

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

December 21, 2005

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:03 p.m., Wednesday, December 21, 2005, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chamber, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Keith.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Martha Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of December 7, 2005, were approved as amended.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

There was no separate report.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Nicholas Vega, Director of Archives and Exhibits, Coronado Historical Association, introduced the new Executive Director, Joseph Dittler.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HRPA 13-05 ZIMMERMAN, MARC & LEESA – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated property addressed as 1111 Flora Avenue and located in the -1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCall reported that the applicant was unable to be present due to heart surgery and asked if the Commission wished to hear the item or continue it. The Commission agreed to hear the item.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. On November 16, the property was designated as an historic resource. Once a property is designated as an historic resource, the owner can apply for a Mills Act Agreement with the City. The agreement is a ten year contract where the owner agrees to preserve the home and in exchange the owner is entitled to property tax reductions. The owner is proposing an extensive list consisting of general maintenance for the property. Information from the County Tax Assessors' Office indicates the City would have a revenue loss of about \$3,000 and there would be a savings to the property owner of about \$5,500. There is currently a waiting list for the Mills Act Agreements and there are about 19 properties on the list.

Commissioner Draper said she appreciates anyone who gets historic designation and continues the process by applying for the Mills Act Agreement.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO FORWARD THE HISTORIC RESOURCE PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION TO THE CITY COUNCIL WITH THE APPROVED LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS FOR 1111 FLORA AVENUE (HRPA 13-05) AS FOLLOWS: GENERAL MAINTENANCE OF THE RESIDENCE.

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

HRPA 14-05 PIPER, WILLIAM & SUSAN – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated property addressed as 930 I and located in the -1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. This property was designated as an historic resource on November 16. The owners are proposing some improvements during the course of the agreement including complete window restoration for the residence, completing exterior paint this year, and again within ten years, dry rot replacement and restoration on the porch and shingles where found, and attic repair and insulation. The County Tax Assessors' Office indicates the City would have a revenue loss of about \$1,800 and there would be a savings to the property owner of about \$3,200. There is currently a waiting list for the Mills Act Agreements and there are about 19 properties on the list.

Ms. McCaull read into the record a letter that was received by Chairperson Keith from Robert Ellis Franklin that indicates that the property has been modified significantly since its original construction. However, the letter seems to speak more on the historic designation of the property, an action that has already occurred.

The applicant, Susan Piper, 903 I Avenue, spoke in response to the letter from Mr. Franklin. She said that the letter was false and incorrect. She has spoken to Robert Creal, the former owner of the house, who resided there for 19 years. He was unable to attend the meeting but Ms. Piper quoted him

as follows: “The original footprint of the house remains intact and unchanged.” When Mr. Creal purchased the house, there was a shed at the rear of the house that had a kitchen, a bathroom and a utility room that was later removed. There are five rooms that are original to the house. There is a large entry foyer with ceiling to floor cabinets, a dining room, one large and one small bedroom, and one large bathroom that may have been a former bedroom. These rooms are all in the original footprint of the house in the original place with the original walls.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper thanked the applicant for providing the information.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO FORWARD THE HISTORIC RESOURCE PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION TO THE CITY COUNCIL WITH THE APPROVED LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS FOR 930 I AVENUE (HRPA 14-05) AS FOLLOWS: (1) COMPLETE WINDOW RESTORATION; (2) COMPLETE EXTERIOR PAINT 2005/2006 AND AGAIN WITHIN 10 YEARS; (3) DRY ROT REPLACEMENT AND RESTORATION ON PORCH AND SHINGLES WHERE FOUND; (4) ATTIC REPAIR AND INSULATION.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES:	Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee and Wilson.
NAYS:	None.
ABSENT:	None.
ABSTAIN:	None.

The motion passed 5-0.

HAP 16-05 **HELMERS, SCOTT & WOOD, ROBIN** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for modifications to historically designated residence addressed as 744 B Avenue and located in the R-1AE (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull reported that the applicant was not in the audience. The item was continued to later in the meeting to allow the applicant additional time.

HRPA 15-05 **HELMERS, SCOTT & WOOD, ROBIN** – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated property addressed as 744 B Avenue and located in the R-1AE (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull reported that the applicant was not in the audience. The item was continued to later in the meeting to allow the applicant additional time.

