

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

April 5, 2006

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:02 p.m., Wednesday, April 5, 2006, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Keith.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The minutes of March 15, 2006, was approved as amended.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull reported that at yesterday's City Council meeting, about 15 property owners were presented with historic plaques by the Mayor and Commissioner MacCartee.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the audience wishing to speak.

Commissioner Wilson said she attended the groundbreaking for the Trant Manor property, which will now be known as the "1906 Lodge." It was very well received, however, the developer of the property, Dave Gillingham, has put out his own newsletter which contains some misinformation as to the function of the Historic Resource Commission with regard to developing the list.

Chairperson Keith reported that the Gillinghams have received word that the "1906 Lodge" has qualified for state designation and it looks very good for them to receive national designation. They would be the second structure in Coronado to have national recognition.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HR 4-06 **FRANK AND RITA ANDROSKI** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 266 I Avenue and located in the R-1E (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The site is 50 feet wide and 140 deep, totaling 7,000 square feet. The site contains a single story residence and a detached garage. City records indicate the home was constructed in 1936 so the residence is 70 years old. The permit shows the owner was Lt. Frank and the contractor was Cliff May. Based upon some

prior research that has been done on other Cliff May homes, there are only three other homes within the community that were both designed and built by Cliff May. This is one of those properties. No alterations have occurred to the property since its original construction other than minor maintenance repair items. Since the home is not 75 years of age, the Commission needs to make a finding that the residence has achieved significance within the last 75 years and that the property also meets two additional criteria. The applicants have indicated the home is in excellent condition. The home is built around an open courtyard and contains original wood windows and doors, and many of the common features found in Cliff May residences including the open courtyard at the center of the house, recess front entries, Spanish style roof, stucco exterior, open beam ceilings, and decorative wood panels around the windows. It is a Spanish Hacienda type architectural style. The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's that ranked the number of homes within the community from 1 through 5, 1 being the most significant such as Hotel del Coronado, gave the home a ranking of 2. It is interesting to note that only two owners have owned this property since its original construction – the original owners being Nicholas Frank Jr. and Helen Frank, and then the current owners acquired the property in 1972.

The applicant, Frank Androski, 266 I Avenue, confirmed he is the second and current owner of the home. He has lived in the home since 1969, and has been working on the home for 30 years. Cliff May visited the home a few years ago before he passed away and was pleased to note that the interior of the home had not been changed. In addition, last Sunday he had a visit from Diane Keaton who was doing research on Cliff May. She intends to build a house along the same structure of the open courtyard and hacienda type. He and his wife believe that what makes Coronado unique are homes such as his, and requests a waiver to the 75 year rule, in order to preserve the home as a unique part of Coronado.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the audience wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Wilson thanked the applicant for being present at the meeting, and said she supported the designation.

Commissioner Draper said the home is fabulous and she is so pleased to have another Cliff May.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 266 I AVENUE (HR 4-06) TO BE A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS: ALTHOUGH THE HOME HAS NOT REACHED 75 YEARS OF AGE, IT HAS REACHED SIGNIFICANCE BECAUSE IT MEETS THE FOLLOWING CRITERIA:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S

- MILITARY, CULTURAL, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY, HAVING BEEN ONE OF THE FEW HOMES DESIGNED BY CLIFF MAY FOR MILITARY OFFICERS AND THIS PROPERTY WAS OWNED BY ADMIRAL FRANK;
- B. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SPANISH HACIENDA ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- C. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF AN ARCHITECT AND BUILDER CLIFF MAY, AND THIS IS ONE OF THREE HOMES WITHIN THE COMMUNITY DESIGNED AND BUILT BY CLIFF MAY.

CHAIRPERSON KEITH SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

Commissioner Keith announced that this is the 78th home to be designated historic.

