

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

March 21, 2007

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:10 p.m., Wednesday, March 21, 2007, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, O'Brien and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner  
Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES

The minutes of March 7, 2007, were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director McCaull reported that for the upcoming budget, she requested an increase, for a total budget of \$13,100, to fund additional newsletters, create new brochures and fund other historic resource projects.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Joe Dittler, Director of the Coronado Museum of History and Art, said that the Museum has just purchased a 1923 Model T that was the original Hotel del Coronado's laundry truck. Mr. Dittler became aware of the vehicle through Bruce Coons and Save Our Heritage Organization (SOHO). Colonel Dick Kenny of Coronado, Class of 1938, gifted the automobile to the Museum.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

**HR 2-07**      **JOHN AND PATRICIA KELLEHER** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 550 A Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The Kellehers have owned this property since 1976. The site is 50' wide and 140 deep totaling 7,000 square feet and contains a two-story dwelling with a detached accessory building. The dwelling also contains a small basement and full attic. City records indicate a permit was issued in 1913 to construct a nine room dwelling. The residence is 94 years old. The application provided an historical photograph of the building dating back to 1913, when it was originally constructed. The home appears to be largely intact since its original construction with the exception of windows that

were added along the second story front façade to close in what appears an open covered sun room. It is presumed this work occurred when the 1935 permit was issued. The photograph also notes the home was the residence of Edgar Rice Burroughs and his family who rented the dwelling in 1913. Irwin Rice Burroughs was a noted American novelist responsible for creating the character Tarzan and writing Tarzan of the Apes circa 1912.

The home has a somewhat Craftsman architectural style with its boxy or square appearance, low-pitched gable roof with wide eave overhangs and decorative (false) beams or braces added underneath the gable and eaves. The large front porch is supported by square tapered columns. The home is primarily stucco with decorative wood braces, wood windows and doors. The application notes the majority of windows on the dwelling are original and are a combination of fixed and crank out. The windows along the front façade at the ground floor are partially leaded and the front door has beveled glass. The Historic Inventory completed in the 1980's described the residence as having a "bungalowoid" architectural style and gave this structure an historical value rating of 4. A four indicated the structure was built before 1942; was in fair physical condition or has had modifications to original exterior appearance; cannot be feasibly returned to near original exterior appearance or condition but could be a contributory structure in a potential historic district.

The applicant, Patricia Kelleher, shared the original photograph that Edgar Rice Burroughs took of his wife and daughter in front of their home on September 25, 1913.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair Wilson said she looked at the property and it appears to be representative of its original condition. Ms. Wilson said this home is worth having as an historic representation of this era and type of architecture.

Commissioner Herron said she is pleased to have this house listed on the historic list.

Commissioner O'Brien agreed and said this is a great house to have historically designated.

Commissioner Crenshaw agreed.

Chairperson MacCartee said she hopes that this home will be included on a future newsletter because Irwin Rice Burroughs lived in the home.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR WILSON MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 550 A AVENUE TO BE A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, SOCIAL, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN NATIONAL HISTORY IN THAT EDGAR RICE BURROUGHS, THE AMERICAN NOVELIST RESPONSIBLE FOR CREATING THE CHARACTER TARZAN AND MANY TARZAN ADVENTURE BOOKS LIVED IN THE RESIDENCE IN 1913 A YEAR AFTER HIS FIRST BOOK TARZAN OF THE APES WAS PUBLISHED;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF A CRAFTSMAN BUNGALOW ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; AND
- D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, P.M. HOLT.

COMMISSIONER HERRON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, O'Brien, MacCartee, and Wilson.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

**HAP 4-07**    **SCOTT HELMERS AND ROBIN WOOD** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for historically designated residence addressed as 744 B Avenue and located in the R-1AE (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On December 7, 2005, the Historic Resource Commission designated the single family residence as a historic resource. On December 21, 2005, the Commission approved exterior alterations to the historic residence. These alterations included changing the light fixture on the front of the residence from a Colonial style to a Craftsman style; modifying the front window on the first floor of the building to its original state; changing the exterior paint scheme; replacing the original cedar shakes on the building with new shakes where necessary; replacing roof shingles; and modifying the flat roof line on the second story at the rear of the building to a sloped roof to address drainage issues. On March 1, 2007, the property owners submitted a new Historic Alteration Permit for additional exterior changes proposed to the exterior of the residence.

