

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

August 17, 2005

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 1 p.m., Wednesday, August 17, 2005, at the Coronado Police Department Emergency Operations Center, 700 Orange Avenue, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Keith.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Martha Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of August 3, 2005, were approved as amended.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

There was no separate report.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

NOI 12-05 Hutsell, Dale and Deborah: – Consideration of Notice of Intent to demolish the single family residence addressed as 562 E Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family) Residential Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The applicants are proposing the demolition of the structure. They have authorized Michael Bass to represent them in this matter since they live out of state. This property is zoned R-3. It is a multiple family residential zone and currently contains a single family residence and a detached garage. Surrounding properties are a mixture of single and multi-family development. A new construction project is occurring just south of this property, a three-unit condominium. The owners are planning on demolishing the structure and also building a three-unit condominium. Since this home was built in 1926, it is 79 years old, and is subject to a demolition review permit process. The purpose of today's hearing is for the Commission to review the structure and determine whether or not it meets the criteria to be designated historic resource. The original owner was Tinnie Johnson and the contractor was identified as P.M. Holt, who constructed several homes within the community. No information was available on the original architect of record, or the Johnson family. It is a Spanish eclectic architectural style. Staff did not find that it overwhelmingly met the criteria. For the record, correspondence was received by the Community Development Department via e-mail from the

Homeowners Association of Crown Manor II, 54 E Avenue, where they indicated their concerns regarding increased density in the neighborhood, associated parking requirements or demands, and an already existing neighborhood that is impacted by parking.

The applicant's representative, Michael Bass, 10215 Summit Crest Drive, Santee, stated that each unit will have a two-car garage so it will increase parking spaces. The applicants wish to demolish the house because it is in very poor shape.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the publish wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Keith stated that when a notice of intent to demolish a home is received, the Commission reviews the criteria listed in the City Ordinance to determine if it would qualify to be designated historic. In addition to the age requirements, it would need to meet two additional criteria to be designated a historic resource.

Commissioner Wilson could not justify the home being historic and said she would be prepared to issue a permit to demolish.

Commissioner Herron said this home was not an historically significant structure in the neighborhood and agreed with issuing a permit to demolish.

Commissioner Draper agreed with the other Commissioners to issue a permit to demolish but pointed out that P.M. Holt was a notable builder that built many homes in Coronado.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON WILSON MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 562 E AVENUE (NOI 12-05) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED A HISTORIC RESOURCE, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

THE PROPERTY DOES MEET THE 75-YEAR AGE REQUIREMENT;

- A. IT DOES NOT EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S) OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;

C. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;

D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL.

IN ADDITION, THE OWNER MUST NOTIFY THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION (CHA) AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO PROVIDE CHA WITH AN OPPORTUNITY TO SALVAGE HISTORIC BUILDING MATERIALS FOR THEIR "KEEP IT IN CORONADO" RE-USE PROGRAM.

COMMISSIONER HERRON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 4-0.

There is a 10-day appeal period.

HR 17-05 **Trant Manor LLC**: Request for Historic Designation of the Trant Manor Lodge (1906 Lodge) addressed as 1401 Ynez Place and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The City condemned this property a number of years ago due to a series of violations occurring on the property. Trant Manor LLC acquired the property and is proposing a number of improvements. The site contains approximately 13,000 square feet and includes the lodge along with the single family residence. The owners are proposing to restore the lodge and plan to also construct some additional structures surrounding the lodge. The property is zoned R-3 and is a multiple family residential zone and is surrounded by a combination of single and multi-family development. Various alterations are proposed to the building and would be the subject of a future historic alteration permit should the Commission deem the building an historic resource. The applicant has a detailed presentation concerning the future alterations which gives the Commission an opportunity to look at the future proposed alterations and also gives the property owner an indication whether or not the alterations may/may not be supported and whether or not to proceed with the designation request. The lodge will be operated as a boarding house, as it was originally intended when it was constructed in 1906. The new facility surrounding the building will also be operated as a lodge and will require a special use permit from the Planning Commission and City Council. There may be some alterations proposed in the future that may trigger a need for relief from the zoning Ordinance, which is one of the benefits of having a property designated an historic resource. A person can apply for exceptions to the Code and those alterations are considered at a public hearing and all property owners within 300 feet are notified to give surrounding owners an opportunity to comment. The owners are indicating that the structure should be designated due to the believed architects of record who are Hebbard and Gill, and for serving as

