

CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

February 4, 2004

A regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m., Wednesday, February 4, 2004, at the Coronado Police Department Emergency Operations Center, 700 Orange Avenue, California, by Susan Keith, Chair of the Historic Resource Commission.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Draper, Keith, Wilson, and Herron

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
John Swanson, Assistant Planner
Linda Hascup, Administrative Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Minutes of the Regular Meeting of January 7, 2004 were continued due to lack of a quorum.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Form 700 - Ms. McCaull informed the Commission that annually each city official must fill out a Form 700, Statement of Economic Interests. This year they are due on March 24 to the secretary.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

None.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Chairman Keith welcomed new Commissioners Mona Wilson and Deni Herron.

PUBLIC HEARINGS:
APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

HRPA 1-04 Marno McDermott - Request for a Historic Resource Preservation Agreement for the Single Family Residence located at 1313 Tenth Street in the R-1A(E) (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Mr. Swanson, Assistant Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. He said the home was designated as the City's 24th historic resource by the City of Coronado on November 5, 2003 and is now eligible to apply for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement with the City of Coronado. A Mills Act Agreement requires the property owner to preserve the home for minimum period of 10 years, and in exchange there is some property tax reduction. He explained that the HRC's role is to review the "list of improvements" that will be attached to the Mills Act application going to the City Council. Due to the condition of the home the applicant is not proposing any improvements to the property other than routine maintenance over the 10-year term of the contract. He indicated that the applicant, Marno McDermott was present to answer questions.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper asked how long the applicant would have to wait to have the Mills Act contract approved by the City Council because of the lack of funding for the program and if it would be of benefit to hold any further applications until after the upcoming joint meeting with the Councilmembers on this topic. Ms. McCaull said the Council generally prefers to approve Mills Act Contracts in the order received, however because of funding limitations they may, on occasion, approve a contract for a property with less financial impact ahead of an earlier application; there is no guarantee of the order of approval. Chairman Keith said her recommendation would be to forward the application to the City Council and let them make the decision about the processing of Mills Act contracts.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS CONSISTING OF THE ROUTINE MAINTENANCE OF THE PROPERTY FOR 1313 10TH STREET (HRPA 1-04) AND FORWARD IT TO THE CITY

COUNCIL WITH THE HISTORIC RESOURCE PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 4-0 with one Commissioner absent. Ms. McCaull advised the applicant that she would notify him of the City Council hearing date.

HAP 1-04 **721 D Coronado Inc.** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit to permit the restoration of the building to its original condition and request for an exception to parking, storage, and density requirements associated with the conversion of the apartment complex to condominiums for the property addressed as 721-727 ½ D Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said that at the January meeting the Commission took a tour of this property and approved its historic designation. The applicant, represented by Ann Keyser, will be restoring the building to the original French Normandy architectural style and is in the process of requesting a conversion of the apartments to condominiums. The restoration will entail sandblasting, re-stuccoing, re-roofing, some interior alterations, electrical and plumbing upgrades, and a new pitched roof for the garage.

Ms. McCaull explained that this project is a different from the earlier project submitted by Ms. Keyser in that the property site is more physically constrained. Along with the condo conversion the applicant is requesting some relief from zoning code regulations which the Commission is empowered to grant. The property currently has 5 parking spaces in a garage for the 6 units. Current code would require 12 spaces (2 for each of the 6 spaces) for the 6 units however there is no room either on the property or off the alley to provide the additional parking. In addition Ms. Keyser is asking to provide 100 cubic feet per unit rather than the code required 200 cubic feet. The only methods to accomplish this would be to utilize the open space between the main building and the garages or to build a second story on top of the garage.

Ms. McCaull said a third area is regarding the number of dwelling units. This lot is zoned is R-3 and is 7,000 sq.ft. in size. Normally the zoning ordinance would allow 4 dwelling units on the property, however the site currently contains 6 units, which the applicant would like to retain. The Historic Preservation Ordinance does allow the Commission to use their discretion in allowing a density bonus to permit the two extra units to remain. Interestingly enough, if the existing apartment complex were to be

demolished involuntarily, the current code allows it to be rebuilt to 6 units, which would be a fact to keep in mind. The site does comply with both the Floor Area Ratio (FAR) and lot coverage standards, and what exists on the site today is far less than what might be seen with a new condominium project.

