

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

June 6, 2007

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:05 p.m., Wednesday, June 6, 2007, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner  
Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of May 16, 2007 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director McCaull reported that the Historic Resource Commission meeting of June 20 is cancelled due to a lack of items on the agenda. She asked if the Commission wished to cancel any other meetings during the summer months of July and August. The Commission agreed to cancel the meeting of July 4, 2007.

Director McCaull then reported that historic designation plaques have been ordered and will be presented to homeowners at the City Council meeting of August 7, 2007.

Director McCall also reported that she was asked to give a presentation to the Coronado Association of Realtors regarding the City's Historic Preservation Program on May 30. The meeting was well attended with 70 realtors present.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

**HR 6-07**      **SAMUEL AND JAIME ESTRADA** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 471 G Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The site contains a single story dwelling and detached accessory building. The property is 25' wide x 90' deep totaling

2,250 square feet. The owners have applied for historic designation to preserve the residence and may apply for a Mills Act Agreement in the future.

City records indicate a permit was issued in 1926 for the construction of the residence. The residence is 81 years old. The owner was listed as Hakes Invest Co. and the contractor was identified as G.L. Stone. Minor alterations and upgrades have occurred to the dwelling since its original construction. A bedroom was added to the residence in 1952, an electrical upgrade occurred in 1988, and gas leak repairs occurred in 2001. The windows throughout the residence have been changed; however, a permit was not issued for those modifications. The application notes the home is in good condition and extensive landscaping surrounds the front façade and front yard of the residence.

Hakes Investment Company was a prominent land developer in the 1920's and 1930's. While not an exhaustive list, 1924 and 1925 Coronado newspaper articles reflect 24 homes were built by the Company. The homes on either side of this residence were also built by the Hakes Company. H. B. Hakes is noteworthy as having underwritten the first paving bonds in Coronado allowing the paving of A, B, and C Avenues and First Street. Mr. Hakes also served on the Coronado City Council. The Hakes family still holds several properties within the community today.

The applicant, Jaime Estrada, 471 G Avenue, gave a brief overview and made herself available to answer questions.

Commissioner Herron asked if the stucco is original.

Ms. Estrada said yes.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair Wilson said the home appears to be in very good condition, and she supports the request.

Commissioner Herron agreed but asked that the applicant be required to lace the plantings.

Commissioner O'Brien said he fully supports the request.

Commissioner Crenshaw said she also supports the request.

Chairperson MacCartee said that applicants have been requested to lace the plantings enough so that the home is viewed. However, this request will not be included in the Resolution as she understands that vegetation is needed on Orange Avenue because of traffic noise.

COMMISSION ACTION

VICE CHAIR WILSON MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 471 G AVENUE TO BE A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF A SPANISH BUNGALOW ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; AND
- D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF HAKES INVESTMENT COMPANY.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, O'Brien, MacCartee, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

Chairperson MacCartee announced that this is the 105<sup>th</sup> home to be designated historic.

**HR 8-07**      **NANCY B. CRABILL** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 1115 Loma Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The site contains a two-story single family dwelling and detached garage and guest quarters at the rear of the property. The site is 40' wide and 140' deep containing 5,600 square feet. The owner has applied for historic designation to preserve the residence for the future. Ms. Crabill has authorized her daughter, Carol Clark, to represent her with this application.

City records indicate a permit was issued in 1925 for the construction of a two story English stucco dwelling and garage. The residence is 82 years old. The owner was listed as Stanley Woodman and the contractor was identified as Oscar Dorman. Minimal alterations have occurred to the dwelling since its original construction.

The residence has been owned by only one family. The original owner, Herbert Stanley Woodman, was a Commander in the Navy and was also an attorney and real estate broker. The property was sold to Captain and Mrs. Charles H. Crabill in 1945. Mrs. Crabill was Woodman's daughter.

The home was built by noted builder Oscar Dorman. Mr. Dorman constructed over 70 homes between 1920 and 1930 within the community. The 1925 local newspaper identifies Mr. Dorman as having constructed at least six stucco dwellings that year.