one of the original boarding houses within the community, because it was owned and operated by Frederick Winchester, who built several properties on the 700 block of C Avenue, as well as the original concrete building on the corner of Loma and Orange.

Chairperson Keith stated that for the record there was a letter submitted to the Historic Resource Commission from Doug St. Denis, representing the Coronado Historical Association, endorsing the request for designation.

The applicant, Dave Gillingham, 649 Pomona, stated that the PowerPoint presentation was being given in order to communicate the overall plan for the structure in addition to requesting historic designation. He stated that he had been interested in the property for many years and actively started negotiating with Mr. Trant, Sr. to purchase the property two years ago. In order to professionally manage the property, he decided that his wife, Sue Gillingham, would manage the property as she has many years of experience in corporate management.

The applicant, Sue Gillingham, 649 Pomona, gave a PowerPoint presentation and an overview of the proposed overall plan for the structure. Their intent was to rehabilitate a house from 1906 and get historic designation; return it to its original use; build historically architecturally similar bungalows around the main lodge that will add guestrooms and make it economically feasible to run the entire property as a very high-end historic inn; create two pocket parks along A Avenue which should have a number of benefits. There are three Coronado couples who make up Trant Manor LLC, Dave and Sue Gillingham, Pam and Mark Gould, and Holly and Joe Jankowitz, all local residents. The goal is to open business as a boarding house by the end of 2006 as it would be the 100 year anniversary.

Chris Ackerman, Architect, 765 C Avenue, said that the building was built in 1906 and was designed by Hebbard and Gill. It was believed to be the last building designed by the two architects whose style was becoming very divergent. Hebbard used an Italian style on the roof and the intricate leaded windows whereas Gill used spare rectangular surfaces with simple punctuations of square windows and arches. The building is made up of a very unusual structure system consisting of custom-made hollow concrete un-reinforced tiles. There are notable interior architectural features, one of which is a center stairwell with a large square hall in the middle and an arched ceiling. In the middle of each wall on the arched ceiling is a curved art glass window that fronts a dormer that fits on all four sides of the building. When the dormer and curved glass windows are opened, air just streams though the entire building. At this intersection, there is a conversion of three different streets which is irregular and dangerous from a public safety point. As a bonus to the applicants and a gift to the City, it is proposed that A Avenue be realigned as it intersects with Ynez and make the Adella portion a separate intersection. This brings the intersection to a 90 degree angle and is designed to provide three more parking spaces for the City to use. Complete underground parking is provided for all currently required parking spaces for the entire development. The grandfathered parking spaces are proposed to be abandoned. The entrance/exit for underground parking would be on A Avenue. All existing windows and openings would be kept as is with the exception of a couple of doors and windows on the first floor in the back. The two-story bungalows would be scattered around the perimeter of the site, removing them away from the historic lodge. They are designed to look like miniature versions of the lodge.

Mr. Ackerman clarified for Commissioner Herron that the realignment of the street would create three additional parking spaces.

Ms. Gillingham stated that there were multiple benefits to the City, which included support of the growing preservation movement, a public park, narrow streets, and possibly another historic landmark to the City. They were looking for the Commission to support the entire development including future alterations.

Chairperson Keith asked the applicant to give an overview of the future alterations.

