

CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

July 21, 2004

A regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m., Wednesday, July 7, 2004, at the Coronado Police Department Emergency Operations Center, 700 Orange Avenue, Coronado, California by Chairperson Keith.

ROLL CALL:

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

MEMBERS ABSENT:

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
John Swanson, Assistant Planner
Linda Hascup, Administrative Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Minutes of the Regular Meeting of July 7, 2004 were approved as amended.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull had no separate report.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

None.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Richard Gadler, a researcher for 106 Inc., a history and archaeology company asked for clarification on the commission's policy on landmarking historic properties with modern additions. He wanted to know at what level of modification does the Commission accept or not accept an application. Chairman Keith said that at the last meeting the Commission came up with definitions for the words "remodeled" and "altered". "Remodeled" would apply to those houses which appear pretty much as they were originally built. "Altered" would apply to the homes that were added on to and were not recognized as their historic condition. She said they are continuing to refine the list using those definitions. The Commission has not established a policy on percentage of alteration but is trying to get a handle on that. She said it would be discussed further later in the meeting and will be on the agenda until the work is done.

Tom Dawson, 708 E Avenue, asked when the Commission meetings are and how to know when meetings are scheduled. He also asked how much of a savings on property taxes a homeowner could expect if their house is designated.

Chairman Keith answered that the meetings are on the 1st and 3rd Wednesdays of each month at 3:00 p.m. She said that when there is an application for designation a legal notification of the public hearing is published in the newspaper and is mailed to the neighbors within 300 feet the subject property. In addition anyone can subscribe to the City's website to receive agendas for the meetings as soon as they are posted. Regarding the Mills Act property tax benefit, she said that when someone applies for designation City staff helps the applicant figure what the possible tax benefit would be. She said there is a complicated formula that the county tax assessor uses to determine the amount. Ms. McCaull added that the Mills act agreements that have been approved thus far have seen anywhere from 50% to 80% or less reduction in taxes.

Chairman Keith said she read an article in the LA Times about a builder who is settling a suite over the demolition of a historic home without a permit. The city invoked their "scorched earth" ordinance which by prohibiting construction on the land for five years is designed to penalize whoever demolishes a historic property. He builder sued the city and they are in the process of settling the problem. The settlement will require the builder to pay the city \$240,000 to create a fund to assist lows and moderate income family to make repairs to preserve their historic homes. He also had to pay \$50,000 to the Chinese Cultural Society, and is required to provide 100 parking spaces for a nearby school as well as other public improvements.

Ms. Keith said she recently found online information on the Historic Savannah Foundation. They have a "revolving fund program" that provides grants for renovations, etc. and also buys historic homes and resells them to people who promise to renovate them. She thought the Commission could discuss this at a later meeting when there aren't too many other items.

PUBLIC HEARINGS:
APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

HR 9-04 **Roberts, Deborah** - Request for a Historic Designation of the single family residence located at 1027 Isabella Avenue located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said that City records do not show a building permit confirming the construction date or who was the architect or contractor, however the Source Point inventory estimates the structure was constructed in 1910, and an alteration permit was issued in 1926. The home is at least 78 years old, if not older. The owner on record at the time was E.M.

Andrews and the contractor was Geo. Thompson. A garage was constructed on the property in 1928 by the owner at the time, Edward Fell. The structure is a simple, bungalow architectural style.

The current owner, Ms. Roberts said that the Source Point document notes the dwelling as being a contributing structure to a potential Ocean/Star Park Historic District. The home was once owned by Diana Gurney, also known as the "Flower Lady", the original owner of the flower stand located at Rotary Plaza. Ms. Gurney was one of the first individuals to enter into a lease agreement with the City to conduct a private business on public property. Ms. Gurney started her business in 1979 and sold it in the late 1990's due to a terminal illness. Ms. Gurney served President of the Chamber of Commerce and President of Coronado MainStreet and to recognize her community contributions a memorial median garden was established on Orange Avenue at 10th Street. The flower stand still remains in operation and is well known in the community.

Applicant, Deborah Roberts, 1027 Isabella Avenue, said she didn't have much more to add other than the Source point document estimated date of construction in 1910.

Commissioner Draper said the Source Point inventory photo was in black and white, but she wondered what the color might have been previously. Ms. Roberts said it was green when she purchased the home. Commissioner Wilson remembered that the home was white four years ago, so it was painted pretty recently. Commissioner MacCartee asked if there was any evidence of redwood siding, as so many homes from that time were redwood. Ms. Roberts said all of the doors are original and they are redwood, but she hadn't found any other information regarding the original siding.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper said the Source Point document refers to wood timbering on the sides and around the windows, so it sounds like the house originally had wood siding rather than stucco. Commissioner MacCartee said it would have been unusual for a 1920 house to be sided in stucco. She thought the connection with Diana Gurney could be a reason for designation, but her fear is that the home has been altered to the point that it is no longer historic.