Dorothy Howard, Architect, 420 H Avenue, gave an overview of the request and made herself available to answer questions. Ms. Howard said that the proposed addition is at the rear of the house behind the ridge line and not visible from the street. The alteration involves expanding both sides of the existing dormer out to the side of the house. It would be expanded out so that the sides would be in line with the side of the first story. She is also doing some interior remodeling on the first floor which would include re-doing the rear elevation of the two story element which was added to the rear of the house, removing the two small double-hungs and the door and replacing it with a large sliding French door out to a new expanded deck. The proposed windows which are only visible from the rear of the home are fiberglass because of the

harsh west exposure. The plan is that the new addition will be shingled and painted with the same casing details as the original house.

Commissioner Herron asked about the clad windows.

Ms. Howard said that the windows are fiberglass and will be painted to match the wood windows.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Herron said she felt the alteration was fine, but said the Commission must keep in mind that changing out windows from wood is not in keeping with the historicity of the home. However, she understands that the windows are located at the rear of the house.

Commissioner O'Brien complimented Ms. Howard on the project. Mr. O'Brien suggested that further research be considered for fiberglass or aluminum clad replacement windows proposed for south facing elements.

Commissioner Crenshaw said she had no issues.

Chairperson MacCartee said it is a fabulous project. She said it is important to make a home look wonderful and still be livable for persons that need more space.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 4-07 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 744 B AVENUE, AS SUBMITTED.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, O'Brien and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

**HAP 5-07** **LORTON AND CAROLYN MITCHELL** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for restoration work to the historically designated property addressed as 623 A Avenue and for the construction of a replacement dwelling at the rear of the site including a request for exceptions to zoning standards for the property located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The residence at 623 A Avenue was designated as an historic resource on March 7, 2007. At the meeting, it was noted that the future owner planned to complete some improvements to the front home as well to construct a replacement dwelling at the rear of the property. Dorothy Howard, architect for the project, presented the conceptual plans to the Commission however no formal action was taken.

On March 8, 2007, an Historic Alteration Permit application was filed with the City. The Alteration Permit proposes restoration work and miscellaneous improvements to the front historically designated residence and plans for the construction of a replacement dwelling at the rear of the property off of Adella Lane. The alteration permit also requests relief for 1) second story rear yard setback requirements; 2) relief for maximum allowable floor height above grade and related story and floor area ratio calculation; and 3) a minor encroachment into the side yard setback.

The front dwelling is proposed to be restored. The wood shingles that are damaged will be replaced to match the existing shingles and the roof will be re-roofed with composition shingles. The windows are proposed to be repaired as necessary so that they are operable. The rear dwelling will be the primary residence on the site. The dwelling is intended to be a “sister” structure to the historic cottage and will compliment the structure through the use of similar architectural style and building materials.

Dorothy Howard, Architect, 420 H Avenue, gave an overview of the request, displayed project materials, color palettes, and renderings, and made herself available to answer questions. Ms. Howard said that the site slopes from A Avenue in scale. The property slopes about 10 feet. The proposal for the new dwelling at the rear of the property is held back toward Adella Lane in order to maintain separation from the original dwelling and provide a common living space for both dwellings, as well as to attempt to align with the neighbors' courtyard/open space in order to minimize blocking sunlight to adjacent neighbors. The existing cottage is painted a faded barn red color. She is proposing to paint and re-roof the existing cottage and do a similar paint job on the new dwelling. Zoning relief is being asked for the second story rear yard setback because the lot is almost 200 feet deep. The rear yard setback would be slightly over 50 feet. In order to hold the second story and maintain the sunlight into the adjacent property, it would be necessary to force the house toward the street, which is not the purpose of the second story rear yard setback. Adella Lane has dwellings that are quite close to the property line, somewhere

between 5 and 15 feet back to the second story. In relation to the surrounding dwellings, the proposed request has quite a bit more relief on the Adella Lane side. Because of the slope of the lot, part of the basement that is toward Adella Lane will be more than 30 inches above grade even though the basement is entirely subgrade once it reaches the courtyard. The concept is to try to keep the distance between the two dwellings so that there is joint use space.