Mr. Ackerman stated that the stairs are a below ground structure that go up the property line, and they do have low planters that are two feet above grade that separate the stairs from the public and go a couple of feet beyond the property line. They are asking for a 5' wide setback along the interior A Avenue side property line. If it were developed as one property, it would be 10 feet. If it were developed as a separate condominium structure, it would be a side yard setback and would be 5'. The reason this is being done is to remove the buildings from the lodge. There is a flat façade two-story building 2-3 feet from the property line. They are asking for a 3' setback. If they revert back to a two-lot configuration, they would have a 30-foot wide parcel which would have a 3' setback. The arbor comes up to the property line at the public park. For the underground parking, they are asking for four spaces which means there are two sets of two spaces. They want to go underneath City property with the parking structure and use that underground parking for the lodge; there are 2-4 spaces.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Daphne Brown, 326 First Street, spoke in favor of the designation.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper commented that the applicant may qualify for the State Register.

Marie Leah, 427 C Street, San Diego, said they would be applying for the National Register. If selected for the National Register, one is automatically on the California Register. It is the National that has the benefits, which include investment tax credits for properties that are put into a depreciable use.

Sue Gillingham commented one of the benefits, in addition to the potential tax credit, is to be included in National Historic Register.

Commissioner Draper stated that they are creating a pocket park for the City at their expense, but the Commission cannot approve changing the streets.

Ms. McCaull stated that the realignment of the Avenue was already reviewed by the Traffic Operations Committee and are supporting the proposed alterations.

Commissioner Draper stated she would certainly support a designation.

Commissioner Herron stated that she understood what a lodge was in 1906 but asked for clarification on its intended use today.

Mr. Ackerman stated that according to the City's zoning Ordinance, this would be a boarding house, which is similar to a high-end boutique/hotel. It is an overnight guest facility with a maximum stay of 28 days, which means that the City would acquire TOT funds from all guests.

Commissioner Herron said that she was interested in viewing the proposals in the next few weeks, and did not see any issues with the future alterations that were presented today.

Chairperson Keith stated she supported the designation, and the requests presented today seemed reasonable.

Commissioner Wilson said she supported the designation, was impressed with the project, and felt the extra cottages would provide more interest.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 1401 YNEZ PLACE TO BE A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE, OR NATIONAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ITALIAN RENAISSANCE ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 4-0.

HR 16-05 **Garbutt, Mark and Apua:** Preliminary Review of future application to be filed for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 576 E Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone and future subdivision of the property to create two parcels with required parking of historic home to be located on adjoining parcel.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. She said that Mr. and Ms. Garbutt have requested a preliminary review of their property in order to determine if it meets the criteria to be designated as a Coronado Historic Resource. The Commission has established a policy where preliminary review applications are filed and reviewed when historic designation is being considered. The preliminary review hearing is handled the same as a normal request would be in that all property owners within 300 feet are notified. The property is zoned R-3 multiple family residential. It has a single family home in the front, garages in the back, next to the alley, with residence up above. This site contains 7,000 square feet so it would allow for the construction of four units if the applicants chose to do so. The owners are interested in preserving the front home. They acquired the property several years ago and have improved/restored the structure. They would like to create two separate parcels so that the rear property can be sold off separately. This process can be accomplished through a lot line adjustment which is an administrative hearing item handled by staff. It would require an exception through the City's minimum lot depth requirement because the rear lot would only have a lot depth of 50' where normally 70' would be required. This is not a unique request. The unique aspect of the proposed idea is that the parking for the front home would be located on the rear parcel. Typically, parking would be required on the same parcel that the dwelling is located. If the property is designated an historic resource, then the Commission has the flexibility to allow the required parking to be on an adjoining property. This can be handled through an easement which is normally done for single family zones. Unfortunately, the Code does not allow for this type of arrangement in the R-3 zone, so if the property is designated historic, the owners would return before the Commission to request that the required parking to be on the adjoining parcel. The front home appears on the 1882 Lot Book so the structure is at least 113 years old. The contractor and owner was Peter Holt, who was also the developer of the property to the north of this property. After 1940, there were not many permits issued although the Garbutts added a deck in 1955. It does appear that alterations have occurred but no records substantiate the alterations.