Commissioner Wilson said it is a cute little house, but she also was not sure it is historic. Diana Gurney is quite recent in history at this point in time, and having business on city property isn't that noteworthy. She thought it could be rated a 3 to 4 because it isn't as near to its original condition as it used to be.

Commissioner Herron said that she would agree with both MacCartee and Wilson. She would find it has been substantially altered and the integrity has not been maintained.

Chairman Keith said she would like to be able to say this home is historic, but the only thing she could hang her hat on is that it represents the beach cottages that Coronado was all about. But it has been altered and isn't now the same as the beach cottage it once was. She appreciates it still being there because she knows what else could be in its place. She said the Commission has to follow the criteria and she would have to stretch the requirements to try to designate this structure. She said she was a great friend of Diana, but her having lived in the house isn't enough to give it historicity. She said she would encourage the applicant to retain the home and keep in it good condition and not allow a monstrosity to be built in its place.

Ms. Roberts pointed out the house is in a scenic district and the trolley tours go by frequently talking about the old cottages, etc. She asked if there were any changes she could do, color related, or exterior finish.

Chairman Keith said that if the Commission denies without prejudice the applicant can come back at a later date. Perhaps more information can be found through research, or Ms. Roberts can do some preservation and refurbishment to return the home to its historic condition. Ms. Draper said that there are old newspapers at the library that might help the applicant - perhaps there would be a story about the builder or architect, or a photo.

Ms. McCaull said that generally if an application is denied it cannot come back again, however denying it without prejudice does allow the applicant an extra chance.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION TO DENY WITHOUT PREJUDICE THE REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1027 ISABELLA AVENUE (HR 9-04), WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES NOT EXEMPLIFY SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S) OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE OR NATIONAL HISTORY;

- D. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- E. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;
- F. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 1.9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME)

COMMISSIONER HERRON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

HR 10-04 **LaSalle Bank** - Request for a Historic Designation of the single family residence located at 1122 G Avenue located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

John Swanson, Assistant Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said the history of the dwelling began when a permit was issued on April 15, 1938, for the construction of a squash court at 532 Marina Avenue (contractor/designer - Paul L. Hathaway). The squash court was then converted to a dwelling in 1951 (contractor - Walter Vestal, a former mayor of Coronado), and in 1998 the dwelling was permitted to be moved to 1122 G Avenue ; contractor - John T. Hansen Enterprises). The application states that the husband of Jane K. Reynolds (nee Keck), Lt. Cdr. Reynolds, was a distinguished Naval officer during WWII. He was awarded the Legion of Merit and served in both the Atlantic and Pacific theatres during the war, as well as in Japan during the Occupation following the war. Jane Keck was a member of the well-know Coronado Keck family. In 1999 another permit was issued to upgrade the relocated structure and to build a new garage (owners - Mark E. and Emily Haack; contractor - Osso Construction).

In 1998, when the residence was still located on Marina Avenue, it was included in the Coronado Historical Association's Silver Anniversary Showcase.

Applicant's Representative, Dr. Ray Brandes, 230 West Laurel Street, Suite 406, San Diego, 92101, said the area where the house at 1122 G Avenue is located, also the next application's 1144 G Avenue, is one of Coronado's more historic areas. He discussed several of the people of historic stature who lived in the neighborhood, and talked about the lifestyle and the gatherings of people that occurred in the neighborhood in the old days. He mentioned that the floor of the original squash court still exists in the current structure. Dr. Brandes said he believes there is much more information to be considered than the attributes of the individual houses. He said we ought to be looking at the communities they reside within as well. He said that the preservation of the house and its restoration, even though it is not of age, is important because of the extremely historic figures in Coronado's history attached to it.

Commissioner Keith said that she has many memories of the home at 1122 G Avenue because Mr. Stewart Reynolds is her uncle. She said she spent many evenings playing there and knows of the structure's and the family's historic past. She said there were several mistakes in the report which concerned her, such as: The property was located behind 532 Marina which is still there; it was Jane and Stewart Reynold's house. The report says it was later converted to a single-story home, but it has always been a two story structure. The report says that at one time it didn't have a roof, but it always had a roof. The report says the home was later moved to 524 Marina, but it was not moved. It remained in the same location, but the address was changed when it became a rental property and the entrance was from Marina through the yard. Ms. Keith said the structure was not moved under a trust of Jane Keck-Reynolds. She died in March of 1997, and the house was not moved until June of 1998 that the permit was issued. By that time the property was already owned by Mr. and Mrs. Mark Haack, not Mr. and Mrs. Mark Maack as listed in the report. The report incorrectly identified the sponsor of the Silver Anniversary Showcase as the Coronado Historical Society, rather than the Coronado Historical Association. Some of the family members were misidentified.

