

CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

December 1, 2004

A regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m., Wednesday, December 1, 2004, at the Coronado Police Department Emergency Operations Center, 700 Orange Avenue, Coronado, California by Chairperson Keith.

ROLL CALL

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

MEMBERS ABSENT:

STAFF: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Linda Hascup, Administrative Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Minutes of the Regular Meeting of October 20, 2004 were approved as amended.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull reported that the City Council approved all four of the Mills Act agreements that were submitted to them within the newly expanded budget. The Commission's presentation and application for historic designation of the City's Parks was also well received and was approved by the Council. The City Manager requested that the slide show be produced into a DVD which could be used as a resource and distributed. Commissioner Herron has agreed to coordinate the effort.

Ms. McCaull also reported that the slide presentation "Castles, Cottages, and Condominiums" would be held the next day at Coronado Historical Association's lecture hall for the public at 7 PM. She advised that the gathering was noticed as a special meeting of the Historic Resource Commission so all of the Commission members could attend.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

None.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

Chairman Keith said she received a newsletter from Save Our Heritage Organization (SOHO) which announces that on March 11 and 13, 2005 SOHO will be holding their Craftsman/Spanish Revival weekend in Coronado and calling it "Some Like it Preserved".

Chairman Keith said she was happy to see in the Eagle the recent real estate advertisement for a Cliff May Ranch Home by Russ McKee of McKee Asset Management. The ad mentions the historic features of the house, the City's Historic Preservation Program and benefits of the Mills Act program. She said this is just what the Commission has been hoping the realtors would start doing. Commission MacCartee added that Page Harrington of CHA was also involved in that.

PUBLIC HEARINGS: APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

HRPA 9-04 Patterson, Ann & Henry: Request for a Historic Resource Preservation Agreement for the Single Family Residence located at 941 G Avenue in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said the Patterson's home was designated as the City's 45th historic residence within Coronado on October 20, 2004 and is now eligible to apply for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement with the City of Coronado. A Mills Act Agreement requires the property owner to preserve the home for minimum period of 10 years, and in exchange there may be some property tax reduction. She explained that the HRC's role is to review the "list of improvements" that will be attached to the Mills Act application going to the City Council. Due to the condition of the home the applicant is proposing to maintain the property in its current good condition during the course of the agreement.

Ms. McCaull explained that even though there is currently a backlog of Mills Act applications this particular property will have no impact on the City's tax revenues and it is likely the agreement could be approved and recorded either this year or next year as mentioned in the staff report.

Commissioner Draper asked if the property tax situation would change if the home was sold in a few years. Ms. McCaull said that once the City enters into the contract with the homeowner they realize that there may be a future anticipated loss of revenue. If

the property was sold, say in 8 years to someone else, the City would not see the increase assessed valuation in property taxes. The agreement runs with the property and stays in place for the new owners. The assessed value is restricted so the property taxes don't increase. Ms. McCaull said the agreement is a revolving 10 year agreement, so one year is added each year unless the owner or the City files a notice of non-renewal. That allows the agreement to be terminated 10 years from the date of the notice.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Corrine Mathews, 1030 Olive Avenue asked for clarification if the historic designation goes on even if the home is sold. Chairman Keith acknowledged that is the case.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

There was no further discussion.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER HERRON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS CONSISTING OF THE ROUTINE MAINTENANCE OF THE PROPERTY FOR 941 G AVENUE (HRPA 9-04) AND FORWARD IT TO THE CITY COUNCIL WITH THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

HRPA 10-04 Peltier, James & Margie: Request for a Historic Resource Preservation Agreement for the Single Family Residence located at 1015 Loma Avenue in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone

Ms. McCaull explained that Dr. Brandeis was to be the applicants' representative as they are out of town, however he is ill. Chairman Keith said the application appears to be very straightforward and she would have no problem reviewing it under the circumstances. The other Commissioners agreed. Ms. McCaull said in her discussions with the applicants they had stated that they want to enter into this agreement in order to preserve the home for the future of the community.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said the Peltier's home was designated as the City's 44th historic residence within Coronado on October 6, 2004 and is now eligible to apply for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement with the City of Coronado. A Mills Act Agreement requires the property owner to preserve the home for minimum period of 10 years, and in exchange there may be some property tax reduction. She explained that the HRC's role is to review the "list of improvements" that will be attached to the Mills Act application going to the City Council. Due to the condition of the home the applicant is proposing to maintain the property in its current good condition during the course of the agreement.

