21-05 **ZIMMERMAN, MARC & LEESA** – Request for Historic Designation of the property addressed as 1111 Flora Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The owners have applied for historic designation and they plan to complete some restoration work to the dwelling and also to apply for Historic Preservation Mills Act agreement. City records indicate that this home was completed in August of 1931 so it is 75 years old. The original owner was Mrs. Smith and the contractor of record was Gernandt Construction Co. The designer is not known. Very few alterations have occurred to the exterior of the building since its original construction other than interior improvements such as plumbing and home electrical upgrades. The application noted that the dwelling was lived in by Mr. Seavy. He was the Mayor of Coronado. The building has Italianate architectural style and has features such as low-pitched roofs, wide overhanging eaves, rectangular massing, balanced symmetrical façade, emphasis on vertical proportions. Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave this home an historical value rating of 3, which indicates there is some historical significance. It is also interesting to note with the application submitted by the Zimmermans, there was documentation that the Coronado Historical Association identified this property as a landmark in 1981.

Commissioner Draper stated that the property is technically 74 years old; however, it will be 75 years old in one month. She also noted the application states that Mr. Smith lived in the house in 1926, when in fact the house constructed in 1931.

Ms. McCaull said she did note that discrepancy and stated that possibly the applicant can provide further information.

Marc Zimmerman, the applicant, thanked Ms. McCaull for her guidance in the designation process. He did not have additional information on the date discrepancy as he said that it was quite a process to obtain the information. He purchased the home in the late 1990's and at that time he did not know the house had any historical value. He hopes the Commission will consider the home historic resource.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Wilson asked if there were any additions to this home. She felt the home should be saved and designated historic.

Ms. McCaull said she did not find any record of additions to the house.

Commissioner Herron said that she was in favor of saving the home.

Commissioner Draper said the home was wonderful and was in favor of designation. She also commented that Mr. Seavy was with Luce Forward, a very prominent firm in San Diego.

Vice Chair MacCartee thanked the applicant.

Chairperson Keith said she was friends with Mr. Seavy, the former Mayor of Coronado, and thanked the applicant for coming forward to save the house.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 1111 FLORA AVENUE (HR 21-05) TO BE A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, SOCIAL AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL (FORMER MAYOR SEAVY AND MR. HARRY SMITH), STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ITALIANATE ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL.

COMMISSIONER DRAPER SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

Chairperson Keith thanked the applicant and advised they would be receiving a plaque during a City Council meeting in the near future.

HR 22-05 **PIPER, SUSAN & WILLIAM** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 930 I Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The site contains a two story dwelling with a carport at the rear of the property. The owners have applied for historic designation to keep this property protected and intact. City records indicate a permit was issued to M. Chapin in 1913 for the connection of the City sewer system. A permit was issued in 1921 for a two room

bungalow kitchen addition. On that permit, it noted that the home appeared on the 1890 Lot Book. The structure is about 113 years old, an older home in the community. In 1939, a porch was added to the residence and a subsequent permit was issued to enclose the porch. In 1974, Robert Creel, the former owner of Ye Old Flower Shoppe, constructed a kitchen and family room addition to the property. In 1996, the current owners added a second story addition at the rear of the home. The home as a Folk Victorian architectural style and the applicants believe it is one of the few remaining examples of that type of architecture in Coronado. The Historic Resource Inventory completed in 1980 gave it a value rating of 4, most likely because the home needed a lot of improvements. The 4 rating typically indicated it was in fair condition and modifications had been made to the home.

Susan Piper, the applicant, 930 I Avenue, thanked the Commission for reviewing the applicant, and thanked Ms. McCaull for all her assistance over the years. She showed documentation that indicates the home was built in 1887, which means the home is 118 years old. Ms. Piper indicated that during the process of fixing a leaking window, she found behind a wall a San Francisco Chronicle newspaper clipping dated August 26, 1887. She feels this is a date marker. She also found a sample of wallpaper and a small Victorian trading card dated 1887. Also found were a number of square cut type B nails, which were made between 1820 and 1900. She passed around the framed samples of the items, which have been placed on acid-free paper. In addition, she added that that her Folk Victorian home exemplifies a cultural and architectural era in Coronado's history, and is one of the few remaining examples of that type of architecture in the City.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Keith stated that on page 43 of the Agenda, under the Historic Resource Designation, Application Form II, there is a correction as follows: "Various Coronado locals, including the Dunn family of Isabella Avenue..." should be corrected to read, "...Loma Avenue." She said that the home qualifies for designation.

