

CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

July 16, 2003

A regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:03 p.m., Wednesday, July 16, 2003, in the Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Gerry MacCartee, Acting Chair of the Historic Resource Commission.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners MacCartee, Keith, Ryan, and Walsh

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioner Draper

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
John Swanson, Assistant Planner
Linda Hascup, Administrative Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Minutes of the Regular Meeting of June 4, 2003 were approved as amended.

The Minutes of the Special Meeting of May 29, 2003 were accepted into the record as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull indicated that some agenda pages were out of order and gave directions for the Commission members to rearrange their packets.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

There were no Committee Reports.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Dr. Ray Brandes, 230 West Laurel Street, San Diego, explained that the withdrawal of the application for historic designation of 1405 Tenth Street had nothing to do with the application process, but more to do with the wishes of the trustee.

PUBLIC HEARINGS:
APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

HRPA 6-03 HISTORIC RESOURCE PRESERVATION AGREEMENT:
CHRISTOPHER ACKERMAN JR., 765 C AVENUE, IN THE R-1B (SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL) ZONE

STAFF REPORT

Associate Planner, Ann McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The property at 765 C Avenue was designated as the City's 21st historic resource on December 4, 2002, by the Historic Resource Commission and is now eligible to apply for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement with the City. A Mills Act Agreement requires the property owner to preserve the home for minimum period of 10 years, and in exchange there is some property tax reduction. She explained that the HRC's role is to review the "list of improvements" that will be attached to the Mills Act application going to the City Council. She added that due to the condition of the home and site evaluation done by staff, Mr. Ackerman does not propose any additional improvements to the property other than routine maintenance over the 10-year contract period.

Applicant, Chris Ackerman, 765 C Avenue said he has recently restored the home and intends to continue to maintain the excellent condition of the restored home as it is.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Walsh said he wasn't on the Commission at the time this property was designated and thought it would only be fair for him to abstain from the vote.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER KEITH MADE A MOTION TO ACCEPT THE LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS CONSISTING OF THE ROUTINE MAINTENANCE OF THE PROPERTY FOR HRPA 6-03 AND FORWARD IT WITH THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION TO THE CITY COUNCIL.

COMMISSIONER RYAN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, Keith, and Ryan

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioner Draper

ABSTAIN: Commissioner Walsh

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0, with one Commissioner absent and one abstention.

HAP 1-03 SANTOS, ANTHONY AND NANCY: REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION OF A HISTORIC RESOURCE ADDRESSED AS 279 C AVENUE IN THE R-3 (MULTIPLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL) ZONE

STAFF REPORT

Assistant Planner, John Swanson introduced the application as outlined in the agenda. He said the City Council designated the front dwelling on the property as a historic resource on November 2, 1999. He explained that the alteration would consist of re-roofing the dwelling using Victorian details and color. Cresting will be added to the roof ridgeline. The proposal also would have the home painted in a Victorian color scheme.

Commissioner Ryan asked if the lot was in the R-3 zone and if it had been split. Mr. Swanson confirmed that it is in the R-3 zone and that the lot has not been split. He reiterated that the rear structure on the lot is not part of the historic designation.

Commissioner Walsh asked if the exterior stairs were a part of the historic portion of the house. Mr. Swanson answered that the applicant proposes to relocate the stairs to the rear of the building where they would not be as prominent. They were added when the home was a boarding house.

Applicants, Nancy and Anthony Santos, 279 C Avenue, confirmed their plan to relocate the stairs to get them out of the public view but didn't have a drawing to show how it would look yet. They also provided a colored rendition of the house as it would look with the new colors. Ms. Santos said the colors are historical and are from American Heritage. Colors that are reproduced appropriate to the period of the Queen Anne Victorian home. She said the colors are a soft yellow for the main field of the house, light moss green on the fish scale, the trim in a darker moss green, and the sash in burgundy, which is very typical of the old Victorian homes. She said the sashes were painted either burgundy or black in those days.

