

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

June 21, 2006

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:05 p.m., Wednesday, June 21, 2006, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Keith.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson.

MEMBERS ABSENT: None.

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of June 7, 2006 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

There was no separate Director's report.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Nancye Splinter, 1027 G Avenue, spoke regarding the need to update the criteria on the Mills Act Program.

Commissioner Draper read from an article called, *The Tear Down Wars*, that appeared in the New York Times which unfavorably mentioned Coronado. It read, "California overhauled its building codes for single family homes placing stricter limits on design as well as the size of the house relative to the lot." Ms. Draper felt it was unfavorable because it mentions that the tear down war is in Coronado and we are part of a losing battle.

Vice Chairperson MacCartee reported that on June 25, the Cottage Conservancy will hold an Open House from 1 to 3 p.m., at 710 Adella Avenue.

Commissioner Wilson reported that the Coronado Library has a wonderful exhibit on the Cottage Conservancy.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HRPA 5-06 **KEN STORUM** – Request for a Historic Resource Preservation Agreement for the historically designated property addressed as 561 C Avenue and located in the R-1A(E) (Single Family Residential) Zone.

The Commission continued this item to allow the applicant and/or his representative to be present at the meeting to address any issues the Commission may have.

HAP 9-05 **1906 LODGE AT CORONADO BEACH** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit modifications to previously approved site plan and addition of covered rear porch for the historically designated property addressed as 1060 Adella Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential).

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On August 17, 2005, the Commission designated the Trant Manor Lodge as an historic resource and subsequently issued alteration permits for the property allowing for restoration to the main building, construction of two-story bungalows surrounding the building, reduction in setbacks and parking relief, and approval of new landscape accessory features. The applicant is requesting additional modifications to the project including removal of the covered pergola that was proposed along A Avenue that connected the historic building with the new bungalows and was to be used for outdoor seating and dining. The applicant has determined that a more convenient location for guests to sit and dine would be immediately north of the dining room at the rear of the building. In its place, a new 8' wooden fence would be located along the property line. The second change involves the removal of the existing covered porch structure at the rear of the building which will accommodate the relocated seating and dining area. The covered porch would run the entire width of the existing building façade and project north from the building about 8 to 9 feet. The covered porch would have a zero side yard setback as previously proposed for the pergola. In addition, minor changes are being proposed to the overall site plan for the project which would create additional open space within the courtyard. The applicant will be returning before the Commission at a future date with the final design for the open space and a detailed landscape plan.

The applicant, Sue Gillingham, 649 Pomona Avenue, gave a brief overview of the proposed request.

Commissioner Draper asked about the height of the proposed wooden fence.

Ms. Gillingham confirmed the height would be 8'.

Commissioner Draper asked if a shed that was attached to the lodge would be removed.

Ms. Gillingham confirmed that area is the proposed site for the dining area.

Commissioner Wilson asked about the retention of an expert to advise the applicant on whether these changes met the guidelines for national trust, and whether the expert is a local attorney.

Ms. Gillingham said that approval initially goes to the State and they have passed two of the three criteria to give the Lodge a national designation. The next step is to submit the final plans. The expert was retained to advise whether the alterations would endanger the designation; it was in the expert's legal opinion that it would not.

Vice Chair MacCartee stated that she has worked with the expert, Marie Burke Lia, and she is a historic preservation attorney, who crafted the original historic Ordinance for the City of Coronado. Her expertise in her field is something that she trusts.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Wilson said she is concerned about having the pergola removed and replacing it with an 8' high wooden fence. In addition, she feels that courtyards should be visible to the public in the spirit of what the specific plan has been.

Commissioner Herron said that this is an excellent project for Coronado. Turning a boarding house into a lodge is a plus for that area. She has no objections to the removal of the pergola and appreciates the porch being added for guest privacy. She hopes that the 8' fence will not be solid.

Vice Chair Maccartee agrees and trusts that the fence will be in keeping with the sensitivity of this project. She also feels confident that the property will remain in the spirit that it was, especially since Marie Burke Lia has stated that, "the new construction will not destroy historic materials, features or spatial relationships that characterize this property."

Commissioner Draper said she did not have an issue with the porch but did share concern about the fence, especially if it is 8' high and solid.

Chairperson Keith stated that the Commission appears to not have an issue with the porch but there is a concern about removing the pergola and creating a fence.

Ms. Gillingham said they are trying to balance the privacy of the guests with an attractive property from the street. No final decision has been made on the material for the fence. She understands the need for aesthetics and appreciates the input from the Commission.