Commissioner Wilson commented that on the Application the correct spelling is Batten, not Batton. She felt that the home is very pretty, and she certainly leans towards the earlier date.

COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 930 I AVENUE (HR 22-05) TO BE A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, SOCIAL AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;

- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF A FOLK VICTORIAN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL.

COMMISSIONER HERRON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

Vice Chair MacCartee reported that Ms. Piper has agreed to open her home to the Coronado Cottage Conservancy, who will show what cottage living is like.

Chairperson Keith thanked the applicant and advised they would be receiving a plaque during a City Council meeting in the near future.

HR 23-05 **A. SWAGEMAKERS** – Request for Historic Designation of the property addressed as 936-954 C Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull reported that the property owner had contacted her yesterday and requested that this item be continued until further notice. No action was taken.

HR 24-05 **MONTALBANO FAMILY TRUST** – Request for Historic Designation of the property addressed as 541 Ocean Boulevard and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The Montalbanos have owned the property since 1984. The site contains a two story dwelling with a partial basement and detached accessory building. The owners have applied for historic designation to preserve their historical, architectural house on Ocean Boulevard and prevent demolition in the future. This home was constructed in 1919. The original owner was Margaret Scott, and the contractor was Chapin and Driver. S.D. Chapin arrived in Coronado in 1898 and was responsible for construction of over 200 homes. It has a Georgian architectural style and is in excellent condition. The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's and was given an historic value rating of 3H, which indicated it was considered historical by the Coronado Historical Association.

Commissioner Draper stated that the architect was listed as R. Alderson, and asked what the "R" stood for – was it "Ray"? Because Ray Alderson was a well known architect who did the Winchester building on Loma and Orange in 1923, and he studied architecture and engineering by correspondence courses.

Ms. McCaull responded that the applicants may know the answer.

Commissioner Wilson asked about the source information on page 97, regarding the reference material to Colonial Revival on page 97, as she felt it was more Prairie rather than Georgian.

Ms. McCaull said the source was the Internet under Georgian because the applicant had described it as Georgian. She said the Historic Resource Inventory called it a Flat Roofed Classic Box architectural style.

Dr. Francis Montalbano, 541 Ocean Boulevard, said he had the original blueprints, which indicates the architect was R. Alderson. The house has had only six owners since 1919. He has lived in the home since 1984. Mr. George Murphy, an umpire for the National Football League, lived in the home with his nine or eleven children. Mr. Montalbano and his wife are both Chiefs of Staff for Sharp Hospital at Children's, and were involved in the purchase of Coronado Hospital. His home is currently being painted – gray for the clapboard and white for the windows, and is being done in diamond paint which is a very new paint being developed for lifetime usage. He and his wife love their home and wish to preserve it.

Dr. Patricia Montalbano, 541 Ocean Boulevard, said she understood one of the Commissioner's interpretation of the Prairie house, especially having lived in Chicago, but does not think that the eaves are that extensive and it goes into a Georgian Colonial type of house. It is very difficult to ascertain what the architect was building at the time.

Dr. Francis Montalbano said the main entrance is on the side rather than on the front of the house.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper said that as a point of reference, the architect was most likely Ray Alderson, and the Winchester building built in 1923 was an Italian Renaissance Revival in style, so that was what he did in 1923 for that particular building. She also felt uncomfortable calling this house a Georgian, but the home should certainly be designated. She thanked the applicant for coming in.

Vice Chair MacCartee said it was a pleasure to have the home on the list.

Commissioner Herron agreed that the Commission was very lucky to see a home on Ocean Boulevard designated.

Commissioner Wilson thanked the applicant for coming in. As general reference, the Source Point photo on page 93 is very helpful to see what the home really looks like.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON DRAPER MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 541 OCEAN BOULEVARD (HR 24-05) TO BE A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, SOCIAL AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF A FOLK VICTORIAN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL (S.D. CHAPMIN WAS A WELL KNOWN CONTRACTOR).

