

# CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

## MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

January 15, 2003

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:05 p.m., Wednesday, January 15, 2003, in the Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Florence Draper, Vice Chair of the Historic Resource Commission.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Draper, Keith, Ryan and MacCartee

MEMBERS ABSENT:

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner  
John Swanson, Assistant Planner  
Linda Hascup, Secretary

### DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull welcomed new Commissioner Gerry MacCartee to the Commission who was recently appointed by the City Council to fill a vacancy on the Commission. She welcomed back Commissioner Jon Ryan who was previously on the Commission representing the Design Review Commission and is now representing the Planning Commission.

She also provided some information regarding recent increasing interest in the Historic Preservation Program and how it has been growing; it is truly a success. Since the new Historic Resource Ordinance was adopted in 1998, 16 homes have been designated through the program, 8 of which have entered into Mills Act Agreements. There are currently 21 homes total designated as historic resources for the City. The City most recently approved the Speer/Steirer and Adams properties for Mills Act agreements. She said that there is now a link on the City of Coronado website [www.coronado.ca.us](http://www.coronado.ca.us) to information about the preservation program, get applications, etc.

### **Annual Meeting for Election of Officers**

Commissioner Keith suggested that the Commission continue this item to the next meeting when there is a full Commission. The other Commissioners agreed to wait to the next meeting.

### APPROVAL OF MINUTES

There were no minutes for approval.

### COMMITTEE REPORTS

There were no Committee Reports.

### ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Commissioner Keith wanted to ask how many applications are in the process for designation at this time. Ms. McCaull said that there is one submitted, two more are coming in, and there is an application for Mills Act that has been received.

### APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

**HAP 1-02**      **MOORE, JOSEPH AND KAREN** – Proposed change to previously issued Historic Alteration Permit for the single family residence at 520 B Avenue in the R-1A(E) (Single Family Residential) Zone.

### STAFF REPORT

Ms. McCaull said that this property was designated as historic on September 18, 2002 and on October 30 the Commission approved a historic alteration permit for the demolition of an existing garage and construction of a two-car garage with a guest suite above at the second story. The Moore's are now proposing a change to their previous plan regarding the windows. Because it does change the look of the windows, staff felt that the Commission might want to review this proposal.

Applicant's architect, Kevin Rugee, 1024 Isabella, brought in a sample of the window they proposed to use. Originally the Moore's were originally planning to replace existing aluminum windows with wood windows to match some of the original wood windows that were on the structure and to match the windows on the addition with the original wood windows. They are now proposing to use wood windows wrapped with a metal clad material. He said the metal wraps around the exterior and the wood shows on the side. Because the window trim color is dark green, which can take a beating from the elements and the sun. The clad windows will retain color better and will require less maintenance. Mr. Rugee said it is a dual glazed window with a 7/8" divided mutton and will be very close to what the original design was. The color will also be a dark green, but is not identical to the current color, but it is guaranteed for 20 years and it can be painted.

Commissioner Keith asked about the one small window on the side of the house. Mr. Rugee answered that the little window with lattice near the front door will remain as it because it was one of the design elements highlighted in the original request for designation. All of the windows on the sides, which are currently white vinyl and don't match the historic windows, will be changed to the new windows. Commissioner Keith said that she understands how difficult the maintenance on a darkly painted window can be because her home has dark brown on it.

Applicant's contractor, Lorton Mitchell, 517 Adella Lane, said that this is a high-end window that will last a long time and still maintain the historic integrity of the property.

## PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

## COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Keith said that she does like wooden windows, but this is a good-looking window that is mostly wood with the metal clad and they are replacing the non-matching vinyl windows. These windows are better than vinyl and do respect the historicity of the house. Commissioner Ryan said that most of the buildings going through historic designation have wooden windows. He said he would have an issue if the standard would be changed by moving to metal windows. He said that when people take on older properties they have to understand that they are, by their nature harder to maintain than a modern house. However, this application is a difficult example because there is only one window facing the street that will be replaced, so maybe this isn't the one to take a stand on. Mr. Ryan said that this would be an instance where the Commission should make a statement for the record that issues such as this are decided on a case by case basis and that this decision is not precedent setting. Chairman Draper said that she agreed that this decision is not precedent setting and that she didn't believe the Commission would not be very favorable of replacing all of the windows with something that is not wooden.

## COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER KEITH MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 1-02 MODIFICATION TO THE PREVIOUSLY APPROVED HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT AS SUBMITTED.

