

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

June 1, 2005

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:02 p.m., Wednesday, June 1, 2005, at the Coronado Police Department Emergency Operations Center, 700 Orange Avenue, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Keith.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Wilson, Keith, MacCartee and Draper.

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioner Herron.

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner.
Martha Alvarez, Administrative Secretary.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of May 18, 2005, were approved as amended.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull requested that the Commission review its Summer Meetings Schedule. She reported that other Commissions within the City had decided to go dark, and that the City Council had cancelled one meeting in July and one in August. After general discussion, it was suggested that the July 20 meeting be cancelled. Commissioner Keith asked that Ms. McCaull to report back to the Commission to confirm the cancellation date.

Ms. McCaull reported that the Demolition Review List (HR 14-04) was due back to the City Council by October, 2005.

Commissioner MacCartee inquired about the status of the Cronan plaque. Ms. McCaull said she believed the plaque would be ready in July, and Commissioner Keith requested the item be placed on the next Agenda of the Historic Resource Commission.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Commissioner Keith reported that she had been asked to be a speaker at the Soroptimist International meeting; had presented an overview of the program; and sold eleven DVDs.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HR 10-05 **Nappen, Dennis and Holly**: Request for historic designation of the property addressed as 1033 Adella Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. Mr. and Ms. Nappen are the current property owners. The site has 65' of frontage along Adella Avenue and contains approximately 5,170 square feet. The site contains a two-story dwelling with an attached garage. The first story contains approximately 1,729 square feet and the second story approximately 1,687 square feet. Mr. and Mrs. Nappen have applied for historic designation to recognize the value of this resource and to insure its future preservation. It is also worthy to note that there are four other homes on this block of Adella Avenue that have been designated Historic by the City. The properties located at 1005 Adella, 1013 Adella, 1015 Adella, and 1022 Adella have been designated historic. The application notes that there is interest in creating a "historic district" for the neighborhood.

City records indicate a permit was issued in 1924 for the construction of a dwelling and garage so the residence is 81 years old. Jerauld Ingle was identified as both the owner and contractor for the project. The estimated construction cost was \$7,500. In 1972, the bathroom was remodeled and miscellaneous plumbing and electrical permits were issued. N. Bild was identified as the owner and Payne Holm was identified as the contractor. In 1973, Mr. Bild added a two-story addition to the rear of the home. Mr. Holm was also the contractor for this addition. Research shows that the Planning Commission granted a variance for this two-story addition allowing a 17'10" setback where normally a 23'3" setback would have been required. In 1994, the interior of the dwelling was remodeled and a one-car attached garage was added. David Gillingham was the owner at the time and Bill Lyons was the contractor. In 2004, the Nappen family renovated 443 square feet on the 2nd floor of the home.

According to the Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's, Jerauld Ingle "was a real estate investor who built numerous homes in Coronado in the early part of the twentieth century. He was a nephew of Elisha S. Babcock. The home at 1105 Alameda Boulevard is an example of his construction work." Material submitted by the applicant also provides information on Jerald Ingle as well as an additional property located at 548 Marina Avenue that Mr. Ingle constructed. The home was originally very similar to the 1033 Adella property but has since been remodeled.

The home has a Prairie architectural style. The structure has fairly simple forms and massing and strong horizontal lines. The dwelling has a stucco exterior with low hipped roof with wide overhangs. The front porch also has a low pitched roof with wide overhangs and is supported by fairly substantial columns. The home is enhanced with a number of windows located on all facades of the building. The windows are in sets of two or three and are double-hung with multi-paned sashes. The application notes that the interior of the dwelling retains the original wood work in the building. The residence was also part of Save Our Heritage Organization's 2005 Craftsman-Spanish Revival historic home tour.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Holly Nappen, owner of the property located at 1033 Adella Avenue, said she was fortunate to live in such a "glorious, old house." She stated she had been living at the property for approximately ten years and stated the house was still very much in its original form except for some minor modifications.

Nancye Splinter, 1027 G Avenue, spoke on behalf of Coronado Historical Association. She expressed support in designating the Nappen property as historical.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Keith stated that she had known some of the Ingle family but was unaware that they were relatives of Elisha Babcock.

Commissioner Draper inquired as to why the original owner's name was spelled differently on the building applications.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION THAT 1033 ADELLA AVENUE LOCATED IN THE R-1A ZONE BE DESIGNATED AS A CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE; IT EXEMPLIFIES SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, AESTHETIC AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY; IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH SOMEONE SIGNIFICANT LOCALLY (MR. INGLE AND MR. BABCOCK); IT IS ONE OF THE REMAINING EXAMPLES OF PRAIRIE ARCHITECTURE WHICH IS NOTABLE IN THE CITY AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE WORK OF THE BUILDER (MR. INGLE); IT ALSO MEETS THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS.

COMMISSIONER KEITH SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, and Wilson.

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioner Herron.

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 4-0, with Commissioner Herron absent.

Ms. Nappen thanked the Commission for this designation, and mentioned the possibility of pursuing an historic district.

The Commission informed the applicant that a plaque would be ordered.

MISCELLANEOUS

None.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Discussion regarding the formulation of a Demolition Review List (HR 14-04)

The Commission reviewed the list of potential properties and made a determination as to which properties should be kept, reviewed further, or eliminated from the list.

Discussion regarding the Public Outreach Program

1. Parks Video: Commissioner Keith suggested that this item be kept on the agenda. Commissioner MacCartee stated that Camporesi Productions, the firm who prepared the DVD, should not be a point of contact for sales of the DVDs. Instead, she suggested that the City be the point of contact.
2. Newsletter: Commissioner Keith suggested that this item be taken off the agenda.
3. Slide Show Presentation: Commissioner Keith suggested that this item be taken off the agenda.
4. Archival Project of City Records: Commissioner Keith suggested that this item be kept on the agenda.
5. Website: Commissioner Keith suggested that this item be kept on the agenda.
6. Historic Plaques: Commissioner Keith suggested this item be taken off the agenda.

Discussion regarding proposed Revolving Fund for Historic Preservation and to fund preservation of cottages (no report).

Commissioner Keith advised that this item would be discussed; however, no action will be taken at this time.

Commissioner MacCartee expressed concern about the criteria used in establishing a demolition list of the cottages. She suggested taking a different approach to the situation – making the public aware of the value of the cottages and establishing important reasons as to why the cottages should be saved.

Commissioner Keith reported that she had spoken to members of the community and had received positive feedback to her inquiries. She suggested possibly forming a group/committee to oversee the project.

Commissioner MacCartee advised that she would be meeting with Attorney Sharon Sherman to put together a mission statement for the Revolving Fund.

The Commission agreed that it was important to “get the word out” and educate the public about the importance of preserving the cottages.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:18 p.m.

Director of Community Development