

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

March 7, 2007

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:09 p.m., Wednesday, March 7, 2007, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, O'Brien and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner  
Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

The minutes of February 7, 2007, were approved as amended.

The minutes of February 21, 2007, were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director McCaull reported that the Commission will have many items scheduled for the next meeting.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

None.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

**HR 3-07**     **LORTON AND CAROLYN MITCHELL** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 623 A Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. Carolyn and Lorton Mitchell are in escrow to purchase this property. The current owner, Kathleen Parish Gann, has authorized the Mitchell's to submit the designation application. This site is 40 feet wide and 195 feet deep totaling 7,800 square feet. The site contains a single story residence at the front of the property and a garage and studio unit at the rear of the site off of Adella Lane. The owners have applied for historic designation to preserve the front structure and plan on constructing a new residence at the rear of the property off of Adella Lane. The rear structure would be the primary residence for the site. The new residence would require some relief from zoning standards and would be the subject of a future Historic Alteration Permit if the structure is designated historic.

City records indicate the dwelling at the front of the property was constructed in 1909 so the residence is 98 years old. The original owner was identified as W.E. Ingelow and the contractor is identified as F. Heilbron. The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980s identified the contractor as being a noted contractor within the community. The Inventory noted that Mr. Heilbron operated a plumbing and heating firm with his sons and his name also appears on the building contract for the notable Percival Thompson Residence at 1156 Isabella Avenue.

No exterior changes have occurred to the front dwelling since its original construction. The property remained in the hands of the Brown family for over fifty years. In the 1960s, the property was acquired by the Goodbody family. Recently the Parish-Gann family acquired the property in the 1990s. The building could be best described as having a simple Bungalow architectural style with somewhat unique features. The home has a side entrance to the residence which is unusual for Craftsman Bungalows which tend to be more symmetrical and have the entry on the front façade. It may be that this dwelling was an “accessory building” to a larger estate at one time, however, staff was unable to confirm its relationship to the large estate to the north at 611 A Avenue. The dwelling has a gable roof with beveled siding and shingles, and wood diamond lite French casement windows. The windows are the most prominent feature along the front façade and are perhaps the most character defining feature of the residence. The application indicates that all of the windows are original and in repairable condition. The Mitchell’s would like to paint the building to improve the cottage’s aesthetic appearance. It is important to note the context of this home with respect to the neighboring block. Several properties on A Avenue have been designated historic as well as the adjoining property, the Hereshoff Court, and the estate oat 611 A Avenue.

If the residence is designated as an Historic Resource, the owner plans to submit an historic alteration permit application for the property. The Mitchell’s would like to retain the front house as a guest house and construct a replacement dwelling (for the alley unit to be demolished) at the rear of the property off of Adella Lane. The new dwelling would require some exceptions to the zoning standards due to the unique lot depth and slope of the property.

Chairperson MacCartee asked if the Commission is able to designate the entire property.

Director McCaull said yes.

The applicant, Lorton Mitchell, 517 Adella Lane, gave a brief overview of the request and made himself available to answer questions. Mr. Lorton displayed an article from the San Diego Union dated 1911 which shows a photograph of the home when it was first built. He said that in 1913, W.E. Brown acquired the property as a honeymoon cottage. He obtained a permit and built the garage and a studio, or what may have been a chauffer’s quarters. The house is currently a burnt-out red which is similar to the color of the Windsor Cottage at the Hotel Del.

Dorothy Howard, Architect, 420 H Avenue, displayed a conceptual plan, gave a brief overview of the request and made herself available to answer questions. Ms. Howard said that the concept for making it logical to preserve the existing cottage as-is and not alter it to make it functional for a family of five is to leave it alone and instead provide care in the form of color scheme, landscaping, and try to bring it forward into the streetscape and use it as a guest cottage and/or granny flat for either of the Mitchell’s parents, and then to construct a new main dwelling at the

