

HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES

Regular Meeting

April 19, 2006

The regular meeting of the Coronado Historic Resource Commission was called to order at 3:04 p.m., Wednesday, April 19, 2006, at the Coronado City Hall Council Chambers, 1825 Strand Way, Coronado, California, by Chairperson Keith.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Ann McCaull, Associate Planner
Martha L. Alvarez, Recording Secretary

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Ms. McCaull reported that yesterday, the City Council considered an appeal of the decision of the Historic Resource Commission to designate the property at 350 D Avenue as an historic resource. The person who appealed the decision was a neighbor. The City Council supported and upheld the decision of the Commission to have the property designated as an historic resource.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS AND OTHER MATTERS

There were no members of the audience wishing to speak.

Vice Chair MacCartee urged the public to visit the 800 block of C Avenue, where a demolition of a cottage is taking place. The Commission is doing its best to avoid these demolitions from happening.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

HR 6-06 **CHUCK AND RITA STEEL** – Request for Historic Designation of the single family residence addressed as 909 J Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone.

Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The property owners have retained Susan Piper to complete historic research on this property. The site is fairly small; it is 25 feet wide and 73 deep containing 1,825 square feet and contains a small, single story dwelling. City records indicate the home was constructed in 1912, so the home is 94 years old. The permit shows the owner was Otto Klein but the contractor and architect are not identified. Some alterations have occurred to the building over its history but mostly it has been restorative type of work. In 1959, the outside wall of the residence was re-shingled and in 1972, a permit was issued to re-cover the roof. In 2002, Flagship Properties restored the residence and a new foundation was put in, the roof was replaced, the kitchen was renovated, and an interior wall was moved to accommodate a new bathroom. Some of the original windows were also replaced in wood to match the original. The application notes that the home has a California Bungalow

architectural style and is significant because it was the first home of Naval aviator, Captain William Lowrey, who rescued a dangling parachutist mid-air over North Island in 1941. This story made the front pages of national newspapers, making him a notable person in Coronado's history.

The applicant's representative, Susan Piper, 930 I Avenue, presented a brief PowerPoint presentation and gave an overview of the home's history, including background information on Captain Lowrey and the aerial rescue that took place in 1941.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no members of the audience wishing to speak at this time.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Chairperson Keith said she knew Captain Lowrey. This is a fabulous home that has been restored, and it was open for one of the Cottage Conservancy's Open Houses.

Commissioner Wilson said she loves the home and it worthy of cottage conservancy. However, she had concerns about the home meeting the minimum criteria for being designated historic.

Chairperson Keith said that the home reflects architectural history in the miniature cottage. She does not feel there are that many left in Coronado and is one of the few remaining examples. There are a number of small cottages, but not this small. It also reflects the military history in that this was the birth place of Naval aviation.

Commissioner Herron said that whenever someone wants to historically designate a home and meets the criteria, it is the Commission's duty to protect and preserve the character of Coronado, and this home exemplifies the character of Coronado.

Commissioner Draper stated that the home meets the criteria to be designated as an historical resource.

Vice Chair MacCartee said that this home is one of the few homes that is completely unaltered. In addition, she would like to add that Captain Lowrey's wife, Helen Lowrey, is noted for her local importance and involvement with civic affairs.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER DRAPER MADE A MOTION THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE COMMISSION WOULD CONSIDER 909 J AVENUE (HR 6-06) TO BE A HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT PROPERTY AND WOULD APPROVE A REQUEST FOR HISTORIC DESIGNATION IF REQUESTED, WITH THE ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION STATING THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- A. IT DOES EXEMPLIFY OR REFLECT SPECIAL ELEMENTS OF THE CITY'S MILITARY, CULTURAL, SOCIAL AND ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY;
- B. IT IS IDENTIFIED WITH PERSONS SIGNIFICANT IN LOCAL AND

