

## CORONADO HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION

### MEETING MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING

August 4, 2004

A regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m., Wednesday, August 4, 2004, at the Coronado Police Department Emergency Operations Center, 700 Orange Avenue, Coronado, California by Chairperson Keith.

#### ROLL CALL:

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

MEMBERS ABSENT:

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner  
Linda Hascup, Administrative Secretary

#### APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Minutes of the Regular Meeting of July 21, 2004 were approved as amended.

#### DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull informed the Commissioners that she would be attending a meeting of the Coronado Residential Association in the evening to give a briefing on the Historic Preservation Ordinance, benefits of historic designation, and the recently enacted demolition procedure for possible historic structures. She said that as of the current date there are 36 homes designated as Coronado Historic Resources and 4 pending applications. There are now 12 Mills Act contracts approved, with 11 pending. She explained that with the City Council's recent approval of an increase of funding for the program several of the pending Mills Act applications will be accommodated this year.

Ms. McCaull reported that there will be a special HRC meeting the next day at 3 pm at 1401 Ynez Place to give the Commission a chance to tour the property prior to its proposed restoration. She explained that the property, known as "Trant Manor" has been boarded up for the last 2 years. The public is also welcome to attend.

## COMMITTEE REPORTS

None.

## ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

Chairman Keith reported that the Council approved \$5,000 more annually for the Mills Act program than is currently allotted in addition for a \$5,000 budget for public outreach. Commissioner Draper commented that the City Council's support of the outreach effort was welcomed. She noted that even though the Historic Preservation Ordinance doesn't address commercial buildings, Councilmember Monroe again brought them forward as worthy of note.

Commissioner MacCartee announced that she and Ms. Nancy Cobb are putting together another slide show program.

## PUBLIC HEARINGS: APPLICATIONS FOR REVIEW

**HRPA 7-04 Wurzelbacher & Streight** - Request for a Historic Preservation Agreement for the single family residence located at 629 A Avenue in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said on March 3, 2004 the home was designated as Coronado's 30<sup>th</sup> historic residence and is now eligible to apply for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement with the City of Coronado. A Mills Act Agreement requires the property owner to preserve the home for minimum period of 10 years, and in exchange there is some property tax reduction. She explained that the HRC's role is to review the "list of improvements" that will be attached to the Mills Act application going to the City Council. The applicant is proposing the following list of improvements over the 10-year term of the contract:

1. Refurbish original exterior French doors and transoms;
2. Repair and Paint all exterior trim and windows;
3. Repair and replace damaged roof tile and perimeter roof deck;
4. Repair brick patios, walkways and landscape walls
5. Maintain and repair original rock creek stucco

Ms. McCaull said that since the City Council's has approved a prioritization process for Mills Act applications, this application would be coming back before the HRC to be prioritized along with the others that have been on hold.

Applicant, Bob Wurzelbacher, said the list of improvements looks pretty dry when it's presented on paper, but it entails much more than meets the eye for an 80-year old property. Chairman Keith explained the method of prioritization and said the wait wouldn't be as long now as previously.

Commissioner Herron said she was curious about the restoration item #5, the repair of the original rock creek stucco. She wondered who could do that type of repair. Mr. Wurzelbacher said that he had the name of a contractor that Ms. Granger, who also lives in Herreshoff Court, had used when she restored her home. He got the name from Ms. Granger/Elizabeth who had her entire home restored.

Ms. McCaull said that since the City Council has approved a prioritization process for Mills Act applications, this application would be coming back before the HRC to be prioritized along with the others that have been on hold.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

There was no further discussion.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS FOR 629 A AVENUE (HRPA 7-04) CONSISTING OF THE FOLLOWING ITEMS: 1) REFURBISH ORIGINAL EXTERIOR FRENCH DOORS AND TRANSOMS; 2) REPAIR AND PAINT ALL EXTERIOR TRIM AND WINDOWS; 3) REPAIR AND REPLACE DAMAGED ROOF TILE AND PERIMETER ROOF DECK; 4) REPAIR BRICK PATIOS, WALKWAYS AND LANDSCAPE WALLS; AND, 5) MAINTAIN AND REPAIR ORIGINAL ROCK CREEK STUCCO; AND SUBMIT THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION AGREEMENT FOR PRIORITIZATION AND APPROVAL.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

