

CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

June 2, 2004

A regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m., Wednesday, June 2, 2004, at the Coronado Police Department Emergency Operations Center, 700 Orange Avenue, Coronado, California by Chairperson Susan Keith.

ROLL CALL:

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioner Draper

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
John Swanson, Assistant Planner
Linda Hascup, Administrative Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Minutes of the Special Meeting of April 28, 2004 were approved as submitted.

The Minutes of the Regular Meeting of May 5, 2004 were approved as submitted.

The Minutes of the Special Meeting of May 26, 2004 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull reported that a discretionary urgency ordinance, to be effective immediately, was adopted by the City Council at their last meeting. The City Council will be looking at a regular ordinance to replace the urgency ordinance, which will incorporate some changes as requested during the hearing. There will be enough time for additional input from HRC and the public before the regular ordinance is adopted.

Chairman Keith asked if the proposed ordinance would come back to the HRC for input and changes before City Council hears it again. Ms. McCaull said it would, depending on the timing. The timetable is for the first reading to take place on either June 15th or July 6th and the 2nd reading with adoption in July or early August.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

None.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Commissioner MacCartee said that she is researching information for the Ocean Boulevard historic designation. She said she is hoping to put together a pictorial history. Ms. MacCartee asked if anyone had seen if the new Star Park sign had been installed. Ms. McCaull said she thought it was but she would find out and report back.

PUBLIC HEARINGS: APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

HR 6-04 **Myers, Harold & Karan** – Request for a Historic Designation of the single family residence located at 749 C Avenue located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said that a building permit was issued in 1909. The owner at the time was recorded as Fredrick Churchill (F.C.) Winchester and the contractor was the firm of Smith and Reed. The sewer permit is # 137 in Coronado. There was a garage added in 1914, which was later (1976) demolished and reconstructed as a two-car garage. The owners in the 1930's and 1940's, the McConnell's, had alteration made in 1940; and the Scheffel's who owned the property in the 1970's modified the family room in 1977. She said the home is a good example of the Bungalow architectural style that Mr. Winchester used for several homes in Coronado. He was also the developer of the Winchester Building, the first reinforced concrete building in Coronado.

Applicant, Harold Myers, 749 C Avenue, said he and his wife decided to request designation because it is a nice part of Coronado that should live on for the future, not only for the neighborhood, but for the whole community. He said they purchased the home in 1979 and have owned it for a little over 25 years. He said his wife loved the home for its style and wood work when they first saw it even though it needed a lot of work at the time, and over the past 25 years they have restored the home. It still has the original internal colonnades, wood work, and beamed ceilings that are so familiar in Mr. Winchester's homes. Some of the homes on the block still have those details, but others have been modernized. He said he and his wife have no plans other than to live in their historic home and enjoy it. He hoped other neighbors would consider doing the same thing with their homes.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner MacCartee said that the pride of ownership shows through. It is this kind of pristine keeping of a home in Coronado and that the Historic Resource Commission is trying to encourage people to save. She said the bungalows are going very fast and this Winchester home is important to keep. Ms. MacCartee said it would be wonderful if the entire block could be designated as a district.

Commissioner Herron said that the inside of the home is as beautiful as the exterior and Coronado is very lucky to have it as a historic home. She said this is just the type of home the Commission is looking for and needs to be designated.

Chairman Keith said the irony of this application is that it began at the Flower Show when Mrs. Myers said she liked the look of the plaques and Mrs. Keith explained how easy it is to get one.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 6-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 749 C AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY MEETS THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S ARCHITECTURAL, HISTORY IN SERVING AS AN EXAMPLE OF THE CLASSIC BUNGALOW ARCHITECTURAL STYLE CONSTRUCTED IN THE EARLY 1900'S;
- C. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY IN THAT F.C. WINCHESTER WAS NOTED FOR BUILDING SEVERAL HOMES WITHIN THE VICINITY AS WELL AS THE CITY'S FIRST REINFORCED CONCRETE BUILDING;
- D. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE BUNGALOW ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND WOULD BE VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; AND,
- E. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, SMITH & REED, WHO CONSTRUCTED SEVERAL HOMES FOR MR. WINCHESTER IN THE VICINITY; AND,

- F. IT DOES MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 1.9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME).

COMMISSIONER HERRON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioner Draper

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 4-0 with one Commissioner absent.