Applicant, Ann Keyser, 271 Alameda Boulevard showed renderings of the project and further explained the improvements and landscaping. She explained how the current garage could be reconfigured for 5 parking spaces, but how it just isn't large enough to provide any more without demolishing it and making uncovered or carport style spaces.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairman Keith said the Commission is acting in lieu of the Design Review and Planning Commissions on the design and planning elements, which is one of the reasons those commissions are represented by a member each on the HRC. The questions are whether the Commission will allow: 1) the 6 units to remain because zoning density allows only 4; 2) less than current standards for parking, and; 3) less than the 200 cubic feet of storage space that is required today but was not when the apartments were built.

Commissioner Wilson said she has no objection from the design, color, and style point of view. She said the only issues seem to be regarding the amount of storage and parking and stated she had no objection to the applicant's proposal.

Commissioner Herron said she respects Ms. Keyser's preservation and development work and encourages her to continue in this work. She said this would seem to be an affordable housing option in Coronado and may attract teachers and working people who can live and work in the community. She said that parking is a major issue here, but there has to be some give and take in order to keep this beautiful building. She said we would have to make do with what has already been there. And the positive is that none will be eliminated. With the storage - do the best you can with what you have.

Commissioner Draper seconded Ms. Herron's statements. She said the garage is a much nicer alternative to a carport. She said she is delighted with this application and looks forward to when the property is be refurbished. She said it will be a lovely improvement, and better for the neighborhood.

Chairman Keith said this would be the first time she has ever considered voting for increased density or reduced parking but in this case it is the right thing to do. She thanked the applicant for saving another wonderful property for the City.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO ADOPT A RESOLUTION APPROVING THE ISSUANCE OF A HISTORIC RESOURCE ALTERATION PERMIT FOR THE HISTORIC RESIDENCE ADDRESSED AS 721 - 727 ½ D AVENUE (HAP 1-04) WITH THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS OUTLINED IN THE RESOLUTION:

- A. The proposed alteration is consistent with the purpose and intent of Chapter 70.20 of the Coronado Municipal Code, the Historic Preservation Element, and the General Plan.
- B. The proposed alteration will not adversely affect the historical, architectural or aesthetic value of the Historic Resource.
- C. The proposed alteration will retain the essential elements that make the Historic Resource significant.
- D. The proposed alteration will not adversely affect the Historic Resource's relationship to its surroundings and neighboring Historic Resources.
- E. The proposed alteration will comply with the Secretary of Interior's Standards as set forth in Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 4-0 with one Commissioner absent.

HR 13-02 **City of Coronado** – Review of Application of Historic Designation of City Parks and Recommendation to the City Council.

Chairman Keith opened the item and announced that it was continued to the March 3, 2004 meeting due to the availability of the parks video.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Selection of Representative to Coronado Historical Association

Ms. McCaull said that during the last meeting there was some discussion as to whether it would be appropriate for the HRC send a representative to attend CHA meetings on a regular basis. She and Paige Harrington, Executive Director of CHA, discussed the idea and propose that the two organizations set up a joint meeting on a quarterly basis. This would allow all of the members of the HRC to attend and would allow the most discussion between the two groups. Chairman Keith said the recent meeting with CHA was very helpful and requested that the quarterly meetings be set up as soon as possible so they could keep the momentum going and not lose what has been gained already.

Barbara DiMichele, of CHA asked if a date had been set for the joint meeting between HRC and the City Council. Ms. McCaull said that it is scheduled for March 3, the next regular HRC meeting.

Commission Discussion Regarding the Public Outreach Program

Plaques: Chairman. Keith announced that the plaques have been received and the only thing is to decide how and where to make the presentations to the property owners. She said they the options could be to present them at a council meeting, at the joint meeting with the Council, or as a special event at the library, etc. Commissioner Wilson thought the public would be more aware if the presentations occurred at a council meeting.

Ms. McCaull explained that the City Manager had requested the presentation plaques take place at a separate event rather than at a City Council meeting. Commissioner Herron said there are presentations for many other groups such as the water polo kids and awards for the turkey coloring contest, etc. The other Commissioners agreed and talked about how to do keep the presentation short. Their thought was that it needed to be done in a way to bring attention to the program and the City Council meeting is televised. Chairman Keith said it wouldn't take long to read a name and an address and hand out a plaque, or if there was a short A/V presentation the mayor wouldn't even have to read off the names; just hand out the plaques. She volunteered to speak with the City Manager if necessary.

Ms. Harrington of said that CHA would love to host a small wine and cheese reception for the homeowners as a thank you after whatever presentation is made.

Commissioner Draper asked what would be done about the properties designated after the plaques were ordered. There were three who would be left out this time. Ms. McCaull said that when the plaque project began the Commission thought 25 would be enough to last at least two years, but more applications have been processed than expected. She explained that the funds for the plaques were not budgeted and were coming out of the Community Development materials budget, so the Commission may need to think about requesting a budget.

