

CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

July 7, 2004

A regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m., Wednesday, July 7, 2004, at the Coronado Police Department Emergency Operations Center, 700 Orange Avenue, Coronado, California by Chairperson Keith.

ROLL CALL:

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

MEMBERS ABSENT:

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
John Swanson, Assistant Planner
Linda Hascup, Administrative Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Minutes of the Regular Meeting of June 2, 2004 were approved as submitted.

The Minutes of the Special Meeting of June 15, 2004 were approved as amended.

The Minutes of the Special Meeting of June 23, 2004 were approved as amended.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull reported that the City Council adopted the regular ordinance regarding demolition permits at their meeting the previous night and it would become effective in 30 days. The Commission members also received an updated Historic Preservation Element and the new ordinance for their commissioner notebooks.

Ms. McCaull said she spoke before the Association of Realtors and handed out application forms for the demolition process and the current ordinance and explained the process. She said she also outlined information regarding the benefits of the historic preservation program and provided pamphlets on that as well. There were several questions and it seemed the realtors appreciated learning a little more. There were

about 45 realtors in attendance. Chairman Keith added that there were also a presentation from representatives of the Residential Standards Improvement Project (RSIP).

Commission Herron asked if they were interested about the incentives. Ms. McCaull said they were most interested in the Mills Act program. They voiced their opinion that there needs to be more funding for the program. Ms. McCaull explained that the Commission was requesting the City Council for an increase and there is a proposal for a new program regarding loans.

Commissioner Draper said that after the last meeting she delivered 40 Historic Preservation brochures to Kathy Koop. She said she would widely distribute them.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

None.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There was no one wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS: APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

HRPA 4-04 Margaret McCain LaGrange - Request for a Historic Resource Preservation Agreement for the single family residence located at 625 A Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Mr. Swanson, Assistant Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said the home was designated as the City's 29th historic property by the City of Coronado on March 3, 2004 and is now eligible to apply for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement with the City of Coronado. A Mills Act Agreement requires the property owner to preserve the home for minimum period of 10 years, and in exchange there is some property tax reduction. He explained that HRC's role is to review the "list of improvements" that will be attached to the Mills Act application going to the City Council. Due to the condition of the home the applicant is proposing to maintain the property in its current good condition over the 10-year term of the contract. Mr. Swanson explained that the applicant has been advised that there is currently a backlog of Mills Act applications and this application would be added to the queue.

Applicant, Margaret LaGrange, 625 A Avenue, said she read the City Manager's quote in Sunday's paper where he said that a cap is needed because "unlike other cities, Coronado's city budget relies largely on property taxes. And because of the cities high land values, each property tax exemption eats a larger chunk of the city budget." She thought his statements were somewhat illogical because due to the higher land values the city gets a tremendous amount of money from property sales. She said she researched the MLS statistics to learn about the increase of the property tax base in Coronado. The property sales in Coronado in 2002 were \$288M. In 2003 there was \$323M in property sales, up almost \$35M. In 2004 the year-to-date sales as of June was already \$213M. She said with the proportional increase in tax base it is obvious that the impact of the few Mills Act homes is minimal. Ms. LaGrange's opinion was that asking for an increase of \$10,000 per year for the program isn't enough; it should be at least \$20,000 more. She added that she planned to use the money she would have spent on taxes on repainting the woodwork every 3 years. Chairman Keith encouraged Ms. LaGrange to attend and speak to the City Council when the Commission tenders their application.

Ms. McCaull explained that the City and Redevelopment Agency receives 58% of the property taxes paid which is a much higher percentage than other cities, so that a decrease in possible tax revenue of 50 - 80% for each Mills Act Contract can have more of an impact on the general fund than in the other cities. That is one of the reasons the City set a cap at the beginning of the program.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

There was no further Commission discussion.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS CONSISTING OF THE ROUTINE MAINTENANCE OF THE PROPERTY FOR 625 A AVENUE (HRPA 4-04) AND FORWARD IT TO THE CITY COUNCIL WITH THE HISTORIC RESOURCE PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION.

