

CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

May 5, 2004

A regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m., Wednesday, May 5, 2004, at the Coronado Police Department Emergency Operations Center, 700 Orange Avenue, Coronado, California by Vice Chairperson MacCartee.

ROLL CALL:

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioner Keith

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
John Swanson, Assistant Planner
Linda Hascup, Administrative Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Minutes of the Regular Meeting of April 7, 2004 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull reported that the City Council made a proclamation recognizing May as Historic Preservation Month. The property owners of historically designated properties were also presented with plaques for their homes. She said the presentation went very well and the owners really liked the plaques and appreciated the recognition.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

None.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Page Harrington, Executive Director of Coronado Historical Association (CHA), congratulated the Commission on the presentation of the plaques. Ms. Harrington announced that CHA is having the tour of homes at the end of the month and there is

publicity in the Coronado Eagle and the homes will be featured in the Union Tribune Home Section on Sunday, May 16. She said the editorial staff of the Eagle interviewed CHA regarding their Art and Antique Auction and the "Keep It in Coronado" preservation program to salvage and recycle architectural elements of old homes. She said she was able to put in a plug for the Historic Resource Commission (HRC) as well.

PUBLIC HEARINGS:

APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

HRPA 3-04 Duncan and Karen Smith - Request for a Historic Resource Preservation Agreement for the single family residence located at 605 10th Street and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Mr. Swanson, Assistant Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said the home was designated as the City's 25th historic resource by the City of Coronado on December 3, 2003 and is now eligible to apply for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement with the City of Coronado. A Mills Act Agreement requires the property owner to preserve the home for minimum period of 10 years, and in exchange there is some property tax reduction. He explained that the HRC's role is to review the "list of improvements" that will be attached to the Mills Act application going to the City Council. Due to the condition of the home the applicant is not proposing any improvements to the property other than routine maintenance over the 10-year term of the contract. Mr. Swanson explained that the applicant has been advised that there is currently a backlog of Mills Act applications and this application would be added to the queue.

Commissioner Wilson referred to the financial breakdown from the San Diego County Tax Assessor's Office and said she views the tax that is lost to the City as an investment in the City rather than a loss. Mrs. Wilson said she wasn't on the Commission when the home was originally designated and asked for some background information regarding the condition of the home historically and currently.

There was a brief discussion regarding the chronological listing of homes waiting for Mills Act contracts. Ms. McCaull said the Commission has until December of 2004 to get their Mills Act recommendations together.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

There was no further discussion.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS CONSISTING OF THE ROUTINE MAINTENANCE OF THE PROPERTY FOR 605 10TH STREET (HRPA 3-04) AND FORWARD IT TO THE CITY COUNCIL WITH THE HISTORIC RESOURCE PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION.

COMMISSIONER HERRON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioner Keith

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 4-0 with one Commissioner absent.

HR 4-04 **Weston Family Trust** - Request for a Historic Designation of the single family residence located at 1005 Adella Avenue located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Mr. Swanson, Assistant Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said that a building permit was issued on May 5, 1903 to construct a dwelling at 1005 Adella Avenue as a summer home for the owner, W.F. Dummer, who was a Chicago banker and capitalist. Mr. Dummer was married to the sister of Mrs. William Templeton Johnson (of the Sturgis family). The contractor was M. Purcell, and the architects were Pond and Pond, who were very well known in Chicago and the Midwest. The home was built in the English Tudor style of architecture which was popular in America during the 1920's and 30's. There were several modifications between 1918 and 1923 which included the addition of a sun porch (contractor S.D. Chapin), a screen porch and bath (Harry Smith, contractor), and a servant quarters and garage (contractor L.R. Dilley.) The property was later sold to Martha (Keck) Clark; and the Weston's purchased the home in 1965.

Applicant, John Weston, commented that he and his wife, Ginger, bought the house 40 years ago to raise a large family and that there has been some good living in the home over the years. They have reason to think that the property wouldn't be transferred to any of the children and would like to have it preserved as it is for the future. He said they have a complete set of very detailed, original blueprints from Pond and Pond Architects. Inside the house is redwood paneling in the living room and dining room, much beautiful moulding wood architecture, 5 fireplaces, refinished fir floors. Mr. Weston said that if they had to build another home they wouldn't change anything. The servants' quarters and garage that were built in 1923 are no longer a part of the property because they were sold after the property was subdivided into three parcels.

Commissioner Draper said that she found a photo of Pond and Pond Brothers at the Chicago Landmarks website. She asked where it came from. Mr. Weston said he found the photo of the home in a book where the original cost of the home was shown as approximately \$10,000. Ms. Draper suggested the Westons might want to give the blueprints to the CHA when they no longer have a need for them to add to their wonderful collection.