Ms. McCaull explained that even though there is currently a backlog of Mills Act applications this particular property will have no impact on the City's tax revenues and it is likely the agreement could be approved and recorded either this year or next year as mentioned in the staff report.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

There was no further discussion.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS CONSISTING OF THE ROUTINE MAINTENANCE OF THE PROPERTY FOR 1015 LOMA AVENUE (HRPA 10-04) AND FORWARD IT TO THE CITY COUNCIL WITH THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION.

COMMISSIONER DRAPER SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

HR 28-04 **Mathews Family Trust:** Request for Historic Designation of the property addressed as 1030 Olive Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said the home appears to be in excellent physical condition. City records indicate the structure is 80 years old as it was built in 1924 by builder O.W. Dorman. The architectural style is a known as English Revival. Very few alterations were made to the building since its original construction. The Sourcepoint inventory rated this structure as a "2", indicating it as having significant architectural importance and would qualify as a contributing structure to a potential historic district.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Applicant's representative, Nancy Cobb, 1110 Isabella Avenue, said Mrs. Mathews and her husband have lived in the home for fifty years. They have maintained the home wonderfully and want to preserve it for the future of the community. She mentioned that Mr. O.W. Dorman was a notable builder in Coronado between 1920 and 1930. She pointed out that the home was only owned by three owners. The Mathews purchased the home from Rear Admiral Allen E. Smith, former Commanding Officer of the USS Missouri. She said that Commander Mathews himself is representative of the essence of a Coronado resident over the last 50 years.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper said she whole heartedly thanked the Mathews for submitting their application and would support the designation of their home. Chairman Keith mentioned the wonderful condition of the home and that it has recently been re-roofed and repainted. Commissioner MacCartee thanked Mrs. Mathews and said it is imperative that people like her step forward. Commissioner Wilson commented that it this is a gift to a block that is quickly changing away from the past.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 28-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1030 OLIVE AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY MEETS THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S, MILITARY, CULTURAL, ECONOMIC, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS OF SIGNIFICANCE IN LOCAL AND NATIONAL HISTORY DUE TO THE NAVAL CAREERS OF NOTABLE

RESIDENTS, VICE ADMIRAL A.E. SMITH AND COMMANDER JOHN CHRISTOPHER MATHEWS, AND MRS. MATHEWS WHO IS A DIRECT DESCENDANT OF EDMUND PENDLETON, AUTHOR OF THE VIRGINIA RESOLUTION DECLARING THE COLONIES FREE AND INDEPENDENT;

- D. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING THE ENGLISH TUDOR ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; AND
- E. IT REPRESENTS THE NOTABLE WORK OF BUILDER O.W. DORMAN.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

Chairman Keith announced that this is the 46th historically designated home in Coronado

NOI 15-04 Maxey, Elaine: Proposal to demolish the single family residence addressed as 435 Pomona Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone

Ms. McCaull introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. Ms. McCaull said that a building permit had been issued in 1921 for a dwelling with six rooms; however the City records do not confirm when it was completed. A garage was added in 1928. The application states that the building is of the craftsman architectural style, is 80 years old, and in poor condition. This structure was not listed on the 1980's Sourcepoint inventory indicating that it was not considered to have any historic significance at that time.

Ms. McCaull explained that the issue for the Commission is to determine whether or not the home meets the criteria to be considered a historic resource. If it does meet the criteria it would become designated as historic and the owner would have to pursue a formal request for demolition, or consider alternatives such as an alteration permit.

Ms. McCaull noted that the proposed resolution contains two conditions regarding photographing and salvaging any historic building materials prior to demolition.

Applicant, Elaine Maxey, 848 Olive Avenue said the house at 435 Pomona has been a rental since 1978 and could be described as a shack at this point.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairman Keith agreed with the applicant that she could see nothing historically significant about this dwelling; however it is too bad the fence has to come down because it is a reminder of earlier times. The fence was put up because of the train that used to go by on Tuesdays and Thursdays at 10:00 in the morning. Ms. Maxey said the fence was built in the mid-60's with a permit that should be on file. It was a good buffer for noise from the train. Commissioner MacCartee said they should get a photo of the fence before tearing it down.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO ADOPT A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WITH FINDINGS MAKING THE DETERMINATION THAT THE PROPERTY ADDRESSED AS 430 POMONA AVENUE (NOI 15-04) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO QUALIFY AS A HISTORIC RESOURCE, THEREFORE ALLOWING FOR THE FUTURE DEMOLITION OF THE PROPERTY.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

Mrs. Maxey asked how many months a demolition permit is good for. Ms. McCaull said once the demolition permit is pulled it is valid for six months and can be extended, however the Historic Resource Commission's decision is final and continues with the property. The home is not historic. She said that if there are any portions of the home that might be re-used, such as windows, doors, doorknobs, etc. for Ms. Maxey to contact the Historical Association to salvage them.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