Barbara DiMichele suggested 1536 Glorietta Blvd said they are planning to do a presentation with photos – maybe an AV kind of thing to make it faster.

Ann Keyser – how much do plaques cost? Ms. McCaull said they are \$100 each.

Draper – do it in March or wait till May for National Historic month. McCaull – in May there is usually a proclamation announcing National Historic Preservation month. Do it then? Keith – asked if Ms. McCaull would bring it up with the CM or should they send representatives. Ms. McCaull cautioned that the CM has preferred not to do PowerPoint presentations. Keith – well OK if that's the way it has to be.

Video: Chairman Keith said the video is still being produced. Bill Putnam, who has been reassigned away from Coronado, turned production of the video over to two other TimeWarner technicians. Ms. McCaull reported that they are still moving forward with the video. Ms. Keith said the video is important to show the history of the parks and will enhance the written application. The editing is what is taking time.

Articles in Eagle & Journal: Chairman Keith announced that the second article was published in the current Eagle. She said the 3rd article is coming due and proposed that Commissioner MacCartee might be willing to write the next one. She said the articles are important to keep the historic preservation program in the light. Ms. McCaull offered that there is a notebook in the Community Development Department that provides all the information on each designated house. It could be helpful to future article writers.

Newsletter: Chairman Keith said Commissioner MacCartee had the idea for the Commission to put out a newsletter. It could be a one pager that perhaps come out quarterly and could provide such features as a spotlight on a historic property, a historic park, a list of demolition permits, highlight of a restoration or renovation, the Martinez mural, historic facts, etc. Ms. McCaull said she contacted the Eagle and found that an insert distributed to 12,500 addresses would cost approximately \$525. If a color display style article was done it would cost \$613. The ideas are great, but there is no budget for them at this time. She explained the Council's policy at this time is for no growth in the next year's budget. She said quarterly might be possible, but it would require City Council approval first. They would want to know what it is about and perhaps see a prototype.

Commissioner Draper said the articles the Commissioner is publishing now are free and she would like to see the meager funds saved for the Mills Act contracts. She suggested that perhaps the series of free articles in the paper could be expanded to include other informative material such as information regarding demolitions, the parks, etc. Commissioner Herron said perhaps the Commission could use a student journalist as a volunteer and also mentioned that the City website could be used to post additional information. Ms. McCaull offered that there is information about the Historic Resource program, but perhaps the plaque could be added and photos of the

designated homes and a list of the inventory. Chairman Keith pointed out that the main purpose is for this Commission to disseminate information about Historic Preservation. She said maybe a newsletter could be put together for people to subscribe to on the website just like they do for agendas, minutes, and the City's monthly newsletter "Currents".

Chairman Keith asked that this item stay on the agenda for next month and discuss ideas again. Ms. McCaull said she would contact Vicki Raun at the Eagle to see if they are willing to do a preservation corner in the newspaper every other month. She said she could get information about publishing a newsletter on the website.

Flower Show: Chairman Keith said the Commission has hosted a booth at the flower show for the last three years. She said it has been very successful in reaching the public; a lot of people ask questions and a lot of information is handed out. The walking tour was popular as were the pictures. She was wondering if the Commission members were interested to do a booth this year. Commissioner Draper said she would be out of state so can't organize it as she has done for the last few years. She said she had very good notes on how to do it if someone else was willing to take it over this year. Ms. McCaull said that last year there was a suggestion to do a map showing the location of all the homes. Commissioner Keith said she would have time to work on a map. Commissioner Keith said she is in charge of the plant sale so can't set it up, but can help man the booth. She said this should be on the next agenda to discuss further since there is some time.

Slide Show: Ms. McCaull said that Commissioner Ryan had an idea to provide a slide show to Time Warner for them to run as filler between shows just like they re-run the high school parade and other local events. The Commissioners decided it would be better to wait until the park video is done before asking Time Warner for something new.

Volunteers as part of the Public Outreach Program:

Chairman Keith suggested that this item be continued until Commissioner MacCartee is present.

Archival Project of City Records:

Chairman Keith said this will be a fun project once it gets started. It could be a lot of fun trying to find out who some of the people and what the locations in the old photos are. She asked the other Commissioners to actively recruit people as volunteers who have been around for some time (people like Patty Schmidt and Lance Massey from CHA) who might have some historic knowledge and know who people in photos are. Ms. McCaull indicated that the archival materials which were ordered are due to arrive within the next week.