HR 5-06 **JORDAN RIDDLE COMMUNITY PROPERTY TRUST** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence and front entry courtyard addressed as 1111 G Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. This property contains a single story residence and a detached garage. The property has a prominent front entry courtyard that provides access to the residence. There are two properties on either side of the courtyard which creates a unifying theme. It has frontage along Alameda Boulevard which is where the garage is located. The owners are requesting designation of the residence and they plan to also undertake some renovation work to the home in the future. They are also requesting designation of the front entry courtyard to be included as part of the designation request. They believe it is a significant feature that unifies the adjacent homes on either side of the courtyard. The home was constructed in 1914 and is 92 years old. A permit was issued to Clara Sturges Johnson and the contractor was S.D. Chapin. A related permit notes that the owner was William Templeton Johnson and he designed this home and the homes on the adjoining two properties located at 1105 and 1117 G Avenue. A permit was issued in 1920 to glass in the front porch and minor repairs occurred to the building in 1951, and in 1955, the laundry room was converted to a bath and enlarged. The building has a bungalow architectural style with simple rooflines and form. The residence has exposed rafter tails, wood windows and stucco exterior. The front entry has decorative columns flanking the front door and side lights. The Inventory completed in the 1980's gave this an historical ranking of 3, along with an H (the H identified that there was some significance to the Coronado Historical Association with the structure). This is the first time that someone has come forth to request a designation for a landscape or an open space area in

addition to the residence. Kevin Rugee is the architect that has been hired to complete some renovation work to the home in the future, and a landscape architect has been retained to perform some landscape improvements to the courtyard. Should the project be designated, plans for the renovation work would need to return before the Commission for consideration.

Commissioner Herron asked if there was anything in writing that actually stated that Kate Session did the landscaping.

Ms. McCaull responded no.

Commissioner Herron stated that she and Commissioner Draper researched this in great detail and from what they have read, they do believe that Kate Session “probably” was part of it, but they do not have a rendering or anything in writing that actually says that.

The applicant’s representative, Kevin Rugee, 1024 Isabella Avenue, said that the owners of the property would like to have the home designated. They also felt that the front landscaping area should be designated. In addition, the owners and landscape architect desire to re-landscape because the area is overgrown and it is difficult to see the home. The intent is to maintain the original design.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Susan Hevelin, 1144 Isabella Avenue, said she believes that the HRC should look not only at homes but also landscape, in particular, trees. She has noticed that many trees have been removed in Coronado and they take many years to grow back.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Keith said she would like to first discuss whether the home qualifies as an historic resource, and second, discuss if the open space in the front yard.

Commissioner Draper said she supports designating the home as an historic resource.

Commissioner Wilson said she supports historic designation of the home.

Vice Chair MacCartee said she supports designating the home and the courtyard as an historic resource.

Chairperson Keith said that the courtyard has always been an element of those three cottages and is owned by majority by the applicants. If the owners are willing to come forward and have the courtyard designated, she feels it would be a great gift to Coronado. She also agrees that the applicants do not need to return before the Commission to discuss what will be included in the landscaping. It will be open space, nicely landscaped, in whatever manner the owners of the house deem they want to have but that courtyard will not be built upon unless an alteration application is brought back and approved by this Commission.

Commissioner Wilson suggested modifying Condition 5 in the Resolution to add, ...”keeping the symmetry as it is being approved.”

Chairperson Keith said that Condition 5 says, “...any modifications...that reduces the size of the open space.”

Commissioner Wilson stated that something should be mentioned about symmetry.

Chairperson Keith said it can be encouraged but not required.

Mr. Rugee said if the main center walkway is kept, perhaps in the future, if the other property is brought in, it would be at that time that they would build a walkway to that particular home. Access to the other home is off of G Avenue, not the courtyard. They wish to keep a center walkway at this time. He added that what they are proposing is that the walkway, the hardscape and the landscape be removed. They are proposing to maintain the central access with a radius element that would feed off to the property.

Commissioner Wilson asked what the material would be.

Mr. Rugee said it would be either brick or concrete. It has not been determined yet.

Commissioner Wilson suggested making it a condition that the walkway and any changes return before the Commission.

Commissioner Draper asked what the original walkway was made of.

Mr. Rugee said it was concrete.

Vice Chair MacCartee said that they have no original photos of this property in the Coronado archives, so they don't know what material was used originally. So she feels that the open space is the treasure as it is very limited in Coronado. She trusts that the applicants and Mr. Rugee will place something very nice in the open space.

Mr. Rugee suggested that it would be better served if he returned before the Commission with a landscape drawing and what they are actually proposing to do.

Chairperson Keith said she had no issues with what the applicant was presenting. The idea that the applicant is willing to designate this area is such a gift that they should be allowed to landscape in any manner they see fit to do. The Commission's purpose is to designate the home. They have been generous enough to go one step further. She is willing to trust the applicant to landscape in a manner they feel is best for the property.