COMMISSIONER DRAPER SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

HRPA 5-04 Weston Family Trust - Request for a Historic Resource Preservation Agreement for the single family residence located at 1005 Adella Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Mr. Swanson, Assistant Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said the home was designated as the City's 31st historic property by the City of Coronado on May 5, 2004 and is now eligible to apply for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement with the City of Coronado. A Mills Act Agreement requires the property owner to preserve the home for minimum period of 10 years, and in exchange there is some property tax reduction. He explained that HRC's role is to review the "list of improvements" that will be attached to the Mills Act application going to the City Council. Due to the condition of the home the applicant is proposing to maintain the property in its current good condition over the 10-year term of the contract. Mr. Swanson explained that the applicant has been advised that there is currently a backlog of Mills Act applications and this application would be added to the queue.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Wilson said that even though the applicant was no present it seemed there was no reason to deny the request. Mr. Swanson explained that the owners could not attend as they had traveled to the East Coast for several months. Mrs. Keith said that she was concerned because the calculations showed an increase in the property taxes and she didn't want to send the application on to the Council unless a representative for the Weston family was here to say there were aware their taxes would be going up. Mr. Swanson said the Weston's were aware of the calculation. He said the County Tax Assessor's staff explained that after they make the Mills Act calculations they then invoice the property owner for the lower of the two numbers, the regular tax or the Mills Act tax. Mr. Swanson said that John Weston told Mr. Swanson that he knew there would be no additional financial benefit for receiving a Mills Act Contract. He said their main concern was to preserve the home. Chairman Keith advised that the Weston's should be advised to be at the City Council Meeting when their application is considered. Ms. McCaull said this item wouldn't be going to the City Council for some time; the Commission would most likely get it back to prioritize with the other pending applications.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS CONSISTING OF THE ROUTINE MAINTENANCE OF THE PROPERTY FOR 1005 ADELLA AVENUE (HRPA 5-04) AND FORWARD IT TO THE CITY COUNCIL WITH THE HISTORIC RESOURCE PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION.

COMMISSIONER HERRON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

HAP 2-04 **Dr. Mark Johnson** - Request for a Historic Alteration Permit to Alter the Historic single Family residence located at 1504 Glorietta Boulevard in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

STAFF REPORT

Mr. Swanson explained Dr. Johnson's property is a flag lot totaling approximately 6,000 sq.ft. with about 16 feet of frontage on Glorietta Boulevard. The home was designated as a historic resource on June 2, 2004. Dr. Johnson is proposing removing the existing garage on the front of the dwelling and building a new garage beside the house. It would be constructed in a style and with materials to match the historic home. He proposes to add a new stairway to the front entrance, extend the roof to provide a few additional square feet inside, remove the solarium, and restore original windows on the dining room and kitchen. The completed project will have about 31% lot coverage and 54% floor area ratio. Dr. Johnson is requesting relief of the setback requirement in the rear yard to 6" from the required 5'. He is also asking for relief from the 12 foot maximum height requirement for the new garage to allow the new garage height to be 13' 5" tall.

Commissioner Keith asked what is on the other side of the property line where the applicant proposes the 6" setback. Mr. Swanson said that is neighbor's rear yard which is approximately 50' deep. He added that the proposed garage would have a 5' side yard setback. The neighboring property owners were notified of the hearing.

Applicant, Dr. Mark Johnson, 1504 Glorietta Boulevard, said his goal is to restore his property close to its exact original appearance as possible. He said the current location of the garage blocks the view of the front of the house and interferes with the architecture. He said he wanted to move the garage to beside to home to open up the front of the home and provide a front yard to make the area more livable, so the garage had to go back beside the house. The only difficulty was that unless the rear yard setback was reduced he would have trouble backing up and maneuvering behind the dwelling. He said it is a lucky coincidence that the neighbor who owns the property on that side is the landscape architect for the project and he has no problem with the narrow setback. They did discuss making the setback a little wider however, so that the area can be accessed or to include landscape in that location.

Dr. Johnson said the new staircase is similar to what existed when the home was built. It is somewhat difficult to see what the original location of the stairs were because of the landscaping in the historic photograph, but it will be built in cement or brick to coordinate with the style of the home. He also proposes to put a fountain in the front.

Dr. Johnson explained that the garage is the standard height, but because the property slopes up the garage is situated at a slightly higher grade. The standard method of calculating heights would put the garage above the allowed height for the garage. Ms. McCaull explained that the way building height is measured is from the grade of the center line of the street and rear property line. Because the property slopes up so high toward the back of the lot, the garage is on a higher grade. Ms. McCaull said the height measurement is based on the way the city measures "grade" rather than the height of the structure above the actual grade of the lot.