Commission Discussion Regarding Ocean Boulevard Seawall Designation
(CONTINUED to the next meeting)

Commission Discussion Regarding the Historic Preservation "Mills Act" Program and Fiscal Restrictions

Chairman Keith said this would be the subject of the joint meeting with the City Council on March 3. There has been some concern that the HRC and CC are not on the same wavelength regarding the direction of the program and what it is trying to accomplish. She said everyone in this group is aware that there was a fiscal cap put on funding for the Mills Act Program. She said that Commissioner Draper pointed out earlier in the meeting that it will be 2006 before there will be funding available for anyone new to enter into a Mills Act Contract with the City. She said it would be good to discuss some ideas to gain Council's interest to provide more money for the program. The earlier attempt was not received well so that is why a joint meeting has been scheduled. She said that this commission is new enough so people don't understand the reason for historic preservation. It is this commission's job to convince them of the benefits to the community. Chairman Keith said perhaps the commissioners should discuss how to word their request; would they want the increase to be a percentage of increased property taxes or a named amount? She said she understands that a Councilmember has to look at the overall picture and not just support their pet projects. They need to be instructed on what the benefits of the program are to the City overall.

Commissioner Wilson said she was surprised to hear that an increase in the program wasn't well received. She said her idea would be to go back to the Council in a positive way and say this is something that needs to be done. She remembers that first presentation when she was still on the Council and it seems the original figure for funding the program was somewhat arbitrary. Now there is some experience to base a realistic figure on.

Commissioner Herron said if we inventory the historic homes in town we could know how much it would cost overall and ask for that. Ms. McCaull explained why an inventory has been a controversial topic in the past. The Commission did previously ask the Council if they would be allowed to update an old list to try to determine how many historic properties there could possibly be, and how many of those might be expected to request historic designation and then request Mills Act contracts. They thought this would be a good way to give the City Council an estimate of how much funding the program would need overall. The Commission believed the estimate would be around 150 or 200 properties. The Council did not approve the request. Commissioner Draper added that the Commission thought their request was reasonable and would be well received, but the council is extremely sensitive still on that subject.

Ms. McCaull explained that the City's program is voluntary, and the existence of an "inventory" of potentially eligible properties, changes the nature of the program in that if an owner of one of those properties wanted to remodel or demolish the building they would be subject to CEQA. That is seen by some as taking away property rights and is why the "inventory" is somewhat controversial. Commissioner Wilson said she remembered the decision to throw out the inventory 15 or 20 years ago was because of one person's the severe criticism of the inventory. Perhaps times have changed since then.

Commissioner Draper reminded the Commissioners of Councilmember Tanaka's advice at a recent HRC meeting. He explained why the Council reacted the way they did to the previous increase in funding request. He said they would be reticent to approve a percentage of anything; it would be better to just ask for a certain amount of money. Ms. Draper said the City Council didn't know the program would do so well or how well the community would respond to it. She said the original budget amount was really a guestimate of how many properties would be in the program. It was originally thought that only a couple of properties a year would apply. It needs to be pointed out how successful the program has been.

Ms. McCaull said it may have been a little overwhelming to the City Council to see how many Mills Act applications were pending and that the request was to approve them all. She said she heard Councilmember Tanaka saying that they would be receptive to a minor increase in the program. She said she would encourage the Commission to mention the other ideas they have for historic preservation; that it isn't just the Mills Act, but a combination of things they would like to do - things that the City Council appointed them to do and why the Commission was created.

Commissioner Keith pointed out the Coronado's standards for historic designation are stricter than other cities. The requirement is 75 years of age instead of 50. And the Mills Act program is only exclusive to residential properties, rather than being more inclusive. She said that if some changes were made to the program, she had a couple of ideas.

Commissioner Draper said there was some controversy at the Council meeting regarding whether homes that were renovated prior to their designation should be eligible for a Mills Act contract in Coronado. There are some people who consider themselves historic preservation purists who think that the Federal Department of the Interior requirements are broken when the homes are have any renovation done prior to applying for historic designation. They also are concerned that a modified historic home should not be allowed to enter into a Mills Act Contract. These people feel it isn't right to do it that way. She said the subject might come up again and thought the Commission should have an answer on the subject. Ms. McCaull said she heard that the controversy seems to be that the restorations were not true to the original nature of the homes - that they were altered significantly through the restoration. She said that

the City however, has the ability to set their own standards for allowing Mills Act benefits and do not have to meet the stricter standard in order to enter into a Mills Act contract. The City can implement the program in any way they want. Ms. McCaull said that the point could be made that those homeowners should be commended for taking on the renovation before they have a contract.

MISCELLANEOUS

None.

FUTURE ITEMS

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:36 p.m.

Tony A. Peña