HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting December 5, 2007

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m., Wednesday, December 5, 2007, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson MacCartee.

MEMBERS PRESENT:	Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee O'Brien, and Wilson
MEMBERS ABSENT:	None
STAFF PRESENT:	Ann McCaull, Associate Planner Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of November 7, 2007 were approved as submitted.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Director McCaull reported that, at the City Council meeting yesterday, the City Council voted to approve Mills Act Agreements for 1313 10th Street, 1015 Flora, and 1043 Ocean Boulevard, which is the Spreckels Mansion. The City Council also granted a special exception allowing the project to exceed the fiscal cap that has been established for the program. Another noteworthy action the City Council took was that they voted to increase the City's annual Mills Act cap from $10,000 to $15,000, based on a recommendation from the Historic Resource Commission. The City Council voted 3-2 to support that request. Ms. McCaull said that Commissioner O'Brien did a great job of presenting the facts and reasons for the increase. More discussion will follow regarding the direction and future funding of the Mills Act Program.

Director McCaull also reported that at the December 18 City Council meeting, Council will be receiving a report from staff, per the direction from City Council. Council wishes to review the Historic Preservation Ordinance and discuss whether or not they wish to make changes to the ordinance as it relates to the Commission's flexibility in providing exceptions to the zoning standards and whether or not the Council would like to have more control over this. It is possible that in the future, alteration permit requests approved by the Commission would not be final but advisory to the City Council.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

Vice Chair Wilson commented that the City Council may not be well informed regarding the

Mills Act Program and the limited authority the Commission has. Ms. Wilson said it is the City Council's responsibility to administer the Mills Act. Ms. Wilson asked if the program runs in perpetuity.

Director McCaull said that the program does run in perpetuity unless a Notice of Non-Renewal is filed. It is a 10-year agreement and every year an additional year is added onto the agreement.

Vice Chair Wilson said she feels that much of the responsibility is being handed to the Commission, who does not have the authority to change the rules. She would like this issue clarified with the Council and suggested holding a joint meeting with the Council.

Chairperson MacCartee suggested placing this item on a future agenda for Commission discussion, then asking Council if they would meet with the Commission. The Commission agreed.

Commissioner Herron announced that her term on the Planning Commission would end at the end of the year, which means that she would also not be serving on the Historic Resource Commission as the representative for the Planning Commission. She said she hopes that everything goes well and that the Coronado Property Review List is completed by the end of the year.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HR 15-07 **BENT FAMILY TRUST** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residences addressed as 720 G Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The property is 25' wide and 140' deep totaling 3,500 square feet. The site contains a two story residence at the front of the property and a residence at the rear of the site. The owner has applied for historic designation to preserve the front residence and to construct a new dwelling at the rear of the property. The owner has applied for a Tentative Parcel Map so that the structures could be sold separately in the future.

It is estimated that the dwelling was constructed in 1892 and moved to its present location in 1911. The home is approximately 115 years old. The application notes that the residence was altered in 1931 by George W. Godspeed; however, City permits did not identify the alterations. Substantial improvements occurred to the dwelling in 1988 when an interior remodel and addition were completed to the residence which added 915 square feet.

The application notes the residence has a Folk Victorian architectural style and the Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave it an historical rating value of 3.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant, Gwyneth Bent, 1617 Glorietta Boulevard, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Crenshaw said she was delighted to have the home designated.

Commissioner O'Brien asked if historic designation of the front home was needed by the applicant in order to build a rear unit.

Director McCaull responded that the applicant did not need an historic designation to build the back unit. With the designation of the front home, the applicant would need an alteration permit for the back structure to make sure that the new structure does not impact the historical significance to the front home. It is also her understanding that the applicant will be requesting an increased floor area ratio because with R-3 development, single family or duplex development, the FAR is lower than it would be if a multiple family structure is developed.

Vice Chair Wilson said she does not feel that the home meets the criteria to be considered an historic resource.