Dr. Johnson said the other main change is to the roofline on the side of the house. He said the reason is because they need more square footage inside the house. The back bedroom is very small and the stairway is very small and dark.

Commissioner Draper asked if Dr. Johnson was aware of the Department of the Interior's standards regarding maintaining historic structures. The standards say that additions shouldn't match the old architecture exactly; rather it should only mimic the style. The reason is that someone who is knowledgeable should be able to tell the difference from the original architecture.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Marney Coons, 44 Kingston Court, said that Dr. Johnson is her client. She said the federal guidelines are highly controversial and are being debated at the state level throughout the country because they have created a hodgepodge of styles. People are putting glass and metal add-ons beside historic homes and it is ruining the look. She said that even when a replication is good anyone who is knowledgeable could tell the

difference. She said that hopefully the controversy over the guidelines will go away before too long. Ms. Coons was very excited that Dr. Johnson is proposing the new location for the garage to providing a yard again. She said the removal of the solarium is obviously a huge improvement.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairman Keith said she is still concerned about the 6" setback. She heard him say he might be willing to pull it forward to accommodate some plantings. Dr. Johnson responded that thought had just occurred to him that it might be better to have a wider setback, but it would still need to be less than 5', but more than 6" in order to have enough room for the garage. He said he could accept 2 or 3 feet and would yield to the Commission. The neighbor had said he doesn't care in either case.

Commissioner Herron asked if there was some way the height of the garage could come down. The project architect, Jorge Zamudio, said that the thought was to match the height of the first story of the house with the roofline of the garage. The garage could be set lower if additional grading was done to the site. He said that they could lower the garage by a few inches and still maintain the architectural line. Mr. Zamudio distributed revised plans reflecting a reduced building height of the garage at 12'11".

Commissioner Draper pointed out that none of the neighbors have come forward against his proposal, but she couldn't speak for neighbors in 50 years who might want to build closer to their lot line which could cause a conflict. Mr. Swanson said that one of the issues that crops up frequently in Coronado is with the existing nonconforming structures in the setback. A new neighbor might want to put in a fence on the property line and then there is no access for painting the structure next to fence. It's even more of a problem when there isn't a good relationship between the neighbors.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 2-04 HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT AS SUBMITTED WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE REAR YARD SETBACK OF THE GARAGE BE NO LESS THAN 18" AND THAT THE GARAGE HEIGHT NOT EXCEED 12' 11" AS DEPICTED IN REVISED PLANS SUBMITTED AT THE MEETING.

COMMISSIONER DRAPER SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

HRPA 6-04 Dr. Mark Johnson - Request for a Historic Resource Preservation Agreement for the single family residence located at 1504 Glorietta Boulevard and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Mr. Swanson, Assistant Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said the home was designated as the City's 32nd historic property by the City of Coronado on June 2, 2004 and is now eligible to apply for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement with the City of Coronado. A Mills Act Agreement requires the property owner to preserve the home for minimum period of 10 years, and in exchange there is some property tax reduction. He explained that HRC's role is to review the "list of improvements" that will be attached to the Mills Act application going to the City Council.

Dr. Johnson is proposing over the ten-year period of the agreement to:

1. Remove the existing garage on the front dwelling.
2. Build a new two-car garage near south west property line, with textures, roof tiles and colors to match historic dwelling.
3. Build a new staircase on the front of the historic resource.
4. Extend three feet of roof over master bedroom with roof tiles and colors to match the historic dwelling.
5. Remove the solarium located in front of the basement.
6. Restore original windows on the dining room and kitchen.
7. Maintain the home in good condition for the term of the agreement.

Mr. Swanson explained that the applicant has been advised that there is currently a backlog of Mills Act applications and this application would be added to the queue.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

There was no further Commission discussion.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS CONSISTING OF THE ROUTINE MAINTENANCE OF THE

PROPERTY FOR 1504 GLORIETTA BOULEVARD (HRPA 6-04) AND FORWARD IT TO THE CITY COUNCIL WITH THE HISTORIC RESOURCE PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION.

COMMISSIONER HERRON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

HR 8-04 **John and Shelly Oval** - Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence located at 536 A Avenue and located in the R-1A(E) (Single Family Residential) Zone.