Ms. Keith said the report indicated that it was the only squash court on the island; however there were always squash courts at North Island. She said when her uncle was out at sea one time her mother had the squash courts installed as a surprise to him. Ms. Keith added that to set the record straight, her uncle never played golf.

Chairman Keith said that as a member of the family she would hate to see some of the inaccuracies go forward. She said would like to give Dr. Brandes time to make the corrections and come back to the Commission.

Commission Wilson said that speaking for herself, the family history isn't as germane to her as the house history. She said she was involved when 1122 G Avenue was in the

designer showcase with the house on Marina as well. She said there is a lot of published history that is correct and the incorrect family history wouldn't affect her judgment. Commissioner Herron said she had spoken with Nick Reynolds and Amy Haines and is comfortable with the homes historicity.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Nancye Splinter, 1027 G Avenue, said she was speaking for herself and her husband Chip Splinter. She and her husband believe that recycling some old lumber and a floor into a new home is not historic preservation. She said there was a two story farmhouse built in 1951, but the house now has no resemblance to that cute, white farmhouse was on Marina when it was a part of the historic showcase. Ms. Splinter said the old squash court was important, but people can't see the squash court. Also, you can't take an historic squash court, add a second story, change it to match the main house on the property and say it is still historic.

Page Harrington, Coronado Historic Association, said she enjoyed the amount of information in her report, but her only concern is the amount of renovations that have taken place, over \$100,000 worth. She would like to hear more about that.

Tom Dawson, 708 E Avenue, said if we are talking about the historical significance of any property being due in part to the people who have lived there or the neighborhood, you apply that to Deborah Roberts's property. He said a very prominent person lived just two doors down from her cottage which would give weight to designation of that property as well.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Wilson said that because of her familiarity with the property she was surprised to see it on the agenda. She said she doesn't believe this is a significant property because it is a remodel, not a restoration; it is not a historic squash court any longer; and the Commission is considering designation of a single property, not a historic district. And it is only 66 years old.

Commissioner Herron said there are many people who have lived in and associated with that house who have stories to tell, but it is not 75 years old, and it has been substantially altered. The notion of historicity is not there.

Commissioner Draper said that she really appreciates what the other commissioners have said. It is only 66 years old, and it is altered and bears no resemblance to the squash court. She said the Commission has to consider the criteria and this property does not meet it.

Commissioner MacCartee said she loves adaptive reuse of historic properties, but this is not really adaptive reuse; it is altered. There were no windows in the squash court or a fireplace, so she said she couldn't find the criteria to designate it.

Chairman Keith said the squash court became a residence in 1951. It was moved down the street. It was completely altered. The only thing remaining of the squash court is the floor. She said she couldn't support the application. Even if it is not 75 years of age there must be an overwhelming significance, which there isn't.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO DENY HR 10-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1122 G AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY DOES NOT MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES NOT EXEMPLIFY SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S) OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE OR NATIONAL HISTORY;
- D. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- E. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;
- F. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 1.9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME)

COMMISSIONER HERRON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

HR 11-04 **LaSalle Bank** - Request for a Historic Designation of the single family residence located at 1124 G Avenue located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

John Swanson, Assistant Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said a building permit was issued on February 2, 1915 to Jerauld Ingle (contractor - L.J. Davis) to construct a dwelling with 9 rooms at 1124 G Avenue. In 1921 Mrs. Alice Lando was issued a permit to construct a storage space, and in 1925 was issued permits to build an addition, make repairs, and build a double garage. The contractor for Mrs. Lando's projects was O.W. Dorman. Another garage was built in 1935. Subsequently various alteration permits were issued for such items as a new roof, 6 new dormers, new siding, a new garage, etc.

One of the owners, Commander Lando had a distinguished naval career. He was a graduate of the Naval Academy in 1907 and serviced on a minesweeper in the North Sea during WWI. He was awarded the Distinguished Service Cross for heroism. A subsequent owner of the home, Admiral A. Beauregard, was a descendant of Confederate Army General Pierre Gustave Toussant de Beauregard, who had a long military career.

The architectural style of the dwelling is listed in the application as a Victorian style known as a "Shingle", which is an unusually freeform and variable style.