Chairperson MacCartee said it does exemplify special elements of the City's aesthetic and economic history.

Commissioner Herron said the home is also one of the few remaining examples in the city possessing distinctive characteristics of an architectural style.

Chairperson MacCartee said she would also add that the home is located in the R-3 zone, although it is not one of the criteria.

Vice Chair Wilson agreed.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 720 G AVENUE TO BE AN HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S ECONOMIC, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY; AND
C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF FOLK VICTORIAN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE IN THE R-3 ZONE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE,

PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED.

COMMISSIONER HERRON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

HR 16-07 **RUDOLPH R. MEDINA** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residences addressed as 165 I Avenue and located in the R-1AE (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The property is 50' wide and 70' deep totaling 3,500 square feet. The site does not have alley access. The property contains a two story dwelling and attached single car garage. The owner has applied for historic designation to preserve the residence and plans to add on to the dwelling in the future along with some minor alterations. The proposed alterations would be the subject of a future Historic Alteration Permit before the Commission should the structure be designated an Historic Resource at today's meeting. Scott Moomjian is the owner's authorized representative with the Historic Designation request.

City records indicate the dwelling was constructed in 1933 so the residence is 74 years old. The original owners were identified as Albert and Elizabeth Galucci. The architect is not known however the builder was identified as Albert Galucci. In 1972, a permit was issued to construct a two story addition to the residence. The application indicates the addition occurred over the single story garage and contained approximately 144 square feet. Mr. Medina, acquired the residence in 2007. The application notes that Mr. Medina has been restoring the property since his purchase.

The application notes the residence is historically significant because it is one of the few remaining examples of the modest, small-scale, single family residential developments that occurred in Coronado's early 1930's, and for representing the Spanish Eclectic architectural style. The two-story home is box shaped with a modest pitched hipped roof with red Mission tile, exposed rafter tails, stucco exterior, wood casement windows, and a recessed front porch entry with arches, decorative stucco detail, and tile roof.

Chairperson MacCartee added for the record that she and Vice Chair Wilson met as a subcommittee of the Commission with the applicants and/or their representative prior to today's meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant's representative, Scott Moomjian, Esq., 427 C Street, Suite 220, San Diego, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions.

Commissioner Herron asked about the proposed deck.

Carolyn LaFrance, Architect, 3568 Sydney Place, San Diego, clarified that Mr. Moomjian misspoke. They are not adding a deck – only a kitchen and dining room.

Director McCaull clarified that part of the applicant's proposal is a roof deck.

Ms. LaFrance said that a roof deck will be part of the proposal.

Vice Chair Wilson stated the proposed roof deck is not under consideration today.

Commissioner O'Brien asked if the applicant will be looking for the Commission's input with regard to the alteration that would later incorporate a roof deck. His concern is that it may change the exterior of the home.

Chairperson MacCartee clarified that the proposed roof deck will not change the look of the front of the house.

Vice Chair Wilson said it is understood that a roof deck must be located at the rear of the home and not visible from the street.

Director McCaull said she had a rendering of the proposed addition and said it would be appropriate if the Commission wanted to comment on the conceptual plans.

Chairperson MacCartee asked the applicants if they desired the Commission to review the proposed addition.

The applicants responded yes.

Ms. LaFrance pointed out that the proposed roof deck would be located at the rear of the home and showed on the rendering the exact location of the roof deck and stairs.

Vice Chair Wilson asked if the stairs were exposed.

Ms. LaFrance said yes. It is an exterior metal stair with a decorative railing.

Vice Chair Wilson asked if the stair originates off of the second story deck.

Ms. LaFrance said that they will be using the original interior stairway which comes up to a landing on the first floor. It then branches off and goes into the second story of the main house where the original staircase is located. It then leads onto the roof of the addition where the deck is proposed to be located.

Vice Chair Wilson said she had concerns with the exterior stairs.