HR 7-04 Mark Johnson, M.D. - Request for a Historic Designation of the single family residence located at 1504 Glorietta Boulevard located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

John Swanson, Assistant Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said a building permit was issued on August 25, 1927, with the cost of the construction being \$11,500. The owner was Captain I.B. Snell and the contractors of record were the Chris A. Cosgrove Company and A.P. Kruger. Mr. Cosgrove was a residential architect and contractor in Coronado for over 20 years, building many homes early in Coronado's history. The home is a mixture of the Spanish Colonial Revival and Spanish Eclectic architectural styles. Much later, in 1977, a permit was issued to demolish a garage and a greenhouse.

Mr. Swanson said that the applicant had requested to make a presentation because he wanted to propose some modifications to the structure.

Applicant, Mark Johnson, said he was attracted to the home because it is almost totally original, with all of the original hardware, casement windows, stucco, hardwood floors, etc., so he purchased it last December and wants to restore it. At one point the old garage had been relocated to the front of the house and the lot was subdivided so he isn't able to put the garage back in the original location. Instead he would like to move the garage to the side of the house so he could put a garden where it is located currently. He would also like to remove a solarium that was added in the 1980's.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Scott Aurich, 734 Glorietta Boulevard, said that Mr. Cosgrove was very unique for his time and if this home was built by him it would be truly significant.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairman Keith asked if there were any concerns regarding with the changes that are proposed. She said she had no problem with the alterations because they seem to be in keeping with the original design of the home.

Commissioner MacCartee said that Mr. Cosgrove was very well known in Coronado's history. She said this home is in the architectural style was all along Glorietta and so many of those homes have been torn down. She said she was very happy that Dr. Johnson was going to restore the home and has no trouble with his plans for changes. Commissioner Herron said the home is a gem, and is significant because of its age, architect, and style. She said she was only sad that it is hidden and we can't see more of it. Commissioner Wilson said it is a great house she is very well aware of and she is happy to support its designation.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 7-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1504 GLORIETTA BOULEVARD, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY MEETS THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S AESTHETIC AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE MIXTURE OF THE SPANISH COLONIAL REVIVAL AND SPANISH ECLECTIC ARCHITECTURAL STYLES, AND WOULD BE VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; AND,
- D. IT REPRESENTS THE WORK OF CHRIS COSGROVE, A NOTABLE BUILDER IN CORONADO FOR A PERIOD OF OVER 20 YEARS.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioner Draper

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 4-0 with one Commissioner absent.

HR 13-02 **City of Coronado** – Review of Application of Historic Designation of City Parks and Recommendation to the City Council. (AGENDA ITEM CONTINUED TO A FUTURE HEARING)

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Commission Discussion Regarding the Public Outreach Program

Coronado Parks Video: Ms. McCaull explained that Bill Putnam was out for some time and then was ill, but materials will be received back from Time Warner this next week. One of his co-workers, Luke, suggested coordinating with Amy Stewart at Coronado Middle School. Commissioner Herron said that Amy Stewart is not only willing to help with the project, but her middle school program has won 15 awards for their videos. Chairman Keith wanted to make sure that the verbal information about Coronado history that has been gathered is also relayed to Ms. Stewart when the materials are turned over to her. She said she would like to see the project completed as soon as possible because there were some photos were borrowed from individuals that need to be returned. Commissioner Herron said she has the utmost confidence in Ms. Stewart. Ms. McCaull said she has contacted the Eagle to remove the ad related to the video.

Newspaper Articles: Commissioner Draper put together an article on the Weston Estate. The Commission approved it to forward to the Eagle.

Commission Discussion Regarding Draft Report to the City Council on Recommendations Regarding the City's Historic Preservation Program and Mills Act Ordinance

Ms. Keith said recommended that the report be sent on to Council. She said that the time seems to be right to ask the City Council to increase the Mills Act budget. After some discussion the Commission decided to ask for at least a minimum of \$10,000 more, but that they would be open for more if the Council was willing.

Nancye Splinter, 1027 G Avenue, commented that the sooner the Commission asks for money the better. She said the drive for preservation has some steam now and they don't want it to lose energy by waiting. She supported a request for \$10,000.

Review and Discussion Regarding an Urgency Ordinance Considered by the City Council adding Chapter 70.22 to Title 70 of the Municipal Code Regarding the City's Demolition Permit Process for Residential Structures Seventy-Five Years or Older; and Further Adopting a Resolution Authorizing the Establishment of an Interim Fee for Demolition Permits

Chairman Keith said the Urgency Ordinance was adopted unanimously by the City Council at their meeting the previous day. The City Council requested that the City Attorney to look into the addition of a penalty that would apply if someone were to demolish their home without permission, which could be as much as the expense to replace the home as it was before the demolition.