Applicant's Representative, Dr. Ray Brandes, 230 West Laurel Street, Suite 406, San Diego, 92101, said that even though Jerrauld Ingle, was listed on the building permit, he never lived at this address; his home was at Alameda and Ocean. The owners were George and Clare Sturges. Mr. Ingle was brought to Coronado to work as a real estate developer and to sell land by his brother-in-law, Mr. Elijah Babcock, who was a part owner of the Hotel Del Coronado. Clare was married to William Templeton Johnson.

The home was purchased by Commander Ellis Lando. Dr. Brandes said he found their son, who now lives in San Francisco. Dr. Brandes was able to gather information and some old photos of the home from the son. The Lando's lived in the home until 1945 or so, which is when Admiral Beauregard and his wife purchased the house. Admiral Beauregard was truly and international figure. As well as his distinguished naval career, he was also diplomat dealing with Latin American matters and was regarded as a very well informed and intelligent person.

Dr. Brandes said Mr. Haack discovered that the home was originally shingled and completely restored it in 1997 and 1998. He changed the interior somewhat and made a third story, taking advantage of the dormers for guests. The house on the back of the property was brought on at the same time. He also had two other houses brought onto the property that were being demolished. That is where he obtained the shutters.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Nancye Splinter, 1027 G Avenue, said the home has been fabulously remodeled, but it is not a restoration. She did some research to find a photo of the old structure and the new one is significantly different. The chimney has been changed; a third floor and a roof deck was added, and French doors were added. Ms. Splinter said the new third floor completely destroys the integrity of the William Templeton Johnson roofline.

Page Harrington, CHA, said that the comments she made regarding the earlier application also apply to this one. The house has been heavily remodeled. Even though you can't argue with the historicity of William Templeton Johnson, she said in the Mills Act sense it would compare with the home on Alameda that John O'Brien remodeled.

Patty McKenna Witalis, 1025 E Avenue said when she was a little girl she lived across the street from this house in the 1950's. She said she doesn't recognize this house at all in comparison to the house she lived across the street from.

Tom Dawson, 708 E Avenue, commented that the fellow who designed the Coronado Flag, Louie Millen lived in that house at one time. The restoration of the home, for the people in the neighborhood, was a long and tedious process over five years, but it does look nice.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairman Keith asked about the black and white photos. There was significant remodel to the original structure in approximately 1925. Additional remodeling has been done since.

Commissioner Wilson said that it appears to be a remodel, even though it is a handsome one. She would agree with Mrs. Splinter on the dormers and the home didn't have a third story, it had an attic. The reference to the historic nature of the past owners was interesting but being a descendant of a civil war general, though impressive, doesn't relate to the historic nature of the house. She kept looking for something that confirmed William Templeton Johnson designed the house, but didn't see anything written. Also, it doesn't look at all like the original property.

Commissioner Herron said that Mr. Haack did a fabulous remodel of the property and the shingle restoration was wonderful. However, the dormers change the house considerably and she doesn't believe that the house that is there today represents a historic house any longer because it has been substantially altered. Even though it is 75 years old it does not deserve historic designation.

Commissioner MacCartee said she thinks the restoration is wonderful and is willing to give some credit for a wonderful restoration - especially the shingles.

Commissioner Draper said she believes it is a William Templeton Johnson home. If an architectural student would come by now they might not recognize it as a changed property. However she would have to give it the scarlet letter of "altered".

Commissioner Herron asked if someone could explain the discussion at the meeting when the altered William Templeton Johnson home on Alameda Boulevard received designation. Commissioner Draper said that she and Commissioner Steiner both had great concern over that designation because of the alteration. However the Commission was new at the time and somewhat anxious to get some designations. Ms. McCaull pointed out that the designation was qualified by the statement that the Porte cu chere was added and was not a part of the designation. The positive aspect of the designation is that the home was preserved.

Commissioner Draper said that maybe some statement could be added about the alterations that are not a part of the designation if the Commission wanted to take that tack.

Commissioner MacCartee said that perhaps they could request Dr. Brandes to come return with a condensed report stating what the changes have been and when they occurred. Commissioner Wilson said that the Council had some concerns with another property that was altered and it was even discussed to de-designate the home.

Commissioner Keith said that she loves the home and could move in tomorrow, but she had a problem with designating a house as a William Templeton Johnson with such extensive remodeling.

Commissioner Wilson commented that there were no famous personages who lived in the home; it is not one of the few remaining examples as there are a number of houses around Coronado that were built by William Templeton Johnson and have a similar appearance.