**HRPA 8-04 Oval, John & Michele** - Request for a Historic Preservation Agreement for the single family residence located at 536 A Avenue in the R-1A(E) (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said the home was designated on July 7, 2004 as the Coronado's 34<sup>th</sup> historic resource and is now eligible to apply for a Historic Resource Preservation (Mills Act) Agreement with the City of Coronado. A Mills Act Agreement requires the property owner to preserve the home for minimum period of 10 years, and in exchange there is some property tax reduction. She explained that the HRC's role is to review the "list of improvements" that will be attached to the Mills Act application going to the City Council. Due to the fact that the exterior and interior of the property have recently been restored to their original (1920) condition, the applicant is proposing to adequately maintain the building and property over the 10-year term of the contract.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

There was no further discussion.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS FOR 536 A AVENUE (HRPA 8-04) CONSISTING OF THE ROUTINE MAINTENANCE OF THE PROPERTY; AND SUBMIT THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION AGREEMENT FOR PRIORITIZATION AND APPROVAL.

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

**HR 15-04**    **Witalis, Patti & Roger** – Request for a Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 927 D Avenue located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said that the dwelling and garage were constructed in 1924 (80 years old) in the Tudor architectural style, and the structure was issued sewer permit #1250 in March of 1925. The original owner of the property was Hakes Investment Company and the contractor was Mr. Hamilton. She said the applicant believes the property is historically significant because of the architectural style and because the Hakes have been notable builders and contractors within Coronado. H.B Hakes underwrote the first paving bonds in Coronado, he served on the Coronado City Council, and his company built numerous homes in Coronado in the 1930's.

Applicant, Patty McKenna Witalis, 927 D Avenue, said she and her husband have owned the house since 1993. She said that basically nothing has been done to it over the years; it is pretty much the same as when it was built. She said if the designation is approved they would be return to the Commission with an alteration permit because they would like to improve the kitchen, add a staircase to the upstairs and add a bath and bedroom, which will entail adding a couple of dormers to match the existing dormers for ventilation and add a porch in the rear. She said that because it is an R-3 property they would also like to demolish the one car garage and replace it with a two car garage, possibly with a studio apartment above. They were thinking of requesting some relief from the covered parking requirement because if they provided 4 parking spaces it would cover the remaining open space on the lot.

Ms. McCaull explained that one of the positive aspects of the newly enacted demolition program is that Ms. Witalis had originally come in asking for a demolition permit. After she described what she wanted to do she was advised by staff that she wouldn't really need to get a demolition permit; she would just need to remodel. When she was advised of the benefits of being designated, the leeway regarding zoning code, she decided to designate the property, and another property she owned also.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION**

Commissioner MacCartee said it is a wonderful example for the type of architectural style we are trying to save in Coronado and the size of home, especially in the R-3 zone and supports the designation. Commissioner Draper commented that it is a sweet little house with very little modified.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 15-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 927 D AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S ECONOMIC AND AESTHETIC HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE TUDOR ARCHITECTURAL STYLE AND BEING ONE OF THE SMALL COTTAGES THAT CORONADO WAS KNOWN FOR, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF BUILDERS BRYANT AND LEDYARD HAKES OF HAKES INVESTMENT COMPANY;

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

**HR 16-04**     **Witalis, Patti & Roger** – Request for a Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 1025 E Avenue located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said that a building permit was issued in 1919 for a Craftsman style home. Sewer permit #831 was issued in March of 1920. The original owner was Louise Jennings and the contractor of record was J.E. Alcaraz. Some minor alterations have occurred over the years, such as the addition of skylights in 1928 and the addition of a bathroom in 1939 by owner Miss Inga Orner. J.E. Alcaraz, an electrician in the early 1900's, began work as a building contractor in the 1920's, and was also mayor of Coronado from 1925 to 1926. In addition, Ms. Orner was an internationally known soprano, having been a member of the Metropolitan Opera Company in New York, and had performed in

several tours in the U.S., Canada, and Australia. Ms. Orner was once received by King Haakon VII of Norway at his royal palace in August of 1930. The Source Point document rated the home as a 2H.