The proposed color scheme is brown with a greenish undertone as the primary body color. She plans to use a window color that is dark red with a creamy white trim on the casings of the windows, and a slightly lighter fascia and rafter tails on underside of the sheathing. Ms. Howard said she feels that this has historical precedent as photographs will show that there were many brown bungalows around town. There were three or four bungalows that had some variation of the proposed color scheme in terms of the brownish body and red windows. The rear house would be a similar set of colors, roofing, and aluminum clad windows in the same color scheme as the front house. The rear house would have the divided light pattern that would mimic the original windows. The applicant is also asking to place a 3-foot high fence along the front property line with an arbor element to attempt to create a sense of entry to the house because the front door to the original cottage is on the side. The proposed paving for the front walkway as well as for the cap of the low fountain that will be in the front yard behind the fence is a burnt red brick color. This will coordinate well with the red color of the window and play off nicely against the siding.

Vice Chair Wilson asked about the location of the fountain.

Ms. Howard said the fountain will be located in front of the window that is most to the right of the front elevation. It is 16 inches high and may not have an actual fountain element but instead be more of a water feature with some water plants.

Commissioner O'Brien asked if the existing trees will be staying.

Ms. Howard said that there are three existing trees that will stay, with the exception of one tree that will need to be removed because it is the location of the proposed secondary arbor element.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

Bob Wurzelbacher, 629 A Avenue, said he has met with the applicant a few times to discuss shared privacy issues. He asked that the method or means of achieving a variance for the floor/basement elevation be accomplished by allowing 25 percent of the basement to exceed this limit by 24 inches. Other than this, he and his wife support the project.

Lorton Mitchell, 517 Adella Lane, said he and Mr. Wurzelbacher met this morning to discuss the privacy issues. The common concern involves both first floors being almost level with on another. There is an artificial grade depression along the side yard. If an 8-foot fence were placed from both of their floor lines, it would actually be a 3 or 3 ½ foot fence. Mr. Mitchell asked if it was possible to add an exception to a slightly higher fence for about 20 feet on the side yard. There would be a 2-foot tall stem wall and an 8-foot fence on top of that; however, the feel and look from either house would be more reflective of a 10-foot fence.

Chairperson MacCartee asked staff if this request was allowed.

Director McCaull said that the manner in which the public hearing was noticed is very broad and provides flexibility in considering the applicant's new request today.

Chairperson MacCartee said the applicant's new request will be taken into consideration.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner O'Brien said he supported the request. Mr. O'Brien said that both Ms. Howard and Mr. Mitchell are professionals who appreciate the project and are taking the steps to preserve a small home on a large lot. He feels that the plan has created a very nice family home for the Mitchells. In addition, the proposed plan takes into account their neighbors on the south side, as well as preserved the trees. The applicants need the variances to accomplish their goals. Mr. O'Brien said that the requested variances are acceptable for the common goal of everyone.

Commissioner Herron said that it is fantastic that they can use the relief to create a better project and a more suitable, private and beautiful dwelling.

Chairperson MacCartee agreed, and said that one of main concerns in town is privacy. She felt that the project has sensitively addressed the issue and has still retained a wonderful historic look.

Director McCaull asked that the applicant clarify the location of the proposed 10 foot fence.

Mr. Mitchell said that the 10-foot fence will begin at the Adella Lane property line and go in about 20 to 60 feet.

### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 5-07, REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR RESTORATION WORK TO THE HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED PROPERTY ADDRESSED AS 623 A AVENUE AND FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF A REPLACEMENT DWELLING AT THE REAR OF THE SITE INCLUDING A REQUEST FOR EXCEPTIONS TO ZONING STANDARDS, AS SUBMITTED, INCLUDING PLACEMENT OF A 10-FOOT TALL FENCE ALONG THE SOUTH PROPERTY LINE APPROXIMATELY 20 FEET TO 60 FEET FROM ADELLA LANE.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.

D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.

VICE CHAIR WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, O'Brien and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

**NOI 2-07**      **LAURIE AND KATHY WILSON** – Notice of Intent to Demolish the single family residence addressed as 817 G Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The site contains a single family dwelling and accessory building on a 7,000 square foot parcel. The owners are requesting that the Commission find the dwelling does not meet the criteria to be deemed historic to allow for demolition of the residence and construction of four dwellings on the site.