Chairperson Keith stated for the record that she met with Ms. Garbutt about six weeks ago to discuss this matter and encouraged Ms. Garbutt to proceed with the process.

Commissioner Draper asked about the original right-of-way and possible future issues.

Chairperson Keith stated that she understood there was no right-of-way; they would use the public sidewalk to get from the parking to their home.

The applicant, Apua Garbutt, 815 Sixth Street, said that she and her husband restored the front home about twelve years ago. The home was purchased from the Hope family and there were three generations that owned the home. On the side of the home, she had a stained glass window made by an artist who researched Hotel Del Coronado in 1911 and duplicated a similar window for the home. There are holes in the floor and the ceiling, the bathroom downstairs needs repairing. She stated that they do not need to keep both homes and are requesting a configuration of the lot line. If the lot line is horizontal, it would be a panhandle lot line and one home could be sold. They are seeking historical designation because of the age, and also because the owner/contractor was Peter M. Holt. It was believed that the structure in the back was originally the carriage house to the front house. There were four "stables" that have been converted into garages. Of those garages, two would be designated for the front house and two for the back house. The front house faces E Avenue and the back house faces 6th Street. They are limited to having a garage in the front house because of the proximity of the school and it is very dangerous for children to ride bikes up and down the street and have cars backing out.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Keith said that this is a preliminary review so Commission input is requested. Staff has indicated that they are amenable to the lot line adjustment but the parking requirements issue needed to be addressed. City regulations require that each lot have two off street parking and this would be an exception in this case.

Ms. McCaull stated that the applicant was still working on the actual lot line configuration. She asked the applicant if Algert Engineering had prepared anything for today's meeting.

Ms. Garbutt said Algert Engineering had prepared the documents but were not able to transmit those documents for the meeting today.

Ms. McCaull stated that without a site plan depicting the actual lot line configuration, she was unable to determine if there was a need to have a reduced rear yard setback for the front home, but there were options for configuring that.

Commissioner Draper said that the request certainly meets the age criteria, it is associated with a significant builder in town, and is one of the few remaining architectural styles. The designation would need to state that only the front property is being considered for historic designation.

Commissioner Herron agreed. She understood the historical significance and the only question would be the site plan.

Commissioner Wilson agreed and said she was prepared to go forward.

Chairperson Keith stated the Commission was agreeable to the request and asked the applicants to submit an application.

COMMISSION ACTION

No action was taken.

HAP 7-05 **DJF 4000 LLC** – Request for modifications to previously issued Historic Alteration Permit for historically designated Monterey Complex addressed as 848-866 D Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The Commission granted designation of this property in January 2005. In February 2005, the Commission approved a series of alterations to the building, mostly involving restoration. It included demolition of the existing garage structures at the rear of the property and construction of some new carports. The carports were authorized to have reduced side yard setback. The property has since been sold and the new owners are re-thinking previous approvals and are requesting additional changes. Curt Holder is the architect

for the project and will explain in more detail what is being proposed. There are steel ladders on the sides of the building which are proposed to be removed to create private patio space for the units on the first floor. The front stairs are in need of structural repair. Some demolition already occurred to the front stairs where decorative tile on the top was removed. Mr. Holder is trying to find replacement tiles. On the rear of the property is a roof deck for a pent house (balcony) and there is wood railing which is proposed to be replaced with stucco. It seems that the exterior elevations along the alley differ from the previously approved elevation submitted and it seems that the windows on the penthouse may be changed slightly. The last change is that the new owner would rather put in garages than carports. The original Monterey building had the two-piece clay tile roof instead of the one piece. There may be some discussion on the preference of the Commission, although this is not an historic structure. The garage structures will have a 4' side yard setback as the carports did. The garages will have a 2 ½ foot setback off the alley which will provide about 18' of space for the garages. The carports would only house about 14' of space.