Applicant, Patti McKenna Witalis, 927 D Avenue, said she has lived in Coronado off and on since 1952 and feels privileged to be able to own and protect little pieces of Coronado. She said she and her husband absolutely love this home; it is the most comfortable and wonderful house. The only thing they could ever see doing to it in the future would be with the garage that is on the lot line and is held together by the termites holding hands. She said they have upgraded the kitchen and bathrooms, and painted the house. They also replaced the rotted, wooden sides along the steps with brick and added some brick in the driveway to eliminate a safety issue. She said she had been in contact with a man who has a Hotel Del Coronado postcard written on by Inga Orner. He is trying to locate the card so he can send it to Ms. Witalis. She said she would frame it and hang it in the house.

Commissioner Draper asked if the Witalis's had done some work on the home since it was listed in the Source Point as in "fair" condition. Ms. Witalis said they removed some aluminum awnings and had it painted. She said they had it stripped it right down to the bare redwood during the process and there was no dry rot except for the little bit in the porch area. Commissioner Herron asked if the multi-paned windows were original. Ms. Witalis said she is sure they are original judging by how much they leak.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

There was no further discussion.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER HERRON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HR 16-04 REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION OF 1025 E AVENUE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S ECONOMIC, AESTHETIC AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;

- C. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH INGA ORNER WHO WAS KNOWN NATIONALLY AND INTERNATIONALLY AS AN OPERATIC SOPRANO, AND WITH FORMER CORONADO MAYOR J.E. ALCARAZ;
- D. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE CORONADO CRAFTSMAN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED; AND
- E. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF CONTRACTOR J.E. ALCARAZ.

COMMISSIONER DRAPER SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron  
NAYS:  
ABSENT:  
ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 5-0.

**HR 19-04**     **Darnell, James P. Family Trust** – Request for a preliminary review of the property addressed as 708 A Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone and whether it meets the criteria to be designated a Historic Resource.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said that Mr. Darnell has requested a preliminary review of his property in order to determine if it meets the criteria to be designated as a Coronado Historic Resource.

The property contains a two-story Italian Renaissance style dwelling, approximately 5,200 sq.ft. in size, with a detached garage, swimming pool, and a tennis court. A building permit was issued in 1915 for the construction of a garage and a dwelling with 16 rooms. Sewer Permit #712 was issued for the home. The original owner was recorded as F.S. Sherman and the contractor was Billings and Whetstone. Some minor alterations have occurred to the dwelling over the years, including a window being converted into a French door, various wall/fence improvements, and the addition of a chain link fence for a tennis court. In the 1970's, the Darnell's added a greenhouse, a pool, and completed some fence replacements.

Ms. McCaull said that Mr. Darnell indicates that the architect was Reginald Johnson who was well known for his projects in the Santa Barbara, Montecito, and Pasadena

areas. He designed several very large estates, including Heavenly Oaks, Baldwin Hills Village, the Santa Barbara Music Academy, as well as the famous Biltmore Hotel. He was recognized as partly responsible for bringing the Spanish Revival style in Santa Barbara to national prominence. Commissioner Draper added that the Reginald Johnson also designed her family home, as well as the La Valencia Hotel in La Jolla which opened in 1926.

Applicant, James P. Darnell, 708 A Avenue, said it would be his preference to live in his home and not have it be demolished until after he is gone. However he applied for the demolition permit before the new ordinance because he believes the property is worth more without the house than with the house and if it is designated as historic his children wouldn't be able to sell it. Mr. Darnell said his request would be to have it released from being a historic house so he can live in it; otherwise he said he would have to tear it down. He said the economics are that five houses could be built in its place.

Commissioner Wilson asked how Mr. Darnell figured the amount of money he would be losing if he kept the home as historic. Mr. Darnell said that with the price of houses in Coronado now, when a property that is a piece of junk goes for \$2M, it is easy to see that his property divided into five lots at a million and a half each is worth more.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

Page Harrington, Coronado Historical, 1100 Orange Avenue, said her research showed the same information as staff presented. She said it is a very significant estate and she believes it would qualify as a historic resource. She said she would differ with Mr. Darnell's assertion that if the property would sell for more if it was divided and sold as five lots. She said that national research shows that the value of noted historic estates is sky-rocketing. She believes he would get more for the home if it was designated historic. She suggested that he might want to do a little more national research. Especially in light of the prominence of the architect, his home might qualify on the national register of historic places. The only other structure in Coronado of that stature is the Hotel Del Coronado.