HR 14-04 City of Coronado: Discussion regarding the formulation of a Historic Property Data List to identify Potentially Historical Properties

Chairman Keith explained that she and Commissioner MacCartee had met with Mayor Smisek and Councilmember Tanaka. She explained that the Commission thinks the process for demolition as it is established today, using the criteria of 75 years of age as a trigger, is working to perfection. The Mayor disagreed and said he would prefer to have a list, which to him would define the issue as black or white, not gray. Chairman Keith advised that it would be impossible to keep the list to only 200

The Commissioners discussed adding the properties listed as "3's" in the Sourcepoint document to the list. Commissioner MacCartee said she was concerned that there may be some dwellings that were previously listed as 3's, 4's and even 5's that have been refurbished and are now 2's. The Commissioners agreed that if they saw any of those homes they would add them to the list to be researched.

Commissioner Draper asked if the list would be flexible so that the homes that aren't 75 years old now could be added as they turn 75. Commissioner MacCartee said it seemed to her that the Mayor might to be flexible on the timeline.

Chairman Keith said there would need to be a process to notify the public once the Commission identifies the properties for the list. Commissioner MacCartee thought that maybe a letter can be composed that is friendly and informative. Ms. McCaull said there would have to be a public hearing to establish the list. She explained the purpose of the list is not to designate the homes listed, but to identify which homes would have to appeal to the commission for demolition or to determine an alternative solution to demolition. There may be homes on the list that will lose their significance over the next few years.

Ms. McCaull said the Council would at least want a progress report from the Commission. She suggested the Commission could let the Council know they are trying to come up with a list of the very most significant homes. Then make the request for a little more time to look at additional homes, or request permission to have annual augmentation after beginning with the current list. Commissioner Wilson said that perhaps they would agree to a secondary trigger, to be added to the list once the houses turn 75. Commissioner Draper said the Council might feel more favorable if structures could be taken off the list if they lose their significance. Chairman Keith said it was her understanding that was exactly what the Mayor does not want, that he would prefer a finite list. Ms. McCaull commented that the Commission is already including some homes, the Cliff Mays, that are not 75 on the list, as well as some homes that were listed below 3. She suggested that the Commission give a progress report to the City Council and ask for the opportunity for more public outreach and a little more research.

Commissioner MacCartee said she would like to add the request to develop an advisory committee as part of the public outreach program. The more people that are involved the better the public outreach will be. She said it could be made up of people in the community (architects, builders, etc. who do things with homes) for the purpose of sharing information. Commissioner Wilson thought that was a good idea and knows at least six people to contact for such a group.

Chairman Keith asked if staff could prepare a preliminary draft report to the Council for the Commission to review at the next meeting. McCaull said the Commission could include an alternative recommendation in their report that they would prefer to keep the current process because it is working so well.

Discussion Regarding Historic Districts

Chairman Keith said this item is on the agenda to discuss so the Commission can learn more about how historic districts work - what are the requirements, how to get one started, etc. Ms. McCaull said the city's preservation ordinance contains a procedure. It requires that 75% of the owners have to agree to the creation of the district. If there are homes within the district that are non-contributing they do not receive historic designation. Ms. McCaull said that she understands that any homes that meet the criteria within the district would automatically become historic. The homeowners of historic homes who do not want to participate (that were not part of the 75% majority) would not have a choice; their homes would be historic against their will.

She said Coronado's ordinance could be crafted in any manner that the Commission feels is appropriate here. Some communities have design criteria for their districts that help to maintain the character of the district. Ms. Keith suggested that the Commission could put together an informational brochure about historic districts to get the information circulating to start creating interest. She said they should all look over the information in the Historic Preservation Ordinance to learn more. Commissioner MacCartee suggested that the Commission members identify some areas to discuss in January.

Discussion Regarding History of Coronado Parks Presentation and Development of Presentation on DVD with Audio

Chairman Keith said this topic was brought up briefly early in the meeting under the Director's Report. Commissioner Herron said she is talking with the City Manager to determine what audience he has in mind. She has also spoken with Amy Steward at Coronado Middle School who has some ideas. She said they want to do the best job possible.

Chairman Keith indicated that she had spoken with Chris Grant, the editor of Coronado Lifestyle Magazine, who wants to see the slide show and do an article in her publication. She thinks it will make a great article.

MISCELLANEOUS

Commissioner MacCartee said she wanted to discuss at a future meeting the forming of an organization such as the Savannah Organization, which is a nonprofit for the promotion of historic preservation in Savannah. Ms. McCaull said this would require a great deal of research on how that is done. She would be able to get information, but reminded everyone that the inventory is the priority at this time.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:30 p.m.

Tony A. Peña
Director of Community Development