HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting March 5, 2008

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m., Wednesday, March 5, 2008, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

MEMBERS PRESENT:	Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, St. Denis, and Wilson
MEMBERS ABSENT:	None
STAFF PRESENT:	Ann McCaull, Associate Planner Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of February 20, 2008 were approved as submitted.

The previously approved minutes of February 6, 2008 were amended to reflect an administrative change to paragraph 9, page 7.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

There was no separate report.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HAP 6-08 **CAROLYN ELLEDGE** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit to modify roof materials for the historically designated residence addressed as 1244 Alameda Boulevard and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On January 7, 2004, the Historic Resource Commission designated this residence as an Historic Resource. In 2006, the City Council approved a Mills Act Agreement for the property. While the owner is not receiving a property tax revenue decrease (home owned prior to Prop. 13), the owner entered into the agreement to further the structure's preservation. One of the planned improvements identified on the Mills Act Agreement was to re-roof the residence. Mrs. Elledge has applied for an Historic Alteration Permit to obtain approval from the Commission to re-roof the residence.

The existing roofing material on the residence is cedar wood shingles and is in poor condition and needs replacement. Mrs. Elledge would like to replace the existing wood shingles with new

wood shingles; however, she is having difficulty locating high quality and affordable roof shingles. As an alternative, she is considering a fiberglass shingle produced by Grand Manor Shingle that would be in a Brownstone color. The application notes that this is the closest material she has found that closely resembles the existing wood shingles. Since this represents a change to the exterior of the Historic Resource, staff determined it would be appropriate to bring this item to the Commission for review, discussion, and action.

The applicant, Carolyn Elledge, 1244 Alameda Boulevard, made herself available to answer questions.

Commissioner Wilson asked if the proposed shingles resemble the original ones.

Ms. Elledge said they do not.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner St. Denis said that the applicant deserves to have a sample of the proposed shingles and suggested that she ask the company to mail her a sample.

Vice Chair O'Brien said he has experience with the proposed Grand Manor shingle. He suggested that the applicant allow the Commission an opportunity to view the same type of shingle on a similar home in Coronado.

Commissioner Wilson asked if the Commission could conditionally approve the proposed shingles based on the Commission viewing the home that Commissioner O'Brien suggested.

Chairperson MacCartee asked the applicant if she would be able to return with a sample.

Commissioner O'Brien opined that the Grand Manor shingle is exactly the right shingle to use on the applicant's home. It was successfully used on the Charlie Chaplin house in Coronado at 10th and Olive.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO ALLOW THE APPLICANT TO RETURN WITH SAMPLE SHINGLE MATERIAL.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, O'Brien, St. Denis, and Wilson
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

HR 14-04 **CITY OF CORONADO** – Consideration of the Draft Coronado Property Review (CPR) List which, if adopted by the City Council, would replace the existing ordinance that uses a 75-year criteria as a trigger mechanism for the Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit process. The CPR List contains single family, multiple family, and non-residential properties.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. This is the second of two hearings the Commission is holding to allow public input and comment. The Commission has reviewed the List over the last several years at the direction of City Council. To date, the List contains about 312 residential properties, 29 non residential and 48 properties that are not 75 years of age. The Commission's recommendation will be reviewed by the City Council, who will then consider adoption of the proposed List. If adopted, there will be additional public hearing with formal amendments to the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Letters from property owners have been received in the past which identify concerns about having their home placed on the list. She has received about 10 telephone calls from interested individuals but no written correspondence stating their opposition to the List.

Chairperson McCaull reiterated that if a home is listed, it does not mean that the home is considered historic. It only means that the home's architecture may contribute to the character of Coronado and there may be incentives available to the buyer which may entice the buyer to preserve and not demolish the property.

PUBLIC COMMENT

William Clemmons, 1204 Glorietta, commented on the Historic Resource Ordinance and requested that his property be removed from the List. He stated that the information about his home derived from SourcePoint is not accurate and should not be the basis for considering his home as a possible historic resource.

Chairperson MacCartee clarified that SourcePoint was an inventory of homes commissioned by the City of Coronado in the 1980's, under the direction of Dr. Ray Brandis of San Diego.