Ms. McCaull pointed out that when the Mills Act agreement was approved for this property there was an extensive list of required improvements, which did include the relocation of the stairs. Ms. Santos showed a photocopy from the San Diego Historical Society of what the home looked like in 1890 (and also showed the crest detail on the roof) and said that is what they intend it to look like when the restoration is complete.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

There was no further discussion.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER KEITH MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 1-03 WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION APPROVING THE ISSUANCE OF A HISTORIC RESOURCE ALTERATION PERMIT FOR THE HISTORIC RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 279 C AVENUE WITH THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS OUTLINED IN THE RESOLUTION:

- A) The proposed alteration is consistent with the purpose and intent of Chapter 70.20 of the Coronado Municipal Code, the Historic Preservation Element, and the General Plan.
- B) The proposed alteration will not adversely affect the historical, architectural or aesthetic value of the Historic Resource.
- C) The proposed alteration will retain the essential elements that make the Historic Resource significant.
- D) The proposed alteration will not adversely affect the Historic Resource's relationship to its surroundings and neighboring Historic Resources.
- E) The proposed alteration will comply with the Secretary of Interior's Standards as set forth in Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966. In the case of a proposed alteration on property located within a Historic District, the alteration does not adversely affect the character of the district.

COMMISSIONER RYAN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, Keith, Walsh, and Ryan

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioner Draper

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0, with one Commissioner absent.

Commissioner Keith requested if, in the future, a list of improvement from any earlier Mills Act agreements be included as part of the background information for any alteration applications. She said she had forgotten what the conditions were for this application since it was quite some time ago. In addition, other Commissioner members may not have been present for those earlier hearings.

HR 4-03 LIPPE & MURPHY FAMILY TRUST: REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF THE SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE LOCATED AT 550 B AVENUE IN THE R-1A(E) (SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL) ZONE

STAFF REPORT

John Swanson introduced the application as outlined in the agenda. He explained that the application states the home was built in 1926 by P.M. Holt for a cost of \$5,000. The building application says it was an English stucco dwelling and garage "Plan # 40". Mr. Holt, a Swedish immigrant who had moved to Coronado from Minnesota, was a notable builder who built several other houses in Coronado. After the home was built it was sold to Carl and Marie Hemenway. Mr. Hemenway was the descendant of four brothers who arrived on the Mayflower and was a pharmacist and eventually part owner of for Furnald Drug (now known as Central Drug) that has been in business in Coronado for over a hundred years. Mr. Swanson said the architectural style is actually in the Tudor Cottage style that was popular in the late 1890's and early 1900's. He pointed out that the dwelling and garage are the only structures that are eligible for historic designation. A guest house, which was built in 1983, is not eligible to be included in the designation.

Applicant, Brian Lippe, 550 B Avenue, said the house is in pretty close to vintage condition. Very few modifications have been made over the years. He said he intends to restore a bedroom that was modified. He said in his investigation he has seen only one other house of this style in town, on J Avenue, but it has been significantly altered. Commissioner Ryan asked if the designation 'Plan #40' meant that this home was built after a standard model of the time. Mr. Lippe said he didn't know.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Ryan recognized Mr. Lippe for his effort and that he was having his home dedicated to preserve it. The other Commissioners were in agreement.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER KEITH MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 4-03, REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 550 B AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY MEETS THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS AND EVENTS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY;

- D. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE TUDOR COTTAGE ARCHITECTURAL STYLE; AND,
- E. IT MEETS THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE.

COMMISSIONER RYAN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, Keith, Walsh, and Ryan

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioner Draper

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0, with one Commissioner absent.

HR 5-03 SUZANNE SCRIBNER TRUST: REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF THE MULTIPLE FAMILY RESIDENCE LOCATED AT 948 D AVENUE IN THE R-3 (MULTIPLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL) ZONE

STAFF REPORT

John Swanson introduced the application as outlined in the agenda. The application states that even though a building permit was not discovered, a City Directory shows that Charles W. and Lewis Carr lived at the residence by at least 1913. In 1915 the Carrs sold the home to William and Lillie Blizard. Mr. Blizard was a motorcycle policeman for the Coronado Police Department and Mrs. Blizard was a real estate agent. In 1944 Mark and Faye Vilim bought the property and subsequently converted it to a five-unit apartment house and rented it to the U.S. Navy. Mr. Swanson indicated that the structure is in the Eclectic Colonial Revival architectural style.