Commissioner Wilson said she agreed but as they are now declaring the front entry courtyard, she requests that there now be sensitivity to the existing symmetry.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE

COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 1111 G AVENUE (HR 5-06) TO BE A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S SOCIAL, CULTURAL;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH WILLIAM TEMPLETON JOHNSON WHO IS A SIGNIFICANT PERSON IN LOCAL HISTORY;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW IF NOT THE ONLY REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF A BUNGALOW ARCHITECTURAL STYLE WITH AN OPEN SPACE COURTYARD THAT IS SIGNIFICANT FEATURE UNIFYING THE ADJACENT HOMES ON EITHER SIDE OF THE COURTYARD, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D. IT IS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF THE ARCHITECT WILLIAM TEMPLETON JOHNSON AND BUILDER S.D.CHAPIN;

CONDITION 6 SHALL BE ADDED TO READ: "THAT ANY REVISIONS TO THE LANDSCAPING WITHIN THE COURTYARD DO NOT REQUIRE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION APPROVAL, HOWEVER, ANY CHANGES SHOULD BE SENSITIVE TO THE SYMMETRY OF LANDSCAPING AS IT PRESENTLY APPEARS."

CHAIRPERSON KEITH SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

Commissioner Keith announced that this is the 79th home to be designated historic.

HAP 1-06 **WILLIAM B MARTY JR** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for historically designated residence addressed as 535 Margarita Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from the 2nd story rear yard setback requirement.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. In March, 2006, the Commission adopted a Resolution designating this home as an historic resource. This structure was designed by the notable architect Cliff May. This property was designed by Cliff May and built by Water Vestal, however, it has all of the design elements found throughout all of Cliff May's home. Once a property has been designated as an historic resource, the exterior alterations that are proposed go back before the Commission for approval. One of the benefits of having historic designation is that one can apply for some exceptions to the zoning standards.

The Commission had a preview to the alterations that were proposed when the designation request was considered. The applicant is proposing a second story addition of about 400 square feet above the existing two-car garage. This property has frontage along Margarita Avenue, Pomona Avenue and Pendleton Lane. The addition is occurring at the rear of the site along Pendleton Lane, so it will not be too visible on Margarita Avenue, which is the prominent street frontage for the residence. Under today's Code, the second story setback would need to be set back 18 feet, the applicant are requesting relief to have a 5-foot setback. With the addition, it is well below the floor area ratio lot coverage standards. It will have a 47% lot coverage, 55% is permitted, and a floor ratio area of 55% where 63% is permitted.

William Marty, 535 Margarita Avenue, said that the plan is to put any alterations to the property on the part of the home that was built in 1990, not the original Cliff May house. He provided photographs of the home, showed paint chips showing a range of proposed colors, and gave a brief overview of the proposed addition.

Commissioner Draper asked if the roof line would be altered on the existing one-story house.

Mr. Marty said it would be raised to the height of the second story.

Chairperson Keith asked about the windows that would be installed in the new addition.

Mr. Marty replied that they would be using the same double-hung style with the same colors.

Chairperson Keith suggested that Mr. Marty contact the Coronado Historical Association and ask about their program called "Keep It In Coronado," as they may have windows that he could use.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Keith said she did not have any issues regarding the requested relief.

Commissioner Wilson said it is a great plan and complimented Mr. Marty on the sensitivity of the proposed alteration.

Commissioner Herron said she drove by the property and the addition is perfectly in keeping with the neighborhood.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON KEITH MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 1-06 HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT AS SUBMITTED FOR AN ADDITION TO THE RESIDENCE AND REDUCED SECOND STORY REAR YARD SETBACK.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

HAP 3-06 **WAGENER & HEITZ** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for modifications of windows on historically designated residence addressed as 1156 Isabella Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. This is one of the larger properties within Coronado that has been designated as an historic resource. The Commission designated it in March, 2005. It was noted as being significant, being designed by noted architect, Irving Gill, and for its Prairie architectural style. The Commission also granted an alteration permit for this property for restoration work to the residence as well as some new construction. The contractor for the restoration project is Russell Prentice, who is the President of Texton Master Builders. As work began, he discovered that most of the windows were damaged beyond repair. Mr. Prentice concluded that the best approach would be to replace all of the windows on the building with Eagle windows. While it is a replacement in kind, since this project went before the Commission originally as an alteration permit and there was not much discussion about the windows being replaced, she felt it was a good idea to bring this item before the Commission.