Marjorie Rayhill, 1200 Glorietta, requested that her home be removed from the List, as stated in her letter to the Commission dated March 19, 2007.

John Herman, 1010 E Avenue, said his property is not a single family dwelling; it is comprised of several cottages. He asked that his property be removed from the List.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Director McCaull stated that the Commission must make a determination on whether to forward a recommendation to the City Council regarding the Draft List as-is or with changes, or continue the item to a future date.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked about the architectural style of Mr. Clemmon's home.

Bruce Coons, Director of Save Our Heritage Organization (SOHO), 2476 San Diego Avenue,

said he would consider Mr. Clemmon's home to be an English Cottage as it lacks all the details to be considered a Tudor.

Commissioner Crenshaw said she understands why residents may want their homes removed from the List, but reiterated that by being on the List, the homes are not considered historic. She said she is in favor of forwarding the List to City Council as is.

Commissioner O'Brien said he is in support of forwarding the List to City Council as is and acknowledging the property owners who are requesting that their homes be removed from the list.

Commissioner Wilson suggested that photographs of the homes be included with the List.

Commissioner St. Denis said she would like the List forwarded to City Council as is and reaffirming that the List contains property that the Commission considers to be architecturally significant. She was also in agreement to acknowledge the property owners who wish to remove their property from the List.

Commissioner Wilson said she would like reiterated that the listed properties are potentially historic only.

Mr. Coons explained that the List contains properties that the City would like to look at before they are considered for demolition. He feels that the majority of the listed properties will probably not be designated. At a future date, the property owners will have the opportunity to bring forward information about their home so that a determination can be made with regards to historic designation.

Mr. Clemmons commented that the original Ordinance stated that if a home is determined to meet the criteria to be considered an historic resource during the course of a Notice of Intent to Demolish hearing, the County Office would deed the property as an historic resource. This paragraph in the Ordinance was later changed when the Ordinance was amended.

Director McCaull said the information was incorrect. She clarified that if the Commission held a hearing through the Notice of Intent to Demolish process and the Commission determined the property met the criteria to be deemed an historic resource, that decision would be appealable to the City Council. The City Council would then hold a hearing and if the City Council upheld the Commission's decision, the property would be deemed an historic resource and the document would be recorded.

<u>COMMISSION ACTION</u>

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO FORWARD THE CORONADO PROPERTY REVIEW LIST AND PHOTOGRAPHS TO CITY COUNCIL, NOTING THE 12 OWNERS WHO HAVE REQUESTED REMOVAL FROM THE LIST.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

HAP 3-08 **LASALLE BANK N.A., TRUSTEE OF TRUST NO. 00-2361** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for proposed alterations to the historically designated residence commonly known as the Spreckels Mansion addressed as 1043 Ocean Boulevard and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. The Alteration Permit also requests relief from zoning standards.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda.

PUBLIC COMMENT

XX

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

XX

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 3-08, REQUEST FOR ALTERATIONS AND AN ADDITION TO THE RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 1043 OCEAN BOULEVARD INCLUDING EXCEPTIONS TO THE ZONING STANDARDS AND MINOR ALTERATIONS TO THE REAR STRUCTURE ON THE PROPERTY WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

1. THE PROPOSED RECESSED TERRACE AT THE FIRST BUILDING LEVEL IS NOT PART OF THE PROJECT APPROVAL AND THE OWNER MAY RETURN AT A LATER TIME WITH AN ALTERNATIVE DESIGN.
2. MINIMAL MUNTIN PATTERS SHALL BE USED FOR THE FRENCH DOORS THAT WILL REPLACE THE EXISTING WINDOWS ON THE FRONT FAÇADE OF THE BUILDING.
3. OWNER SHALL RETURN TO THE COMMISSION WITH DETAILS OF PROJECT MATERIALS AND COLORS FOR THE BUILDING.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.

C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, MacCartee, and O'Brien.
NAYS: Commissioners St. Denis and Wilson
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-2.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:05 p.m.

Tony A Peña
Director of Community Development