Applicant's representative, Dr. Ray Brandes, 230 West Laurel Street, Ste. 406, San Diego said he had done some more research since the application was submitted. He found that Mr. Carr was not only a member of the Coronado Board of Trustees; he was also the director of Coronado Parks and Trees (Public Services). He explained that the application said the home was rented to the U.S. Navy for the purpose of housing Navy personnel, but the record isn't very clear on the true purpose of the rental. He said that during that period of time several properties were rented for other purposes by the Navy. He knew that the Free Brothers Market was used to employ women to make necessary parts for something that is not known. He expects there were sleeping quarters in the residence, but there are several possibilities for its use. He couldn't say for sure what the use was, however the lease is in itself an unusual document. The interior of the residence was remodeled to make apartments in 1951. Dr. Brandes did a thorough search of the home and could find no signs of any exterior alterations or of a

previously existing front door of any kind. Two apartments at the rear of the property were built too late to be included in the historic designation and should not be considered as a part of this application.

Dr. Brandes also learned that Mrs. Vilim was associated with the Coronado Flower Association for several years and was a president of the National Society of Button Collectors. He divulged that she had “conned” him out of a set of buttons he had found in a home in Germany during his time in the armed service when he helped to liberate Germany. The buttons were very unusual, thick and egg-shaped, and carved with the faces of famous Germans. He said she gave him a few bucks for them. Dr. Brandes mentioned that most of Mrs. Vilim’s sons were gifted musicians. They founded the Vilim Institute of Music in St. Louis. Her son Richard became the director of Radio City Music Hall Symphony Orchestra. Joseph went to the Prague Conservatory of Music where he returned to become a member of the Chicago Conservatory Symphony Orchestra and was a friend of Tchaikovsky, Anton Dvorak, and other prominent musicians of the time.

Dr. Brandes said the home has some elements of the prairie style or a bungalow, but the asymmetrical Colonial style seemed to be the best description. He said the bay windows on the first and second floor and the front of the house, and the half-egg shape of the house was marvelously creative.

Commissioner MacCartee asked if there was ever an open porch on the front. Dr. Brandes said he wasn’t aware there ever was one. There was not even a front door at any time. Commissioner Walsh pointed out that the staff report mentioned the enclosure of the front porch in association with the government lease.

Commissioner Ryan thought it was very foresightful of the Vilim family to purchase the house and immediately turn around and rent it to the government without ever living in it. They bought it for \$7,200 and the rent was \$200 annually, paid in advance on the quarter. Dr. Brandes said he was very curious to know what went on in that house. For those years there were no names in the phone book for that residence.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Scott Smith, 928 10th Street, said he was in attendance because he had received the legal notice and was curious about the designation process and possible affect on neighbors. He said where he came from legal notices were required for variances, which a neighbor might want to know about in advance. Ms. McCaull explained the notification is established by government code and requires notification of all neighbors within 300 feet of the applicant property for discretionary permits. Ms. McCaull said that on occasion the surrounding property owners don’t feel the home is worthy of designation and may want to speak up. Mr. Smith asked if the Mills Act would allow some benefits to a successful applicant and what the impact would be to him. Ms. McCaull answered that with a Mills Act contract the owner of the property is required

to maintain the home as it is for a period of 10 years and in exchange may receive some advantages regarding taxes. Ms. McCaull said the designation may have some benefit to his home, but the neighbor may be able to make some changes that would affect him. Commissioner Ryan added that if this property was torn down and condos built in its place the neighbors would also be notified. Ms. McCaull said there were other changes to the property that would not require legal notification, such as a new single family home being built in the place of the existing structure. Mr. Smith asked where he could get more information on the program. Ms. McCaull said he could contact the Community Development Department and suggested John Swanson would be a good resource.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Walsh said he was struggling with the merit of the application. He doesn't think the home was especially attractive and that despite the research it doesn't seem to live up to being a good example of the eclectic colonial revival architectural style. In addition he didn't see that the persons or events were particularly significant even though they were participants in Coronado's past.