HR 26-05 **DR. KENNETH STORUM** – Request for Historic Designation of the property

addressed as 561 C Avenue and located in the R-1AE (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The property is 50' wide and 140' deep and contains 7000 square feet. The site has a single story dwelling with a detached accessory building and the owner has retained Attorney Scott Moomjian to complete the research on the property. This report notes the structure's significance due to its historic and architectural style. The home was first issued a permit in 1927 and it was completed in 1929. The architect of record is not known and the analysis completed by the consultant indicates about six families have owned the property since its original construction. In 1997, a permit was issued to Mr. William Haffey for an 809 square foot addition to the rear of the home. In 1996, some electrical and interior medications to the structure were completed including an addition of a bay window. The application notes the residence is in excellent condition, having been restored and rehabilitated recently. The structure has a stucco exterior with arched wood windows and tile roof. The application notes that it is one of the few remaining examples of a mid-1920's modest, small scale Spanish eclectic single family residential construction in the community. The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave the home a historical rating value of 3, which indicates there was some historical significance to the residence. Although the Inventory indicated the home had a "California Spanish" architectural style, Ms. McCaull agreed with the applicant that the home was more "Spanish eclectic."

Attorney Scott Moomjian, 427 C Street, Suite 220, San Diego, representing the applicant, reported that the home exemplifies special elements of Coronado's architectural history. The building is an excellent, modest example of the "Spanish eclectic" style of architecture construction in the 1920's. The structure is valuable for the type, period and method of 1920's Spanish electric construction, and the building has not been substantially altered. Although the prior owner, Mr. Haffey, had constructed an 809 square foot addition to the rear of the property, the addition is not visible from the front primary facade, which was recently restored meticulously by the applicant with the addition of new stucco, new windows, and tile work. Historic photographs taken in the 1950's or 1960's were provided to the Commission. The rear additions to the home have been restored and rehabilitated consistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards in that the addition is set back and is not visible from a public right-of-way. Also, it is similar but differentiated in terms of the roof type and similar materials used as not to create a false impression of historical development.

Dr. Kenneth Storum, 561 C Avenue, said he was born in Coronado, and his mother was Miss Coronado in 1952. He noted that the home has all of its original windows, dry rot was cut out and new wood replaced the old wood. The only change to the front of the house was that French doors were removed, and subsequently replaced.

Commissioner MacCartee asked the applicant the original square footage of his home.

Attorney Moomjian stated that the residential building record indicates the home is about 1,792 square feet, per the County Assessors' Office. The addition is about 824 square feet, which is consistent with the permit which states 809 square feet.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper said that the home appeared to be lovingly restored.

Vice Chair MacCartee commented that one of the Commission's goals is to save smaller homes, and she thanked Attorney Moomjian for coming forth.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 561 C AVENUE (HR 26-05) TO BE A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, SOCIAL ECONOMIC, AESTHETIC AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE (SPANISH ECLECTIC), AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED (UNUSUAL U-SHAPED FLOOR PLAN THAT HAS NOT BEEN SIGNIFICANTLY ALTERED);

CHAIRPERSON KEITH SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

Chairperson Keith thanked the applicant and advised they would be receiving a plaque during a City Council meeting in the near future.

Chairperson Keith called a recess at 3:37 p.m.

The meeting reconvened at 3:45 p.m. All members were present.

HAP 16-05 **HELMERS, SCOTT & WOOD, ROBIN** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for modifications to historically designated residence addressed as 744 B Avenue and located in the R-1AE (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The home was designated as an historic resource on December 7. The owners are proposing five alterations associated with the permit request, as follows: (1) changing the light fixture on the front of the home from a Colonial style fixture to a Craftsman style fixture; (2) modifications to the front windows on the first level of the building. The existing windows are vinyl and the applicant would like to replace them with wood; (3) change the exterior paint scheme on the building; (4) replace the original 94-year-old Cedar shakes with new cedar shakes; (5) replace the roof shingles. The roof line will remain as is with the exception of the roof over the sun room at the rear of the dwelling. The roof line will be changed from a flat to sloped roof to address draining issues.

The applicant, Scott Helmers, 744 B Avenue, apologized for arriving late. He said that the front windows on the first floor will be replaced with windows that look similar to the windows on the side bay. The side bay windows may be moved to the front if he is not able to find a like kind.

Chairperson Keith referred the applicant to the Coronado Historical Association as they have a program called, “Keep It In Coronado,” and they may have the windows he is looking for.

Mr. Helmers showed the Commission a sample of the paint scheme. It appears the original house was painted green and he is proposing a similar green color. He said the original roof was a cedar shake and every subsequent roof has been layered on top of that. Currently the home has asphalt shingles. He is attempting to give it a dark brown color to give it the same look with an asphalt shingle. He would like to change the flat roof to a sloped roof because the runoff runs right into the flat part of the sun room and drains into a section of the roof that leaks. This change would allow for better drainage and prevent leakage. He is proposing that the roof line run from the ridge cap over to the edge of the sun room, which is located at the back of the home.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper thanked the applicant for his enthusiasm.