City records indicate the dwelling was constructed in 1925 so the residence is 82 years old. The owner and contractor were identified as C.P. Matteson. The architect/designer is not known. No exterior changes have occurred to the building since its original construction. Based upon city permits, it appears at least five families have owned the property. The home has been in the Wilson family since at least 1960.

The home has a Spanish, somewhat Mission, architectural style with a stucco exterior, arched front entry porch, decorative parapet and projecting tiled visor roof, and two large focal windows along the front façade. While the application notes the home is in poor condition, the exterior appears to be in very good condition. Additionally, the condition of the home is not considered when the Commission makes a determination regarding the historical significance of a structure. The architectural style is very reflective of the type of dwelling constructed within the community during the 1920's and while not particularly unusual, is representative of an architectural style that represents the City's developmental history. The application notes that while the residence does represent the Spanish architectural style, there are many remaining examples left within the community.

The applicant, Kathy Wilson, Cardiff by the Sea, said that she and Laurie Wilson are the daughters-in-law of Jim and Pat Wilson who own the family home. There been five generations living on the lot so it is a special lot to them. There are two families that inherited the home. Both her husband and Laurie Wilson's husband are deceased. She and Laurie Wilson are trying to preserve the property for the grandchildren. Laurie Wilson lives in the existing dwelling and another property is needed in order to have two locations so that each family can have a residence. Both Laurie Wilson and her children would like to stay in Coronado. With regard to the condition of the home, there has been no maintenance done to the home in 28 years. In

addition, Laurie Smith cared for their father-in-law for many years and has been at the residence for about eight or nine years.

Vice Chair Wilson said the home is very lovely and it is situated on a very large lot and asked if they had considered adding a second home at the rear of the property.

Ms. Kathy Wilson said it was a consideration but it would not divide the property equally between the two families.

Commissioner O'Brien asked if it was the applicants' intend to build two homes on the property.

Ms. Kathy Wilson said she and Laurie Wilson have not made a decision as to what they can afford to do and what looks good as far as the neighbors are concerned. There is a condominium on one side of the property and zoning is allowed for multiple family living.

Chairperson MacCartee said that if the structure is deemed not historic, there are potential benefits that may be lost. Ms. MacCartee said that rehabilitating or rebuilding a new home has its benefits.

Ms. Kathy Wilson said that she and Laurie Wilson were considering bringing in another investor, building four houses, and then paying the investor off. The property is their collateral because they do not have the type of incomes that would pay a 2 million dollar loan. They are currently talking with a financial advisor.

Chairperson MacCartee asked if the applicants wish to continue the item in order to consider other options.

Ms. Laurie Wilson, 817 G Avenue, said that financially it would be difficult for her to stay on the island because she has been single for 11 years, and it is expensive to keep up the monthly living expenses and potential costs to build another house. The reason that the four houses sounded like a good deal is because they would have the option to sell two units to pay to build two houses for each family. Her children were born and raised in Coronado and they would like to continue living here. Ms. Wilson said that she would not like to see the home demolished but feels that she has no other options if she and her family wish to continue living here.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Herron said that this is one of those quality of life issues and feels that this particular home is a common house in Coronado. Ms. Herron said that approving the request is in the best interest of both homeowners.

Vice Chair Wilson asked how many of these types of homes remain in Coronado.

Commissioner Crenshaw said there are 145 houses that were built between 1921 and 1930. Ms.

Crenshaw said that she hoped the applicants would reconsider but she understands their circumstances. She said that she preferred to see two lots on the property versus four.

Commissioner O'Brien said that the new R-3 scheme allows four houses on two small, narrow lots so he feels this neighborhood is going to change significantly. The structures are sold as single family homes and not as condominiums when in fact they are condominiums. Mr. O'Brien said that he would like to see this house stay.

Commissioner Herron asked if consideration had been given to tax issues.

Director McCaull said that she had discussed this point with the owners because at this time the tax being paid on the property is considerably low. By inheriting the property, it can remain low; however, once new homes go up, the property tax will go up considerably. Ms. McCaull said that she suggested to the applicants that there is the potential that two homes could be built at the rear of the property. The Commission would have the ability to provide relief for the parking for the front home which would generate additional income.