Commissioner Ryan said there seems to be two sides to the discussion. On one hand he also doesn't find the personages or events to be significantly historical or any other criteria other than the age of 74 years. However, the residence is in an R-3 location that will be overtaken in a short amount of time with condominium projects. He leans towards designation of the property in order to preserve it. He said to him the really historical thing you could point to is the lease with the Navy, which seemed to be an amazing real estate deal. And the unknown use of the home during WWII has some mystery to it.

Commissioner Keith said she is in major support of the application, one reason being that it is in the R-3 zone. It may be the only house remaining in the mixed residential area that will show what used to be there. She is appreciative of the owner coming forward to designate the property instead of going after the money they could make. There are plenty of people who would tear it down immediately and put in a condo. Ms. Keith said it may not be beautiful, but it has character. She also said the people are significant in her mind. Mr. Carr, was one of the original members of the Board of Trustees, and as a motorcycle cop in 1915 Mr. Blizard must have been one of only around 2 or 3 policemen in town. He would have been one of the most important people in town being "the motorcycle policeman". She thinks the contract between the Navy and a Coronado homeowner for the mystery use is extremely important. It would be very interesting topic to look into and a good subject for an article.

Commissioner MacCartee said she agrees wholeheartedly with Commissioner Keith. She said she doesn't look at the homes for their beauty, she only considers whether they are representative of Coronado. It is the charm, character, and integrity of what Coronado once was. Ms. MacCartee said it is wonderful that the owner cares enough to

preserve this as a gift to the community. She also agrees that the history of the people who used to live there is fascinating.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER KEITH MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 5-03, REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF THE MULTI-FAMILY RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 948 D AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY MEETS THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY THROUGH THE LEASE WITH THE NAVY;
- C. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY WITH MR. CARR BEING ONE OF THE FIRST DIRECTORS OF THE BOARD OF TREES AND PARKS, AND MR. BLIZARD AS A MOTORCYCLE POLICEMAN; AND,
- D. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE ECLECTIC COLONIAL REVIVAL ARCHITECTURAL STYLE.

COMMISSIONER RYAN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, Keith, and Ryan
NAYS: Commissioner Walsh
ABSENT: Commissioner Draper
ABSTAIN:

The motion passed with a vote of 3-1, with one Commissioner absent.

Ms. McCaull announced that this is the 23rd historically designated property in Coronado.

HR 3-03 BODNAR FAMILY TRUST: REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF THE SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE LOCATED AT 1405 TENTH STREET IN THE R-1A (SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL) ZONE

Commissioner MacCartee indicated for the record that this application had been withdrawn at the request of the applicant

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Commission Review of Proposed Historical Language for the Star Park Sign.

The Commission members discussed whether they should suggest where the sign should be located. Commissioner Keith thought it should be away from open areas where children playing in the park would crash into it, but still be in a central location. She thought that next to the large palm tree would be a good location. Commissioner Ryan commented that the tree might not be there as long as the sign; it could possibly fall to disease or old age. He suggested a central location near the flag or the rock.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER KEITH MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE WORDING ON THE HISTORIC PLAQUE AND RECOMMEND THE PLAQUE BE CENTRALLY LOCATED IN THE PARK (NEAR THE FLAG OR THE ROCK, OR AT THE BASE OF THE LARGE PALM TREE).

COMMISSIONER WALSH SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners MacCartee, Keith, Walsh, and Ryan

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioner Draper

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0, with one Commissioner absent.

Commission Discussion Regarding the Public Outreach Program

Commissioner MacCartee said she and Commissioner Keith spoke with Bill Putnam of Time Warner Cable, who has offered to do a video to go along with the application requesting the designation of the parks. She said he is really excited about this project. Ms. Keith said there is an item in the Eagle asking for people to tell their stories about things that have happened to them in the parks to be included in the video. The plan is for a 15 minute video that is so interesting it feels like 10 minutes. Commissioner MacCartee is in charge of writing the script for the video, but they are still looking for someone to be the voice of the video. Bill Putnam said he can do it if necessary. Commission MacCartee said she still thinks they should ask Ron Clark. Commissioner Ryan said he does have the perfect voice for the part. Ms. Keith said that Mr. Putnam eventually wants to do a documentation of Coronado history via video, like the old Civil War series. She said they have already spoken about a follow-on video about the designated homes.