rear of the property on Adella Lane for their families. The space between the existing cottage and the new structure could be used as a joint common outside area. The open space could be aligned with the courtyard of the adjacent property located north of the Mitchell's property so that the neighbor's sunlight is not blocked. Because the lot is sloping toward Adella Lane by about 8 feet, the transition exiting from the existing cottage could be to step down in various terraces to visually tie the two structures together. The new structure would then step down the hill via a split level so that the garage is at the level of Adella Lane. The new structure would be two-story and the second story would be held back both from Adella Lane although not as much as is required by the rear yard second story setback in the current zoning Ordinance. This would require a variance as the current Ordinance requires a second story setback from the rear yard of 26 percent of the lot depth because it is such a deep lot, totaling about 50 feet. Most of Adella Lane has been developed with two story structures so holding the second story back on the new structure by 50 feet would be an anomaly. The concept is to do something that is livable for the Mitchells and yet not overwhelm the original historical cottage.

Commissioner O'Brien asked how many variances were needed, and if a variance was required with the FAR.

Ms. Howard said the variance that is needed relates to the limitation of the first floor being no more than 30 inches above grade, and relief from the second story rear yard setback. The new dwelling is designed with 5 foot side yards rather than 4 foot side yards that are required. They would like to have eaves that approximate the length of the eaves on the existing cottage.

Commissioner O'Brien asked if they will need or require that the existing house be considered an accessory structure because there are two separate kitchen-able units.

Ms. Howard said that because there are two permitted dwellings on the property, they are asking to retain the front house as-is. They are looking at building the new structure at the rear of the property as a replacement for the previously permitted dwelling.

Ms. McCaull added for clarification that there has been one other similar situation. on a property located on the 900 block of J Avenue that was also zoned R-1A. They had two dwellings on the property. The applicants were authorized to demolish the rear structure and rebuild a replacement dwelling. Staff's opinion at that time was that there was no increase in non conformity and the two dwellings were being maintained.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if both houses were proposed to be designated.

Ms. Howard said they are asking for designation of the front existing cottage which includes the entire site.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if it was their intention to save the historic portions of the rear house.

Ms. McCaull displayed photographs of the rear structure to clarify what was being proposed to be demolished. The rear house has no historical value.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked about the entrance to the rear house.

Ms. Howard said that the main entrance to the rear house will be facing the courtyard.

Vice Chair Wilson said that the color needs to be retained on the small house and asked if this could be made a condition for the large house.

Ms. Howard said she would need to speak to the owners regarding the color scheme. If the original colors were to be retained on the historical cottage, there would be some reflection of that in the rear structure. However, they would not want to have the same color scheme on the entire rear structure as the warm red color on an entire two story dwelling would be too much.

Vice Chair Wilson said this color is authentic for the small cottages.

Ms. Howard said the home would look nice with brown shingles and white windows.

Mr. Mitchell said the original color was the classic bungalow brown. The house was nicknamed, "the little brown bungalow." The previous owner, Ms. Goodbody, painted the dwelling a red color in the late 1960's or early 1970's much to the dismay of Katherine McCain, who lived next door at the time. They are currently considering the brown color scheme.

Commissioner Herron asked if the French doors at the rear of the property are original.

Ms. Howard said she believes they are original.

Commissioner Herron asked if the interior of the home reflects the same amount of exterior detail.

Ms. Howard said yes. Other than the kitchen being remodeled in the late 1970s, the remainder of the house has the original built-ins, box beams, wood trims, doors and hardware.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair Wilson said that the structure should be declared historic based on its history, appearance, and minimal alterations.

Commissioner Herron said that the size of the lot is an historic-shaped lot because of its uniqueness. The front home definitely is valuable for its history.

Commissioner O'Brien asked if the color scheme would need to be discussed today.

Chairperson MacCartee said that the applicant would have to return before the Commission if they wished to change the color scheme.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 623 A AVENUE TO BE A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S POLITICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY BEING OWNED BY W.E. INGELOW WHO WAS THE CITY'S TREASURER IN 1912 AND OBVIOUSLY A MAN OF SIGNIFICANT IMPORTANCE;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE BUNGALOW ARCHITECTURAL STYLE WITH UNUSUAL DIAMOND LITE FRENCH CASEMENT WINDOWS, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; AND
- D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, FRED HEILBRON, WHO WAS ALSO THE BUILDER FOR THE NOTED PERCIVAL THOMPSON RESIDENCE LOCATED AT 1156 ISABELLA AVENUE.