Chairperson Keith said the color scheme looked great. She had no issues with the applicant changing the roof line over the sun room, or the light fixture.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER HERRON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 16-05 HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT AS SUBMITTED.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

HRPA 15-05 HELMERS, SCOTT & WOOD, ROBIN – Request for Historic Preservation Mills Act Agreement for the historically designated property addressed as 744 B Avenue and located in the R-1AE (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The owners have applied for a Mills Act Agreement. The owners are proposing improvements that were previously considered under the Alteration Permit request. Information from the County Tax Assessors' Office indicates the City would have a revenue loss of about \$7,000 and there would be a savings to the property owner of about \$13,500. There is currently a waiting list for the Mills Act Agreements and there are about 19 properties on the list.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO FORWARD THE HISTORIC RESOURCE PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION TO THE CITY COUNCIL WITH THE APPROVED LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS FOR 744 B AVENUE (HRPA 15-05) AS FOLLOWS:
(1) FRONT LIGHT FIXTURE: REPLACE COLONIAL STYLE LIGHT FIXTURE WITH A

CRAFTSMAN STYLE FIXTURE; (2) FIRST FLOOR WINDOWS: REPLACE VINYL WINDOWS WITH WOODEN HORIZONTALLY HUNG DOUBLE SASH WINDOWS; (3) PAINT: REPAINT EXTERIOR IN MORE PERIOD APPROPRIATE COLORS (GREEN SIDING, YELLOW TRIM, RED SASH); (4) SIDING: REPLACE ORIGINAL 94-YEAR-OLD CEDAR SHAKES WITH NEW CEDAR SHAKES AND KEEP SAME LOOK - NO CHANGE IN FRONT ROOF LINE - CHANGE BACK ROOF LINE TO IMPROVE DRAINAGE OVER SUN ROOM; (5) CHANGE COLOR OF SHINGLES TO BROWN IN KEEPING WITH NEW PAINT SCHEME.

COMMISSIONER REED SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

Ms. McCaull said that the plaques should be arriving in a few weeks.

MISCELLANEOUS

None.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Discussion regarding the formulation of a Demolition Review List (HR 14-04)

Ms. McCaull said the Commission is concluding the preparation of a Demolition Review List as directed by City Council. The Commission has reviewed over 1,500 homes and has composed a list of 600 homes for review by City Council at their meeting of January 17, 2006.

The Commission agreed to review the entire list again before final submittal to City Council.

Discussion regarding the Historic Resource Commission Newsletter (no report)

Ms. McCaull said she had contacted the City Manager's office in early December and was advised that the next Community Newsletter would be published in January. The deadline for draft submittal is January 3. The Commission agreed to place the HRC newsletter in the April issue.

Discussion regarding the Coronado Cottage Conservancy (no report)

Vice Chair MacCartee reported that the next CCC Open House will be held on Sunday, February 26, from 1 to 3 p.m.

Discussion regarding Historic Resource Designation Benefit of applying for relief to zoning standards as provided for in the Historic Preservation Ordinance (no report)

This item was continued. No action was taken.

Discussion regarding Historic Districts

This item was continued. No action was taken.

Discussion regarding the Appeal of the Historic Resource Commission to deny an Historic alteration Permit for the property located at 1045 Loma Avenue.

Ms. McCaull reported that on December 7, the Commission considered and denied an alteration permit request and exceptions to the Code on this property. On December 13, during the 10-day appeal period, a letter was filed by the owners of the property, Mr. and Mrs. Dolgen, appealing the Commission's decision to the City Council. Ms. McCaull provided the Commission with copies of the Chapters pertaining to administrative hearings and procedures. She noted that the hearings are not open public hearings and in order to speak, one must be placed on a list called the List of Witnesses. Ms. McCaull asked the Commissioners if they wished to be placed on the list.

Commissioner Draper asked what was needed in order to submit documentation prior to the January 3 Council meeting.

Ms. McCaull responded that all information must be submitted to her by Thursday, December 29 in order to include it with her staff report.

Chairperson Keith clarified that information already presented to the Commission will be included in the staff report. However, members of the public wishing to speak should place their names on the list. In addition, written material must be submitted by Thursday, December 29.

Vice Chair MacCartee expressed concern about this issue. She asked if there was some way that this issue could be worked out before it went before Council.

Chairperson Keith asked the Commission to consider whether one Commissioner should be appointed to speak on their behalf, or if they wish to advise Ms. McCaull if they will be attending the meeting and speaking on their own behalf.

Commissioner Herron suggested that all Commissioners be on the list.

Daphne Brown, 326 First Street, said that Mr. Scott Aurich discussed the Dolgen project with her. She wanted to clarify that she does not wish to be on the appellant's Witness List. She wishes to be on the City's Witness List.