The application notes that the two-story home has a full attic with stucco exterior, steep gable roof, and leaded casement windows. The entrance to the residence is along the side façade and a large brick chimney is a predominate feature along the front façade. The residence is described as having a “Cotswold cottage” architectural style. A more common name of Costwold cottage is English country cottage. Prominent architectural features of these cottages include steep, cross gables, casement windows with small panes, brick stone or stucco siding, and a massive chimney dominating the front or side façade. The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980’s gave this property a historical value rating of 2. A two indicated the structure was built before 1942; was in excellent physical condition; was almost entirely unmodified from original exterior appearance; had substantial architectural significance; and would qualify as a contributing structure to a potential historic district. Several structures within the vicinity have been designated historic resources and there is great potential for a possible historic district to be created in this area.

The applicant, Nancy Crabill, 1115 Loma Avenue, made herself available to answer questions. Ms. Crabill said she has lived in the home since she was eight years old. She remembers the Glorietta neighborhood was known as the “flats” and animals like cows, goats and chickens were permitted in her neighborhood. She recalled that her family arrived in Coronado in 1922 and lived in a home at the corner of 10<sup>th</sup> and D Avenue. Unfortunately, when she was still quite young, her father died in an accident that occurred while he was making gin during the Prohibition, and her mother subsequently re-married.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

Susan Keith, 801 Toleda Avenue, said she supports the historic designation request. Ms. Keith said the house is wonderful and the neighborhood is spectacular. She understands that the neighbors are very interested in designating the district as historic.

Carl Jennings, 1135 Loma Avenue, said he has lived next door to the Crabills since 1971, and supports the historic designation request.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Crenshaw said the home is absolutely exquisite, thanked the applicant, and said she supports the request.

Commissioner O’Brien agreed that this is a terrific house in a great neighborhood.

Commissioner Herron thanked the applicant and said she looks forward to having this be the first district to be historically designated.

Vice Chair Wilson said she supports the request and hopes this will be the first historically designated district.

Chairperson MacCartee said this home is a gift to the City and thanked the applicant for requesting that her home be designated.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 1115 LOMA AVENUE TO BE A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH COMMANDER STANLEY AND H.S. WOODMAN WHO WERE PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE COSTWOLD (ENGLISH COUNTRY) COTTAGE ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; AND
- D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, OSCAR DORMAN.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, O'Brien, MacCartee, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

Chairperson MacCartee announced that this is the 106<sup>th</sup> home to be designated historic.

**HAP 8-07 FRED AND PATTI LAU** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for proposed addition to historically designated residence addressed as 624 First Street and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from zoning standards.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The residence at 624 First Street was designated as an historic resource in September of 2006. The residence was noted as architecturally significant due to its Dutch Colonial Revival architectural style with a prominent Gambrel roof; the notable work of the Jessop & Sons construction company; and identified with persons significant in local history since the Jessop family built several homes along First Street and were the owners of Jessop and Sons Jewelers in San Diego.

At the designation hearing, it was noted that the owners planned to complete some improvements to the residence in the future. Kevin Rugee, architect for the project, presented the conceptual plans to the Commission however no formal action was taken. The site is located on the corner of First Street and G Avenue. The alteration permit proposes the addition of 676 square feet on the first floor and an additional 242 square feet on the second story of the residence. When completed, the project will have a 29% lot coverage and a 39% floor area ratio which complies with zoning standards.

On the first floor of the residence, a new master bedroom is proposed to be added at the rear of the structure along the north property line. A new kitchen is proposed along the side of the residence facing G Avenue. The zoning ordinance requires a 12'6" side yard setback along G Avenue and the alteration permit requests a two-foot encroachment into this standard to allow a 10'6" setback. A new raised porch is proposed at the rear of the residence that essentially connects the kitchen and master bedroom additions.

On the second floor of the residence, a new bedroom is proposed above the new kitchen. This bedroom would have two new balconies. One balcony would face First Street and the second balcony would overlook the rear yard. Along the second story rear elevation, modifications are proposed to the roof line. The two gable-paired roofs will be eliminated and changed to a solid ridge line with one gable roof. The application notes that project materials and details will match existing conditions.

Director McCaull commented that she has added a condition in the Resolution which requires that before the applicants order any windows or doors, they must provide an example of the materials to staff to ensure that the order is consistent with the expectations of the Commission.