Chairperson Keith said she had no issues with the porch and the proposed additions and feels it is in keeping with the property and the needs of guests.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 9-05 HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT AS SUBMITTED FOR MODIFICATIONS TO PREVIOUSLY APPROVED SITE PLAN AND ADDITION OF COVERED REAR PORCH. THE APPLICANT WILL RETURN WITH DETAILED PROJECT MATERIALS AND COLOR BOARD FOR THE EXISTING AND PROPOSED BUILDINGS AND COVERED PORCH; DETAILED LANDSCAPE PLANS FOR BOTH PRIVATE AND PUBLIC LANDSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS; DETAILED SIGN AND LIGHTING PROGRAM FOR THE BUILDING; FINAL DESIGN FOR THE FENCE; AND MODIFIED HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT IF ANY FURTHER EXTERIOR CHANGES ARE PROPOSED.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

CHAIRPERSON KEITH SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

HAP 4-06 **JIM AND MELINDA MARLAR** – Preliminary review and comment on proposed addition to Historically Designated single family residence addressed as 465 Palm Avenue and located in the R-3 Multiple Family Residential Zone. The alteration would require zoning exceptions to the front and side yard setback requirements.

Commissioner Draper stepped down from the dais as she lives within 300 feet of the affected property under discussion.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The Commission has established a policy to allow for preliminary review applications to be filed with the City to allow property owners to submit potential projects to the Commission for early input and comment. These preliminary applications are handled in the same format as formal applications including a public hearing and notification to all property owners within 300' of the project. This home was designated as an historic resource on April 18, 2000. On the ground floor of the residence, the kitchen, bathroom and bedroom are proposed to be expanded. The increased square footage will be about 69 square feet. The garage is also proposed to be enlarged to create a conforming size parking space. The garage addition will be 23 square feet. The second story additional totals 868 square feet which will include two bedrooms and two new bathrooms. Once a home has been designated as an historic resource, one of the benefits of designation is that the property owner is entitled to apply for exceptions to the Code that would normally not be permitted. It is a policy decision for the Commission as to the extent of flexibility provided in zoning regulations to a historic resource and site. The subject property is fairly small, containing 3,313 square feet. It is triangular shaped with street frontage on Palm Avenue, 5th Street, and E

Avenue. The front setback requirement along E Avenue is 16'6" and the applicant is requesting a reduced setback of about 7'. The garage is nonconforming and the applicant would like to expand the depth of the existing garage to provide a functional single car garage space. The expansion would have a zero side yard setback along the interior side property line requiring relief from the zoning ordinance. Additionally, the architect would like to raise the roof line to provide a shed roof along the front façade of the garage so that it is more compatible in scale with the second story addition. This work would involve new construction and some relief from the Code. The Spanish architectural style would be retained with the addition. The Commission must consider whether the alterations would appear to meet the criteria to be issued an alteration permit, and secondly, whether zoning exceptions to the Code would be reasonable.

The applicant, Melinda Marlar, 465 Palm Avenue, said she and her husband have been working with Kevin Rugee, architect, since October. They currently reside in Tucson, Arizona and this has been their second home for about 40 years. They would like to make this home livable so that they can retire here.

Kevin Rugee, Architect, 1024 Isabella Avenue, gave an overview of the proposed project and made himself available to answer any questions.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair MacCartee said that the Commission supports making homes livable for homeowners. She expressed concern that because the criteria for the Mills Act Program may change, the applicant may not receive benefits as quickly as anticipated.

Ms. Marlar said it would not be an issue.

Commissioner Wilson said she did not have an objection to the proposed setbacks for the garage or any other changes as long as the outside of the home is preserved. She asked about the size of the property.

Ms. Marlar confirmed that the home has about 1,250 square feet of living space.

Commissioner Herron asked about the square footage after the addition to the home.

Mr. Rugee said that the total proposed footage is 2,189. Because it is in the R-3 zone, the deduction of the garage is still allowed.

Chairperson Keith said that because the lot and its use are irregular, she supports the proposed plans. Further, the Commission appears to be supportive of the proposed alterations as delineated on the plans, while still preserving the architectural elements as enumerated by the owner.

COMMISSION ACTION

No action was taken on this item.