The applicant, Rudolph Medina, 12340 Aquitaine Court, San Diego, said the reason he purchased the house is because it is a wonderful example of early 19th Century Spanish California architecture. However, the home is functionally obsolete and it is very difficult for a family to live in the home. His goal, by adding to the home, is to bring it up to a current living standard and also embellish the current architecture. Mr. Medina clarified that the stairway will not be metal; it will be a custom iron stairway that is quintessential of the Spanish architecture of that era.

Vice Chair Wilson said she did not have any criticism of the addition; however, she had concerns because normally the stairway is located in the interior.

Commissioner Herron stated she had no issues with the stairs.

Commissioner O'Brien said that if a roof deck is proposed on an historic home, the Commission is always interested in reviewing the details when the applicants return with an alteration permit. Mr. O'Brien said he is fine with the direction they are headed.

Commissioner Herron noted that a roof top deck is an ongoing subject for discussion. The roof top must be such that it maintains the privacy of the neighbors.

Chairperson MacCartee thanked Mr. Moomjian for a wonderful report because it is very historic and stated she would provide a copy to Mr. Joe Ditler, Executive Director of the Coronado Historical Association for their archives. Ms. McCartee also added for the record that the previous owner, Dr. William T. Booth, was considered one of the most outstanding citizens Coronado has ever known. Besides being President of the Rotary Club, he was one of the founders of the Coronado Hospital and it was his guiding hand in 1952 that got the Coronado Hospital started. There is a plaque at Christ Church that recognizes Dr. Booth for his contributions to the community.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 165 I AVENUE TO BE AN HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, ECONOMIC, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY; AND
B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY IN THAT

DR. WILLIAM T. BOOTH OWNED THE RESIDENCE AND WAS ONE OF THE MOST OUTSTANDING CITIZENS CORONADO HAS EVER KNOWN. BESIDES BEING PRESIDENT OF THE ROTARY CLUB, HE WAS ONE OF THE FOUNDERS OF THE CORONADO HOSPITAL AND IT WAS HIS GUIDING HAND IN 1952 THAT GOT THE CORONADO HOSPITAL STARTED. THERE IS A PLAQUE AT CHRIST CHURCH THAT RECOGNIZED DR. BOOTH FOR HIS CONTRIBUTIONS TO THE COMMUNITY;

C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SPANISH ECLECTIC ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED.

E. IT DOES MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME).

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

HR 17-07 **CHARLES STUART MCLEOD** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residences addressed as 803 Adella Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Director McCaull reported that the applicant had requested that the Commission continue this item to the meeting of December 19, 2007.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO THE MEETING OF DECEMBER 19, 2007.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

HR 18-07 **JASON AND JEANINE EHRET** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residences addressed as 921 A Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Commissioner O'Brien recused himself and stepped down from the dais.

Director McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. Michael and Donna Rutter are the owners of the property located at 921 A Avenue. Jason and Jeanine Ehret are in escrow to purchase the property and are the owner's authorized representatives at today's meeting. The property contains a one and one-half story dwelling with approximately 1,926 square feet and a detached garage. The lot does not have alley access. The potential owners have applied for historic designation to preserve the residence and plan to make alterations to the building.

City records are not clear when this home was originally constructed. The earliest permit issued on the property dates to 1913 when a dwelling with 2 rooms was connected to the sewer. This permit also notes that the dwelling was moved to the site in 1912 from Lot 18/block 42. Research indicates and confirms material contained in the applicant's submittal that the home was originally located at 831 Adella Avenue and moved to the site. The application notes the dwelling was constructed in 1896 but staff was not able to confirm this construction date. It is estimated that the dwelling is 111 years old. Some alterations and repairs have occurred to the dwelling since its original construction.