The applicant and architect, Curt Holder, 3696 Midway Drive, San Diego, said that when they purchased the property they felt it would be more valuable if changes were made. The first change is the exterior. There is metal ladder and very narrow stairs on both sides of the building, which interrupts the open space of the persons living below. The ladder is proposed to be removed, keeping the balcony at the top and the rear door from the unit. This change is not visible from the exterior. The other change to the exterior is placing windows in the rear window openings. Most of the other windows fit within the same framework. The tile capping has been removed by demolition crews and he is looking for similar replacement tile. On the penthouse, there is existing deck wood which is proposed to be removed and replaced with stucco to match the existing building. It is being offset so it does not look like an extension of the old building.

Commissioner Wilson asked if there was a fire issue removing the ladder.

Mr. Holder stated that the ladders may have been there for exits but the drawings submitted to Esgil were approved for the construction documents and the exiting situation was approved. In addition, sprinklers are being added to the entire building.

Commissioner Herron indicated she liked the idea of garages instead of carports, and supported changing the roof so that it would be apparent that it was not part of the original structure.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Keith stated that her main concern was that the tile capping had been removed and asked that it be replaced with similar tile.

Ms. McCaull clarified that when she visited the site and placed a Stop Work Notice, it was just the first section of the stairwell where the tile had been removed, however, it seemed that he was saying that additional tile had been removed.

He confirmed that more tile had been removed and it would be replaced.

Ms. Wilson said she was pleased that an effort was being made to coordinate the colors of the building.

Chairperson Keith asked if there were only two windows on the penthouse elevation facing the alley that are proposed to be removed.

Mr. Holder stated that it was only those two windows.

Commissioner Herron said she was in agreement with the changes but hoped that in the future when there are historic alterations, that the persons involved in the process are knowledgeable about what they are doing, because the tile capping was very important to the building.

Commissioner Draper agreed that when the building was designated historic, it was said that the tile would be maintained.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 7-05 HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT AS SUBMITTED WITH THE CONDITION THAT THE TILE CAPPING BE REPLACED WITH SIMILAR TILE.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, Wilson, and Herron
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

HAP 8-05 **ACKERMAN, CHRIS** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for historically designated residence addressed as 765 C Avenue and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. In 2002, the property was designated as an historic resource. The owner is proposing some modifications to the property which trigger an alteration permit by the Commission. Several changes are proposed to the building. Mr. Ackerman has prepared some revised plans.

The applicant and architect, Mr. Chris Ackerman, presented the revised proposal. He stated that the property consists of three 25' wide lots plus an extra 5' strip. He has agreed with the City to do an irregular lot split that is very close to the house and through the garages to the alley. That leaves sufficient land to develop two houses in the future. His intent is to keep a yard for the 765 C Avenue house and develop the other two houses on the other side of the fence. He is not proposing to add any square footage and most of the proposed modifications cannot be seen from the street. He is proposing a bay window in the kitchen located on the south side towards the back of the front part of the structure. He is proposing to change the flat roof in the glass hallway to a gabled roof in order to provide a floor to ceiling height of 7'10" and run heating ducts into the back of the house. The second change proposed is to add a "chimney" skylight that will project from the side of the roof line and is about 4' by 4' in size. The last modification proposed is to add a new raised roof with clerestory type windows over an existing room.

Ms. McCaull stated that one of the benefits of having the property designated historic is that the lot line is allowed to go through an existing structure where normally it would not.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Keith said that she did not see any problems with what was being proposed, but expressed concern that the plans had been presented with very short notice. She asked staff if there were concerns about the Commission making a decision based on the revised plans presented today.

Ms. McCaull stated it was more of a policy matter for the Commission to decide. She asked the applicant if the revised plans were in compliance with setback requirements.

Mr. Ackerman said the proposed changes are the three dormers. The dormer to the south pops out one foot, which is not a problem. The overhang on the pop-out would extend to the side yard beyond the one foot, about two feet.