Ms. Kathy Wilson said that Laurie Wilson has been a widow for 10 years and she has been a widow for five-and-a-half years. They have each been raising their two children and it has been a tough road. As much as it is an emotional decision for their respective families, it has been a very difficult decision. However, their financial situation defines their present decision. The homes would also represent a valuable asset for their children to inherit.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 817 G AVENUE (NOI 2-07) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

- B. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S), OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;.
- E. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME).

THE COMMISSION ADDED THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

1. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CITY AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO ALLOW THE CITY AND/OR THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION AN OPPORTUNITY TO PREPARE A PHOTOGRAPHIC FILM, VIDEO, OR OTHER APPROPRIATE RECORD OF THE EXTERIOR/INTERIOR OF THE STRUCTURE.
2. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION (CHA) AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO PROVIDE CHA WITH AN OPPORTUNITY TO SALVAGE HISTORIC MATERIALS FOR THEIR "KEEP IT IN CORONADO" RE-USE PROGRAM.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, and MacCartee.  
NAYS: Commissioners O'Brien, Wilson.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-2.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

**NOI 3-07**      **JOHN G. DOWNS TRUST** – Notice of Intent to Demolish two single family residences addressed as 867-869 B Avenue and located in the R-1A(E) (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. Mollie S. Downs is Trustee of the John G. Downs Trust. Ms. Downs has applied for a Notice of Intent to Demolish permit application on behalf of the Trust. The site contains two detached single story dwellings. The parcel totals 5,600 square feet. The property was recently re-zoned R-1A(E) and would permit one dwelling unit for every 5,250 square feet. (Even at its previous zoning of R-1B, only one dwelling unit would have been permitted on this site).

City records indicate the front dwelling was constructed in 1912 and the rear dwelling was constructed in 1913. The dwellings are 95 and 94 years old, respectively. No exterior changes have occurred to the front residence since its original construction. The rear structure had a porch added to it in 1921 and a garage constructed in 1915. It also appears the rear structure was originally siding and at some point was refinished with stucco. The rear structure appears altered from its original state and also has no particular architectural style.

The original owner of the front home was A. W. Woods. A. W. Woods was also the original owner of the property at 550 A Avenue that is on today's agenda for Historic Designation. It is surmised that A. W. Woods was a land speculator/developer in the community's early 1900's. The original owner of the rear home was L.H. Colby. Both homes were subsequently purchased by J.S. Elwood. It is interesting to note that Mr. Elwood also acquired the adjoining properties at 861-863 B Avenue and 853-857 B Avenue in 1914. (These properties have previously been authorized for Demolition through the City's Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit Review

process). Based upon City permits issued for these properties, Mr. Elwood retained all of these properties until at least 1944. Staff was not able to uncover any information regarding Mr. Elwood. John Downs acquired the property in 1970.

The applicant, Mollie Downs, 1780 Avenida del Mundo, gave an overview of the request and made herself available to answer questions. Ms. Downs displayed photographs of the home which she said is uninhabitable.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

Richard McCampbell, 1309 9<sup>th</sup> Street, expressed concern with density issues.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner O'Brien said the applicants wish to obtain a demolition permit so that they can sell the lot. This is the step they must take in order not to open an escrow with the buyer not knowing what it is he is getting. In order to get organized, the applicant must first obtain the demolition permit. Mr. O'Brien said this request is easier to support because the trade-off is not nearly as difficult.

Chairperson MacCartee said that if a potential buyer wanted to designate the house as an historic resource, the potential buyer could receive many benefits.

Commissioner O'Brien said that the applicant needs to have the demolition permit so that they are not turning their back on all buyers. A smart buyer who sees the opportunity may wish to do something other than demolish the structure.

Chairperson MacCartee said that the structure at that point would have been declared not historic.

Director McCaull said that once the Commission finds that a structure does not meet the criteria to be historic, it cannot be found to be historic at a later date. The only manner this issue has been addressed is when there has not been much information about the historical significance of the structure, the Commission has determined that the home does not meet the criteria to be deemed historic, allowing for the future demolition; however, if new information becomes available regarding the historical significance, the applicant will be allowed to re-apply for designation. This has been done once or twice before.

Chairperson MacCartee stated, in response to earlier public testimony, that the Commission is aware of privacy concerns in Coronado. However, the Commission does not have any purview over what is built once a structure is demolished.