She said it has been fun for them to do the research. Regarding Cronan Park at 6th and Pomona, the earlier research that was done told them that Willy Cronan was one of eleven people who won the Medal of Honor for helping out during the USS Bennington disaster in San Diego harbor. The Bennington blew up in San Diego Bay in July of 1905.

Spreckel's yacht also participated in saving some of the Navy personnel. But they didn't know why Willy Cronan was selected as one of the honorees besides the fact that he lived nearby on 6th Street. Some time was spent searching online, including the Medal of Honor website. Then they spoke with Ken Mitchell, the PAO for North Island, and finally found in the City archives the resolution in which Lloyd Harmon made the motion naming the park in 1957. There was no reason listed, only the motion. Ms. Keith knew Mrs. Harmon was still alive so she called and spoke with his son-in-law. Mrs. Harmon didn't know the answer, but her son-in-law took it on as a project. He went down to the library and found in the old Eagle & Journal archives Willy Cronan's obituary and a whole article on the park. Commissioner MacCartee said the fun thing is that it is so interesting to find out the details. That is what is going to grab the citizens. A video will be all that much better.

Commissioner Keith said it was discovered that Centennial Park had inadvertently been left off the list of parks that the City Council reviewed, so they will add that back onto the application.

Commission Discussion Regarding the Request to Utilize the Historic Resource Inventory Prepared by Sourcepoint to Create a New, Updated Historic Resource Survey

Ms. McCaull briefed the Committee that the Community Development Director and the City Attorney are still working on their report for the City Council. She said it would be very helpful to have a concise statement from the Commission to explain their intention regarding the use of the inventory. She suggested a subcommittee could prepare a short paragraph to list what the commission's goals and objectives are.

Commissioner Ryan said that could be done very quickly. He said one very important reason is to find out the FACTS. He said it will be very important to be able to present to the citizens and the City Council the specific facts regarding our historic properties. For example, if they could say that out of 9,600 parcels (3,500 of them in the central part of town) only a certain number are eligible for historic designation. This information will be significant education. The topic of historic designation can then be discussed with knowledge of the facts once they are discovered.

Commissioner Ryan said another reason would be for the purpose of outreach to the homeowners of the historic properties; let them know that the City has a program.

Ms. McCaull asked what the Commission's intention is once an inventory has been created? She posed the situation that would occur if there is outreach and people did not want to be on the inventory, what then? She said that staff doesn't want to speak on behalf of the Commission in this area. Commissioner Ryan said that getting all the way to the end point is tricky. In the beginning he would like to get away from the title "inventory". Commissioner MacCartee said that she believes the HRC needs a tool to

know what resources are available; it would be like having an encyclopedia. She would also change the name from inventory. Ms. McCaull reminded them that they had discussed the term "survey" previously.

Commissioner Keith said the actual counting of possible historic homes is important. As is the outreach to the owners. Her 'druthers' would be to have an inventory, but she said she is realistic and knows the City Council wouldn't support an inventory. She said that perhaps it is best to request a lesser purpose for this list.

Commissioner Ryan suggested that it should be called a "Historic Count" since that is what they are trying to get to and to have that be the main purpose.

Commissioner Walsh asked if the single criteria would be purely the age of the home. The other Commissioners agreed. Commissioner Ryan said if the small number of eligible homes was known that might appease some of the developers. They would realize that there were only a small number of properties that wouldn't possibly be available for redevelopment.

MacCartee said the Commission still needs to gain some clout in the community and get some other work done, like get the parks designated. She said that having the count of properties would be a great tool and that is what they want.

Ms. McCaull said that even with the discussion, staff would be much more comfortable with a statement crafted by the Commission. She asked if a couple of commissioners could put something together. Commissioners Ryan and Keith volunteered to work together.

MISCELLANEOUS

None.

FUTURE ITEMS

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:39 p.m.

Tony A. Peña