The applicant's representative, Kevin Rugee, 1024 Isabella Avenue, gave a brief overview of the request and made himself available to answer questions. Mr. Rugee said the applicants have owned this beautiful home for about 15 years. The applicants hired Mr. Rugee about one year ago to do some expansion work. He said the difficulty from a design standpoint was attempting to tie in the new roof structure with the existing gambrel roof. He feels the proposed design is the best possible solution for the applicants and the community in that the design will complement what currently exists. Overall, he feels this will be a great project.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Herron said she was glad that the gambrel roof was re-done as the roofs all tie in. She said she always has a difficult time in approving the enlargement of a second floor; however, the size is in keeping with the lot. She added that persons who want to update their homes have the right to do so, so long as it is tastefully done.

Commissioner O'Brien said he was fully in support of the request. He said he drove by the house this afternoon and given the size of the house and lot and the gambrel roof challenge, he understands that the applicants and the architect had to spend much time on this project to get to

this point. Mr. O'Brien feels that they have done a special job with this house.

Chairperson MacCartee said this was an extraordinarily sensitive project. She said the bones of the house are still there and one cannot tell the house has been added on to. She also clarified that if the applicants were to apply for Mills Act in the future, the alterations would be taken into consideration and would probably affect their placement on the list. She then added that the Commission would love it if the tree could be saved.

Dr. Fred Lau, 624 First Street, said they have owned the house for 15 years. The house is very special to their family and they have worked closely with Mr. Rugee. Mr. Lau said that the tree will be moved to another location on the property.

Commissioner Crenshaw said the home is one of her very favorite. She understands that this home has won many awards for its garden. She congratulated the applicant and his family for maintaining a beautifully visible home on First Street.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 8-07 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR PROPOSED ADDITION TO HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 624 FIRST STREET, AND GRANT RELIEF FROM ZONING STANDARDS.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION INCLUDING A 2' REDUCED STREET SIDE YARD SETBACK WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, O'Brien, MacCartee, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

**HAP 9-07 GREG AND MELINDA SMITH** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for restoration work to the historically designated residence addressed as 1313 10<sup>th</sup> Street and located in the R-1AE (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On November 5, 2003, the Historic Resource Commission designated this residence as a historic resource. The structure was noted as historically significant due to its Southern California architectural style and for being designed by noted architect Richard Requa.

The McDermott's, who originally applied for historic designation, subsequently sold the house to the present owners in 2004. Greg and Melinda Smith are proposing interior and exterior restoration work along with some interior remodeling to the residence. Kevin Rugee is the architect for the project and has submitted a detailed application and plans outlining the proposed project.

While the project plans are very detailed and identify the amount of interior restoration, remodeling, and upgrades that will occur with the project, interior improvements to the residence are not under the purview of the Commission. The Commission's review authority applies to the exterior of the residence. To that extent, the majority of work that will be undertaken is simply restoration. Exterior stucco repair will occur as necessary; existing wood windows and doors that are not operable will be replaced; the two-piece clay tile roofing will be replaced where necessary; balcony railing will be repaired or replaced; the existing trellis at the front of the residence will be removed; a new wrought iron gate is proposed for the front entry; and a door along the north elevation will be changed to windows while a previously enclosed window will be returned to a window.

The original owners applied for a Mills Act Agreement in 2003 and it is slated for approval this year. Given the list of items the applicants are undertaking, it is a substantial improvement to the residence.

The applicant's representative, Kevin Rugee, 1024 Isabella Avenue, gave a brief overview of the request and made himself available to answer questions. Mr. Rugee said that the applicants are trying to return the house to a working condition. They are not proposing to add any square footage. Mr. Rugee clarified that there is currently a wrought iron gate that was added to the house. The original Requa drawings he obtained from the applicants showed the house originally had a wooden gate. They are planning to remove the wrought iron gate on 10<sup>th</sup> Street and build a new wooden gate to match the original one. Mr. Rugee mentioned that he had planned on returning at a later date with a landscape plan. He plans to re-do the landscaping on the courtyard. As part of the landscaping, the applicants would like to add an outside fireplace,

grill, and a small spa. Mr. Rugee has developed a plan and hoped to obtain preliminary approval from the Commission today. The applicant would like to add a small fireplace that would encroach into the existing five-foot setback along the alley. Mr. Rugee would like to add gates to an 8-foot wall along the alley property line in order to have access to pool equipment. They are also proposing to add some gravel walkways, herb gardens, flowers, and roses. They are not planning to increase the size of the patios. Mr. Rugee asked if the Commission would allow the applicant to encroach into the alley setback with a fireplace, grill and pool equipment, and cut a hole in the wall for some gates.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if the applicant was requesting variances on the proposal that was submitted earlier (other than the one being requested today).