The home has a Craftsman Bungalow architectural style with a cross gable roof with wide overhangs, exterior wood shingles, prominent vertical shaped wood windows along the front façade and enclosed entry porch along the northern elevation. The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave this residence a historical value rating of 2H. A rating of 2 indicated the structure should be a candidate for inclusion on the Coronado Historical Register and was built before 1942. The structure was also recognized as a Coronado Historical Landmark by the Coronado Historic Association in the 1980's. In addition to the architectural significance and uniqueness of the residence, it is important to recognize the structure as being the residence of Mike Rutter. Mr. Rutter was extremely active in local community service affairs and participated in several organizations and served on the Coronado Planning Commission from 1984 through 1989.

Current and older photographs of the building and site have been provided with the application. Vegetation has significantly concealed the architectural style and craftsman detailing of the residence. The Commission may want to require that landscaping be trimmed to reveal more of the residence should the structure be declared historic.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant's representative, Jason Ehret, 1324 9th Street, gave a brief overview of the request

and answered questions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Vice Chair Wilson said it is a wonderful home and said that anything of this caliber should be added to the inventory. The cross gable makes it architecturally important as well as the shape of the home, which looks like Tent City re-visited. In addition, the Craftsman Bungalow architecture is of great interest and appeal. However, Ms. Wilson said it is difficult to see the home and suggested that the vegetation be cleared out.

Commissioner Herron suggested mentioning Dr. Lacey, who worked as a professional druggist at the Hotel del Coronado

Commissioner Crenshaw said the home is a beautiful addition to Coronado.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 921 A AVENUE TO BE AN HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY; AND
B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL HISTORY IN THAT MANY OF THE OWNERS PLAYED IMPORTANT ROLES IN CORONADO'S HISTORY. THE FIRST OWNER, DAVID LACEY, MANAGED THE PHARMACY AT THE HOTEL DEL CORONADO; A LATER OWNER, KEN SHORTT, OWNED AND OPERATED SHORTT'S SHELL STATION AT 10TH AND ORANGE FOR 33 YEARS; AND THE MOST RECENT OWNERS, MIKE AND DONNA RUTTER, WERE ACTIVE IN THE CIVIC AND SOCIAL LIFE OF CORONADO. MR. RUTTER IS PAST PRESIDENT OF THE CORONADO BOARD OF REALTORS AND CORONADO BEAUTIFUL, AND PAST VICE PRESIDENT OF THE NAVY LEAGUE AND THE CORONADO CHAMBER OF COMMERCE. HE ALSO SERVED ON THE CORONADO PLANNING COMMISSION, WAS PRESIDENT OF THE CORONADO RESIDENTIAL ASSOCIATION, PRESIDENT OF THE CORONADO HIGH SCHOOL ALL-SPORTS BOOSTER CLUB, A MEMBER OF THE CORONADO ROTARY CLUB AND A MEMBER OF THE DOWNTOWN TASK FORCE;
C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF CRAFTSMAN BUNGALOW ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED.

THE COMMISSION ADDED THE FOLLOWING CONDITION:

> THAT THE SITE, LANDSCAPING, AND MISCELLANEOUS IMPROVEMENTS SURROUNDING THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SHALL BE ADEQUATELY MAINTAINED TO PROVIDE FOR THE VISIBILITY OF THE STRUCTURE FROM PUBLIC RIGHTS-OF-WAY AND IMMEDIATE STEPS SHOULD BE TAKEN TO REMOVE LANDSCAPING THAT CURRENTLY CONCEALS THE HISTORIC STRUCTURE.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Commissioner O'Brien.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

HAP 16-07 **MARY KAY BOROJEVICH** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for historically designated residence addressed as 909 D Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from zoning standards.

Director McCaull reported that the applicant had requested that the Commission continue this item to the meeting of December 19, 2007.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER O'BRIEN MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO THE MEETING OF DECEMBER 19, 2007.

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, MacCartee, O'Brien, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

NOI 10-06 **JOHN C. MATTHEWS** – Notice of Intent to Demolish the single family residence addressed as 923 J Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The site contains a single story dwelling with a detached garage and guest house. The property is 50' wide and 140' deep

totaling 7,000 square feet. City records indicate a permit was issued in 1914 to construct a dwelling with 5 rooms. The structure is 93 years old. The property is currently for sale. The plan is to demolish the existing residence and construct a new building on the site. Since the structure is over 75 years of age, a Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit Application has been filed with the City. W. Craig Clarke is the owner's authorized representative with the application.

