

# CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

## MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

December 15, 2004

A regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m., Wednesday, December 15, 2004, at the Coronado Police Department Emergency Operations Center, 700 Orange Avenue, Coronado, California by Chairperson Keith.

### ROLL CALL

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

MEMBERS ABSENT:

STAFF: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner  
Linda Hascup, Administrative Secretary

### APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Minutes of the Regular Meeting of November 3, 2004 were approved as submitted.  
The Minutes of the Special Meeting of November 10, 2004 were approved as submitted.  
The Minutes of the Special Meeting of December 1, 2004 were approved as submitted.

### DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull reported that the National Trust has put out a publication called "Protecting America's Historic Neighborhoods; Taming the Teardown Trend". It summarizes what is happening across the country with the tearing down of small, older homes in historic neighborhoods and being replaced with large homes that don't fit in with the character of the neighborhood and are destroying the fabric of the communities. It also talks about what communities around the country are doing to address this issue. She said the Commission could discuss it at a future hearing if they are interested.

She also reported that per Commissioner MacCartee's request she has contacted the City Attorney regarding the ability to form a trust such as the Savannah Organization that was brought up at the last meeting.

## COMMITTEE REPORTS

None.

## ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

Commissioner MacCartee asked if the Commission should discuss the current issue regarding Central Beach since it is a Coronado resource. She said she would also like to discuss the Master Tree Plan which is identifying heritage or landmark trees within Coronado to be protected. She thought that perhaps the Commission could put together a memo regarding their thoughts on these topics.

Commissioner Draper said she would like to share with the other Commissioners an article from the LA Times regarding the formation of a cultural heritage commission. Their City Council has approved spending \$5M to create a list similar to the one this Commission is developing. However because they don't have the money in their budget they are looking for donations. Their program is not voluntary, and their commission has been active for over 40 years. Ms. Draper gave the article to staff to make copies for everyone.

Commissioner MacCartee requested on a future agenda to create a subcommittee as an advisory committee to this commission. This would reach out to more community members to participate.

Chairman Keith reported on her recent excursion to Catalina Island and the tour of the historic home formerly owned by the Wrigley family. She said it is only open to the public once a year. She said that everything is so clean and historic in Avalon and asked how they keep it that way. The answer she received is that everyone is on the commission.

## PUBLIC HEARINGS:

### APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

**HR 29-04**     **S. Lee and Shawna Meyer:** Request for Historic Designation of the property addressed as 1010 Olive Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. According to the research done by the applicant's representative, Ms. Kathleen Crawford, a historical property consultant, the building was constructed in 1931, which would make the structure 73 years old. The earliest city building permit was for a re-

roof in 1934, and a maid's room was added over the garage in 1939. Balconies and a roof deck were added in 2001. Ms. Crawford's research indicates that the structure was designed by notable architect Richard Requa, and is typical of his "Southern California Style" of Spanish Eclectic design. A point of interest is that the home was occupied by the Alessio family, owners of the Hotel Del Coronado for a period in the 1960's.

The Sourcepoint inventory rated this structure as a "2", indicating it as having significant local historical and architectural importance, being in excellent physical condition, and almost entirely unmodified from its original exterior appearance.

Applicant, Lee Meyer, 1010 Olive Avenue, said the house would appear to have significant historic significance and he and his wife would never want to see that house torn down. It has beautiful architecture. He attended a "Requa Revisited" garden party recently and could see so many of the Requa's design elements in that home that were similar to his own home. He said they were so similar it was striking. Mr. Meyer said he and his wife plan to live in the house until their children are grown and have no intention of moving away even after that. He said they would like to maintain this wonderful art treasure. The interior was recently remodeled on the inside, but the exterior was kept true to its original style.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairman Keith said this is the first time the Commission has considered a home that is not 75 years of age, so the Commission would need to carefully consider the criteria. Commissioner Wilson said she would have no trouble finding that the home had achieved historic significance based on its being designed by Richard Requa in the Spanish eclectic architectural style.

Commissioner Draper commented that it would be 74 years old in only two weeks and would have no problem waiving the 75 year requirement because it has achieved great significance in her eyes.

Commissioner MacCartee said this home has always been a treasure and can't see anything that has been changed over the years. She said the 75 year requirement could easily be waived.

Commissioner Herron said that she could easily recognize historicity of this particular house.