Russell Prentice, 1013 Park Place, said he took photos of the existing windows and has detailed information from Alpine and Windowerks, Inc. on how they will duplicate all of the windows.

Commissioner Draper asked what the difference was between Philippine Mahogany and Douglas Fir.

Mr. Prentice said that Douglas Fir is considered a soft wood, Philippine Mahogany is a hard wood. The main reason that it was chosen over Douglas Fir was for insect and rot resistance. One of the considerations on restoration was that any time a window is restored, there is an ongoing yearly maintenance program that needs to be established and on a home this size, it is a significant amount of money.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Susan Hevelin, 1144 Isabella Avenue, asked if they were replacing or retrofitting the windows. She asked if the brick would all be removed and new windows placed in, or will it be built over the existing frame. In the event that it was retrofitted, the glazing would get much smaller and change the appearance of the window. Would all windows be replaced in the house?

Chairperson Keith said the proposal is that they will have identical windows made to replace the ones that are there now. Alpine and Windowerks, Inc. do a wonderful job of copying old windows, and use old glass. It would look exactly the same except the wood would be different, but it would be the same size.

Violet Wagener, 1156 Isabella Avenue, said that the idea is to preserve an Irving Gill home and there needs to be modern wood to replace the windows so that the interior of the home is not ruined by rain.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Wilson said she did not see a problem. Alpine and Wood Works is an excellent company and Mahogany is better than Fir.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON MACCARTEE MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 3-06 HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT AS SUBMITTED TO REPLACE THE WINDOWS IN KIND WITH A CHANGE FROM DOUGLAS FIR TO PHILIPINE MAHOGANY.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER DRAPER SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 5-0.

HRPA 2-06 **DJF 4000 LLC** – Request for Historic Resource Preservation Agreement for the historically designated property addressed as 848-866 D Avenue and located in the R-3 (Multiple Family Residential) Zone.

Commissioner MacCartee stepped down from the dais as she lives within 300 feet from the affected property. Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. It was recently designated as an historic resource. They were also eligible to apply for a condo conversion to convert the apartment building to condominiums, which is one of the benefits of the Historic Preservation program. An additional benefit is to apply for the Historic Preservation Mills Act agreement, a 10-year agreement that the property owners enter into with the City. The property owner agrees to preserve the structure and if necessary rehabilitate it. In return, they are entitled to property tax reductions. When the application was filed, they noted several improvements that they planned to undertake during the course of the agreement, however, all the work has been completed. Final occupancy was authorized on March 23, 2006. The Commission would require a Mills Act application from all 15 property owners plus a copy of the Homeowners Association agreement. An apartment or condominium has never before applied for a Mills Act Agreement, so it is fairly unique. There is currently a backlog of Mills Act applications of about 18 properties. It is not anticipated that this agreement would be recorded for at least 12 years. Information on the loss of property tax revenue to the City and the Redevelopment Agency has not been received.

Commissioner Draper suggested continuing the item until the owners can all get together and have their bylaws and condominium requirements all set. There does not appear to be a danger in losing this structure.

Commissioner Wilson asked staff if they were looking for Mills Act relief on the units they have resold or sold as new units. After buying the building and having it declared historic, they would receive certain concessions in terms of setbacks, garages, and other requirements that one would normally make in a condominium conversion. Are they asking for the Mills Act benefit for the original purchase price, or for the homeowners? If they are speaking for the homeowners, they have 15 properties to bring under the Mills Act.

The applicant's representative, William Hoefling, said that a complete renovation of the building has been completed. There are currently two owners, one renter, and the remainder of the units are vacant. The idea is for each homeowner to seek relief under the Mills Act. He understood they would have to provide the board with the names of each homeowner when it is available. He learned about the Mills Act through his sales agent.

Commissioner Wilson said it would seem proper to look at the Monterey as a whole, and decide who would receive that benefit. She felt it would be a good idea to obtain legal advice from counsel.

Ms. McCaull said that by the time the document is recorded, even if there was an exception made to allow the Monterey to receive a property tax relief this year, about December, 2006, there would be new property owners by that time.

Chairperson Keith said that everyone has voiced concern about the Mills Act program. She had suggested scheduling a workshop because in her opinion, the Mills Act is not working the way it should in Coronado. There are 18 homes waiting to receive benefits. She is suggesting that this item be continued because they do not have the names of all the property owners, and because she would like this item taken to a workshop where legal advice can be obtained and input received from either Council or staff to possibly incorporate this into a proposal to Council. They would need Council approval to hold the workshop.

