

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

January 2, 2008

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:05 p.m., Wednesday, January 2, 2008, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Vice Chair Wilson.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Crenshaw, O'Brien, and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner  
Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Annual Election of Officers. This item was continued due to a lack of quorum.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

**HAP 16-07 MARY KAY BOROJEVICH** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for historically designated residence addressed as 909 D Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from zoning standards.

Ms. McCaull reported that the applicant had requested that the Commission continue this item to the meeting of January 16, 2008.

COMMISSION ACTION

The item was continued. No action was taken.

**HAP 19-07 DAVID UDELL AND TOM LANCASTER** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for historically designated residence addressed as 803 Adella Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from zoning standards.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On December 19, 2007, the Historic Resource Commission designated this residence as an historic resource. At the meeting, it was noted that the owners planned to restore the residence, make some alterations to the home, and construct a new garage on the property. It was noted that these modifications would be the

subject of a future public hearing.

An Historic Alteration Permit has been filed with the City for proposed restoration and alterations planned for the Historic Residence. The project plans depict the improvements planned for the site. The Alteration Permit generally involves changing out two windows on the first floor of the residence to French doors; addition of windows on the third level of the residence; a new balcony at the rear of the building on the third story; and construction of a new two-story, two-car garage.

The owners are also considering changing the color scheme on the building and will clarify the proposed color changes.

The new balcony proposed on the third story of the building is being created by cutting into the existing roof line at the third story attic. The balcony will not extend beyond the existing building envelope. The balcony will have a 5' side yard setback where an 8' side yard setback is required. Other alterations proposed to the dwelling will comply with zoning requirements.

A new two story garage is proposed at the rear of the property. The roof plans do not appear to be consistent with the elevations and should be clarified. With the steep pitch roof, a large volume of area is created and the plans call for an exterior stairwell leading to what is referred to as "attic" space. The current design with the two dormers projecting from the gable roof along with the exterior stairwell leading to habitable space has been designed in such a manner that it qualifies as a "second story" structure rather than an attic. An accessory building with a sloped roof of 6:12 or greater shall not exceed one story and maximum of 15' seven inches in height. That portion of the roof exceeding 14' 4" is limited to a maximum of 15% of the entire building's roof plan area. The proposed building height and number of stories proposed does not comply with zoning regulations and would require the Commission's approval for exceptions to zoning standards.

Director McCaull commented that she has had discussions with the applicants and adjoining property owners who have expressed concern about the size, bulk and mass of the proposed structure.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant, David Udell, 803 Adella Avenue, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions.

Terri Rodgers, 801 Adella Avenue, said his property is located at the rear of 803 Adella. He said he has no objection to the proposed balcony which overlooks his pool. He also commented that he has no issues with the garage as long as the garage height matches the angle of the peaks on the house. He does not support the addition of a second story to the structure.

Larry Hardigan, 731 Adella Avenue, said he lives in the adjacent property. He said he is thrilled that the house is being restored but has concerns with the structure's height and living area above the garage with regard to privacy issues. In addition, he understands there are proposed windows on the third floor which would impede on his property's privacy.

Commissioner Herron asked if windows are being proposed on the third floor.

Mr. Udell responded yes.

Commissioner O'Brien asked if the proposed new windows will match the existing wood casement windows.

Mr. Udell said the windows will be replaced with the same type of window.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Crenshaw asked about the 76 foot rear yard setback when 97 feet is required, and asked if the rear yard slopes downhill.

Director McCaull said the setback requirement is measured from the rear property line going up. She mentioned that this is an unusually large lot in terms of lot depth so it does not have as great an impact as it may have on a standard 140 foot lot depth. The neighbor who lives immediately behind this lot indicated he had no concerns with the balcony and staff has no concerns with this request.

Vice Chair Wilson asked about the color scheme change.

Mr. Udell indicated they will be using a relatively similar color scheme. He said he would like to present to the Commission a more detailed color scheme.

Commissioner O'Brien asked about the proposed window on the third floor and north elevation.

Mr. Udell said the area is relatively narrow and the window is proposed to add natural light to this area.

Commissioner O'Brien agreed with the applicant that this area is not suitable as a living area because it is a constrained space and the windows would add balance and light. Mr. O'Brien said he would support the request.

Vice Chair Wilson said she will also support the request.

### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 19-07 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 803 ADELLA AVENUE, INCLUDING EXCEPTION TO THE ZONING STANDARDS, AS SUBMITTED, WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

1. APPLICANT SHALL RETURN WITH REVISED PLANS FOR THE PROPOSED TWO CAR GARAGE; AND

2. APPLICANT SHALL RETURN WITH DETAILS OF THE PROPOSED COLOR SCHEME.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, O'Brien, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

**HAP 20-07 GWYNETH BENT FAMILY TRUST** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for construction of a new dwelling behind the historically designated residence addressed as 720 G Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On December 5, 2007, the Historic Resource Commission designated this residence as an historic resource. An Historic Alteration Permit has been filed with the City for proposed alterations planned for the site. The application proposes to construct a replacement dwelling at the rear of the site. The property is zoned R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) and allows for two dwellings on the property. Since a residential condominium map has been processed for the site, the development falls under the zoning standards for multiple family dwellings.

The project plans depict the details of the project proposal. The new dwelling proposed at the rear of the site would be two stories with an attic and roof deck. Four parking spaces in a tandem configuration are proposed at the first level. Two of the spaces would be for the historically designated residence at the front of the property and two of the spaces would be for

the new dwelling at the rear of the site. The existing historically designated residence contains 1,595 square feet. The new dwelling would contain approximately 1,500 square feet. The floor area ratio proposed for the site totals 89% which is below the 90% allowed for residential condominiums. The lot coverage proposed for the site totals 57% which is below the 60% allowed by the code. The design features called out on the plans are not necessarily required since this is a residential condominium complex. The proposed building is 28' in height which also complies with code requirements.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant, Gwyneth Bent, 1617 Glorietta Boulevard, speaking on behalf of the Bent Family Trust, made herself available to answer questions.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked if the proposed structure will be visible from the street.