John Swanson, Assistant Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said a building permit was issued on March 12, 1920, with the cost of the construction being \$39,605. The property owner and contractor were listed as E.D. Park Realty. The architect was unknown. He said there have been several modifications to the home since it was built. E. D. Park, was a realtor whose company speculatively purchased and sold properties, and built homes as a developer between 1916 and 1926. It was also the primary real estate company that handled much of the investment, rental, and home sales in Coronado over that ten year period that was pivotal in the City's history. The style of architecture could be called "Modern"

Applicant's representative, Kathleen Crawford, La Mesa said that this home is very much an example of Mr. Park's real estate period in Coronado. He was a very influential and prominent developer in Coronado at that time. She said that the modifications to the structure were primarily on the rear of the property and don't effect the look of the home. She said she drove up and down the streets in Coronado looking for another house like it and couldn't find any. Ms. Crawford said the Ovals have done a wonderful job of restoration.

Commissioner Herron said she hasn't seen such an extensive overview of the home as the report that was presented but there is no early picture. She said it appears the second story balcony is new, and there is a railing she questioned. Ms. Crawford answered that the balcony was added, but it isn't on the front.

Shelly Oval, 536 A Avenue, said the railing was on the home when she purchased the home, but she doesn't know if it was on the home originally.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Wilson complemented the thoroughness of the report. She said there was more information than necessary and it was probably quite costly to produce. Ms. Wilson said she loves the wrought iron on the house but didn't know if it was original. She never thought this house was particularly historic. In Sourcepoint it is rated as a 4, which is somewhat low on the historic consideration. She spent a lot of time looking at it and some of the remodeling troubled her. She said she doesn't regard the importance of the realty firm as being a historic item; it isn't the same thing as an architect or builder which she felt are more in tune with historicity. And it isn't a pure architectural style, such as a "Gill"; it is more a mix of styles that could be called "Modern". She said there are a couple of properties in a similar style, but not exactly. She said she needed to be convinced this is worthy of designation.

Commissioner MacCartee said she was also on the fence with this application. She said it isn't what we think of when we think of the historic look of Coronado, however she said she does feel it is part of the neighborhood which is becoming important here. She agreed that the realtor is not important enough, however the home does portray the social structure of what Coronado was. It was built for the upper middle class and was used as a military rental. In that sense it is part of Coronado's history.

Commissioner Draper said she is also a little on the fence. She said she might agree to the social and economic history of the home because if nothing else the realtor was involved with the economics of the period, and it does fit in with the neighborhood.

Commissioner Herron said she spoke with a couple of other owners on the block and the prior owner of the property. She asked if they knew of the integrity of the home. Everyone feels it does fit in with the neighborhood and is a home of memory. It played a role through this process of developing the town. She thought it is more significant on a social and economic level than of architectural significance. People do know the home.

Chairman Keith said she doesn't have the concerns that other commissioners have. As she drove by it struck her as one of the few remaining examples of the type of architecture in Coronado even if it isn't a Craftsman or a Tudor. She said there is a Gill influence to the architecture and it is definitely one of the few remaining, as well as being associated with an economic and social time in Coronado. No one famous lived there, but it does represent places that people lived in Coronado in those years. She

said it only takes two criteria in addition to the age to designate and since the owner is requesting designation there is enough. Ms. Keith added that they aren't all Gill's and Requa's.

Page Harrington, Executive Director of Coronado Historical Association, 1100 Orange Avenue, commented that she agrees with some of the hesitation because she doesn't think it is like some of the stunning examples the Commission has seen lately. However it does play right into what the Commission is trying to do by saving homes that fit into the character of the neighborhood.

Applicant's representative commented on the inventory process. She has evaluated thousands of homes. The inventory is just a guideline because often times they are done from the car as a "windshield inventory". The Sourcepoint survey was done in 1985 when the home was not lovingly restored. It was listed as a 4 at the time, but it doesn't mean it had no historic significance or that it isn't better now.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 7-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1504 GLORIETTA BOULEVARD, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY MEETS THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING THE MODERN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE CHARACTERISTIC OF A PERIOD IN CORONADO'S DEVELOPMENT.