Mr. Weston added that the house he was raised in and moved from in 1932 was 476 C Avenue has also been designated historic. His daughter and son-in-law live in that house now, so there are two historic homes in the family. Commissioner MacCartee said that 476 C Avenue was the first home designated by the Historic Resource Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper commented that she found it interesting that the Dummer's didn't ask the brother-in-law, William Templeton Johnson, to design the house.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 4-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1005 ADELLA AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY MEETS THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S AESTHETIC, ARCHITECTURAL, CULTURAL, ECONOMIC, AND SOCIAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE ENGLISH TUDOR ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND WOULD BE VALUABLE FOR STUDY, AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; AND,
- D. IT REPRESENTS THE WORK OF NOTABLE ARCHITECTS POND AND POND.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioner Keith

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 4-0 with one Commissioner absent.

HR 13-02 **City of Coronado** - Review of Application of Historic Designation of City Parks and Recommendation to the City Council. (AGENDA ITEM CONTINUED TO A FUTURE HEARING)

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Commission Discussion Regarding the Public Outreach Program

Historic Plaques and Historic Preservation Month were covered under the Director's Report.

Coronado Parks Video: Commissioner Herron said she would suggest that the project needs to move along to someone who can complete it. She read an article about someone who had put together a historic video, so there must be people out there who do a similar service. Commissioner MacCartee said she didn't think there was funding to pay for someone else to complete the project. She asked if they could move forward with the park application it. Commissioner Wilson said there might be someone at the College or High School level who would want to take it on as a class or individual project. There might be someone willing to back the video financially. Commissioner MacCartee said it might be time to ask for the return of materials and what has been done so far and look for someone else to finish putting it together.

Ms. McCaull said she would follow up with Bill Putnam and report back to the Commission on where the project is at and perhaps Commissioner Herron look for someone who might be willing to take on the project.

Commissioner MacCartee said the article in the Eagle asking for information on the parks needs to be taken out of the paper because there has been no response and the project is stalled.

Newspaper Articles: Commissioner Draper volunteered to prepare an article for July.

Newsletter/Website: Commissioner Wilson said she likes the idea of using a plaque as the newsletter logo. She suggested shortening an earlier phrase suggestion to "Preserving the Future", and came up with some other ideas as well. The Commissioners decided to go with "Preserving the Future" and to use the plaque as a logo. Ms. McCaull asked if the Commissioners wanted to use the new logo (plaque and phrase) on the City website where there is a listing Historic Preservation information, such as the HR applications and information on the homes that are currently designated, with photographs to be added. She asked if the Commission wanted to use

the plaque and the logo with the website information. They decided that both images should be on anything that goes out from the Commission so that it is associated with their efforts.

Commissioner MacCartee said that since there wouldn't be a newsletter because of the cost perhaps they could put an insert into CHA's quarterly newsletter. Ms. Harrington said it wouldn't be additional cost to CHA and they would be willing to insert a two-sided flyer. She said they normally print around 1,200 newsletters and the next issue will go to print in a week, ready to mail within 10 days. She said if that is too early they will be doing another newsletter in 3 or 4 months. Ms. McCaull said the flyers could be copied at City Hall so there would be no significant additional cost for the Commission. The Commission members decided to wait until the next edition.

The Commissioners discussed what information should go on an insert, such as a list of designated homes, photos, etc. Commissioner MacCartee said it will be good to work hand in hand with CHA. She would really like to do something with impact, make it look good and spend a little time thinking of what they want to say, rather than just doing lists. Commissioner Draper agreed. She said that maybe the Council would like to see the entire package brought back to them and a good newsletter insert would make to make the Commission look more professional and give some validity to their request for more funding for preservation. Commissioners MacCartee and Wilson volunteered to work on the newsletter.

Commissioner MacCartee made a motion that the Historic Resource Commission adopt the logo as discussed, and have a news page ready to include in the Coronado Historic Association's newsletter for the next quarter.

Commissioner Wilson seconded the motion

The motion passed 4-0 with Commissioner Keith absent.

Flower Show: Commissioner Wilson said it was good that she set up the booth the evening before because of the rain and the number of people who visited the booth. She presented the pink ribbon the booth won to Ms. McCaull. She said there was a lot of interest in the booth. Some people were interested enough to pick up designation application packs. All of the applications were given out and people wanted to talk about historic preservation.

Ms. Wilson said the quiz wasn't as well received as she thought it would be. She said maybe they should take a break from doing it next year, or maybe it could be redone or typed in bigger font. She said that also, the photos are looking a little tired and the boards are a little warped from dampness so they should be redone.

Ms. McCaull said that it was a surprise how many historic walking tour flyers were picked up. There were over 150 printed originally and Mrs. Wilson another 150 or 200 which were mostly taken as well. She said the map was a hit and the walking tour really works.

Historic Preservation Program Slide Show for Coronado Cablevision: Commissioner Herron said this may be another opportunity of collaborating with the school district. She sees the video as a slide show showing the historic homes, something like the realty ads. The idea came up that there could be some information, a subtitle line with each photo, saying, "Coronado Historic Home" and include the date built. There could even be a title page and a script. Commissioner MacCartee said they should definitely use the logo and "Preserving the Future" on it as well.

McCaull said she would ask Bill Putnam about running a Power Point presentation. She said there is already a power point presentation that was put together for public outreach to various organizations.

Archival Project of City Records: Ms. McCaull reported that the last meeting went very well and they plan to get together again next month.