Vice Chair Wilson said that she finds it very surprising that a structure in a R-1A lot has two dwellings. Once the two dwellings are demolished, only one structure may be built. She feels that the only thing wrong with the home is that it has been neglected. Ms. Wilson said it would make more sense to keep the two homes.

Commissioner O'Brien agreed but said that if the applicant is holding a demolition permit, the

market will tell them what is best to do with the house.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 867-869 B AVENUE (NOI 3-07) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, SOCIAL, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S), OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;
- E. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME).

THE COMMISSION AGREED THAT IF NEW INFORMATION BECOMES AVAILABLE REGARDING THE HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESIDENCE AND THE OWNER WISHES TO PURSUE DESIGNATION IN LIEU OF DEMOLITION, THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WILL CONSIDER AN APPLICATION FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION.

THE COMMISSION ADDED THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

- 1. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CITY AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO ALLOW THE CITY AND/OR THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION AN OPPORTUNITY TO PREPARE A PHOTOGRAPHIC FILM, VIDEO, OR OTHER APPROPRIATE RECORD OF THE EXTERIOR/INTERIOR OF THE STRUCTURE.
- 2. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION (CHA) AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO PROVIDE CHA WITH AN OPPORTUNITY TO SALVAGE HISTORIC MATERIALS FOR THEIR "KEEP IT IN CORONADO" RE-USE PROGRAM.

COMMISSIONER HERRON THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, O'Brien, and MacCartee.  
NAYS: Commissioners Wilson.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-1.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

**HRPA 2-07** **MATTHEW AND DENISE HERRON** – Request for an Historic Resource Preservation Agreement for the historically designated property addressed as 1718 Visalia Row and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Commissioner Herron stepped down from the dais as the subject property in discussion is her home.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On April 6, 2005, the Historic Resource Commission designated this property as an historic resource. One of the benefits of having the property designated historic is that the property owner is then eligible to apply to the City of Coronado for an Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement. During the ten-year period of the agreement, the property owner will undertake the following improvements: 1) Replace front porch due to dry rot; 2) Paint exterior of dwelling; 3) Restore garage.

The applicant, Denise Herron, 1718 Visalia Row, gave a brief overview of the request and made herself available to answer questions. Ms. Herron provided copies of photographs and documents that reflected the architects of record to be Hebbard and Gill.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

VICE CHAIR WILSON MADE A MOTION TO FORWARD THE HISTORIC RESOURCE PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION TO THE CITY COUNCIL WITH THE APPROVED LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS FOR 1718 VISALIA ROW (HRPA 2-07) AS FOLLOWS: 1) REPLACE FRONT PORCH DUE TO DRY ROT; 2) PAINT EXTERIOR OF DWELLING; 3) RESTORE GARAGE.

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, O'Brien, MacCartee, and Wilson.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT: Commissioner Herron.

ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

**HR 14-04**     **CITY OF CORONADO** – Discussion regarding Draft Demolition Permit Review List to replace the existing Ordinance that uses a 75-year criteria as a trigger mechanism for the Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit process. This List includes single family, multiple family, and non-residential properties.

The Commission discussed reviewing 352 and 952 A Avenue to consider whether those properties should be added to the list.

The Commission discussed the properties located at 352 and 952 A Avenue. The Commission agreed to keep 352 A Avenue on the list, and remove 952 A Avenue because it was built in 1951 and is not 75 years old.

Public Comment

Bruce Coons, Executive Director, SOHO, 51 Aruba Bend, suggested that the Commission visit the residences located at 155, 175, 555, 671, 765, 825, 855, 973, 1144 (not 75 years of age) Alameda Boulevard.

Commission Discussion

Commission discussion ensued.

Commission Action

The Commission proceeded to review the list of potential properties and made a determination as to which properties should be kept, reviewed further, or eliminated from the list.

Commission Action

The Commission agreed to visit the residences located at 155, 175, 555, 671, 765, 825, 855, 973, 1144 (not 75 years of age) Alameda Boulevard to determine if these properties should be added to the List.

The Commission agreed to visit all properties listed on B and C Avenues for review at the next meeting.

The Commission agreed to combine the A and B list into one list.

**Discussion regarding the Historic Preservation Newsletter**

The Commission agreed to not create a Newsletter at this time due to time constraints.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:26 p.m.

---

Tony A Peña  
Director of Community Development