NOI 4-06 **DUTCH AND MARGARET SWAGEMAKERS:** – Consideration of Notice of Intent to Demolish the apartment complex addressed as 936-954 Avenue and commonly known as Granada Court and located in the R-3 (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. This property has been owned by the property owners since 1974 and is fairly substantial in size with 125' of frontage along C Avenue totaling 17,500 square feet. The site contains six detached single story bungalows located around a central courtyard with a two-story structure at the rear of the property that contains four units. A total of 10 units exist on the property. If the property were developed, a total of 11 units could be permitted. The City previously received a request for historic designation and prior to the public hearing, they were notified by the applicant to defer the item. Subsequently, the property owners decided that they did not want to proceed with historical designation and filed a Notice of Intent to Demolish permit application with the City. City records indicate a permit was issued in 1925 for the construction of the complex; it is 81 years old. The original owner and contractor was Paul Carle. The central courtyard for the apartments was designed by Kate Session's nephew and the Coronado Flower Show also provides the Paul Carle Memorial Trophy" as an award for horticultural excellence. Very few alterations have occurred to this complex. A garage was added to the property in 1931. The Granada Court has a Mission Revival Court architectural style with box shaped structures and flat roofs. The buildings have a stucco exterior, wood windows and gabled hoods over the entries. Research indicates that the "court" architectural style was prominent in the teens, twenties, and thirties. The courts were conceived in Southern California in 1901 by Arthur S. Heineman. These courts were uniquely suited to the climate and was a physical and cultural expression of the Craftsman Movement with design features emphasizing the low and horizontal, and also allowed families of more moderate means to enjoy the outdoors together while still retaining their own completely autonomous detached homes. Very few "courts" remain within our community today. Only five in Coronado closely resemble this location. The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave the complex a historical value rating of 2, which indicates it had significant historical value, the structure was in excellent physical condition, was not substantially altered, and had substantial architectural significance.

Chairperson Keith explained the requirements for demolition requests for homes that are older than 75 years of age.

The applicant, Dutch Swagemakers, P.O. Box 181404, said that he has taken care of his properties inside and outside but is no longer able to maintain his properties because of health reasons.

Commissioner Wilson asked if Mr. Swagemakers has offered the property to any one else other than the City.

Mr. Swagemaker said that he has offered to sell his property but has not received an acceptable offer and because of contingencies. He has not had the property declared an historical resource

because he has been unable to sell his home. His other options are to demolish his property, and rebuild, because it would be more cost effective.

Margaret Swagemaker said that her husband is upset because of an intimidating call they received from Mark Johnson, who claimed be speaking on behalf of the Cottage Conservancy.

Vice Chair MacCartee clarified that Mark Johnson is not authorized to speak on behalf of the Cottage Conservancy and had no right to make any telephone calls on behalf of the Cottage Conservancy. She did not want the public to see the Cottage Conservancy in a negative light.

Chairperson Keith stated that the Commission will be making a determination today as to whether the property is historic or not historic. The Commission will not be discussing the financial side of any agreement as it is not in their purview.

Ms. Swagemaker asked that the property be demolished because she does not feel that the property is historic.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Story Vogel, 350 D Avenue, said that the Swagemakers have been wonderful stewards of the apartment complexes for 34 years. He feels that Coronado owes Mr. Swagemaker a debt of gratitude for taking care of the complex for so many years. He feels that they could benefit from additional information regarding the historic resource process. He feels that the property is historic and hopes the home will be designated.

Alana Coons, 51 Aruba Bend, on behalf of Save Our Heritage Organization (SOHO), stated that they believe the bungalow court to be historic. The Swagemakers have been great stewards of the property.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Keith reviewed the criteria used to determine if a structure is historic.

Commissioner Draper said the courtyard is 81 years old and meets the criteria to be designated historic.

Vice Chair MacCartee said that she respects Mr. Swagemaker for his dedication in preserving the court for so many years. She thanked the Swagemakers for 30 years of taking care of this fabulous oasis in Coronado. She has also seen the architectural renderings for Granada Court, and feels that if they work together, they can come to some solution. She agrees that this is an historical property.

Commissioner Wilson said she is grateful for the opportunity to have this Court and agrees that the structure is historic.

Commissioner Herron agrees that the structure is historic.

Chairperson Keith agrees that the structure is historic. The Commission is in great gratitude to

the Swagemakers for their diligence and their work in preserving the structure. It is a wonderful example of a Southern California courtyard.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON HERRON MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 936-954 C AVENUE (NOI 4-06) DOES MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S), OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY AS PAUL CARLE WAS RECOGNIZED FOR HIS EXCELLENCE IN HORTICULTURE AND A RESPECTED MEMBER OF THE COMMUNITY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF A CRAFTSMAN BUNGALOW ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; THE COURT WAS A PHYSICAL AND CULTURAL EXPRESSION OF THE CRAFTSMAN MOVEMENT WITH DESIGN FEATURES EMPHASIZING THE LOW AND HORIZONTAL, THE OPEN AND THE CAREFULLY HANDMADE;
- D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER AND DESIGNER, PAUL CARLE.