David Dolgen, 734 Glorietta Boulevard, said he appreciated the Commission's comments, however he expressed concern that this issue had reached this point. He believes that the Commission's mission is very important and is tremendously critical for the community that it functions well. He also believes that it is still in process because the Ordinance is fairly new. For this particular property, and for similar properties in size and significance, it is very costly to preserve, restore, and remodel a home to make it appropriate for contemporary use while at the same time being true to the architectural and historical significance. He feels upset that the prospective new owner who is very interested in this type of project is potentially not going to be able to satisfy those mutual objectives. He asked if there was something that could be done to prevent this issue from becoming a "political,

grand debate” but rather becoming more of a refining definition on whether a homeowner can own, store and operate a motor coach. He said he welcomed any ideas on working this out.

Chairperson Keith clarified that the item is not on the agenda and therefore cannot be discussed at this time. However, she can speak about the appeal and the different options available. She stated that the applicant has two options: (1) go forward with the appeal as planned; (2) request that the appeal be put “on hold” and return before the Commission to try to work out a “compromise.” She said she would be willing to meet with the applicant with the understanding that she cannot guarantee a compromise. Another alternative would be to appoint a subcommittee to meet with the applicant.

Commissioner Wilson asked Ms. McCaull when this item was scheduled before City Council.

Ms. McCaull responded it was scheduled for January 3, per the appellant’s request. The appellant could request a continuance of the appeal hearing.

Commissioner Herron asked if a special meeting could be called should there be a time issue.

Chairperson Keith said that it would be difficult to schedule a special meeting before December 28.

Mr. Dolgen suggested if there was a possible resolution, he would consider continuing or withdrawing the item prior to the appeal hearing.

Ms. McCaull said that Mr. Dolgen definitely could request a continuance on the appeal hearing until a further date to allow him to work with the Commission to try to develop a resolution. It would be continued until the appellant re-filed an appeal hearing.

Mr. Dolgen said he was leaving town tomorrow but his representatives were available to speak with the Commissioners. He suggested if he was able to get a specific sense of a possible resolution prior to January 3, he was very open to it. He does not have an interest in making this item something that would detract from the good work of the Commission.

Chairperson Keith said the Commission’s next regularly scheduled meeting is January 4, the day after the City Council meets.

Mr. Dolgen reiterated that if there was a possibility that the Commission would speak to his representatives via a subcommittee or individual Commissioners before Council meets, it would allow him to make a determination on whether they would proceed with the appeal.

Steve Aurich, 916 Glorietta, said he was willing to work with staff to resolve this issue.

Bob Bowlus, the architect for the project, said he was also very willing to meet with staff to discuss this project.

The Commission agreed that a subcommittee consisting of Commissioners MacCartee and Draper would meet with the appellant’s representatives.

Chairperson Keith reiterated that the Commissioners would only meet and listen to the appellant’s representatives but could not give a guarantee on this issue.

Ms. McCaull said there is a possibility that a special meeting could be called next week after the subcommittee met with the appellant's representative. The potential problem is that at the special meeting, if a solution is not arrived at, an appeal would be ongoing a few days later and the Council at the administrative hearing would need to know why a compromise was not reached. In addition, the minutes would not be ready at that time.

Vice Chair MacCartee said that it was worth a try because this issue was dividing the community in a very bad way.

Ms. McCaull mentioned that procedurally there are other issues. If a solution is reached, it will need to be heard at a public hearing, which would involve notification to all property owners within 300 feet, 10 days prior to the hearing.

Mr. Dolgen requested a five-minute recess.

Chairperson Keith called a recess at 4:49 p.m.

The meeting reconvened at 4:54 p.m. All members were present.

Mr. Dolgen asked to meet with the subcommittee next week. He felt that if there was enough progress made, he could make a decision whether to withdraw the agenda item and a special hearing may not need to take place.

Chairperson Keith reiterated that the subcommittee could meet with him but they could not guarantee anything. The appellant would then need to decide whether he wished to continue the appeal.

The Commission agreed that the (revised) subcommittee consisting of Commissioners Herron and MacCartee would meet with the appellant's representative.

Mr. Dolgen stated he appreciated the spirit of the conversation and thanked the Commission.

Chairperson Keith said she appreciated Mr. Dolgen coming forward.

Daphne Brown, 326 First Street, said she hoped that Mr. Dolgen and the subcommittee could come to a resolution.

Chairperson Keith expressed her personal gratitude to Commissioners Herron and MacCartee for taking time from the holidays to attempt to resolve this issue.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:57 p.m.

Tony A Peña
Director of Community Development