Ms. McCaull said there were a number of suggestions that came out through the public testimony. One from Councilmember Tanaka was that there could be additional criteria other than the 75 year age limit, such as "having reached historic significance over the last 75 years." Another idea was the development of a list identifying potentially significant homes to make it easier to know which structures might be affected by the ordinance. Someone else thought the age limit should be lowered to 50 years. There were also some comments about public notification and the addition of fines. She said the intent is to create an ordinance that is as fair as possible and consistent with current policies.

Chairman Keith asked the Commission members if they wanted to discuss lowering the age requirement to 50 years as it was brought up at the City Council meeting. She said her thought was that it might be best not to go in that direction at this stage. There was general agreement from the rest of the Commission members.

Ms. McCaull provided copies of the draft Demolition Permit and evaluation sheet for the Commissioners' information.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Kevin Rugee, 1024 Isabella, said he would suggest that there be some guidance provided, for what to do when a remodel necessitates tearing down a portion of the house. Maybe there would be some leeway approved at the staff level if the remodel was somewhat minor. He said in the big picture these older significant homes need to be maintained. He would like to see some wording that would allow an addition in the rear of the home, where no changes are visible, and/or are in keeping with the original style, but would increase the livability of the home. Maybe a full historic review would not be necessary under those circumstances.

Barbara DeMichele said CHA's Preservation Committee has a concern in the same area, more from the perspective that currently a lot of work can be done without pulling a demolition permit. She said there should be a trigger mechanism when the amount of work proposed reaches a significant threshold.

Ms. McCaull said the ordinance provides definitions for Demolition and Alteration and also spells out what review process applies. There would be some room for interpretation on what is considered a partial demolition and that would be something that staff would determine. She said for clarification that this is a different process than for demolition of a nonconforming structure.

Ms. Keith's response was to say that once the ordinance has been in use we will find there may need to be some changes made. She said the idea now is to be as fair as possible and to work together rather than be adversarial. She said the Commission might find they have to meet more often so that applicants aren't kept waiting for an

unreasonable period of time. Ms. McCaull said the Commission has the ability to change their own schedule without City Council approval.

David Dolgen, 1045 Loma Avenue, asked about the timing of the staff review and how soon an application could be reviewed. Ms. McCaull said the urgency ordinance was approved by the City Council and is in effect right now. She said if a project comes in tomorrow it can be reviewed. He wondered how a structure that had significantly remodeled would be viewed. He said he was asking the question because his home is probably a good example of what the process will look like. He said he has spent some time researching to find the original drawings and information about his home, a Requa (Mann House) on Star Park Circle, because he really would have liked to restore the original architecture. It has been so dramatically altered that a restoration would be daunting. An additional challenge is that the lot was also altered. Chairman Keith said that if the home is 75 years old it would be reviewed by HRC and a determination would be made regarding its historic standing. She said that just because a structure is 75 years old, that doesn't mean it is historic. If only 50% remains that is historic they would probably say it isn't worthy of being saved as historic.

Regarding the discussion of creating a listing of possible historic homes in Coronado, Chairman Keith said she received a directory of properties in the historic property data file for San Diego County from Marie Leah of the Office of Historic Preservation that was compiled in 1999. She said it might be a good starting point for creating a list to be used in conjunction with the new process. The benefit of the list is that it came from a source outside of Coronado. Ms. Keith suggested that the Commission members could divide up the list and visit the addresses to see if the homes still exist and/or if they have been visibly substantially altered. The Commissioners decided to divide the listing so that they looked at areas that do not contain their own addresses, to avoid any perceived conflict of interest, and report back at the next meeting.

Barbara DeMichele said the earlier Sourcepoint document gave a lot of information about historic significance that isn't contained on the State list and suggested cross-referencing the two lists. Ms. Keith said it was a good idea, but to wait until they see which homes are still there.

Ms. McCaull cautioned that adoption of an inventory would have to come after adoption of the ordinance because of the time it would take to do a thorough review of the list and meet the public noticing requirements.

Scott Aurich commented that having a list of homes that are clearly historical seems to be a really good idea; it would help people know up front what to expect if they were proposing to purchase one of the homes whether they could remodel or demolish and rebuild. He said it would also be good for the community to know that there are benefits to historic designation. In addition it would be good to see more funding for the Mills Act program to encourage more people to take that route.

Ms. Keith cautioned that if the house is on the list it wouldn't necessarily mean it is historic, but that there is potential for it to be historic. If it is on the list it would go before the HRC to make that determination. Ann Keyser, 271 Alameda Boulevard, agreed with the idea that some of the homes listed might end up just being old and may not have any significance.

The Commission decided to field check the list to identify whether properties still exist, whether there had been substantial alterations, and the structure's condition.

MISCELLANEOUS

None.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:00 p.m.

Tony A. Peña
Director of Community Development