VICE CHAIR WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, O'Brien, MacCartee, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

Before the vote was taken, the following discussion ensued among the Commission members:

Chairperson MacCartee announced that this is the 101<sup>st</sup> home to be designated historic. Commissioner Wilson said she had an issue with the color scheme as she feels that the color is an intrinsic part of what the cottage is about.

Commissioner O'Brien suggested giving the applicant the option of retaining the existing color, or using the original color.

Mr. Mitchell said the brown bungalow color scheme is fine. They would like to add some color to the rear house such as tinting the gable ends a green color. He feels that painting the structure brown is not a good idea as it makes the structure look bigger.

Commissioner O'Brien said he had no issues with having the applicant return before the Commission with a color scheme. He was comfortable knowing that the applicant was considering the original color scheme.

Mr. Mitchell suggested returning with the brown color scheme and an alternate color scheme.

Vice Chair Wilson said this arrangement was fine.

Chairperson MacCartee said that this arrangement would not be part of the Resolution as the applicant would be returning before the Commission with the two color scheme options.

### DISCUSSION ITEMS

**HR 14-04**     **CITY OF CORONADO** – Discussion regarding Draft Demolition Permit Review List to replace the existing Ordinance that uses a 75-year criteria as a trigger mechanism for the Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit process. This List includes single family, multiple family, and non-residential properties.

Director McCaull reported that this item was continued from the last meeting in order to review the List. There was discussion regarding changing the name of the List and Mission Statement. The Commission also discussed reviewing 352 and 952 A Avenue to consider whether those properties should be added to the list.

### Public Comment

Bruce Coons, Executive Director, SOHO, 51 Aruba Bend, provided information on the processes used by other cities with regard their inventory list. Mr. Coons suggested naming the list, “Coronado Historic Resource Inventory.”

### Commission Discussion

Commission discussion ensued.

### Commission Action

The Commission agreed to re-name the list, “Coronado Property Review (CPR) List.

With regard to the Mission Statement, three of the Commissioners opted for the first Mission Statement while two Commissioners preferred the second Mission Statement. The Commission agreed to merge the two Mission Statements and will make a decision on the final version at its next meeting.

The Commission proceeded to review the list of potential properties and made a determination as to which properties should be kept, reviewed further, or eliminated from the list.

Director McCaull reported that Gordon Campbell, whose mother is the owner of the commercial property located at 1111 Ninth Street contacted staff on March 1, 2007 and asked if the Commission had taken this property off the list as requested previously in writing and verbally to the Commission at several past meetings. Mr. Campbell is requesting that action betaken as soon as possible regarding his property.

Director McCaull said she advised Mr. Gordon about the process that the Commission uses with regard to these types of requests. Mr. Gordon was told that the Commission would not be

addressing those residents requesting removal of their property from the list until several months from now. Mr. Gordon wanted to express to the Commission his desire for the Commission to take action as soon as possible.

Chairperson MacCartee asked if the Commission would be able to designate the property at a future date if it is removed from the list.

Vice Chair Wilson said that Mr. Gordon felt there was a better chance of selling the property if it could be demolished. If the Commission agrees to remove the home from the list, the building could be torn down. Ms. Wilson said she was not inclined to remove it from the list.

Chairperson MacCartee said the home is historic and she is concerned about removing it from the list.

Commissioner Herron said that if the Commission responds to one letter, they should just place all of the requests on the table. Ms. Herron said she was not prepared to do this.

Commissioner O'Brien said that rather than force the Commission to remove the home from the list, he would rather see the applicant request a Notice of Intent to Demolish permit. At that time, the Commission could forward the request to Council.

Chairperson MacCartee suggested urging Mr. Gordon to wait until the List is complete. Once the List is complete, the City Council will entertain his request.

#### Commission Action

The Commission agreed to visit the residences located at 352, 952 and 953 A Avenue, and 810, 924 (later determined not to exist), 953 and 950 (later determined not to exist) Adella Avenue to determine if these properties should be added to the List.

#### ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:03 p.m.

---

Tony A Peña  
Director of Community Development