Ms. Maryanne Darnell Nass, 310 B Avenue, said that when her father passes away only she and her brother will own the property. They wouldn't be able to afford to buy each other out or restore the house so they could live in it. She said her dad bought it as a wonderful investment. She said that both she and her father believe the city should not be able to put a stipulation on what they can do with their own property. She didn't know why she and her brother should have to go into debt to pay the inheritance tax.

Chairman Keith said she wanted to clarify that Mr. Darnell does have a demolition permit in his hand that is valid for a certain period of time. She said it was issued in

May, so it will expire in November. Mr. Darnell clarified that he originally requested the permit in May, but it wasn't issued until July.

Ms. Keith said that if the Historic Resource Commission issues a demolition permit there is no expiration date. She advised that Mr. Darnell has asked the Commission to advise him, if under normal circumstances, his house would be considered historic. If this commission decides it is historic the Darnell Trust would have to come back with an application to go through the entire demolition process.

Mr. Darnell said he and his wife would like to spend their last years in the house. It needs a new roof and the family room needs a new ceiling. He said if the Commission grants him the privilege of living in the house he will have to put about \$50,000 into it right now to continue to live in it. Ms. Nass said they don't want to get rid of the house now; they would like to keep the home for her mom who still plays tennis there at 82 years of age. She said it would hurt them as much as it would hurt the City to tear down the house. When they moved in there wasn't a single shower in the house, and now you can't find parts for the toilets. Ms. Nass said they might not divide it into five lots, perhaps only 3, but they just want to have their options. Mr. Darnell said that part of his privilege is to build a house on the tennis court and after two years of living in it get a \$2M tax benefit and then build another house and get another \$2M tax benefit. He said that is the economics he is faced with.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper said that if this was a regular application she would have to say it very clearly meets the criteria of a historic home because of its age, and being built by Mr. Johnson, a nationally known architect, and it is certainly one of the few remaining examples. She said that in her opinion it is a historic home.

Commissioner MacCartee said she would be betraying her job as a commission to call this property as anything but historic. She said that Mr. Darnell's property is one of the prime examples of the kind of architecture that Coronado was known for. It is probably one of the last large pieces of property left in Coronado that has grounds. She said that even though her area is not the economics, she has trouble believing that there would not be a buyer willing to pay the kind of money that type of property is worth.

Commissioner Herron commented that she would agree. She said she has been in the home and it is a splendid, beautiful historic home; a fine example of Coronado's best.

Commissioner Wilson said that Mr. Darnell's home couldn't be considered anything but historic. She said there was no other possible finding. It is a marvelous home and has wonderful grounds.

Chairman Keith said she was the one who encouraged Mr. Darnell to come forward to get a reading from the Commission. She said she had done absolutely no research or has any background information on the home other than knowing it was old and big. Now that she knows the architect was Reginald Johnson and of his renown she said she would have to vote to designate it as a historic resource if an application was submitted.

Ms. McCaull said it appears that the Commission had reached consensus and Mr. Darnell has the answer to his question.

Mr. Darnell said he would have to appeal to the City Council. He said he didn't think anyone would come along who would want the place or pay that kind of money. He said they won't want to repair the seven bathrooms or the ceilings, a lot of which are made out of beach sand. He said the house has to go, one way or another.

**NOI 4-04**     **Rugee, Kevin & Gail** - Consideration of Notice of Intent to demolish the single family residence and detached studio house addressed as 842 D Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.  
(APPLICATION REQUEST WITHDRAWN)

**NOI 5-04**     **Hoffman, Wayne and Nancy** - Consideration of Notice of Intent to demolish the single family residence addressed as 1026 E Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ann McCaull, Associate Planner, introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. She said the home was constructed in 1925 in the English Tudor cottage architectural style. The dwelling was issued sewer permit #1328. The architect is unknown, and the contractor was O.W. Dorman. There were several minor repairs and modifications over the years, including the addition of a glass porch in 1928, a bathroom in 1930, a re-roof in the 1940's, and the addition of a patio cover in 1960. The Source Point document rated the home as a 3. The current owners of the property feel it does not meet the criteria to be designated as a historic resource as there are not many notable merits and there are several other remaining examples of this architectural style remaining in the community.