- NATIONAL HISTORY AS BEING THE FIRST HOME OF NAVAL AVIATOR CAPTAIN WILLIAM W. LOWREY, WHO RESCUED A DANGLING PARACHUTIST MID-AIR OVER NORTH ISLAND IN 1941 AND LATER RECEIVED THE DISTINGUISHED FLYING CROSS MEDAL; AND HIS WIFE HELEN LOWREY IS NOTED FOR HER LOCAL IMPORTANCE AND INVOLVEMENT WITH CIVIC AFFAIRS;
- C. IT IS ONE OF THE FEW REMAINING EXAMPLES IN THE CITY POSSESSING DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF A VERY SMALL CALIFORNIA BUNGALOW STYLE, AND IS VALUABLE FOR THE STUDY OF A TYPE, PERIOD, OR METHOD OF CONSTRUCTION AND HAS NOT BEEN SUBSTANTIALLY ALTERED;

CHAIRPERSON WILSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, Keith, MacCartee, and Wilson.
NAYS: None.
ABSENT: None.
ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed 5-0.

Commissioner Keith announced that this is the 80th home to be designated historic.

HAP 2-06 **MR. AND MRS. MARTIN BROWN** – Request for Historic Alteration Permit for the historically designated residence addressed as 834 Tolita Avenue and located in the R-1A (Single Family Residential) Zone. The alteration permit also requests relief from the 2nd story rear yard setback requirement for roof decks.

Chairperson Keith stepped down from the dais as she lives within 300 feet from the affected property. Ms. McCaull introduced the staff report as outlined in the agenda. The Commission designated this property as historic resource in March of 2006. At that time, preliminary proposed alterations were reviewed by the Commission, and concerns were expressed by the Commission and neighbors about the proposed roof deck design. The designation request was continued to allow the owner/architect to come up with a revised proposal and it was submitted to the Commission. The exterior stairwell had been modified or removed, the roof deck was located more at the center of the building, and the Commission seemed to generally support the revised plan as being a much more improved plan than the previous one. Today, the applicant is presenting a formal alteration permit with all the details on the proposed alterations as is allowed with historic resources. One of the benefits is that one can apply for reduced zoning standards. The applicant is requesting a 22-foot rear yard setback requirement where normally a 39-foot setback would be required. Some additional alterations are occurring to the building. The second story at the rear of the home was being removed and expanded, a new foundation will be put in, and some repair work to the front porch, and some existing aluminum windows will be changed out to wood. The front porch railing on the second floor does not meet current Code requirements and will be modified to meet building code requirements.

The applicant's representative, Kevin Rugee, Architect, 1024 Isabella Avenue, said the staff report is very concise. He wishes to reiterate there will be structural upgrades required at the first floor to accommodate the second floor addition. The back part of the ground floor will have some work done and may entail doing interior work, and possibly tearing off of some shingles in the exterior rear. They intend to keep the same look to the home but with minor modifications. The expansion that will be done to the house is very limited considering what could be done.

Commissioner Wilson said it looks like the proposed building height will be 24 feet 9 inches tall when completed which is taller than the existing building. She asked for additional information.

Mr. Rugee said the roof change will be a difference of about four feet. It is still below the allowable height measurements.

Commissioner Herron asked if the roof deck contained a 3-foot high wall.

Mr. Rugee responded that the guard rail is measured from the deck to the top of the rail, so if a person is standing at the deck, they will never have less than three feet of railing for a wall, which is minimum code.

Commissioner Herron asked if it was possible to decrease the square footage of the roof deck.

Mr. Rugee said that no matter the size of the roof deck, it is still necessary to have a guard rail.

Commissioner Herron said that the roof deck looks far superior in the middle and is couched within the ridge line and the roof, so in that sense, he has maintained the historicity of the home. She is concerned about privacy issues.

Mr. Rugee said that one should keep in mind that the use of the roof deck will be minimal.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Sally Krummenacher, 1104 Isabella Avenue, said her property abuts the Brown property at a right angle. She said that the roof deck being discussed is larger and located closer to the rear property line than the one originally proposed. She is not in support of the roof deck as it intrudes into her back yard and her privacy.

Kevin Rugee, 1024 Isabella Avenue, said it is important to keep in mind that the previous meetings included presenting concepts, and modifying those concepts to appease many people. Drawings were submitted in accordance with the requirements of the historic alteration permit and have been available for about two weeks. He assured the Commission that they were not trying to "slip" anything by them. Concept drawings do not have the same dimensions, design or features as when it goes before the Commission for alteration approval.