VICE CHAIR MACCARTEE DRAPER SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

Vice Chair MacCartee asked Drs. Montalbano if they would agree to include their names on a list of designated homes which is published in the local newspaper. They agreed.

Commissioner Wilson thanked Ms. McCaull for all her hard work.

Chairperson Keith recognized Ms. McCaull for her dedication in encouraging many residents to come forth with their applications and for working closely with them through the designation process.

MISCELLANEOUS

None.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Discussion regarding the formulation of a Demolition Review List (HR 14-04)

The Commission reviewed the list of potential properties and made a determination as to which

properties should be kept, reviewed further, or eliminated from the list.

Commission regarding the Historic Resource Commission Newsletter

Commissioner Wilson expressed her concern that the Newsletter was too “bland” and did not reach enough residents. There were four other flyers in the local newspaper that day and she felt it may have gotten “lost.” She also feels that different fonts should be used for each article and for the header. Also she suggested placing it in the City’s Quarterly Newsletter. She will ask the City Manager about this suggestion. She volunteered to bring back examples of different presentations of the Newsletter to make it more eye-catching.

Ms. McCaull responded that the same firm would probably be used to produce the Newsletter. The PR firm used for the Quarterly Newsletter is a private firm that produces a high quality presentation but encouraged Commissioner Wilson to speak with the City Manager.

Vice Chair MacCartee said that the color presentation would look very nice, and felt that their Newsletter should be better presented.

Ms. McCaull said that the cost may be close to \$2,000.

Chairperson Keith suggested that Commissioner Wilson look into these options and return with some suggestions.

Commissioner Herron said she wanted to keep the logo and wanted to reproduce it better.

Discussion regarding the Coronado Cottage Conservancy (CCC) (no report)

Vice Chair MacCartee reported that the CCC would be having their first Board of Director Meeting on December 1, 2005, at the Golf Course. She would be present as a non-voting, HRC representative. They will hold an open cottage program, called Cottage Sunday, where every other month, a cottage will be open for the public to tour. There will be a minimal \$5 charge to cover advertising. The tour will focus on the history of the house. The first tour will be held on December 11, from 1 to 3 p.m. at Harold and Kaye Myers house. A list of about 10-12 homes for touring has been established.

Chairperson Keith asked if everyone is aware of the email for the Cottage Conservancy updates. It is “cottageconservancy@san.rr.com.”

Commissioner Herron asked why Cottage Sunday is being held every other month.

Vice Chair MacCartee said that they just don’t have the energy.

Commissioner Herron suggested tying it to the art in the park.

Vice Chair MacCartee said it was on a volunteer basis and said she was happy to take names of anyone wishing to volunteer their time to this program. The points of contact are Chairpersons Sharon Sherman (435-1628) and Nancy Cobb (435-5993). She said that about 45 persons attended

the second meeting held last Wednesday. There will also be another program called the Cottage Core, which is a group of citizens that will take different blocks of the island and have it be their block and they will familiarize themselves with the cottages and their owners and will know if something goes on the market, etc. This encourages persons to get to know their town again.

Commissioner Wilson asked if anyone from the Council has called or expressed an interest.

Vice Chair MacCartee responded no.

Commissioner Wilson suggested that Vice Chair MacCartee go before Council and report on the meeting.

Ms. McCaull agreed because although she communicates to the Council via the weekly updates, she is not directly involved.

Chairperson Keith inquired of Ms. McCaull if Vice Chair MacCartee should be the designated person to go before Council.

Ms. McCaull suggested Vice Chair MacCartee or Attorney Sherman.

Commissioner Wilson suggested Vice Chair MacCartee because of her enthusiasm.

Chairperson Keith expressed concern about blending the HRC and the CCC. She wanted to make sure that the citizens and the City that these are two separate entities.

Commissioner Herron stated there is no conflict of interest.

Commissioner Draper agreed with Chairperson Keith in keeping the entities separate. She suggested it may be better if the Council saw a broader base, and did not see the entities as one.

Vice Chair MacCartee agreed to go before the Council.

Chairperson Keith suggested forwarding emails to Council to keep them updated on the Cottage Conservancy.

Discussion regarding Historic Resource Designation Benefit of applying for relief to zoning standards as provided for in the Historic Preservation Ordinance (no report)

This item was continued.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:48 p.m.

Tony A Peña

Director of Community Development