Chairman Keith said it seemed to be the consensus of the Commission that the home should be considered historic based on its association with Requa, and as an example of the Spanish Eclectic Architectural style. Commissioner Draper added that Mr. Richard Alessio was one of the occupants of the home beginning in 1962, which is also a significant factor. The Alessio Investment Company purchased the Hotel Del in 1960, Mr. Alessio later fell into legal difficulties. The rumor is that while the Alessio's lived in the home, Marilyn Monroe visited and allegedly bathed in champagne in the master tub; but that is just the rumor and hasn't been verified. Mr. Meyer said he had heard similar stories that may or may not be true, but they definitely lend some color.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER KEITH MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 29-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1010 OLIVE AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THAT ALTHOUGH THE HOME IS ONLY 73 YEARS OLD RATHER THAN 75 IT HAS ACHIEVED HISTORIC SIGNIFICANCE FOR THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE OR NATIONAL HISTORY IN THAT RICHARD REQUA WAS THE ARCHITECT AND THE ELISIO FAMILY (FORMER OWNER OF THE HOTEL DEL CORONADO, LIVED THERE;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING THE SPANISH ECLECTICE STYLE OF ARCHITECTURE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; AND
- D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF ARCHITECT RICHARD REQUA.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

Ms. McCaull said this is the 47<sup>th</sup> historically designated property in the City of Coronado.

**HR 14-04**     **City of Coronado:** Commission Discussion regarding the Formulation of a Historic Property Data List to be used in-lieu of the 75-year threshold for determining what structures are subject to the Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit Process

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She explained the information contained in the status report to the City Council. The list so far contains about 217 properties that would be subject to the demolition permit process. She said the report recommends that the City Council direct the Commission to proceed with the development of a list, and to authorize an additional six months to enable completion of the project.

Commissioner Herron asked if it would be appropriate to share the information with the City Council of the current articles on historic preservation and the article from Los Angeles on the \$5M set aside for their inventory list preparation. She said this might point out that Coronado is right in the current time and can be proud of their efforts at this time.

Commissioner Keith wondered if there was any background information from the Historic Preservation trust article that would be helpful to the City Council. She said it would give some credence to what the HRC is doing.

Commissioner Wilson suggested that maybe the Commission should delay sending the report to a later City Council meeting so it would not compete with the lifeguard service building discussion. She said the delay would also allow the Commission some time to prepare more substantial information in the report's recommendation. Commissioner Wilson volunteered to work on the wording for the recommendation. Commissioner MacCartee stated that she is opposed to the list. Chairman Keith said that the Commission can put a statement in the recommendation stating how they feel; that having a list will be so divisive. Ms. McCaull indicated that the City Manager's office might come up with another alternative recommendation after seeing the Commission's recommendation. The Commissioners then discussed the wording and made a few minor corrections.

**DISCUSSION ITEMS**

**Discussion regarding the Public Outreach Program**

Ms. McCaull congratulated the Commission on all of the programs they have accomplished this year; the website information; the newsletter; the historic plaques, the new slide show presentations; and the designation of city parks.

Eagle/Journal: Ms. McCaull asked if everyone had seen the article by Vicky Raun in the current Eagle. It said the Historic Preservation program is going strong, as evidence by the designation of the City's parks, etc. Chairman Keith said that she and

Commissioner MacCartee had spoken with Ms. Raun regarding another article. Commissioner Wilson asked if someone could approach the Eagle to get the regular meetings announced in the Eagle and have a list of topics to be discussed at each meeting.

Newsletter: Commissioner Draper said it might be good to make a goal of having another newsletter in March and listed some possible topics for future HRC meetings that would invite people to attend. It could also list some outreach programs and topics such as creating a historic district.

Slide Show: Commissioner MacCartee said she and Nancy would like to do another slide show in February or March.

Park's PowerPoint Presentation: Ms. McCaull said that conversion of the presentation from PowerPoint to CD video format according to the City Manager's request is being worked on. She said the voice over by Ron Clark is completed and Commissioner MacCartee has agreed to listen to see if it still fits with the slide show.

Flower Show: Chairman Keith said the group should work on putting together a new handout for the Flower Show. She has a draft and will bring it to the next meeting.

### **Discussion regarding Historic Districts**

Chairman Keith said that in the back of the Sourcepoint there is a section regarding a historic district. Ms. McCaull said she ordered a pamphlet from the Trust for Historic Preservation and it should arrive before too long. There isn't much information in the current ordinance. She recommended the Commission continue this discussion to the next meeting when more technical information will be available to help with the discussion. Chairman Keith said the timing is good as people are just beginning to ask about districts.

### MISCELLANEOUS

None.

### ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:17 p.m.

---

Tony A. Peña  
Director of Community Development