Commissioner Draper said she believes a person of national history is represented here but could not find enough to argue for designation because of the significant changes.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO DENY HR 11-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1124 AVENUE BECAUSE OF THE FACT THAT IS THAS BEEN SIGFNIFICANTLY ALTERED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES NOT EXEMPLIFY SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S) OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE OR NATIONAL HISTORY;
- D. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- E. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;
- F. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 1.9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME)

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS: Commissioner MacCartee

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 4-1.

HR 12-04 **Dolgen, David and Ellen** – Request for a Historic Designation of the single family residence located at 1045 Loma Avenue located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said a building permit was issued for construction of the main dwelling and a garage in 1926. with the cost of the construction being \$29,600. The property owner at the time was Samuel Mann, and the contractor was listed as A.E. Keyes. A copy of the original plans submitted by the applicant lists the notable architects Requa and Jackson. There have been several repairs and interior modifications to the home since it was built, and a two car garage with a second floor was added in 1992. A second story addition was also added at the southern wing of the residence. The structure has a Mission architectural style with Moorish influences. It represents Requa's "Southern California Style".

Applicant, Richard Dolgen, 1045 Loma Avenue, said he and his wife have been working on the restoration of their home for two years. There is extensive work to do. He explained what had happened to the home over the years and how he was returning it to the original condition. Mr. Dolgen said he was fortunate enough to obtain the 20 original sheets of plans from the San Diego Historical Society, that have been a great guide for the contractor. He said they will be taking the old windows out of the remodeled structure and putting back in historically accurate windows. The original windows were very clever; they actually had built in roll-up screens. There is one left in the tower. The window contractors were overwhelmed with the genius of the design, but unfortunately can't reproduce it. He thinks that enough of the house exists (the principal core) to satisfy all of the criteria. He said they will be back with the plans for the demo and refurbishing.

Chairman Keith asked if Mr. Dolgen had seen the book by Mr. Requa about his travels to Africa. She said you can see in that book the details in this house, in some cases exactly. Mr. Dolgen said that book was where he got some of the photos for the application.

Commissioner Draper commended the applicant on bringing this information to the Commission now before he does the work.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Barbara DiMichael, president of the Coronado Historical Association, commented that this is the way the process should be done; show the alteration before the designation.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairman Keith asked staff if the house could be looked at as three portions, with the center portion being the Requa. Since, additions were added to the right and left sides, she asked if the Commission could consider designating the center portion of the house without including the right and left sides. Ms. McCaull said that it had been done before, so it probably could be done. Ms. McCaull said that she doesn't believe this applicant will be pursuing a Mills Act contract, but if he were she didn't think the assessor's office could divide the portions of the home and make the computation. But the commission could certainly make a motion to designate a certain portion.

Commissioner Draper said that she is very much in favor and would be happy to make a motion. The rest of the Commission members agreed saying they were all for it and it is a gift to the community.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 12-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1045 LOMA AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT EXEMPLIFIES SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND THE MAIN BUILDING HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED ALTHOUGH IT IS RECOGNIZED THAT ADDITIONS HAV OCCURRED TO THE BUILDING THAT ARE PLANNED TO BE REMOVED IN THE NEAR FUTURE; AND
- D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF RENOWNED ARCHITECT, RICHARD REQUA, WHO DESIGNED SEVERAL SIGNIFICANT HOMES WITHIN THE COMMUNITY AS WELL AS OVER 200 STRUCTURES IN BALBOA PARK.

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

HR 13-04 **Cusick, Tim and Tammy** – Request for a Historic Designation of the single family residence located at 1125 Flora Avenue located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said there was not a record of a building permit in the City records; however a permit was issued in 1913 for repairs. That permit notes that the structure appeared on the 1897 lot book. The estimate is that the home is at least 107 years old. The architectural style is Victorian, and the application states that the home was designed by architect Irving Gill. Over the years there were several miscellaneous repairs, alterations, and termite repair work, as well as a kitchen remodel, and the addition of a new concrete foundation. In 1987 the home was recognized for its architectural significance with a historic plaque from the Coronado Historical Association. In May of this year the dwelling was included on the CHA's Historic Home tour.

Applicant, Tammy Cusick, 1125 Flora Avenue, said she believed the architect was designed by Irving Gill even though there as no proof in writing that she knew of. She said her home is named the "Harlow House". The rose garden at the library was the "Harlow Rose Garden" and she is hoping the library will restore it because Ms. Harlow was pretty involved at the library. She said when the home was on the market all of the other prospective buyers were interested in tearing down the home. She promised Mr. Runner, who had done a wonderful restoration, that she was going to keep everything as he restored it.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper said it was very interesting to learn how originally the Hotel Del Coronado supplied steam heat for the Cusick home.