Commissioner Herron commented on the restoration of the Monterey by the original owners, who then sold it with the plans to DJF 4000 LLC. Tiles had been removed, concrete was broken, and windows were not replaced in kind. She does not feel confident that the Monterey is eligible for the Mills Act program. She would not vote in favor.

Commissioner Wilson thanked Mr. Hoefling for bringing this request before the Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the public wishing to speak.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

None.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON KEITH MADE A MOTION TO CONTINUE THE ITEM TO ALLOW TIME FOR THE APPLICANT TO PROVIDE THE CITY WITH THE NAMES OF ALL THE PROPERTY OWNERS THAT WOULD BE ENTERING INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH THE CITY, AND FOR ADDITIONAL RESEARCH TO BE COMPLETED BY STAFF AND COUNSEL OF THE LEGAL ISSUES AND RAMIFICATIONS OF ENTRY INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH A CONDOMINIUM COMPLEX. THIS MATTER WOULD ALSO BE FOLDED INTO A FUTURE WORKSHOP TO BE CONDUCTED ON THE MILLS ACT.

COMMISSIONER WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: Commissioner MacCartee.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

NOI 1-06 **BETTY L. SMITH** – Notice of Intent to Demolish the single family residences addressed as 967 and 967 ½ G Avenue and located in the R-1B (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. This site is 50 feet wide, 140 feet deep, totaling 7,000 square feet. The property permits two units to be developed, if desired. The purpose of the hearing is for the Commission to evaluate the structure and whether or not it meets the criteria to be deemed an historic resource. If the Commission finds that the property does not meet the criteria, the applicant can proceed with the demolition. If they find that the property does meet the criteria, it provides an opportunity to look at alternatives to the demolition of the structure. The front residence was built in 1924 and is 82 years old. The contractor was O.W. Dorman, a prominent builder in the community who constructed over 44 homes in a 10-year period of time between 1920 and 1930. A few alterations have occurred to the front building including a number of re-roofs. Permits do not clearly demonstrate how the back structure became a residence, however, alterations did occur in 1965. It appears that the residence has been owned by the same family since its original construction. The front residence has a Spanish architectural style with a stucco exterior, flat roof with arched parapets, red slanted tile roof at the center of the building, and fairly simple building lines. The application did note that the windows are aluminum and but it appears that some of the original windows still exist. The front door is flanked by multipaned sidelights and the rear residence does not appear to represent any significant architectural style. The Historic Resource Inventory completed in the 1980's gave this building a historical value rating of 3. That meant it had minor modifications to its original appearance and was represented of a recognized style or local architectural style and perhaps be a contributing structure to a potential historic district. If the property is not deemed as an historic resource, she recommended that the Commission place a condition in the Resolution requiring the applicant to notify the Coronado Historical Association (CHA) at least 10 days prior to the demolition to give the CHA an opportunity to either photograph the site or there may be certain architectural features within the building that perhaps CHA would like to use as part of their "Keep It In Coronado" program.

The representatives, Beth and Bill Delano, 965 E Avenue, said they were very fortunate to live and work in Coronado and find great value in the Commission's efforts to keep the village integrity intact. They do not feel that the home qualifies as an historic resource as its only significance is that the home was built by a local builder. In further research, they went to the National Trust for Historic Preservation and they state that a home is not historic simply because it is old but rather because it has ties to individuals or events of historic or architectural importance.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Joseph Ditler, Director, Coronado Historical Association (CHA), 1100 Orange Avenue, said there was a slight communication breakdown between homes that are being demolished and how they affect the "Keep It In Coronado" program. He asked that owners who demolish a structure contact him.

Chairperson Keith said that a demolition permit is not issued unless all the conditions on a Resolution are fulfilled, which includes contacting the CHA.

Heidi Wilson, 948 G Avenue, said is well acquainted with the home's interior and exterior and feels that it is not worth saving. She appreciates that the new owners will be sensitive to how the new home will affect the neighborhood.

Ann Patterson, 941 G Avenue, welcomed the new owners to the community. She called Ms. Delano and agreed with her that the home needs to be demolished. She hopes that her new neighbors will be sensitive when building a new home.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Keith said the home at 967 G Avenue is 82 years of age and was built by Oscar Dorman. However, she does not feel it qualifies as an historic resource and supports the demolition request.

Commissioner Wilson said it is unfortunate that the home cannot be saved but agrees with the request to demolish.