Ms. Bent said it will not be visible.

Vice Chair Wilson asked about the new dwelling not reflecting the same architectural style.

Ms. Bent said it will look similar.

Commissioner O'Brien said he had received written correspondence from a neighbor, Marilyn Mathern, and asked Ms. Bent if she had spoken with Ms. Mathern.

Ms. Bent said she had not spoken with her neighbor recently.

Marilyn Mathern, neighbor, expressed concern with the proposed setback and the lighting impact it may have on her property.

Ms. Bent responded that the setback between the front and rear unit is 10 feet.

Director McCaull displayed the proposed site plan and stated that a 3 foot side yard setback is being proposed. The lot is 25 feet wide and the zoning ordinance requires a 10 percent lot width setback, so a 3 foot side yard setback is required. A variance is not being requested for the setback.

Ms. Bent clarified that this type of request is allowed on an R-3 zone.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Crenshaw said she is delighted that this property was designated because it is located in an R-3 zone. She understands that no exceptions are being requested and has no issues.

Commissioner O'Brien said he is prepared to support the request.

Vice Chair Wilson said she is concerned that the City's ordinance is written in such a manner as

to allow this type of request.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 20-07 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW DWELLING BEHIND THE HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 720 G AVENUE, AS SUBMITTED.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, O'Brien, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

**HAP 21-07 FRED AND MARTHA JAY** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for addition to existing garage and construction of a carriage house above for the historically designated dwelling addressed as 700 B Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from zoning standards.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On April 18, 2007, the Historic Resource Commission designated this residence as an historic resource. An Historic Alteration Permit has been filed with the City for proposed alterations planned for the historically designated property. The application proposes to construct an addition to an existing

garage and build a carriage house above. The alteration permit also requests zoning code relief for the carriage house.

One Carriage House is permitted on a single family residential zone lot with both street and alley access subject to standards A-O as identified in the zoning ordinance. Staff review of the proposal indicates the Carriage House does not comply with sections C and D. Section C requires that the second story level be set back a maximum of five feet from the rear property line versus the 6' setback proposed with the carriage house. Section D indicates that no portion of the carriage house structure shall extend beyond 26' from the rear property line. The proposal has the carriage extending 28' beyond the rear property line which exceeds the code by 2'. When the project is completed the site will have a 48% floor area ratio and 30% lot coverage which are well below the allowable standards for the site.

Ms. McCaull stated she had received several telephone calls from neighbors in the vicinity. Most tended to be concerned with the size of the carriage house. There have been other carriage houses proposed in the vicinity; some larger than 500 sq. ft. This proposed carriage house does comply with the 500 sq. ft. size allowance. In addition, the design is intended to match the home at 700 B Avenue.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant, Martha Jay, 700 B Avenue, made herself available to answer questions. She said she has spoken with her neighbor who lives immediately adjacent to her property, and who is very supportive of the proposed alteration.

Commissioner O'Brien asked staff to provide an update on the Carriage House regulations.

Director McCaull said a subcommittee was formed, comprised of Council members, Community Development staff, and members who were original participants in the Carriage House Regulations subcommittee. There have been concerns expressed by previous committee members as well as the general public that carriage houses are too large. The proposed standards would reduce the size of carriage houses and provide clarity in terms of access to carriage houses. Currently, internal access to carriage houses is allowed; the proposal is that it be mostly external. The idea is to limit internal access from the garage in order to minimize the possibility of easily converting it into a dwelling unit; carriage houses cannot be rented out separately. There is also an effort being made to try to control the bulk and mass of the structure in the attic or roof area. The new ordinance is not anticipated to be in force for at least three months. In addition, it has been City Council's policy that once an application has been submitted, it is covered under the old ordinance.

Commissioner Crenshaw asked for clarification on Section C and D of the zoning ordinance, which is not being complied with.

The applicant's representative, Kevin Rugee, 1024 Isabella Avenue, gave a brief overview of the request and answered question. Mr. Rugee clarified that the reason for the rear encroachment is that they are trying to use the existing garage as the base footprint and take the sloped roof up from the perimeter walls. With regard to the bulk and mass scale, the ridge height and floor area are within the current zoning standards.

### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Crenshaw asked staff about the concerns expressed by surrounding property owners.

Director McCaull said telephone calls were received from Ms. Adreason and Dr. Margaret Meadows, who asked for clarification about the project proposal, Code exceptions, and size of the carriage house. They indicated they would contact Mr. and Ms. Jay directly.

Ms. Jay said she spoke with Jean Nurdning, who owns the property south of her home. She also spoke with the condominium owner whose property is located at the rear of her property.

Commissioner O'Brien said he is willing to support the request including the proposed carriage house as it meets current square footage requirements.

Vice Chair Wilson said she will also support the request.

### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 21-07 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT FOR ADDITION TO EXISTING GARAGE AND CONSTRUCTION OF A CARRIAGE HOUSE ABOVE FOR THE HISTORICALLY DESIGNATED DWELLING ADDRESSED AS 700 B AVENUE, INCLUDING EXCEPTION TO THE ZONING STANDARDS, AS SUBMITTED.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.

E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, O'Brien, and Wilson.  
NAYS: None.  
ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee.  
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 3-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:02 p.m.

---

Tony A Peña  
Director of Community Development