All of the Commissioner members agreed they were happy to see the application because this is a representative property. Chairman Keith said most people would have been surprised that this home wasn't already designated.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 13-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1125 FLORA AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY MEETS THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY IN REPRESENTING THE VICTORIAN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE;
- C. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY IN THAT THE HOME WAS ORIGINALLY CONSTRUCTED FOR U.F. NEWTON, WHO IS BELIEVED TO BE THE FIRST MANAGER FO THE HOTEL DEL CORONADO. THE HOME WAS LATER OWNED BY THE HARLOW SISTERS WHO BEQUEATHED A SUM OF MONEY THAT ESTABLISHED THE "HARLOW ROSE GARDEN" AT THE CORONADO LIBRARY;
- D. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; AND
- E. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF ARCHITECT IRVING GILL.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

NOI 1-04 **Finch, Chris and Karen** - Consideration of Notice of Intent to demolish the single family residence addressed as 844 E Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said the applicants would like to demolish the structure so they could build a larger home than the existing one bedroom, one bathroom home to accommodate their growing family. They are expecting a baby very soon. She added that this is the first time the commission has considered a demolition request.

The dwelling was constructed in 1923. The architect is not known and the contractor is not well known. The architectural style is a typical bungalow, with a stucco exterior that was rated as a 4 in the Source Point document. It is 650 square feet in size and is located in the R-3 Zone. She said that staff's recommendation is that there are no

outstanding criteria to retain the home as a historic resource and does not meet historic designation criteria.

Chairman Keith explained that the methodology for the demolition permits would be to look at the historic factors related to the property and decide if there is enough historic significance for designation. Alternately, they would recommend approving the demolition request.

Applicant, Chris Finch, 844 E Avenue, said he was surprised to see what is involved in the considerations made by the Commission. He also thought that staff was very professional and thorough in putting together the information for the application and the Commission is very painstaking to be fair in their considerations.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Daphne Brown, 326 First Street, said she had been in the house on E Avenue when it was under different ownership. She thought it was a darling little cottage - for one person. She said it is big enough for one, but not for two and especially not three people. Ms. Brown said she doesn't see how the bungalow could be called "missionary revival"; it's a just an ordinary cottage that needs some elbow room and is surrounded by high apartments on either side. She was in support of the request.

Nancye Splinter said she drove by this home and the whole block has improved and would be wonderful for this first project to be approved; it would set a very nice tone. She agreed completely with Ms. Brown.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper said she had no problem with the application. There is no significant builder, contractor, or notable people who have lived there. The only criterion it meets is age.

Commissioner MacCartee said she walks by every day and they have made it so cute she hates to lose it; but it is just an old bungalow with no significance.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 844 E AVENUE DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED A HISTORIC RESOURCE.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron
NAYS:
ABSENT:
ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

NOI 2-04 Bergman, John and Janice - Consideration of Notice of Intent to demolish the single family residence addressed as 517 A Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She explained that the Bergman's would like to restore/renovate the dwelling and relocate it to the rear of the property above the garage. The applicant has indicated if the relocation expense becomes prohibitive they would like to have the option of demolition.

The home was constructed in 1909, so the official age is 95 years of age. The original owner was Harold A. Taylor, who was a nationally recognized photographer. The designer was Emmor Brooke Weaver, who worked with Pond and Pond in Chicago, and later with Hebbard and Gill. Mr. Hardy purchased the home in the 1970's. The Source Point document indicated the structure was given a rating of two, which is of high significance.

Ms. McCaull said she believes this home is not at the level of significance the City Council had in mind when the ordinance was prepared, however it does have some architectural importance. The draft resolution supports the applicant's request.

Applicant, Craig Clarke, 248 H Avenue, passed out additional information to the Commission. He asked that if the Bergman's request was denied if it could be without prejudice so they would have a chance to come back. Ms. McCaull said it is included in the resolution.

Mr. Clarke said his clients fell in love with this house when they saw the inside. It fits in very well with the Kennedy and Stockdale homes on either side. After they move the existing structure to the rear they plan to build a house in a style similar. One of the issues with the lot was the depth of grade the house is sitting on. The street is at eye level when they are standing in the doorway. They would like to fill in the lawn and build at street level.

Mr. Clarke explained that there is significant termite damage and the rafters are full of dry rot and termites which was expected. The house had a porch at one time and the new owners will probably restore it after it moved. He said they didn't know how

much it would cost to move the structure yet because there hasn't been enough time to determine the condition, which would determine the expense.