Applicant, Nancy Hoffman, 1026 E Avenue, said when they first heard about the Mills Act she contact Ms. McCaull who helped her with some research to see if they could have it designated as historic. She said they would have liked to save the home, but the research showed that the home probably didn't meet the qualifications. She and her husband Wayne spent some time deciding what to do and have decided they would like to build a cottage style home in its place and have worked with an architect to develop plans. She said the best part of the old house is the big window in the front. Ms. Hoffman said they might want to try to use it in the new house, but the leaded part

is quite corroded. She didn't know if it would hold together once the window is taken out, but if they don't use it they would most certainly make it available for someone else to use in a historic type house.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairman Keith said the neighborhood where this home is located has remained pretty much untouched and the home fits in so well. She said it could be a potential historic district that would be a place many people would want to go see just for the homes that are still there. Her request to the applicants would be to build something that will be complementary to the neighborhood. Ms. Keith said she thought the home might meet some of the historic criteria but perhaps not enough to justify making it stay. She was appreciative that the owner would be willing to allow Coronado Historical to come in and salvage historic pieces for their program.

Ms. Hoffman said she and her husband have thought about what kind of house they would want to build, but the current home is the only one that is different in the neighborhood now. The new house will fit right in and won't stand out. It will have a porch across the front and wrapping around the side and won't be too large. It will be one story in the front and then two in the middle. They had originally planned on one story, but it doesn't give them quite enough room for when they keep their grandchildren, which is pretty frequently.

Commissioner Herron said she agrees that the block is a perfect historic quality block that could potentially be considered for a historic district. Everyone on the block has been working to upgrade their homes, and the home across the street has a similar window. She said she would be sad to lose the house, because it is the cottage style that the Commission talks frequently about saving. She said she would view the home as historic. She suggested that the homeowner could have the home designated as historic and still be able to modify it to fit her needs with an alteration permit. Commissioner Wilson said she was surprised the owner didn't think the home was historic because she would have a hard time saying it isn't.

Ms. McCaull said the purpose is to decide if the structure meets historic criteria to be designated as a historic resource. If it meets the criteria, the commission designates it and then the applicant comes back and requests the demolition permit. She said however, there are several other examples of this type of architecture in the city.

Commissioner Draper said it is definitely old enough and it is a sweet home. The age and architectural style qualify, but she would have to reach to find the other criteria

required for designation. Commissioner MacCartee said her worry is about what kind of house would replace this one in the neighborhood in its place.

Ms. McCaull said she wanted to remind the Commission of a recent discussion regarding a house on A Avenue. There were a lot of reasons the home could have been designated as historic, but staff had cautioned that the original intent of the ordinance was to try to save the more significant homes within the community. This may be a cute home and may just meet the criteria, but perhaps the Commission might want to rethink how they view this type of home. She asked if the City Council really meant for a bungalow like this to be kept from demolition when they were really looking at the more significant homes.

Commissioner Draper said she was sad to lose the home on A Avenue, but it wasn't one of the last remaining of its kind. She said she would have to trust this applicant that they would build a home that is fitting for the neighborhood. Not every home in the neighborhood has to be historic for it to be a historic district. Commissioner Herron said that even if there are several remaining, it is a style that was only done for a certain period of time so there are a finite number of homes.

Commissioner MacCartee said that if the owner came in requesting this be designated the Commission would find a way to designate it. She said she would have been happy to designate it; however there are two sides of the question as Ms. McCaull mentioned. This owner is not making that request.

#### COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 1026 E AVENUE (NOI 5-04) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED A HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT; AND
- B. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S AESTHETIC, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY; HOWEVER,
- C. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S) OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE OR NATIONAL HISTORY;
- D. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR

METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;

- E. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL;
- F. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 1.9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME)

COMMISSIONER KEITH SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, MacCartee  
NAYS: Commissioners Herron and Wilson  
ABSENT:  
ABSTAIN:

The motion passed 3-2.