Commission Discussion Regarding Draft Report to the City Council on Recommendations Regarding the City's Historic Preservation Program and Mills Act Ordinance

Ms. McCaull said the discussion item was on the agenda as a follow-up to the joint meeting between HRC and the City Council. She said the Commission would submit recommendations to the Council regarding processing of Mills Act applications and the direction of the Historic Preservation Program. She said the format of the report as presented in the agenda is basically the format she would propose to submit to the City Council; with the headings of: Public Outreach Efforts; Demolition Permit Process; Mills Act Program; and, Additional Funding for Historic Preservation Program.

Prioritization of Mills Act Requests

Page Harrington, Executive Director of Coronado Historic Association said, regarding how HRC might prioritize Mills Act applications, that she had prepared a couple of options for charts the Commission to consider. One method would award numeric points; another would be to apply values such as Excellent, Good, or Fair.

The Commission members were in favor of the numeric chart because the use of "excellent, good, or fair" could be somewhat subjective. They felt that the important criteria to consider should be: the age of the home, whether a home was in original condition or had been remodeled (structural and design integrity), possessing distinctive style or characteristics, architectural significance and scarcity, historical importance of associated persons, and how endangered a home is (the likelihood of "imminent danger of demolition"). Ms. Harrington said that once the criteria is decided the Commission could take a look at the 35 homes already designated and choose one as a poster child for a full 35 points for the 7 areas.

Commissioner Herron suggested a criteria item for the fiscal impact on the City's finances. Commissioner Draper said she'd like to suggest that any application that has an impact over \$15,000 be taken out of this process and be handled separately. Commission MacCartee agreed that there are certain distinctive landmark homes that need to be considered separately, such as the Hanson Mansion.

Mills Act Program Funding

The Commissioners agreed they would request an increase from fees from the current \$5,000 additional per year for the program to \$10,000 additional per year.

Additional Funding for Historic Home Preservation Program

Commissioner MacCartee said she thinks more money for the Mills Act program should come before asking for money for other things. She questioned if asking for \$1,000 would be too much at this time. The Commission discussed the cost of providing plaques for new properties in the program and Ms. McCaull said she would try to get a separate line item in the Community Development budget for the plaques.

Commission Wilson said she would prefer to drop the request for the grants, but keep the revolving loan suggestion. The ensuing discussion brought out the fact that grants are likely to be so small they wouldn't be very helpful, but the City Council might like the idea of "loans" better because they would be repaid.

Demolition Permit Process

The Commission members all agreed with the CHA that the demolition permit process should be expanded for homes over 75 years of age to include: an increase in the demolition permit fee; a 30 day delay prior to demolition; publication of a formal "intent to demolish"; a physical inventory of the property, as well as required research on the historicity of the property.

Commissioner MacCartee said she was very surprised to discover the small amounts charged by other cities for demolition permits. Commissioner Wilson said that Del Mar and San Diego have the most similarities to Coronado and they both have higher demolition fees. It seems that Coronado should too. The Commissioners discussed that if demolition fees were higher it might at least make applicants think harder about demolishing their properties and bring more money into the program. Commissioner Draper said it could be based on the valuation of the property, for example \$20 per \$1,000 of valuation. Ms. McCaull explained that the city attorney advised that the fees can't be based on a valuation of the property; there has to be a nexus in that the fee charged is related to the cost to the City for issuing the permit and making inspections, etc., which at this time is \$83. She said there was a movement to look at all of the City's permit fees around a year ago, but that hasn't been undertaken yet. She suggested that the increased fee would reflect the additional expenses entailed in the longer process, public noticing, inspections, etc.

Commissioner Wilson said the City Council would expect to hear a request from the Historic Resource Commission to increase these fees, and that a 30 day notice of intent to demolish isn't unreasonable to ask for. She said that the fee examples provided by San Diego and Del Mar would be good evidence to base the fee increase request on. Commissioner MacCartee said that a lot could be done in 30 days.

Ms. McCaull said that staff is concerned with the proposal outlined by CHA in that it lets people know that a structure is going to be demolished, but there is no process in place to proceed forward after everyone knows about the demolition. She suggested a process similar to what is done in the City of La Mesa. If the home is 75 years or older, an "intent to demolish" is published in the paper, then a public hearing is scheduled (by HRC which would require a legal notice in the paper and mailing to neighbors within 300'). The Commission could hear testimony from the property owner and the public in order to prepare recommendation. This would open up the opportunity for dialogue and HRC could educate the property owner of the benefits of historic designation should they choose to go that route. The Commission would make a recommendation on whether the structure could be demolished. City Council could be appealed to on the Commission's decision.

Commissioner MacCartee said that it would be important for people to see the notifications. She said if there was a regular display area in the Eagle that showed demolitions monthly, then people would be used to seeing it and take note of notices of "intent to demolish". She said they could be located in proximity to the regular information box.

MISCELLANEOUS

Commissioner Draper turned in her suggestions to add to the list of homes that the Commission would like to see designated.

Ms. McCaull said she would send out a current list of designated homes to the Commissioners via email.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:06 p.m.

Tony A. Peña
Director of Community Development