Commissioner Herron said she understands that this is a "tired" home and hopes that it will be replaced with a kind and loving home that fits into the neighborhood.

Vice Chair MacCartee said she would vote that this home is not an historic resource because it does not meet the criteria. She did however disagree with a letter she received from Attorney Ronald J. Chin, who said the home was built by an "historically insignificantly builder," and that "It is a common Spanish-style structure without any significant elements." She feels that every town has its history. We are a small village and have a history of small homes, cottages and bungalows – this home is one of them.

Commissioner Draper agreed with all of the Commissioners and felt that the letter was inappropriate and incorrect.

COMMISSION ACTION

CHAIRPERSON DRAPER MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION MAKE A DETERMINATION THAT THE HISTORIC STRUCTURE ADDRESSED AS 967 G AVENUE (NOI 1-06) DOES NOT MEET THE CRITERIA TO BE DESIGNATED AN HISTORIC RESOURCE WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES NOT EXEMPLIFY SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL, ECONOMIC, POLITICAL, AESTHETIC, ENGINEERING, OR ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS NOT IDENTIFIED WITH A PERSON(S) OR AN EVENT(S) SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL, STATE OR NATIONAL HISTORY;

- C. IT IS NOT ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF AN ARCHITECTURAL STYLE, AND IS NOT VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;
- D. IT IS NOT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF A BUILDER, DESIGNER, ARCHITECT, ARTISAN OR LANDSCAPE PROFESSIONAL.
- E. IT DOES NOT MEET THE STATE PROGRAM OF LANDMARKS AND POINTS OF HISTORICAL INTEREST AS SET FORTH IN ARTICLE 2 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 50280) OF CHAPTER 1 OF PART 1 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE AND ARTICLE 1.9 (COMMENCING WITH SECTION 439) OF CHAPTER 3 OF PART 2 OF DIVISION 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA REVENUE AND TAXATION CODE (AS AMENDED FROM TIME TO TIME).

IN ADDITION: (1) THE OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CITY AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO ALLOW CITY AND/OR THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION AN OPPORTUNITY TO PREPARE A PHOTOGRAPHIC, FILM, VIDEO, OR OTHER APPROPRIATE RECORD OF THE EXTERIOR/INTERIOR OF THE STRUCTURE; (2) THE OWNER SHALL NOTIFY THE CORONADO HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION (CHA) AT LEAST 10 DAYS PRIOR TO DEMOLITION TO PROVIDE CHA WITH AN OPPORTUNITY TO SALVAGE HISTORIC BUILDING MATERIALS FOR THEIR "KEEP IT IN CORONADO" RE-USE PROGRAM.

COMMISSIONER KEITH SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Keith, Draper, MacCartee, Wilson, and Herron
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

MISCELLANEOUS

None.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

HR 14-04 City of Coronado: Consideration of a Draft Demolition Permit Review List to replace the existing ordinance that uses a 75-year criteria as a trigger mechanism for the Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit process. This List includes single family, multiple family, and non-residential properties.

Ms. McCaull said this item was placed on the agenda in the event the Commission wished to discuss the action that was taken at the last meeting or if they desired to proceed and review additional homes.

The Commission reviewed the list of potential properties and made a determination as to which properties should be kept, reviewed further, or eliminated from the list.

Discussion regarding the Coronado Cottage Conservancy (no report)

Vice Chair MacCartee reported that the next Open House would be held on April 30.

Discussion regarding the Appeal of the Historic Resource Commission decision to designate 350 D Avenue as an Historic Resource

Commissioner Keith reported that Ms. McCaull had written a letter to Mr. Rauber informing him that the appeal will be heard at the City Council meeting of Tuesday, April 18, 2006. This Commission needs to be represented. It is not known on what grounds Mr. Rauber is making the appeal.

Ms. McCaull stated that the information Mr. Rauber wants the City Council to consider in overturning the decision for designation needs to be turned in five working days prior to the Council meeting. During a conversation with Mr. Rauber, he indicated that he did not feel the home met the criteria to be designated an historic resource, especially since it was less than 75 years of age.

Commissioner Keith stated that the Commission needs to be represented at the City Council meeting. It was agreed that Commissioners Herron, Keith, MacCartee and Wilson would attend the meeting, and that Chairperson Keith would speak before the Commission.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:54 p.m.

Tony A Peña
Director of Community Development