Ms. McCaull said she added additional conditions to the resolution for this property and all future requests of this type: 1) the owner must notify the City at least 14 days prior to demolition; 2) that the City or Coronado Historical Association be given the opportunity to document the home via photograph or video; and 3) that the CHA be provided with an opportunity to salvage historic building materials for their "Keep it in Coronado" re-use program. The owner indicated she would like to reuse some of the items in the home as well.

She added that the earlier research done on the historicity of the Hoffman's home showed that it would most likely not qualify for the Mills Act program which has much more stringent requirements than historic designation.

**HR 17-04**     **Sosnowski, Ronald & Barbara** - Request for a Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 1013 Adella Avenue located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

(CONTINUED TO THE AUGUST 18, 2004 MEETING)

**HR 13-02**     **City of Coronado** – Review of Application of Historic Designation of City Parks and Recommendation to the City Council.  
(AGENDA ITEM CONTINUED TO A FUTURE HEARING)

**DISCUSSION ITEMS**

**Commission Discussion Regarding the Formulation of a Historic Property Data List to Identify Potentially Historical Properties**

Ms. McCaull explained the process that has taken place so far to create the current list. She said the previously discussed plan to tour the sites won't be possible. The City Attorney indicated that a moving tour would be difficult to meet the goals of the Brown Act. He said it would be difficult for adequate public participation. She suggested that either the commission members pair up, or have staff photograph all of the remaining structures on the list and bring the photos to the commission. She said that staff has photographed several of the homes and handed out the photos. The Commission commenced the comparison between the current photos and the historic photos.

Commissioner Keith said she envisions that the final document will contain historic photos, current photos, a list of permit history, and a narrative describing the historic characteristics of each structure. It would also provide a historic rating.

Commissioner Herron said she was having a problem with the current process. She said she felt the Commission was moving away from the original philosophy of saving the character of Coronado and are now picking out only the jewels. Chairman Keith said the Commission had been given the task by the Council to come up with a process and to develop a list of significant properties which would have to apply for permits in order to be demolished. She said that even if the Commission comes up with a list of the most significant homes, that doesn't mean there aren't other homes that are eligible to be designated. This list and the process will prevent another demolition like the one that occurred on Tolita Avenue. She said it will allow the key historic structures in Coronado to be saved from demolition. Ms. Keith said that after the Commission finishes with this list, they could go back and review all the homes they didn't put on the list and put together what would be the new "Source Point" for Coronado.

Ms. Keith said that they couldn't save every house, but should finish working through the current list. When the list is finished the Commission can present it to the Council and explain that the Commission has some serious concerns about limiting the demolition process to just these homes and that they would like to continue working to review the next 100 or so, and refine the list. Commissioner Herron conjectured that they could present the list as a work in progress. Commissioner Herron said she would like to continue documenting the historic homes and add to the list. There was general agreement from the rest of the Commissioners.

Page Harrington, Executive Director of Coronado Historical Association, said she agrees with Commissioner Herrons' reluctance, but she knows the Commission has to go forward because the Council has asked for it. She asked if CHA could continue to be notified of demolition requests for all of the homes over 75 years of age, even the ones not on the list. Ms. McCaull said there may be some modifications to the ordinance due to these changes and she could look at the additional notification for CHA.

The Commissioners divided up the list to research the microfilm records for a list of permits and any other information they can find regarding modifications to the homes. The microfilm sometimes contains information about the owner, architect, builder, etc. They decided to bring back the information they gathered for the first meeting in September.

### **Discussion regarding size limitations for Historic Resource Designation Applications**

The Commission continued the discussion on this item.

### **Commission Discussion Regarding the Public Outreach Program**

Commissioner Draper asked about the article that was submitted to the Eagle that still hasn't been published. Ms. McCaull said she heard from the Eagle staff that the article was too editorial. She said the Eagle is planning to run a story soon about the Mills Act and other historic preservation topics. Chairman Keith said she would try to find out more.

### MISCELLANEOUS

None.

### ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

---

Tony A. Peña  
Director of Community Development