Mr. Rugee said he was not asking for other variances.

The applicant, Greg Smith, 1313 10<sup>th</sup> Street, thanked the Commission and added that a bench which was originally located in front of the house and was subsequently moved into the interior courtyard would be returned to its original location.

Mr. Rugee added that with regard to the colors, any type of roof tile will match the existing two-piece clay tile roof, the windows will be painted blue to match the other windows, the existing railings in the interior courtyard and some wrought iron potting (grill work) are painted a faded blue but will be painted a dark brown or black color, and the stucco will be painted and patched and will remain a classic white color.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson MacCartee asked about the alley setback request.

Director McCaull said the manner in which the project was noticed in the newspaper, it called for an alteration permit and did not identify a request for exceptions to the zoning ordinance. If the applicant is requesting for exceptions to the Code, the plans submitted today would have to come back for the Commission's approval so that appropriate notification could be completed. Ms. McCaull said the Commission may give the applicant some preliminary comments but no action could be taken today.

Chairperson MacCartee asked if the issue regarding the color of the railings had to return before the Commission.

Director McCaull said the applicant described that the planter railings would be dark brown or black to look like wrought iron. If the Commission is comfortable with the request, that issue would not need to return before the Commission. The applicant said the color of the trim on the windows would match the existing windows. Ms. McCaull said if the Commission desired that these issues be handled administratively, that could be done.

Vice Chair Wilson said she felt this was a very happy solution. She has no issues with the request for the alley setback request and felt that all the changes that were mentioned in the report certainly comply with making this house retain its historic look.

Commissioner Herron said she was happy that the house is a Requa revived and is in pristine condition. She is very pleased and has no issues with the alley setback request.

Commissioner O'Brien said he is fully in support of the request. He has no issues with the alley setback request and said he would support the (landscaping) request which will return at a future date.

Commissioner Crenshaw said the house is absolutely exquisite and she loved looking at the original plans. She looks forward to seeing the gorgeous tile in the patio. In addition, she had no issues with the request for the alley setback.

Chairperson MacCartee agreed and said that the Commission was giving the applicant a preliminary "thumbs up" on the alley setback although no action can be taken on this issue today. With regard to the color, the Commission agrees that staff will handle this matter administratively, so it will not be included in the Resolution.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 9-07 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR RESTORATION WORK TO THE HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 1313 10<sup>TH</sup> STREET AND LOCATED IN THE R-1AE (SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL) ZONE.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, O'Brien, MacCartee, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

**NOI 6-07**      **MERRI M. MCMAHON TRUST** – Notice of Intent to Demolish the single family residences addressed as 520 Glorietta Boulevard and located in the R-1A CC1 (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The property is in escrow and the owner has authorized the potential buyer, Jose Garcia, to file a Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit application with the City. Mr. Garcia has authorized Tim Seaman to represent him through the application process and public hearing.

City records indicate the dwelling was constructed in 1915 so the residence is 92 years old. The owner was identified as S. Kipp and the contractor was noted as the Davis Bros. A permit was issued in 1943 for repairs and alterations to the dwelling. A subsequent permit was issued to Mrs. Parker in 1947 for interior alterations to the dwelling. No other permits were issued for the dwelling until 1998 when an electrical upgrade permit was issued to the Ezra Parker Family Trust.

The subject property was part of a large area of land owned by the Parker Family. The land (48,000 sq. ft.) was subdivided in 1999 and sold to individual family members and various parties. Richard Parker, owner of the property at 508 Glorietta, served on the Coronado City Council from 1968 to 1974 and as Mayor during that time from 1971 to 1972. The residence is surrounded by extensive landscaping and is fairly difficult to view from the public right-of-way.