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Keith, Ryan, and MacCartee

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

**HRPA 3-02** **DIMATTEO** - Request for Historic Resource Preservation Agreement: DiMatteo, James P., 1236 Alameda Boulevard in the R-1A (Single Family) Residential Zone.

## STAFF REPORT

Mr. Swanson, Assistant Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said this property was designated as a historic resource by the City of Coronado on October 30, 2002 and is now eligible to apply for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement with the City of Coronado. He explained that the HRC is to review the "list of improvements" that will be attached to the Mills Act application going to the City Council. Mr. Swanson mentioned the

DiMatteo's are not proposing any improvements to the property other than routine maintenance over the 10-year contract period.

Commissioner Keith pointed out that there were some potential improvements listed on the Mills Act Agreement application that included a potential expansion of the kitchen and an addition to two bedrooms in the northwest quadrant of the house per attached expansion plans. Mr. Swanson pointed out that Mr. O'Brien, the applicant's representative, had submitted a letter stating that the DiMatteo's do not currently contemplate any improvements or modifications. Ms. McCaull added that the context of the list of improvements is for general maintenance work and items that would be occurring on the historic property. The type of improvements listed on the application would require a different type of application, a Historic Alteration Permit application, and are not really improvements of the type that would go the list before the Commission today.

Applicant's representative, John O'Brien, 101 Ocean Drive, Coronado said that he had previously owned this property and restored it. He commented that the fiscal the cap imposed on Mills Act benefits in Coronado was a real disincentive for people who would like to designate their properties in the future in the hopes of receiving this tax break. If the DiMatteo's application is approved by the City Council, they won't be able to receive a break until November of 2004 due to the cap. He said he thinks there is a better way to address this cap and said this might not be the appropriate time and place to get into this in discussion, but he would like to eventually propose to the City Council that the price of the property prior to be resale be the basis of the computation of taxes. He said that the tax on the property prior to restoration and resale was a great deal less than the property is worth now. The City's income would not be affected as much if the previous home price was utilized as the basis.

Commissioner Draper said that perhaps the Commission could ask staff to look into this. Commissioner Ryan said that he also felt the Commission should discuss it. Commissioner Keith said that perhaps it should be on the next agenda as a discussion item as they couldn't discuss it today. Ms. McCaull said that she could put it on the next agenda.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

Dave Ditzler, 1051 G Avenue asked several questions about the historic preservation program. Chairman Draper and Ms. McCaull explained how the process works as to designation and Mills Act contracts, etc.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

There was no further Commission discussion.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER KEITH MADE A MOTION TO ACCEPT THE LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS FOR HRP 3-02 CONSISTING OF THE MAINTENANCE OF THE PROPERTY AND FORWARD IT TO THE CITY COUNCIL.

COMMISSIONER RYAN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Keith, Ryan, and MacCartee

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

**HAP 3-02**      **DR. RAYMOND J. AND NANCYE M. SPLINTER TRUSTEES** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit to alter the historic single-family residence located at 1027 G Avenue in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

### STAFF REPORT

Mr. Swanson, Assistant Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said that the home at 1027 G Avenue was designated as historic on December 9, 1998. He described the project which will consist of a single story addition in the rear of the property and that all of the windows in the addition will match as closely as possible the existing original windows.

Commissioner Keith commented that the pictures are much better than have been received in the past. You can actually see the house. Mr. Swanson explained that this is a new requirement of the Community Development Department.

Applicant, Dr. Raymond (Chip) Splinter, 1027 G Avenue. He addressed Mr. Ditzler's question of why the historic preservation program is a benefit to the public. He said that the community gives a tax break to someone who gives a view easement to something that is beneficial to the community. This helps preserve something that makes the community a better place. It's just a valuable to the community as an easement that allows access to the beach. Commissioner Draper added that not only is a benefit provided to the community, but the property owner also has obligations.

Dr. Splinter gave some of the background on the property. He said that they had to fight with a previous bidder who was going to tear the house down. Part of the restoration that he and his wife are doing includes the reuse of windows that they have removed from the cottages owned by PacBell that are slated for demolition very soon. He said that he moved in at the last minutes to salvage the materials from those buildings. He pointed out on a drawing where there were original doors and windows and where he plans to insert PacBell windows and a new door. The reason for inserting the additional windows is to provide additional circulation on the west side. He said the siding they are using is special, cut by a circular saw that leaves a circular pattern. He has spent a lot of time trying to find matching siding, but it just is not available, so they will take off the existing siding, preserve it, and reapply it to sections of the home that are more visible, using new siding in other less visible areas, possibly mixing it with the old siding in a pattern. He provided a sample of a ridge-capped shingle that is virtually undetectable from the original shingles and has a 40 year guarantee. He explained that there may be some issues in trying to meet energy codes and Title 9 because these windows are single-paned and draughty.