Ms. Wilson said that in addition to Harold Taylor, Lou Hardy was also a resident of the house. He was the Lou Hardy that the Chamber of Commerce named their award after. This, along with the rating of 2 in Source Point she was leaning toward trying to save it as it is and suggest an add-on in the back. She was troubled with the caveat that they might not be able to save the house.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Page Harrington, 1100 Orange Avenue, said this is a fabulous structure and Emmor Weaver is a very significant architect. She added that the Harold Taylor Photographs are the largest collection in the Historical Association's archives. That being said she knows this is a difficult situation. She really appreciates what the potential owners are willing to do. The plan to move the house to the rear of the property is a wonderful idea - and that they will preserve it. She wondered if there was a way to talk about the designation of the property - it clearly has enough criteria. It would be nice if there was a way to ease the financial burden for the new owners.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper said the home is located on a gorgeous block and is an example of very few left in town. There is the significance of the architect, the photographer, and the fact that it was rated a 2 on the Source Point inventory. Mr. Taylor was a significant landscape photographer and was instrumental in the arts and crafts movement in San Diego. His shop was the only source of Rockwood pots, and he had a studio at the Hotel Del. She said she loves the idea of moving the structure back, but is concerned with the difficulty of accomplishing it. She would love to have someone come and say they could move it.

Commissioner MacCartee said that Harold Taylor is part of Coronado's history. She said the town would be fortunate to have a craftsman house built on the front of the property. She isn't willing to draw the line in the sand and deny the request though. She is assuaged by what is in the letter about the craftsman cottage.

Commissioner Herron she believes the neighborhood in the front and the alley represents the character of Coronado we are trying to hard to preserve and protect. While she would like to believe the house could be moved and put on top of a garage, she thinks we have to be realists. If the owners are willing to build a home that is similar to the Stockdale's and the Kennedy's, she could go along with the plan. She wasn't willing to deny their request.

Chairman Keith said she had been thinking about this application all weekend. There is no question that if this house was coming forward for designation it would be approved because it meets virtually all of the criteria. Harold Taylor was certainly significant in the city and the county. He was the founder of the Flower Show and the Floral Association. Lou Hardy also has some significance in Coronado. There is no question about the architect or the style. Ms. Keith asked Ms. McCaull if because of the height limit the Commission has the prerogative to allow an applicant to put a second story on a garage in a single family R-A zone.

Ms. McCaull said this was discussed with the applicant. They could receive some relief from the code usually, but in this case it isn't necessary. Because of the slope of the property between the alley and the street and the way the City measures the grade it would in effect only be one story in height instead of two stories. It is within code.

Chairman Keith said she would have no problem with moving the structure, but the decision of when it becomes "too expensive" is very subjective. She said she would hate to approve the application without knowing what the outcome will be. She asked if it was possible to condition the approval so the structure could be moved, but not demolished. And ask the applicant to return when or if they were not able to accomplish the move. Commissioner Wilson thought that was a workable option.

Ms. McCaull explained that the moving of the home is considered to be a partial demolition, which triggers this public hearing process. The purpose of the review is to determine if the home meets the criteria to be designated as an historic resource. If the home is considered significant it is designated and then the applicant must come back to the Commission to request the actual alteration, whether it is the relocation or the demolition. The purpose of the meeting isn't to negotiate a first or second step. If it is designated as historic it would warrant further discretionary review to explore alternatives. The applicant has stated their primary intent is to restore the structure, but that may not be possible.

Commissioner Wilson said that in that case she would find the home to be significant because of all of the reasons discussed previously. Commissioner Herron said she also believes it is historic.

Ms. McCaull said that if the Commission decides this structure does meet the criteria, they would need to adopt a resolution with the appropriate findings defending the decision. She said as noted in the staff report she isn't sure this represents the type of significant or noteworthy structures within the community that this initial ordinance was established for.

Chairman Keith said there is no question in her mind that it is historic, but isn't sure she would want to fight that battle. Commissioner Draper said that to be practical the house will deteriorate further and may be difficult to sell as it deteriorates. She said the

new owners states the desire to make a house that looks like what was there, which is better than someone coming in a building something out of character. If the owner can be trusted it would save the home from deteriorating over time and becoming an eyesore.

Janice Bergmann, 534 C Avenue, said that when they first looked at the property they didn't see anything worth saving. Then she went inside and found how charming it was with its hardwood floors, built-ins, etc. She said they have always loved craftsman homes and really want to build one on the front of the property to fit in with the neighborhood. They would really love to keep the original home and move it to the back of the property. They would love to retire here in Coronado and be a part of the community. They want to be able to have their family come over and join them. With the house in the back it would be so convenient for their family to come and stay.