The original 5 bedroom home was owned and built by S.D. Chapin. Mr. Chapin was a prominent builder in Coronado's early years having built more than 200 homes. While the original builder may have been noted, the home has had several alterations over the course of its history and appears to be substantially altered. No additional information was discovered by staff regarding the historical significance of the structure.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant's representative, Craig Clarke, 240 H Avenue, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 923 J AVENUE (NOI 16-07) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

A. IT DOES NOT EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
B. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S), OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;
C. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF A NOTABLE BUILDER, OSCAR DORMAN.
E. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 9 (COMMENCING WITH

SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME).

THE COMMISSION ADDED THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:

1. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CITY AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO ALLOW THE CITY AND/OR THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION AN OPPORTUNITY TO PREPARE A PHOTOGRAPHIC FILM, VIDEO, OR OTHER APPROPRIATE RECORD OF THE EXTERIOR/INTERIOR OF THE STRUCTURE.
2. OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION (CHA) AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO PROVIDE CHA WITH AN OPPORTUNITY TO SALVAGE HISTORIC MATERIALS FOR THEIR "KEEP IT IN CORONADO" RE-USE PROGRAM.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, O'Brien, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

NOI 17-07 **ST. PAUL'S UNITED METHODIST CHURCH** – Notice of Intent to Demolish the duplex addressed as 726-728 Olive Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The site contains a single story duplex with a detached garage. The site is triangular shaped and adjoins other property owned by St. Paul's United Methodist Church. City records indicate a permit was issued in 1922 to construct a dwelling so the residence is 85 years old. St. Paul's United Methodist Church is planning to construct a new building on this part of their land as well as their adjoining property. Since the structure is over 75 years of age, a Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit Application has been filed with the City. Dave Gillingham is the owner's authorized representative with the application. The adjoining building addressed as 724 Olive Avenue is also planned to be demolished. Since the structure has historically been utilized for church activities rather than residential and not on the Draft Coronado Property Review list, staff determined this structure was not subject to the Demolish permit review process.

The duplex at 726-728 Olive was originally owned by Emma Scheider and constructed by P.M. Holt. In 1958, partitions within the dwelling were removed and it is believed that at this time the dwelling was converted from a single family dwelling to a duplex.

PUBLIC COMMENT

The applicant's representative, Dave Gillingham, 649 Pomona, gave a brief overview of the request and answered questions.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 726-728 OLIVE AVENUE (NOI 17-07) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AN HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

A. IT DOES NOT EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
C. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;
E. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME).

COMMISSIONER CRENSHAW SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Crenshaw, Herron, O'Brien, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

DISCUSSION ITEM

HR 14-04 **CITY OF CORONADO** – Discussion regarding Coronado Property Review (CPR) List to replace the existing Ordinance that uses a 75-year criteria as a trigger mechanism for the Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit process. This List includes single family, multiple family, and non-residential properties.

Director McCaull reported that the Commission most recently completed their review of the list. The list contains residential and non-residential properties and the Commission today will be making a final review of all residential properties to ensure they should remain on the list.

The Commission proceeded to review the list of potential properties and made a determination as to which properties should be kept, reviewed further, or eliminated from the list.

Public Comment

Shelly Oval, 536 A Avenue, stated that 500 Glorietta Boulevard is a great home and should be kept on the list.

Commission Discussion

Commission discussion ensued.

Commission Action

The Commission completed their review of the residential property review list and requested that staff provide a list of the commercial properties for review at their next meeting.

Discussion regarding Penalties for Violations of the Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit Process. (No report)

This item was continued. No action was taken.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:21 p.m.

_____
Tony A Peña
Director of Community Development