VICE CHAIR MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

NOI 5-06 **JEANNE L BECK TRUST**: – Notice of Intent to Demolish the single family residence addressed as 300 First Street and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. Barry L. Beck is the trustee of the trust. The site contains a single story dwelling and detached garage. The property is oddly shaped with 102' of street frontage along First, 50' of street frontage along Alameda, and 73' of frontage along Palm Avenue. The site contains about 10,132 square feet. The owner indicates the residence is in poor physical condition and he is financially unable to complete the repairs necessary to maintain the residence. He is requesting the Commission determine that the home does not meet the criteria which would allow future demolition of the residence and sale of the property. City records indicate that a sewer permit was issued in 1901 for connection to the City's public sewer system. There are no records indicating when the home was built although building permits exist which indicate this home was on the 1903 Lot Book; the structure is estimated to be at least 103 years old. It is interesting to note that the residence across the alley located at 320 First Street, similar in architect style, was owned by the same property owner in the 1920's, Arthur Simpson. Few alterations have occurred to the building since its original construction. Re-roof permits were issued in 1928 and 1937; bedroom and bath repairs were made in 19545; foundation and concrete slab repairs were completed in 1949; plumbing improvements occurred in 1965; and the building's sewer connection was upgraded in 1978; hardwood floors were installed in the 1960's; repairs in the existing back porch wood deck in 1979; roof repairs in 1981. The application notes that the structure has a beach house architectural style with large covered porch, redwood exterior and single pane sash windows; is in poor condition and in need of extensive repairs; deterioration of the foundation's structural support of the walls and damage to structural supports of roof and roof; presence of mold deep in the wood walls throughout the house and wood rot to the house windows; electrical and plumbing need complete replacement as well as the roof of the dwelling. The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave this building an historical value rating of 2, which indicates it had fairly significant historical value. The Inventory indicates the building has a Jamaican architectural style. Common elements of this style of building include wide verandas on at least two sides; balustrades; applications of contrasting types of lattice; and deep ornate fascia board. The first floor was usually elevated by low stilts or pilings to allow air to circulate, prevented rot, cooled the ground floor and kept insects, rodents and bugs out of living quarters.

Barry Beck, 1715 Thelborn Way, San Diego, said he grew up in this home and lived in the community from 1958 to 1978. He states that the home is in a very poor condition and does not feel that it meets the criteria to be designated historic.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Martha Jordan, 1125 G Avenue, brought a historical photograph from the late 1920's of the home. She feels that the home is unique, an absolute architectural treasure and should be preserved.

Nancy Splinter, 1027 G Avenue, said that although the home may be in bad repair, it can be brought back to life with the will of the owner. She feels that the home is historic and feels that the owner should not have let the property get to such a point of disrepair.

Alana Coons, 51 Aruba Bend, on behalf of Save Our Heritage Organization (SOHO), said that this home is very important. It is a very early bungalow and unique for its architecture and what they describe as Hawaiian Plantation influence. It appears to be in very good shape on the exterior for its type and construction. Their organization is offering the owner an opportunity to

tour the home at no cost and show the home in its best light. They would also be happy to bring experts from all different areas to assist the property owner.

Caroline Murray, 770 Coronado Avenue, says the home is fabulous and refers to it as Hawaiian Craftsman.

Mr. Beck stated that regarding an earlier comment about allowing the property to get to a point of such disrepair, his parents did the best they could with what they had. He is financially unable to repair the home to be in a livable state.

Kevin Rugee, 1024 Isabella Avenue, said there appears to be a financial issue as well as an historical question. He asked that the Commissioners direct the property owner to organizations that may assist him in preserving the structure if he is willing to do that. It seems that property owners want to save the homes but financially sometimes it is not feasible.

Daphne Brown, 326 First Street, spoke with the former owner, Ms. Beck, and has visited the home in the past. She understands that the home needs a great deal of repair.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Ms. McCaull reported that she received an email from Dr. Mark Johnson, who indicated that the property has great historical value and is one example of two homes on the island that have the Hawaiian Victorian architectural style and needs to be saved.

Chairperson Keith said that she learned of some new information today which she wished to share with the Commission. She states that George Thompson lived in the home and was one of the first or second naval flight surgeons who provided medical care to military and civilians within Coronado. Although she does not have any written documentation other than family knowledge, she understands that Mr. Thompson was always on-call during the night to anyone who had a medical need.

Commissioner Wilson said that this was the type of personal anecdotal knowledge that makes it a joy to serve on the Commission. That type of information could be further researched.

Commissioner Draper said that personal knowledge is right up there with primary authority.