The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave this building a historical value rating of 4. A rating of 4 indicated the structure was built before 1942; was in fair physical condition or has had modifications to original exterior appearance; cannot be feasibly returned to near original exterior appearance or condition but could be a contributory structure in a potential historic district; and was representative of a unique or scarce style.

The applicant's representative, Tim Seaman, 421 Date Avenue, Imperial Beach, gave a brief overview of the request, showed photographs of the existing house on the property, and made himself available to answer questions.

Commissioner O'Brien asked if the applicant will be living on the property.

Mr. Seaman said that the applicant plans to live on the property.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

George Behr, 522 Glorietta, said he lives next door to the subject property. He stated that although he has not met Mr. Garcia, he understands that the house is in very poor condition. He said he supports the request and looks forward to having a beautiful home next to his home.

Dr. Patricia Behr, said she is the property manager (and twin sister) of the current property owner. She said her sister must sell the property because her sister was diagnosed with cancer. Ms. Behr said she fell in love with the property when she first saw it. She said the backyard is incredible – it has beautiful trees and plantings. She definitely supports the request.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Crenshaw said she felt that demolition in this case may be a better idea than salvaging it. She said the property is barely visible and does not meet any of the criteria to be considered an historic resource. She stated she would support the request.

Commissioner O'Brien said he also supports the request.

Commissioner Herron said she has heard about the gardens in the backyard and understands that Mr. Garcia would like to build a fairly large home on the lot which would encroach on the gardens. Ms. Herron said she approved the demolition of the home but hoped that it would be sensitive to the surrounding area and to the neighbors.

Ms. Behr clarified that the backyard trees are located on the peripheral part of the property and will not be located near the proposed structure.

Ms. McCaull added that the City does not regulate the removal of trees on private property so it is entirely possible the applicant may choose to remove the trees.

Mr. Seaman said that the applicant would very much like to retain the trees due to privacy issues.

### COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 520 GLORIETTA (NOI 6-07) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AS AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTIES DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

- A. IT DOES NOT EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, AESTHETIC, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL

- STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;
  - E. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME).

THE COMMISSION ADDED THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

- 1. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CITY AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO ALLOW THE CITY AND/OR THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION AN OPPORTUNITY TO PREPARE A PHOTOGRAPHIC FILM, VIDEO, OR OTHER APPROPRIATE RECORD OF THE EXTERIOR/INTERIOR OF THE STRUCTURE.
- 2. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION (CHA) AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO PROVIDE CHA WITH AN OPPORTUNITY TO SALVAGE HISTORIC MATERIALS FOR THEIR "KEEP IT IN CORONADO" RE-USE PROGRAM.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, O'Brien, MacCartee, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

#### DISCUSSION ITEMS

**HR 14-04**     **CITY OF CORONADO** – Discussion regarding Coronado Property Review (CPR) List to replace the existing Ordinance that uses a 75-year criteria as a trigger mechanism for the Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit process. This List includes single family, multiple family, and non-residential properties.

The Commission proceeded to review the list of potential properties and made a determination as to which properties should be kept, reviewed further, or eliminated from the list.

Public Comment

Bruce Coons, Executive Director, SOHO, 51 Aruba Bend, suggested that the Commission visit residences located on H Avenue, I Avenue, J Avenue, and Isabella Avenue.

Commission Discussion

Commission discussion ensued.

Commission Action

The Commission agreed to visit the residences located at 155, 200, 210, 216, 250, 258, 305, 320, 412, 428, 474, 579, 600, 630, 775, 842, 915, 917, 928, 942 H Avenue, and 114, 165, 568, 796, 955, 930, 931 I Avenue, and 141, 225, 300, 315, 323, 500, 654, 676, 711, 727, 754, 810, 845, 908, 930, 931, 936 J Avenue, and 1012, 1016, 1020, 1024, 1027, 1101 Isabella, to determine if these properties should be added to the List.

The Commission also agreed to visit all properties listed on Jacinto Place, Loma Avenue, Margarita Avenue, Marina Avenue, Miguel Avenue, Monterey Avenue, Ninth Street, and Ocean Boulevard.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:27 p.m.

---

Tony A Peña  
Director of Community Development