Ms. McCaull said the applicant would also be in need of a reduction in the side yard setback requirement for the pop-out. It would be at the Commission's discretion to either notice that issue to another hearing, or if they would feel comfortable approving the alteration permit today. When a person applies for an alteration permit and requests exceptions to the Code, it has always been included in the public hearing notice so that the public is aware of what is being requested.

Chairperson Keith stated that what the applicant is proposing is very much in keeping with the style of the house and will virtually not be seen by the public. She was in support of approving the permit.

Commissioner Herron said that the alterations are historically in keeping with the house and she had no concerns, except for the walkway and the bay window.

Mr. Ackerman stated that the bay window already exists and there is plenty of room for the walkway.

Commissioner Draper said she had looked up in the dictionary the word “clerestory” and it showed a picture of a Romanesque abbey in Germany; it was an upper part of a window to let in light and air.

Mr. Ackerman said that the back of the north side of the house was very dark and he was attempting to get light into that area.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 8-05 HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT AS SUBMITTED WITH THE REVISED PLANS.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- F. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- G. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- H. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- I. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE’S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- J. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR’S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, Wilson, and Herron

NAYS: None.

ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee.

ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

HRPA 6-05 Rennie, Celia: Request for a Historic Resource Preservation Agreement for the Single Family Residence addressed as 300 Ninth Street and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the item as outlined in the agenda. The Commission designated the property as an historic resource in May 2005. It was the 57th residence to be designated and was recognized historic due to serving as an example of the Mediterranean architectural style and having been designed by the notable architect, Richard Requa, and for serving as a residence to several major families who had distinguished military careers. Ms. Rennie has applied for the Historic Preservation Mills Act agreement, which is one of the benefits of having a property designated as an historic resource. The applicant has agreed to preserve the property for at least a ten year period of time, and then the property can receive property tax reductions. She had not yet received the estimated property loss to the City. The County Assessors Office had indicated they are backlogged during this time of year. There is a backlog of Mills Act applications and this would be added to the list for future consideration.

The applicant, Celia Rennie, was present in the audience.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Keith recommended adding a Consent Calendar to the Agenda in order to expedite items under consideration such as Mills Act applications.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER KEITH MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE LIST OF IMPROVEMENTS FOR 300 NINTH STREET (HRPA 6-05), TO ATTACH TO THE HISTORIC RESOURCE PRESERVATION AGREEMENT APPLICATION TO BE FORWARDED TO THE CITY COUNCIL.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, MacCartee, Draper, Wilson, and Herron
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 4-0.

MISCELLANEOUS

None.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Discussion regarding establishment of a program to encourage the retention and restoration of Coronado Cottages.

Chairperson Keith said that Commissioner MacCartee had been working with Attorney Sharon Sherman on this project. Ms. Sherman is presently out of town but had made arrangements to deliver a letter to Chairperson Keith. Unfortunately, Ms. Sherman may not have known that today's meeting began at 1 p.m. Chairperson Keith said that Ms. Sherman indicated she will be meeting with the City Manager and the City Attorney. She has reserved the Winn Room at the Coronado Library, on September 22, from 5-8 p.m. Chairperson Keith has given Ms. Sherman names of persons that have shown an interest in the program and advised that they attend the meeting. Ms. MacCartee will be going before Council as a private citizen to officially tell the Council about the formation of the committee, which was formed at the suggestion of the City Manager. Ms. Sherman has indicated that she may have someone who may underwrite a ½ page announcement encouraging citizens to attend the September 22 meeting.

Chairperson Keith confirmed that Ms. Sherman would chair the meeting of September 22. She also mentioned that she had met with Mr. Chris Ackerman, who showed enthusiasm about the program, and also indicated that Councilmember reaction to the program was positive.

Discussion regarding the formulation of a Demolition Review List (HR 14-04).

There was no action taken on this item.

Discussion regarding the Public Outreach Program (no report).

There was no action taken on this item.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:05 p.m.

Tony A Peña
Director of Community Development