Commissioner Wilson said the home is a wonderful, plantation-type beach cottage. It is a treasure and although it needs repair, it can be taken care of. The home is symmetrical in its beauty and is 103 years old. She is sure that Ms. Beck did the best she could. This home could go on the open market, SOHO has made a handsome offer, and it is a wonderful property that should be kept.

Vice Chair MacCartee said that Jessop built the Manor House on First Street. As he brought his relatives from the old country, he built cottages all along First Street. This home is one of them. Although there is no documentation, this information has been handed down throughout the years – these cottages are called the Jessop Cottages. She feels this home deserves a fighting chance. The Cottage Conservancy offers a three-hour, free consultation where they will advise the property owner what can be done to expand the home, and if the home can be saved.

Commissioner Draper agreed. She feels the home meets the criteria to be designated historic, and considers SOHO's offer very generous.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON WILSON MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 300 FIRST STREET (NOI 5-06) DOES MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, AESTHETIC, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY AS FORMER RESIDENT DR. GEORGE THOMPSON WAS ONE OF THE FIRST OR SECOND NAVAL FLIGHT SURGEONS WHO PROVIDED MEDICAL CARE TO THE MILITARY AND CIVILIANS WITHIN CORONADO AND REPRESENTING THE HAWAIIAN PLANTATION BEACH ARCHITECTURAL STYLE;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S), OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY HAVING BEEN ONE OF SEVERAL HOMES BUILT ALONG FIRST STREET BY THE JESSOP FAMILY AND FOR ITS ASSOCIATION WITH DR. GEORGE THOMPSON WHO ASSISTED BOTH MILITARY AND CIVILIANS WITH THEIR MEDICAL NEEDS WITHIN THE COMMUNITY AT ANY TIME OF DAY OR NIGHT;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF A HAWAIIAN PLANTATION BEACH HOUSE ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;

COMMISSIONER DRAPER SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

The Commission took a five-minute recess at 4:13 p.m.

The Commission reconvened at 4:19 p.m. All members were present.

NOI 6-06 JOE AND CAYLEE PINSONNEAULT: – Notice of Intent to Demolish the single family residence addressed as 937 J Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. This property contains two dwellings, one addressed as 937 J Avenue and the other at 941 J Avenue. The property owners are proposing to demolish a detached garage and home at the rear of the site addressed as 937 J Avenue. In their place, a new four car garage with a guest house above would be constructed. The new structure would match the Spanish architectural style of the front home on the site. The new structure will be required to comply with the carriage house regulations as outlined in Chapter 86.56 of the Municipal Code. An email was received from Dr. Mark Johnson who was very concerned about the demolition of the home, but he may have erroneously referred to the home at the front of the site. City records indicate that a permit was issued in 1921 for the construction of a “bungalow garage” with three rooms. The structure is 85 years old. According to the Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980’s, J.E. Alcaraz began working as a building contractor in the 1920’s and his name appears on many of the City’s building permits. Mr. Alcaraz was also the Mayor of Coronado from 1924 to 1926. No other permits were issued for the rear structure. The Inventory gave this property an historical value rating of 3; however, it is staff’s belief that the identification of this property was largely based on the importance of the front home rather than the rear residence particularly as the architectural style was described as “Spanish Eclectic.”

The applicant’s representative, Kevin Rugee, 1024 Isabella Avenue, was retained by the property owner to assist them with this project. He says the front home is very charming; but the cottage in the back does not relate to the front house. The concept is to remove the cottage, replace it with a garage and a carriage house over the garage, which would tie in to existing Spanish style of the front home.

Chairperson Keith asked why the property owner was not applying for historic designation of the front house.

Caylee Pinsonneault, 701 First Street, said that she needs to research and obtain additional information before she decides to apply for historical designation of the front home.

Commissioner Wilson asked if the applicant would agree to continue the item to allow her time to consider designating the front home. In exchange, the Commission would approve her request to demolish the back house.

Chairperson Keith stated that the applicant had the option today of asking for a continuance to allow her time to speak with her architect.

Mr. Rugee brought to the Commission’s attention that there is a two-car garage that is proposed to be demolished. He asked for a five-minute recess.

The Commission took a five-minute recess at 4:34 p.m.

The Commission reconvened at 4:38 p.m. All members were present.

Mr. Rugee stated the applicant would like to request a continuance to allow her time to obtain clarification on several issues before making a decision.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

COMMISSION ACTION

This item was continued to the next regular meeting of the Historic Resource Commission.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Ms. McCaull reported that there was a question raised by Dr. Mark Johnson regarding why the Commission meetings could not be held at a more convenient time, for example, late in the afternoon or evening.

The Commission agreed that a change in meeting times would not be feasible.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:38 p.m.

Tony A Peña
Director of Community Development