She reiterated that because of the termite damage they just don't know what they are facing. Ms. Bergmann said she promised that their intent is to build a craftsman style house that the entire neighborhood will be proud of. They have already contacted a contractor that specializes in Craftsman. She is excited to be here, loves the small town feel, and doesn't want to build something that won't fit in.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER KEITH MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE APPLICATION NOI 2-04 FOR THE PROPOSED RELOCATION OR DEMOLITION OF THE SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 517 A AVENUE WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION WITH THE CONDITION THAT ALL EFFORT BE MADE TO MOVE THE STRUCTURE. FURTHER. IF THERE IS A FINANCIAL HARDSHIP THE APPLICANT MUST RETURN TO THE COMMISSION TO SEE IF THERE IS SOME WAY TO FIND MONEY TO HELP THEM. IF THAT IS NOT POSSIBLE THE HOUSE CAN BE DEMOLISHED. IF THE HOME IS DEMOLISHED THE APPLICANT WOULD HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO USE THE SALVAGED MATERIALS IN THE NEW HOME AFTER WHICH CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION MUST BE GIVEN THE OPPORTUNITY TO SALVAGE THE REMAINING HISTORIC PIECES OF THE HOME FOR THE NEW PROGRAM "KEEP IT IN CORONADO". IF THE HOUSE IS DEMOLISHED, BECAUSE IT IS A POTENTIALLY A HISTORIC DISTRICT ON A AVENUE, THE NEW HOUSE MUST BE A CONTRIBUTING FIGURE IN THAT NEIGHBORHOOD.

COMMISSIONER DRAPER SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

Mr. Clarke said he was very appreciative of the Commission's willingness to work with the applicant.

NOI 3-04 Queisser, Harold and Kandi - Consideration of Notice of Intent to demolish the single family residence addressed as 955 F Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She explained there was a building on the site in 1892. It is not clear that it is the same structure that exists today. However the structure that is there is at least 75 years of age. It is a bungalow style, 660 square feet in size, without any particular architectural elements. It was listed in Source Point with a rating of 4, which is a very low significance.

Applicant's representative, Kelly Queisser, said that she was speaking for her parents. All of the children are grown and are moving off on their own. Her parents want to build a new, smaller home for themselves. Their current home is three stories, six bedrooms, four bathrooms. She said she could guarantee they will build a respectable home that won't hurt the character of Coronado.

Commissioner Draper asked about the termite damage. Ms. Queisser said that not only is there extensive termite damage and mold, there is an illegal addition on the rear that it in horrible condition. It would cost more to fix the house than tear it down and build a new home.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Wilson said that this is an example of an old house. She would have no problem with granting a permit to demolish it. Commissioner MacCartee said it was once an adorable cottage with a front porch. "It isn't any more; let it go."

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 955 F AVENUE DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED A HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY DOES NOT MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

- B. IT DOES NOT EXEMPLIFY SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S) OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE OR NATIONAL HISTORY;
- D. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- E. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;
- F. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 1.9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME)

COMMISSIONER DRAPER SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

HR 13-02 City of Coronado - Review of Application of Historic Designation of City Parks and Recommendation to the City Council. (AGENDA ITEM CONTINUED TO A FUTURE HEARING)

Ms. McCaull reported that Mr. Putnam dropped of the tapes of work done so far.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Commission Discussion Regarding the Formulation of a Historic Property Data List to Identify Potentially Historical Properties

Chairman Keith explained the methodology the Commissioners have been using to improve the list. So far each area has been looked at by two Commissioners. She suggested that the Commission now needs to go out and look at the properties as a group and apply the rating by consensus.

Ms. McCaull said she is suggesting that this list be put forward as the list of the most historically significant homes, but let people know that another list is being worked on that will contain the other homes that are over 75 years of age but were not significant to make it onto the most critically significant list.

Page Harrington, said that CHA would be happy to help however they can and will set aside as much time as it takes.

Nancye Splinter - 1027 G Avenue, asked when is would be appropriate to request the addition of a home that isn't on the list already. Ms. McCaull answered that if you know of a home to add please call staff as soon as possible.

Ms. McCaull said she would look into the logistics of the Commission going together for view the homes.

Commission Discussion Regarding the Public Outreach Program

The Commission continued this discussion to a later agenda.

MISCELLANEOUS

Chairman Keith asked to add a discussion item on the size of applications for designation because the agenda size is becoming quite prodigious.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:40 p.m.

Tony A. Peña
Director of Community Development