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

HR 13-02 **City of Coronado** - Review of Application of Historic Designation of City Parks and Recommendation to the City Council. (AGENDA ITEM CONTINUED TO A FUTURE HEARING)

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Commission Discussion Regarding Report to the City Council Regarding the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Mills Act Program

Ms. McCaull said the Council would hear the Commission's report at their August 3 City Council meeting. The report includes several recommendations, which include: a request for an annual budget of \$5,000 for public outreach efforts; increased funding for the Mills Act program accompanied by a prioritization method to apply to applications for Historic Preservation (Mills Act) Agreements; and suggestions for additional programs which would benefit owners of historically designated properties.

Chairman Keith said that with the recent increase of interest in historic preservation and the Council's awareness, she would suggest that the Commission request that the cap for the Mills Act program be increase to \$20,000 per year. The rest of the Commissioners agreed that \$20,000 would be an appropriate amount to ask for. Commissioner Wilson said that getting more money for the newsletter was not nearly as important as funding the Mills Act Program at a higher level.

Commissioner Wilson said the statement in the Sunday newspaper article that Coronado is the only City with a Mills Act cap impressed her. She said that whoever represents the HRC at the City Council meeting needs to let them know that. She said they also need to know that the Commission is making fast progress on the list of historic homes.

Commissioner Wilson said she would strike through the alternative recommendation to leave the fiscal cap at \$5,000. Ms. McCaull said it is important that the Commission know that there is a good possibility that the City Manager's office would not support and increase in the cap. That office requires alternatives for the City Council to consider in the staff report. Even if the Commission were to request a larger amount as an alternative she could not guarantee it wouldn't be changed by the City Manager's office. Herron said that the realty people in town want to see the City put their money where their mouth is if they are truly in support of historic designation. They are going to say "Where's the beef?" The Commission members agreed that gaining a larger budget for the Mills Act Program was the most important request.

Commission Discussion Regarding the Formulation of a Historic Property Data List to Identify Potentially Historical Properties

Ms. McCaull explained that the Commission is working on a baseline document that represented the most properties that could possibly be considered historic. She

suggested that the Commission use a methodology to identify the clearly most significant homes and then concentrate on rest of list.

Chairman Keith suggested that they divide up the list again, this time with different addresses, and go out looking for the 2's. The Commissioners discussed how to indicate alterations versus renovations on the list and agreed on a method. They agreed that further building records would also need to be consulted to confirm whether or not a home had been altered.

Chairman Keith asked if the Commissioners could get copies of the pages in Sourcepoint that corresponded to the homes they were reviewing. Ms. McCaull said that would be possible.

Ms. Harrington, of Coronado Historical Association (CHA) said that she thought the Commission was on the right track. She said that CHA also has records on many of these homes as well as the Sourcepoint documents. She said they have made updates to the Sourcepoint since it was published as well and that there is an intern at CHA this summer who might be of help to the project.

Ms. McCaull suggested that the Commission's recommendation could include that the list be updated periodically. She said that depending on how many houses are on the initial list - the Commission might come up with a premier list of 150 homes - then let the City Council know that there will be a secondary list added to the main list.

Jane Mortenson, 1000 Adella Avenue, said she thought the ordinance was changed to include commercial properties. Ms. Keith said they talked about it, but they didn't actually add the commercial this time. She said she believes that the council will expect to see e commercial structures when the Commission submits the list. Ms. McCaull said that Councilmember Monroe mentioned that there are commercial properties that should be protected, so she suggested they look at the commercial properties too if they are already on the list.

Commission Discussion Regarding the Public Outreach Program

Chairman Keith said she developed a sample new handout in response to the realtor question: "What does historic preservation do for me?" It is one simple page of bold print. She thought it could be read with a quick at a glance, and a realtor could hand it to someone who was looking at a historic home. She thought they could put a logo or historic home at the top. The Commissioners agreed on a logo. They agreed to take the page home, look at it, and come back with suggestions.

Commissioner Draper offered to go to every real estate office in town with these new handouts when they are ready. Commissioner Wilson said she would get pricing and investigate whether they could get some sponsorship from real estate people.

Coronado Parks Video: Commissioner Herron reported that teacher Amy Stewart is taking the next year off of school, so she should be even more available to work on the video.

Newspaper Articles: Commissioner MacCartee said she still wants to do a fall newsletter.

MISCELLANEOUS

None.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:44 p.m.

Tony A. Peña
Director of Community Development