The applicant, Martin Brown, 834 Tolita Avenue, said he was open to reducing the size of the roof deck but wanted to communicate that they have been working on the design to respond to various concerns. He feels that the current design is the best one so far although he is losing bedroom space because the interior stairway takes a lot of square footage from the inside. However, it looks better and cleaner.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Draper said that she is pleased that they have done away with the exterior stairway and placed the roof deck in the center. She is not in favor of raising the roof any further because it will skew the balance of the entire footprint. She is neutral on the size of the roof deck. She feels the alterations will not destroy the original historicity of the property.

Commissioner Wilson stated that the historic value has been retained by the way the architect has submitted the design, even though there is a significant addition which makes the house more livable. Although privacy is a concern, she feels that all attempts has been made to keep everyone's privacy and use intact.

Commissioner Herron said that the historicity of the home has been maintained and thanked Mr. Rugee for an excellent job.

Vice Chair MacCartee said that there are trees and vegetation that can be used to respond to concerns about privacy.

COMMISSION ACTION

COMMISSIONER WILSON MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE HAP 2-06 HISTORIC ALTERATION PERMIT AS SUBMITTED.

THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS WERE MADE:

- A. THAT THE PROPOSED ALTERATION IS CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSE AND INTENT OF THIS CHAPTER, THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT AND THE GENERAL PLAN.
- B. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORICAL, ARCHITECTURAL OR AESTHETIC VALUE OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCE.
- C. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL RETAIN THE ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS THAT MAKE THE HISTORIC RESOURCE SIGNIFICANT.
- D. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL NOT ADVERSELY AFFECT THE HISTORIC RESOURCE'S RELATIONSHIP TO ITS SURROUNDINGS AND NEIGHBORING HISTORIC RESOURCES.
- E. THE PROPOSED ALTERATION WILL COMPLY WITH THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS AS SET FORTH IN SECTION 106 OF THE NATIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION ACT OF 1966.

COMMISSIONER DRAPER SECONDED THE MOTION.

AYES: Commissioners Draper, Herron, MacCartee, and Wilson.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT: Commissioner Keith.

ABSTAIN: None.

The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

MISCELLANEOUS

None.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

HR 14-04 City of Coronado: Consideration of a Draft Demolition Permit Review List to replace the existing ordinance that uses a 75-year criteria as a trigger mechanism for the Notice of Intent to Demolish Permit process. This List includes single family, multiple family, and non-residential properties.

Chairperson Keith said that the Commission was given direction by the Council to reduce the number of homes by removing the homes that were not essential to notification of demolition.

The Commission reviewed the list of potential properties and made a determination as to which properties should be kept, reviewed further, or eliminated from the list.

Discussion regarding Coronado Historic Association's "Keep It In Coronado Program" (no report)

This item was continued at the request of Joseph Ditler, Executive Director, Coronado Historical Association (CHA), who was not able to attend the meeting.

Ann McCaull commented that Mr. Ditler raised some questions regarding the HRC process and why, when an Intent to Demolish permit is issued, CHA is not being contacted or given an opportunity to review and salvage what they can. Ms. McCaull said that when the Notice of Intent to Demolish process began, they learned about CHA's "Keep It In Coronado" program. At the request of the CHA director, a condition was initiated that all applicants whose homes were approved to be demolished were encouraged to work with CHA to give them an opportunity to salvage the materials and use it in the program. However, it is important to note that this is a voluntary program and the applicant is not required to cooperate with CHA, nor release any of his/her property to CHA.

Discussion regarding the Coronado Cottage Conservancy (no report)

Vice Chair MacCartee reported that there will be an Open House at the Patterson's home on April 30. She invited everyone to attend.

Discussion regarding the Appeal of the Historic Resource Commission decision to designate 350 D Avenue as an Historic Resource (no report)

This item was earlier discussed under "Director's Report."

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:01 p.m.

Tony A Peña
Director of Community Development