The whole house is draughty. He was wondering if the building codes can be eased because this is a historic structure.

All of the Commissioners gave compliments to the applicant. Commissioner Ryan said that this is a benchmark presentation and he is a benchmark presentation. It would have been good to be able to tape this as a training film for future applicants. He appreciates that the Splinters want to retain the integrity of the building. He suggested that another discussion item for a future agenda might be how the Historic Preservation Ordinance would give the Commission the ability to provide relief from some building codes for windows, etc.

Chairman Draper brought up the fact that it was pointed out in the application where the new work was differentiated from the old work and shall be compatible in size, color, shape, architectural feature, etc. She understands the reason for the standards. Mr. Splinter responded that this home was nothing but a "kit" Oriental Craftsman. He said that the builder of this home was the only Asian builder in Coronado and built a quality home; the house hasn't sagged a quarter of an inch in 100 years. This particular period was an era of great construction; there are a lot of windows to let in light because electricity wasn't as widely available in those days. He wouldn't want to compromise on the originality of the home. Mr. Splinter said that the previous owner of the home was Wiley Wilson who was an eccentric preservationist.

Ms. McCaull responded that there is a section in the Historic Preservation Ordinance currently that provides exceptions for historic homes by using the State Historical Building Code. She would work with the City's building inspector to see what could be done. The applicant will be available for a waiver of building permit fees outside of those that are a direct cost to the City, such as plan check fees done by the City's outside consultant.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

Dave Ditzler, 1051 G Avenue, rebutted Dr. Splinter's statement that this easement is as good as a view easement, saying that it is only an opinion. He had several other questions that staff and Commission members attempted to address. Ms. McCaull offered to spend some time with Mr. Ditzler to explain the program more thoroughly.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Keith said that what the Splinters are doing is exactly what we want to see in Coronado. She especially lauded the saving of the windows of the buildings being torn down by PacBell. She said not enough of Babcock Court was saved back when it was torn down. Every house has to be a livable house, a home, besides just being a house and what the Splinters have done already is a terrific.

Commissioner Ryan said that the Splinter's need to be complemented for the record because this is a benchmark application and the Splinters have shown true leadership.

Commissioner MacCartee said that she wanted to complement and thank the Splinters' In their case there are many papers of Dr. Wilson's in the historical association and hoped that they go read them.

### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER KEITH MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 3-02 WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION APPROVING THE ISSUANCE OF A HISTORIC RESOURCE ALTERATION PERMIT FOR THE HISTORIC RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 1027 G AVENUE WITH THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS OUTLINED IN THE RESOLUTION:

- A) The proposed alteration is consistent with the purpose and intent of this Chapter, the Historic Preservation Element and the General Plan.
- B) The proposed alteration will not adversely affect the historical, architectural or aesthetic value of the Historic Resource.
- C) The proposed alteration will retain the essential elements that make the Historic Resource significant.
- D) The proposed alteration will not adversely affect the Historic Resource's relationship to its surroundings and neighboring Historic Resources.
- E) The proposed alteration will comply with the Secretary of Interior's Standards as set forth in Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966. In the case of a proposed alteration on property located within a Historic District, the alteration does not adversely affect the character of the district.

COMMISSIONER RYAN SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Keith, Ryan, and MacCartee

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

### DISCUSSION ITEMS

Commissioner Ryan provided information on the Planning Commission meeting the previous day. He said that two of the Commissioners expressed interest in destruction of the 1038 E Avenue property. He said that the Commission currently is looking at designating the park system and working on an outreach program. He advised the Planning Commissioners that there is nothing HRC can do because designation is voluntary. They requested that the HRC discusses how the potential loss of historic structures in Coronado could be prevented in the future. Ms. Draper said she had a conversation with that director of Coronado Historical Association (CHA) on this subject and Mr. Pena may be receiving a call from the CHA before too long.

The Commissioners agreed that they would like to discuss on the next agenda what can be done in the future to protect non-designated properties that may be historic.

MISCELLANEOUS

FUTURE ITEMS

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:25 p.m.

---

Tony A. Peña  
Director of Community Development